

Summary of Terminal Evaluation Results

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Arab Republic of Egypt	Improving Small-scale Farmers' Market-oriented Agriculture Project
Sector: Agriculture and Rural Development	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge: Agricultural and Rural Development Group ² , Rural Development Department	Total Cost
Period of Cooperation(R/D): From May 27 2014 to May 26, 2019 (five years)	Partner Country's Implementation Organization: Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (MALR)
	Supporting Organization in Japan: none
<p>1-1. Background of the Project</p> <p>In the Arab Republic of Egypt (hereinafter referred to as Egypt), agriculture is one of the most important economic sectors contributing to about 11% of GDP in 2015 and employing about 28% of the working population in 2013. Agriculture is significantly important in Upper Egypt, located to the south of Cairo, where over 55% of employment is agriculture related. The proportion of poverty is estimated to be approximately 25% of the total population in Egypt while the rate is as high as about 52% in the rural area of Upper Egypt.</p> <p>In Minia and Assuit governorates, agriculture production center of Upper Egypt, small-scale farmers account nearly 90% of all the farmers. Hence, support to small-scale farmers is considered a crucial issue to be addressed for rural development through poverty mitigation.</p> <p>To increase income from agricultural production, it is necessary for small-scale farmers to properly respond to various challenges related not only to production (procurement of quality seeds, cultivation techniques, and prevention of insects and diseases), but also to securing budget for harvest and shipment. Farmers are also faced with uncertainty of marketing, changes of commodity prices, suppression on the profit by middlemen, etc. As a result, few small-scale famers try to enter into cash crop farming in Upper Egypt, while high profitability can be expected.</p> <p>The Ministry of Agriculture and Land Reclamation (MALR) deploys extension workers at governorate, district and village levels for the purpose of instruction and guidance to famers. However, due to shortage of operation budget and extension workers, guidance to famers in terms of cultivation methods, farm management, and marketing has not been done sufficiently.</p> <p>Meanwhile, in Egypt, agricultural cooperatives are established in every village, and have certain degree of potential to take a leading role to guiding famers for livelihood improvement, as they possess assets (land, buildings, facilities, etc.), as well as permanent staffs with relatively high educational background. Nevertheless, they are lacking in experiences and knowledge to assist farmers to execute commercial activities and cannot take the advantages of their assets and human resources.</p> <p>Under the circumstances, the Government of Egypt submitted a request to the Government of Japan for a technical cooperation project in order to address the issues in Minia and Assuit governorates, Upper Egypt, mentioned above. In December 2013, both the governments signed R/D and “Improving Small-scale Farmers’ Market-oriented Agriculture Project (ISMAP)” was commenced in May 2014 with</p>	

the cooperation period of five years until May 2019.

The Project aims at improving small-scale farmers' farming based on the market-oriented approach, and strengthening the governmental extension system, and capacity development of extension workers of the government and agricultural cooperatives. Along with the market-oriented farming, gender mainstreaming is an important strategy in the Project implementation to enhance women's capacity in their farming, family welfare and the livelihood improvement.

In November 2018, about six months prior to the termination of the cooperation period, JICA conducted Terminal Evaluation to ascertain the progress of the Project, and to provide recommendations for the future course of the Project jointly with the Egyptian stakeholders.

1-2. Project Overview (PDM 3)

(1) Overall Goal: Agricultural incomes of the small-scale farmers in the target villages and surrounding villages*¹ in Minia and Assiut Governorates are increased.

(2) Project Purpose: Agricultural incomes of the target small-scale farmers and surrounding small-scale farmers*² who practice the ISMAP Approach are increased.

(3) Output:

1. Market-oriented extension approach is established.

2. Agricultural techniques for value-added products are examined and developed.

3. Capacities for making and implementing action plans of the agricultural cooperatives are strengthened.

4. Farming methods based on the market-oriented approach are deployed within the target agriculture cooperatives.

(4) Inputs

Japanese Side

- Dispatch of Experts: 6 Short-term Experts (81.5 M/M) (as of the end of October 2018)
- Overseas Training: Four times: a total of 29 Egyptian CPs dispatched.
- Procurement of Equipment (as of July 2016): Approximately 1.92 million yen (Personal computers, printers, digital camera, etc.).
- Local Cost Assistance (as of July 2016): Approximately 10.9 million yen (cost for transportation, trainings, etc.).

Egyptian Side

- Allocation of CPs: a total of 47 CPs has been assigned; 29 CPs are assigned as of the end of December 2016 (10 are female).
- Facility: Office space for the Japanese experts in Cairo (MALR), in the Agricultural Directorate in Minia and Assiut Governorates
- Project Running Cost: Salary of CPs, utilities, and a part of TOT.

2. Terminal Evaluation Team

Japanese Side

(1) Mr. Shinichi NOGUCHI (Leader) Senior Deputy Director, Team 5, Agricultural and Rural Development Group2, Rural Development Department, JICA

(2) Ms. Asuka SHIBUYA (Cooperation Planning) Assistant Director, Team 5,

Egyptian Side

(1) Eng. Ahmad Salah Ibrahim (Member) Monitoring and evaluation consultant at MALR

(2) Dr. Gehan A.G Elmenofi (Member) Chief Researcher (Professor) & Deputy Director for Research of the Agriculture Extension and Rural Development Research Institute

Agricultural and Rural Development Group2, Rural Development Department, JICA (3) Ms. Makiko KUBOTA (Gender) Senior Advisor on Gender and Development for JICA (4) Dr. Hideaki HIGASHINO (Evaluation Analysis) Senior Consultant, RECS International. Inc.	(AERDRI)-Agricultural Research Centre (ARC)
Period of Evaluation: November 2-November 22, 2018	Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Review

3-1. Project Performances

(1) Summary of Project Purpose Achievements

Project Purpose: *Agricultural incomes of the target small-scale farmers and surrounding small-scale farmers*2 who practice the ISMAP Approach are increased.*

Indicator a: *The agricultural incomes of the small-scale farmers who practice the ISMAP Approach are increased by 6% - 37% by household and village.*

Indicator a was achieved. In the tables below, annual net income per feddan in each target village from the 1st to 3rd cycle in Mina and Assuit governorate (about 20 farmers) is shown. Significant increase was made in both governorates, although in Assuit, the annual income of 2017 summer and 2017-2018 winter crops was slightly below the baseline due to sharp plunge of the onion market price. As for each village, 18 out of 20 villages satisfied the indicator a (Details of each village income, please refer to Chapter 3 of the Terminal Evaluation Report)

Minia Governorate	Target income increase 9%~37%	Annual Net Income per Feddan in Each Village (EGP)				
		15S & 15-16 W Crops<*(Baseline<**))	16S &16-17W Crops (increase (%))	16-17W & 17S Crops (increase (%))	17S & 17-18W Crops (increase (%))	17-18W & 18S Crops (increase (%))
9 Target Villages (Three villages each from the 1 st to 3 rd cycle)						
Average of the 9 villages (increase (%))		7,700	12,879 (+67.3)	11,886 (+54.4)	13,076 (+69.8%)	n.a.

Assuit Governorate	Target income increase 6%~ 28%	Annual Net Income per Feddan in Each Village (EGP)				
		15S & 15-16 W Crops<*(Baseline<**))	16S &16-17W Crops (increase (%))	16-17W & 17S Crops (increase (%))	17S & 17-18W Crops (increase (%))	17-18W & 18S Crops (increase (%))
11 Target Villages (Three villages in the 1 st cycle st , four villages each in the 2 nd and 3 rd cycles)						
Average of 11 villages (increase (%))		6,973.6	11,744.6 (+68.4)	13,372 (+91.8)	6,967.6 (-0.1)	n.a.

Indicator b: *At least 30% of the women who practice the ISMAP Approach have made a business plan and practiced the market-oriented activity based on the plan.*

Indicator b was satisfied. Out of 66 women who participated in the training of business planning, 52 (79%) prepared business plans and practiced the market-oriented activities based on the plan. Out of 47

women who responded, 41 women increased their incomes (87%).

Indicator c: The agricultural incomes of surrounding small-scale farmers who practice ISMAP Approach are increased.

The indicator c has been partially satisfied at the time of Terminal Evaluation. According to the interview survey to 45 surrounding farmers in nine villages Minia, and 55 surrounding farmers in 11 villages in Assuit, the ratio of the respondents who answered that their incomes had increased are as follows:

Minia Governorate	Nos of Surrounding Farmers	Nos of Surrounding Farmers whose income had increased (%)					
		15S	15/16 W	16S	16/17 W	17S	17/18 W
Target villages in the 1 st cycle	16	9 (%)	9 (%)	40 (%)	71 (%)	100 (%)	100 (%)
Target villages in the 2 nd cycle	15	---	---	0	0	40 (%)	100 (%)
Target villages in the 3 rd cycle	14	---	---	---	36 (%)	93 (%)	93 (%)
Total	45						

Assuit Governorate	Nos of Surrounding Farmers	Nos of Surrounding Farmers whose income had increased (%)					
		15S	15/16 W	16S	16/17 W	17S	17/18 W
Target villages in the 1 st cycle	15	0	33 (%)	33 (%)	56 (%)	69 (%)	64 (%)
Target villages in the 2 nd cycle	20	---	---	50 (%)	61 (%)	50 (%)	55 (%)
Target villages in the 3 rd cycle	20	---	---	---	55 (%)	55 (%)	35 (%)
Total	55						

In Minia governorate, almost all the respondents answered that their income had increased in 2017 and 2018 cropping seasons, while in Assuit, the ratio was not so satisfactory. The reason why surrounding farmers' income has not increased sufficiently in Assuit governorate is not clearly known at the time of Terminal Evaluation.

Indicator d: More than half of the small-scale farmers who practice ISMAP Approach changed their farming style toward market based.

Indicator d was satisfied. A survey was conducted by the Project Team in October 2018 to see whether the small-scale farmers who had practiced ISMAP Approach in the past changed their farming style toward market based.

In Minia, out of 166 farmers interviewed, 141 farmers (84.9%) responded that they had introduced farming plans based on ISMAP Approach and still continues applying them. While, in Assuit, out of 259 farmers interviewed, 230 farmers (88.8%) responded that they had introduced farming plans based on ISMAP Approach and still continues applying them.

(2) Summary of Output Achievements

Output 1: Market-oriented extension approach is established.

<p>Indicator 1a. The draft plan of extension flow based on the market-oriented approach is formulated.</p>	<p><u>Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The draft plan of the extension flow for the 1st and the 2nd cycles were formulated in July 2015 and June 2016, respectively. • During the 1st and 2nd cycles, inconsistent or irregular participation of target farmers was one of the issues to be addressed. The Project Team tried to encourage farmers to participate by adjusting selection criteria of the target farmers and provision of attendance record book called “Passport”. However, no significant improvement of farmers’ attendance was made. • To address the issue, modification of the extension flow for the 3rd cycle was made including. introduction of the Marketing Committee comprised of around 10 interested and active farmers in the target village as a core functional mechanism for disseminating the market-oriented approach. • The demonstration farm was also introduced in the extension activities in the 3rd cycle to enhance demonstration effects.
<p>Indicator 1b: The average score of evaluation on formulation and revision process of the plan of extension flow is higher than 4 in the five-grade evaluation by the relevant stakeholders.</p>	<p><u>Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation by the relevant stakeholder (Egyptian CPs) on the formulation and revision process of extension flow was conducted in January 2017. • The average score of evaluation was 4.5 out five-grade evaluation, and the indicator b is satisfied. • Egyptian CPs think highly of the formulation and revision process of the extension plan, and understand the necessity to continuously revise the plan of the flow from now on according to the conditions of the target farmers, villages, market, etc. • In October 3, 2018, another evaluation was made in the Joint CP Meeting at Cairo. The result was 4.33 out of five-grade evaluation.
<p>Indicator 1c. The extension flow based on the market-oriented approach, which is revised through implementing project activities, is approved by the Joint Steering Committee (JSC).</p>	<p><u>Almost achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The extension flow which was revised based on the results of implementing the Project activities of the 3rd cycle, was approved by JSC in July 2017. • Finalization of the extension flow is under process based on experiences from the 4th and 5th cycles.
<p>Output2: Agricultural techniques for value-added products are examined and developed.</p>	
<p>Indicator2a. Guidelines and manuals</p>	<p><u>Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At the time of Terminal Evaluation, a total of 95 training materials are

<p>on the examined and developed agricultural techniques are made.</p>	<p>available. Details</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the 1st cycle, technical guidelines and manuals prepared by Agriculture Extension Sector, ARC and Assuit Agricultural Directorate were reviewed, selected and utilized for the Project training activities. • From the 2nd to the 4th cycles, training materials prepared by ARC, Minia University, Assuit Agricultural Directorate, El Azhar University were reviewed, selected and utilized for the Project training activities. • Over the five cycles, the Project Team also prepared nine materials.
<p>Indicator 2b. More than 70% of the examined and developed agricultural techniques are included to the Training of Trainers for extension staff.</p>	<p><u>Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant agricultural techniques introduced by the Project are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Intercropping in summer cropping (tomato and sunflower, and cucu and sun flower) - Intercropping in summer cropping (tomato and maize and cucumber maize) targeting the lean season - Introduction of new and appropriate varieties (garlic, tomato, cucur sesame, soybean, Irish potato) - Composting - Off-crop Season Cultivation (garlic, cucumber and tomato) - Triple cropping system (Potato→cucumber→kidney beans/potato→wheat→soybeans) - Application of chemical fertilizer (potassium) • All the techniques introduced under the Project were included to TOT for the extension staff by the Project Team.
<p>Output3: Capacities for making and implementing action plans of the agricultural cooperatives are strengthened.</p>	
<p>Indicator 3a. Action plans for improving agricultural incomes of small-scale farmers are made by the target agricultural cooperatives.</p>	<p><u>Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Current status of the cooperatives was analyzed and grasped through SWOT analysis. • The SWOT analysis was conducted on the 1st, 2nd and 3rd cycle villages, in May 2014, March 2016, and November and December 2016, respectively. The number of participants amounted to 213. • Strength: large capital/assets, Weakness: Insufficient staff • Based on the analysis, action plans were formulated for all the 20 target agricultural cooperatives.
<p>Indicator 3b. More than 70% of activities based on the action plans are implemented.</p>	<p><u>Almost Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At the time of the Terminal Evaluation, the degree of implementation of the action plans was not high enough as capacities of some agricultural cooperatives are still weak (shortage of staffs and budget) to implement their plans. • For the cooperatives without sufficient capacity to implement the plans, review of the plans, and more close monitoring and follow-up were made by the Project Team.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workshops were held in both Minia and Assuit Governorates in September and October 2018. The total participants: 203 (88 from Minia and 115 from Assuit) • In the workshops, evaluation of the action plans and discussion on dissemination of ISMAP extension flow were conducted. • According to the self-evaluation of the action plans, implementation rate is about 69% for Minia and about 72% for Assuit on average.
<p>Output4: Farming methods based on the market-oriented approach are deployed within the target agriculture cooperatives.</p>	
<p>Indicator 4a. Extension plans for deploying farming methods by the target agricultural cooperatives</p>	<p><u>Achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extension plans to disseminate ISMAP extension flow were prepared by all the target village cooperatives in the workshops held in September and October 2018. <p>According to the dissemination plans, about 15,600 farmers will be targeted within seven years in Minia, while in Assuit, about 24,600 farmers will be targeted within 8 years.</p>
<p>Indicator 4b. Existence of new farming activities based on the market-oriented approach within the target agricultural cooperatives.</p>	<p><u>Almost achieved</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the site survey, Terminal Evaluation Team observed that the number of farmers who follow market-oriented approaches increased. <p>Although it is difficult to show quantitative data, according to the survey conducted by the Project Team in September and October 2018, out of 425 interviewees (farmers who participated in the Project activities), almost all responded that they still continue applying the farming plans formulated in the trainings of the Project.</p>
<p>3-2 Summary of Evaluation based on Five Evaluation Criteria</p> <p>Evaluation results based on 5 evaluation criteria are as follows:</p> <p>(1) Relevance: High</p> <p>The Project remains highly relevant with Egyptian development policy, needs of local communities, Japan’s aid policy and strategy, at the time of Terminal Evaluation.</p> <p>(2) Effectiveness: Moderate</p> <p>Effectiveness of the Project was evaluated High. The indicators of the Project Purpose were mostly satisfied. Dissemination of ISMAP Approach was more than expected at the formulation stage of the Project. As for women’s activities, there were also notable changes in women’s capacity toward conducting business activities after the 3rd cycle.</p> <p>(3) Efficiency: Moderate</p> <p>Efficiency of the Project is also considered moderate. Input by the Japanese side: provision of equipment, local cost assistance, and assignment of Japanese Experts is considered appropriate in general and utilized for the implementation of the Project activities.</p> <p>The achievements of Output were satisfactory. However, shortage of the budget for the Project operation caused by worsening of fiscal condition in the Egyptian side hindered smooth implementation of the Project activities. Timely countermeasures against the issue were not taken because of frequent change of the Egyptian CPs at the management level. These facts lowered the efficiency of the Project.</p> <p>(4) Impact: Positive Impacts observed.</p>	

It is considered difficult that Overall Goal will be achieved within three to five years after the completion of the Project due to shortage of budget of the Egyptian side.

Technical Impact: In the 3rd and 4th cycles it was confirmed that many surrounding farmers learned the new cultivation technologies from target farmers, from the cooperative staff, and by observing the demonstration farms. The dissemination led to improvement of cultivation technology and change of attitude to market-oriented approach of surrounding farmers.

Social Impact: There were farmers who had changed to market-oriented agriculture through participation in the Project activities.

Some women who participated in the Project increased their voice and bargaining power within the household and expanded their mobility to contribute to household economy. It was also observed several positive changes in men's mindset and attitudes towards women as capable partners for their household economy.

(5) Sustainability: Relatively Low

Sustainability of the Project was evaluated relatively low. There are concerns in financial, technical and management aspects of the Project.

3-3. Factors promoting the production of effects

3-3-1. Factors pertaining to planning

None

3-3-2. Factors pertaining to implementation process

(1) Change of Strategy

After the 3rd cycle, the Project Team decided to formulate an organization called Marketing Committee comprised of around 10 interested and active farmers in the target village as a core functional mechanism for attracting other farmers to the Project activities and disseminating the market-oriented approach. It was confirmed that the Committee has been functioning well since the 3rd cycle activities. The Project also changed the strategy to support women's activities by conducting feasibility study for their potential business activities as well as introducing a business plan training. It was confirmed that the strategy change contributed to enhance the capacity of women as well as to increase their incomes.

(1) Demonstration Farms

In the 2nd half of the Project, The Project team tried to increase demonstration farms after the 3rd summer season cropping. Although it was not easy for the Project Team to find farmers who accept to set up demonstration farms in their farm land, the Project was able to arrange almost the same number of demonstration farms and they contributed to drawing attentions from the surrounding farmers.

(2) Gender and Culture Sensitive Approach of the Project within the Local Context

Gender and culture sensitive approach of the Project within the local context of Upper Egypt contributed to active and continuous participation of women. (i.e. gender training for the CPs, women-target training, introduction of activities that respond to the needs of local women). In the 2nd half of the Project, the Japanese side extended the assignment of the Gender Expert to enhance gender mainstreaming activities in response to the recommendations made at Mid-term Review. Local consultant who has expertized on gender mainstreaming was also employed.

(3) Training in Japan

Training in Japan conducted four times so far. A total of 29 Egyptian CPs (almost 60% of the total CPs assigned) was dispatched to Japan (and Kenya) for training and contributed to motivate the CPs to participate in the Project activities.

3-4 Factors inhibiting the production of effects

3-4-1. Factors pertaining to planning

At the initial stage of the Project, gender mainstreaming activities have been referred to the Kenya SHEP approach which promoted the equal participation of men and women in the same sphere and activities. However, this approach did not work due to the presence of culture of gender segregation and strong patriarchal social norms in Upper Egypt.

3-4-2. Factors pertaining to the implementation process

(1) Shortage of Operation Budget by the Government of Egypt

According to R/D signed in December 2013, the Egyptian side (MALR) was supposed to bear the local cost of the Project from the 2nd year of the cooperation period through securing the CP fund. However, the budget has not been arranged yet. Only a part of TOT (training of trainers) was born by agricultural cooperatives in Assuit Governorate. This situation has hindered the smooth operation of the Project activities, and pose concern against the sustainability of the Project after the termination of the cooperation period.

(2) Conservative Social Norms of Upper Egypt Region

Farmers in the Upper Egypt Region have conducted traditional farming for generations, and some farmers are so conservative as to change their way of cropping especially when they are aged. From the standpoint of gender mainstreaming, it is observed that the culture of gender segregation inhibits the participation of women and men in the same sphere, which hampers smooth implementation of some key activities of the Project.

Furthermore, there were some women who were not able to participate in the Project due to the strong patriarchal social norms in rural Egypt that women's roles are closely tied to the domestic sphere and men's roles tied to the public sphere. Accordingly, the Project implemented women-target activities as a step to promote gender equality and women's empowerment in a target society.

(3) Monitoring of the Project Activities

Monitoring system has already been introduced to the Project. However agricultural cooperative officers who are in charge of daily monitoring has limited time, transportation means, and trainings in the Project activities. Thus, they cannot give proper advice in a timely manner.

(4) Frequent Turnover of the Egyptian CPs at the Project Management Level

During the past four and a half years, the Project Director changed four times and the Project manager changed. With such frequent changes at the management level of the Egyptian side, the issue that the Project has been faced, such as shortage of operation cost of the Project as well as limited resources for extension activities, cannot be addressed appropriately.

3-5 Conclusion

The Egyptian and Japanese sides jointly conducted Terminal Evaluation of the Project according to the five evaluation criteria, through reviewing the Project reports, interview to stakeholders (Egyptian CPs, Japanese Experts, farmers, etc.), as well as site visits Minia and Assuit Governorates.

Relevance and Effectiveness of the Project were confirmed high at the time of Terminal Evaluation. However, Efficiency of the Project was evaluated Moderate: shortage of the budget for operation cost by the Egyptian side, as well as conservative social norm of the Upper Egypt region decelerated the progress of the Project. Positive impacts were observed in technical, social and economic aspects. Sustainability of Project is considered relatively low, as there remain concerns with financial, technical and management aspects.

Since the Project Purpose has been virtually achieved and will be fully achieved during the remaining

cooperation period, the Terminal Evaluation Team considered that the Project has attained its original goal and should be terminated on May 26, 2019 as described in R/D.

3-6 Recommendations

3-6-1 Recommendations to the Project Team in the remaining period

(1) Follow-up activities of all target villages

In order to take root the ISMAP Approach in the villages, intensive follow up activities such as holding wrap up workshops to reactivate the Marketing Committee is needed for all the target villages of the Project from the 1st cycle to 5th cycle.

(2) Marketing Committee

1) Important role of Marketing Committee

Since the role of Marketing Committee is not clearly mentioned in the ISMAP Flow proposed by the Project, its concept has not been well understood even by the farmers participating in the Project activities. So it is recommended to put “the objective and mission of Marketing Committee” into ISMAP flow distinctly, then make farmers understand that it is indispensable to implement the ISMAP activities by the initiative of Marketing Committee in the villages even after the completion of the Project.

2) Enhancement of leadership for Marketing Committee

The farmers in the regions tend to prefer to work individually, even they can recognize the benefit of the organizing farmers’ group for cultivating and trading. Marketing Committee should take a responsibility or leadership to formulate farmers’ groups thereby establishing linkage with agroindustry companies and disseminating cultivation technologies to surrounding farmers.

(3) Groups to support Contract Farming

In order to implement Contract Farming, establishing functions in the agriculture cooperatives or governorate offices is recommended which can give technical and legal advices to the farmers and examine the process of contracts in order to minimize the farmers’ risks. Through this process, such functions are expected to accumulate the knowhow and success stories of the Contract Farming which will be benefit for advantageous negotiations.

(4) Dissemination of updated techniques

Some of the target villages which participated in 1st and 2nd cycle of the Project didn’t receive new cultivation techniques, supplemental information and manuals are needed to be updated, the Directorates offices will make a follow-up plan until the end of the Project.

(5) Enhancement monitoring and common understanding of the progress

Before the Mid-term Review, the Project CPs at the central level did not have sufficient opportunities to conduct field visit. Although, after Mid-term Review, the number of Technical Committee meeting and site visit has been still limited, CPs have been gradually increasing their efforts to continue ISMAP Approach in Egypt. As a result, a draft proposal of establishing of the ISMAP unit in MALR was prepared with their own initiatives to sustain and expand the Project’s outputs nationwide. It is recommended to keep conducting periodical monitoring by Technical Committee in order to conduct ISMAP Approach.

(6) Follow up actions for women target activities

The evaluation team suggests the Project team and MALR to make efforts to sustain and expand these outcomes within the two target governorates as well as nationwide with actions as follows;

1) Finalization of the manuals

The project has drafted “Manuals for Gender Activities in ISMAP” in 2016, and has repeatedly updated the contents since. In order to finalize, it is recommended that the Project team carefully review

the drafted “Manuals for Gender Activities in ISMAP” in order to deliver clear messages in accordance with the concept of gender mainstreaming. The manuals also needs to be prepared in a user friendly way.

2) Implementation of TOTs

It is recommended that the Project team conducts TOTs to further enhance the capacity of the CPs as well as the extension officers to implement women target activities at the field level. TOTs with the finalized manuals for extension officers as well as for “women pioneers” at the district and the village level would be effective to sustain and expand ISMAP Approach for women.

3) Conduct knowledge sharing workshop

It is also suggested for the Project to organize a workshop to widely disseminate knowledge, good practices and success stories made by the Project along with the extension flow as well as the manuals for its implementation. It is recommended to invite various stakeholders in the workshop including the governors, National Council for Women (NCW) in order to strengthen their partnership and take actions to expand ISMAP Approach for women in Upper Egypt.

6.2.1 Recommendation to the Egyptian Side

(1) Securement of budget allocation from central level

Since the Project started, budget for the Project, agreed in the R/D, has never been disbursed by the Egyptian government regardless of the efforts of the CPs team for preparing and submitting annual budget plan required. It has been a major obstacle against the smooth implementation of the Project. Towards the completion of the Project, the budget for conducting ISMAP activities should be secured at the central level to sustain the Project activities.

In this respect, it is recommended to negotiate with the Financial sector of the MALR HQs, as well as Ministry of Planning and Ministry of Finance.

(2) Budget allocation from the cooperative

According to the law (Law No. 204/2014), up to 5 percent (5 %) of cooperative surplus budget is utilized for training services for the farmers. In order to secure financial sustainability of the ISMAP activities, it is highly recommended for MALR and governorate offices to instruct all agriculture cooperatives to make use of the budget (In Assiut governorate, the budget for ToTs was allocated with the board members’ understandings and decisions).

(3) Establishment of ISMAP unit

Egyptian CPs have discussed how to continue the ISMAP activities after the completion of the Project without any support of Japan. After the series of discussions, they submitted a proposal for establishing the ISMAP Unit as a permanent implementation structure at both central and governorate levels. Terminal evaluation team strongly suggests MALR HQs to approve the proposal.

(4) Assignment of extension officers to the target villages

Through the interview in the villages, it is observed that no extension officer is assigned after the retirement of extension officers in some villages. Since they play an important role in introducing new cultivation techniques, giving advices about problems related to cultivation and raising small animals, and providing market information to villages, the recruitment of new officers or assignment of concurrently officers who cover multi-villages are, at least, recommended.

(5) Utilization of IT devices

IT devices such as smartphone are widely used in the rural area. IT devices can be utilized for market survey or information sharing and data collection. Promotion of extension services through IT devices should be taken into account.

(6) Collection of baseline data of surrounding villages

Post-Evaluation will be implemented three to five years after the termination of the Project. Data to verify the indicator of Overall Goal should be collected.

(7) Enhance efforts to promote gender mainstreaming

The outcome made by the Project shows that women in Upper Egypt have a great potential to contribute to the household economy as well as the livelihood improvement. It is recommended that the MALR further promotes gender mainstreaming at the central and district level to establish the gender responsive extension mechanisms and service delivery, which will further increase agriculture profitability and livelihood improvement.

5.2.2 Recommendation to Japanese side

(1) SHEP training program for the Middle East

The Project established ISMAP Approach based on the JICA's SHEP approach, and various knowledge, lessons learnt and good practices are accumulated through the implementation. Egypt is expected to play a leading role to expand JICA SHEP Approach in the Middle East and is suggested not only to expand ISMAP approach to small-scale farmers of all over the Egypt, but also to share the experiences with neighboring Arab countries. For attaining the purpose, JICA should consider formulating SHEP training program for the Middle East to share knowledge success stories, issues and challenges of ISMAP. This training program will also contribute to maintaining the motivation of Egyptian CPs to continue the ISMAP Approach in Egypt.

5.3. Lesson Learnt

(1) Success story

The Project has changed its strategy by focusing on obtaining more success stories of market-oriented agriculture based on the recommendations by Mid-term Review team. This change surely contributed to progress of the Project activities. Recognizing good examples of income increase, surrounding farmers are willing to follow the way. Therefore, agricultural extension with demonstration of success story is very effective in promoting SHEP Approach.

(2) Gender Mainstreaming activities should be carefully tailored within the local context

At the initial stage of the Project, gender mainstreaming activities have been referred to the Kenya SHEP approach which promoted the equal participation of men and women in the same sphere and activities. However, this approach did not work due to the presence of culture of gender segregation and strong patriarchal social norms in Upper Egypt. Gender analysis should be conducted in each context and carefully tailored gender mainstreaming activities should be implemented.

Gender norms and relations differ across time and space. It is important to carefully examine the local social context and conduct gender analysis to identify different social norms, barriers and opportunities for women and men at the initial stage of a project implementation so that effective gender mainstreaming activities which are tailored within the local context to be planned and implemented. In a society where gender segregation prevails, it is effective to implement women target activities.

(3) Importance of women extension officers

Female extension officers played important roles to facilitate the Project activities to increase capacities of women as well as their income in Upper Egypt. It is important to support female officers and female extension officers in supporting rural women particularly in a society where gender segregation prevails.