

Country Name	The Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Capacity Development Project	
United Republic of Tanzania	Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Capacity Development (RUWASA-CAD) Project Phase 2	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In order to cope with the limited access to safe water in rural areas, the Government of the United Republic of Tanzania prepared Water Sector Development Programme (WSDP) which was designed under the Sector Wide Approach to Planning (SWAp) in February 2007. WSDP was constituted by the four main components which included the “Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Programme” (RWSSP).</p> <p>In such context, the Government of Tanzania requested the Government of Japan technical cooperation for the “Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Capacity Development (RUWASA-CAD) Project” (Phase 1) in order to strengthen a system for implementation, operation and maintenance of the rural water supply.</p> <p>In order to disseminate the “Training Package” developed under the Phase 1 Project, RUWASA-CAD Project Phase 2 started in September 2011.</p>																					
Objectives of the Project	<p>[Phase 1] Through enhancing Ministry of Water and Irrigation (MoWI) capacity for managing capacity development programmes, developing a training system model for District Water and Sanitation Teams (DWST) in managing Rural Water Supply and Sanitation (RWSS) projects, enhancing capacity of Basin Water Offices (BWOs), Regional Water and Sanitation Teams (RWSTs) and others, the project aimed at enhancing capacities of the target Districts providing RWSS services, thereby contributing to improving the RWSS services.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: RWSS services in the target districts are improved. Project Purpose: Capacities of the target Districts providing RWSS services for rural communities are enhanced. <p>[Phase 2] Through revising Programme Implementation Manual (PIM) Annexes, and developing Capacity Development Implementation Guideline, the project aimed at enhancing the system of supporting Implementing Agencies’ (IA) Capacity Development (CD), thereby contributing to strengthening IA’s capacity to implementing RWSSP.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: The capacity of Implementing Agencies (IA’s) to implement RWSSP is strengthened. Project Purpose: The system of supporting IA’s Capacity Development is enhanced for proper implementation of RWSSP. 																					
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: [Phase 1] 22 districts in the Regions of Dar es Salaam, Coast, Lindi and Mtwara [Phase 2] Tanzania nationwide (excluding regions in Zanzibar) Main activities: [Phase 1] (1) Strengthening capacity of the Ministry of Water and Irrigation to manage capacity development, (2) developing a training system model, (3) developing capacities of BWOs and RWSTs and others [Phase 2] (1) Revision of PIM Annexes, (2) development of CD Implementation Guideline, and (3) conducting Training of Trainers (ToT) Inputs (to carry out above activities) [Phase 1] <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td>Tanzanian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 4 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 7 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 5 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Project office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: computer, printer, and vehicle</td> <td>3) Local cost: Allowance for counterparts and training participants and utility charges</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local expenses: general expenses, procurement of equipment and vehicles, printing, contract with local consultants, construction cost</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> <p>[Phase 2] <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td>Tanzanian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 10 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 15 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 5 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Project office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Computers, printers and air conditioners for the project office</td> <td>3) Local cost: Allowance for counterparts, electricity and water</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local expenses: Employment of local staff, transportation, local expenses, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </p> 		Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side	1) Experts: 4 persons	1) Staff allocated: 7 persons	2) Trainees received: 5 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office	3) Equipment: computer, printer, and vehicle	3) Local cost: Allowance for counterparts and training participants and utility charges	4) Local expenses: general expenses, procurement of equipment and vehicles, printing, contract with local consultants, construction cost		Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side	1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff allocated: 15 persons	2) Trainees received: 5 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office	3) Equipment: Computers, printers and air conditioners for the project office	3) Local cost: Allowance for counterparts, electricity and water	4) Local expenses: Employment of local staff, transportation, local expenses, etc.	
Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side																					
1) Experts: 4 persons	1) Staff allocated: 7 persons																					
2) Trainees received: 5 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office																					
3) Equipment: computer, printer, and vehicle	3) Local cost: Allowance for counterparts and training participants and utility charges																					
4) Local expenses: general expenses, procurement of equipment and vehicles, printing, contract with local consultants, construction cost																						
Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side																					
1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff allocated: 15 persons																					
2) Trainees received: 5 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office																					
3) Equipment: Computers, printers and air conditioners for the project office	3) Local cost: Allowance for counterparts, electricity and water																					
4) Local expenses: Employment of local staff, transportation, local expenses, etc.																						
Project Period	[Phase 1] September 2007-July 2010 [Phase 2] August 2011-July 2013, July 2014-May 2015	Project Cost [Phase 1] (ex-ante) 280 million yen, (actual) 430 million yen [Phase 2] (ex-ante) 340 million yen, (actual) 382 million yen																				
Implementing Agency	[Phase 1] Ministry of Water and Irrigation (MoWI, Restructured to be MoW on November 2010)																					

	[Phase 2] Ministry of Water (MoW)
Cooperation Agency in Japan	[Phase 1] EARTH SYSTEM SCIENCE CO., LTD. [Phase 2] EARTH SYSTEM SCIENCE CO., LTD., KOKUSAI KOGYO CO., LTD., JAPAN TECHNO CO., LTD.

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

As the ex-post evaluation was conducted for both Phase 1 and Phase 2 projects in parallel, verification of the Phase 1 Overall Goal using indicator 3 and 4 was not feasible because the data are limited data.

1 Relevance	
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Tanzania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policies of Tanzania. "Vision 2025", the basic policy of national development in Tanzania, advocates "access to safe water" as one of the goals for achieving a high standard of living for the people. Also, rural water supply has been given high priority in policy documents such as the "National Poverty Reduction Strategy (NSGRP)" (2005-2010), the "National Water Policy (NAWAPO)" (2002) in harmonization with NSGRP, and the Millennium Development Goals".</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Tanzania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion ></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development needs of Tanzania for rural water supply. Limited access to safe water in rural areas had been a problem in Tanzania. At the time of the Phase 2 project completion, MoW launched WSDP from 2007 to 2025, and WSDP phase II just started. There was high expectation among members of WSDP that the revised PIM would contribute to improve the WSDP implementation.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy to Tanzania. At the time of ex-ante evaluation of the Phase 1 project, one of the five priority areas set based on "Country Assistance Programme for Tanzania" (2000) and the policy dialogue between Tanzania and Japan in 2001 was "Improvement of living environment by basic infrastructure development". At the time of the ex-ante evaluation of the Phase 2 project, infrastructure was one of the priority areas under the "Country Assistance Program for Tanzania" (2008). Water Resources Management and Rural Water Supply were included in this category.</p> <p><Evaluation Result></p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.</p>	
2 Effectiveness/Impact	
<p>[Phase 1]</p> <p><Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion></p> <p>The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. Among the indicators, "DWSTs adopt selection procedures of candidate communities for the scoping survey based on the demand-responsive approach (DRA) in the promotion phase" (Indicator 1) was partially achieved while "DWSTs examine and make comments to progress reports and other output reports to be submitted by the Technical and Facilitation Service Providers within the period agreed." (Indicator 2), "DWSTs update information on water supply and sanitation conditions as well as operation and maintenance of existing water supply facilities in the district every year." (Indicator 3) and "DWSTs integrate the strategies and activity plans on water supply, sanitation and hygiene promotion for households and schools into DWSP and annual plan." (Indicator 4) were achieved.</p> <p><Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation></p> <p>The effects of the project have continued at Lindi Region. There have been 5 DWSTs and 1 Municipal Water and Sanitation Teams (MWST) and they have continuously carried out practices initiated under the project for strengthening capacity for RWSS services. On the other hand, there has been a need of capacity building to water users and also enhancing the capacity of community organizations to give them ability to properly manage of the facility. Information on other target Regions were not collected due to time and budget limitation to execute this ex-post evaluation.</p> <p><Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation></p> <p>The Overall Goal has not been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Although the coverage rate of water supply improved in the target Regions, it did not reach the target value of the indicator, mainly because of rapid population growth, decrease of borehole production because of over utilization, failure or deterioration in some of projects because of lack of operational knowledge and maintenance cost, limited water sources and others, even though the target year of overall goal was set in 2015. (indicator 1). Due to the lack of operational & maintenance knowledge among the community users, the percentage of water supply points working for more than 6 months a year did not reach the target either (indicator 2).</p> <p>[Phase 2]</p> <p><Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion></p> <p>The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion, as all indicators, namely "The improved PIM Annexes (RWSSP) are authorized by MoW for official use in WSDP." (indicator 1), "The update method of the improved PIM Annexes (RWSSP) is formulated in TWG-2.." (indicator 2) and "More than 80% of RWST, which participated in ToT training provided by the Project, formulates the annual CD plan for their LGAs in line with regional scale CD implementation procedure stipulated in CD implementation guideline" (indicator 3) were attained.</p> <p><Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation></p> <p>The effects of the project have continued after the project was completed. PIM Annexes, for which the project supported and which was approved by MoW for official use, have been updated after the project completion. Nationally, RWSTs which participated in ToT training under the project, have continued formulating annual CD plan in order to achieve a goal targeted in water supply projects. The Capacity Development Implementation Guideline, which was developed under the project, have been updated in order for Community Owned Water Supply Organizations (COWSOs) to follow on how to implement rural water supply projects. MoW has supported RWSTs to pass on the skills provided by ToT to Regional Water Engineers (RWEs) and use of Capacity Development in order to transfer knowledge to the users and COWSOs.</p>	

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been partially achieved. According to a questionnaire survey conducted by MoW, more than 80% of IAs implemented RWSP nationally, by referring to the improved PIM annexes (Indicator 1). The extent to which CD support is provided to IAs was not verified as no information on the nationwide status is obtained (Indicator 2).

[Phase 1 &2]

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impact on the natural environment by this project has been observed, and there has been no land acquisition and resettlement.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the Phase 1 and Phase 2 projects is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
[Phase 1] (Project Purpose) Capacities of the target Districts providing RWSS services for rural communities are enhanced.	Targets: DWSTs which practices the following actions in implementation of RWSSP reaches to 80% (18 districts) by July 2010.	Status of the achievement: partially achieved (Partially continued) (Project Completion)* - The number of DWSTs that carried out the practice was 9 out of 22 (40%). Although this was less than target figure, the rest of the project targeted districts were practicing DRA at least partially. (Ex-post evaluation)**
	Indicator 1: DWSTs adopt selection procedures of candidate communities for the scoping survey based on the demand-responsive approach (DRA) in the promotion phase	- There have been 5 DWSTs and 1 MWST in Lindi Region. They have used DRA.
	Indicator 2: DWSTs examine and make comments to progress reports and other output reports to be submitted by the Technical and Facilitation Service Providers within the period agreed.	Status of the achievement: achieved (Partially continued) - The number of DWSTs that carried out the practice was 20 out of 22 (90.9%). This is more than the target figure. (Ex-post evaluation) - On quarterly basis at Lindi Region
	Indicator 3: DWSTs update information on water supply and sanitation conditions as well as operation and maintenance of existing water supply facilities in the district every year.	Status of the achievement: achieved (Partially continued) (Project Completion) - The number of DWSTs that carried out the practice was 21 out of 22 (95.4%). This is more than targeted figure. (Ex-post evaluation) - On quarterly basis at Lindi Region
	Indicator 4: DWSTs integrate the strategies and activity plans on water supply, sanitation and hygiene promotion for households and schools into DWSP and annual plan.	Status of the achievement: achieved (Partially continued) (Project Completion) The number of DWSTs that carried out the practice was 19 (86.3%). This is more than targeted figure. (Ex-post evaluation) - The plans have been updated every year and its implementation plan have been updated on quarterly basis at Lindi Region.
[Phase 1] (Overall Goal) RWSS services in the target districts are improved.	Indicator 1: By the year of 2015, coverage rate of improved water supply increases in the rural part of the target districts from 57.8 % to 75.6%.	Status of achievement: Not achieved (Ex-post evaluation) Enhanced capacities of the target Districts providing RWSS services have helped the water coverage reach 68.9%, but not 75.6%, due to rapid population growth, decrease of borehole production because of over utilization, failure or deterioration in some of projects because of lack of operational knowledge and maintenance cost, limited water sources and others.
	Indicator 2: By the year of 2015, percentage of water supply points working for more than 6 months a year increases from 73% to 100% in the target districts.	Status of achievement: Achieved (Ex-post evaluation) The target was achieved (100%). Then due to lack of operational and maintenance knowledge among the community users, as well as overloading to some boreholes with hand pumps led to repair of equipment sometime (e.g. hand pumps installed at schools and hospitals).
	Indicator 3: By the year of 2015, number of legally registered Water User Entities (WUEs) increases compared to the present value in each target district.	Status of achievement: Not verified (see Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation)
	Indicator 4. By the year of 2015, people who have access to improved sanitation in the target districts increases from X% to Y%.	Status of achievement: Not verified (see Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation)

*At the project completion, the survey results were obtained from the questionnaire survey for monitoring.

**At the time of ex-post evaluation, among the 4 target Regions under the Phase 1 project, the evaluation team only collected information from Lindi Region, due to limited budget and time for executing this ex-post evaluation.

[Phase 2] (Project Purpose) The system of supporting IA's Capacity	Indicator 1: The improved PIM Annexes (RWSSP) are authorized by MoW for official use in WSDP.	Status of the achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) The improved PIM annex (English and Swahili) was approved and uploaded to MoW HP for official use by the mid of April 2015.
	Indicator 2: The update method of the improved	Status of the achievement: Achieved (Continued)

Development is enhanced for proper implementation of RWSSP.	PIM Annexes (RWSSP) is formulated in TWG-2.	(Project Completion) The proposal of PIM management structure was discussed and agreed in JSM. (Joint Supervision Mission; JSM is conducted semi-annually to review the progress of implementation of WSDP jointly by the Government of Tanzania and Development Partners). (Ex-post evaluation) PIM including Annexes has been updated during a quarterly report and send to MoW in order to improve rural water supply.
	Indicator 3: More than 80% of RWST, which participated in ToT training provided by the Project, formulates the annual CD plan for their LGAs in line with regional scale CD implementation procedure stipulated in CD implementation guideline	Status of the achievement: Achieved (Continued) (Project Completion) More than 80% of RWSTs prepared annual CD plan for their LGAs by the end of the project term. (Ex-post evaluation) Nationally, RWSTs have continued formulating annual CD plan in order to achieve a goal targeted in water supply projects.
(Overall Goal) The capacity of Implementing Agencies (IA's) to implement RWSSP is strengthened.	Indicator 1: The results of the questionnaire survey by AGM (Annual General Meeting) show that more than 80 % of IAs implement RWSP by referring improved PIM annex.	Status of Achievement: Achieved (Ex-post Evaluation) - The results of questionnaire survey by AGM shows that more than 80% of IAs implement RWSP by referring to improved PIM annex - MoW has conducted survey during AGM in order to improve or meet 85% average water required by the country to rural water supply to get safe water by 2025.
	Indicator 2: The CD support to IAs of RWSSP is provided to more than 80% of CD activities planned in line with regional scale CD implementation procedure stipulated CD implementation guideline.	Status of Achievement: Not verified (Ex-post Evaluation) - Total number of CD for COWSCOs in Coastal Region 2018/2019 is 100 which is updated cumulative each year. No information was obtained for the other regions.

Source : JICA documents and a questionnaire/interviews with Rural Water Supply Agency (RUWASA) and MoW.

3 Efficiency

The project cost for the Phase 1 significantly exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 154%) and the one for the Phase 2 slightly exceeded the Plan (the ratio against the plan: 112%). Although the project period for the Phase 1 was within the plan (the ratios against the plan: 97%), the ones for the Phase 2 project exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 128%), due to the change of the project design. Also, one of the factors the project cost exceeded the original plan was that the input from Tanzanian side planned to use the basket fund. The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the both projects is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The Government of Tanzania has been very keen on water supply and sanitation in rural areas, as stipulated in the “Water Supply and Sanitation Act No. 5” (February, 2019), the “Water Supply and Sanitation Act” (2009), the “National Water Policy” (July 2002) and others. The new “Water Supply and Sanitation Act No. 5” (February, 2019) stipulated to formulate Rural Water Supply Agency (RUWASA) who will be responsible of coverage of supply of clean and safe water in the rural areas of Tanzania mainland.

<Institutional Aspect>

It was only two months since RUWASA was established at the time of ex-post evaluation. Hence, the demarcation of roles and responsibilities, in terms of monitoring and updating PIM and supporting IA's CD for implementation of RWSSP, between Rural Water Supply Division of MoW and RUWASA has not been clear. Besides, MoW was still recruiting staff for RUWASA at the time of ex-post evaluation.

At the regional level, RWST at each region has two RWEs in average, however, the number of staff has been insufficient to undertake the duties for PIM and CD.

<Technical Aspect>

The situation at the time of ex-post evaluation was that most of the trained staff had moved to different offices or departments. They were transferred before establishment of RUWASA and no handing over of the project knowledge was done at all. In the course of forming RUWASA, MoW has been looking for fund both for project financing and capacity building for the new team, and has secured fund from Development Partners (DPs). Up to June 2019, all DWSTs got support from RWSTs. Following the formation of RUWASA, it was expected that RWSTs would be reformed again.

<Financial Aspect>

The government new financial year started from 1st July,2019 however, at the time of ex-post evaluation, ministries and other institutions had not received budget due to no disbursement by the Ministry of Finance. Because of the transition period, all past record have been secured at Regional Administrative Office (Registry department) then later on will be shared to RUWASA offices in the region.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, as there have been some problems in the institutional, technical and financial aspects, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.

.5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Phase 1 project achieved the Project Purpose at the time of completion. The extent to which the effects have continued was not verified as information on the target Regions other than Lindi was not collected. The Overall Goal of the Phase 1 project was partially achieved, as the coverage rate of water supply improved, though it did not reach the target. As for the Phase 2 project, the Project Purpose was achieved and the effects of the project have continued. The Overall Goal of the Phase 2 project has been partially achieved, as more than 80% of IAs implemented rural water service projects referring to the improved PIM annexes. As for the sustainability, there have been some problems in the institutional, technical and financial aspects. As for the efficiency, the project cost significantly exceeded the plan and the project period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- MoW is recommended to set aside budget for CD activities, and strengthen the number of staff and its skills, especially for timely supervision to check RWSS projects. RUWASA is recommended to carry out supervision of Regions (Districts, Wards and Villages), including site survey and conducting meetings and collecting necessary information to the operation and maintenance of RWSS projects.
- MoW is recommended to conduct capacity building of community organizations who did not receive the training during the project implementation to give them ability to properly management of the facility.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- At the Coastal Region, COWSOs have been maintaining facilities well. However, most of the water users were complaining about paying water fees and they needed water free. ToT under the project only targeted RWSTs to improve the WSDP implementation based on discussions on the request of Tanzanian side and priorities of the activities. It might be more effective to conduct capacity building to water users to raise awareness on the importance of water collection fee which helps O&M of the project facility.
- As for the efficiency, one of the reasons why the project cost exceeded the original plan was that the input from Tanzanian side planned to use the basket fund. However, the Tanzanian policy changed and the fund could not be used as planned. Although the input from counterparts is necessary to retain their ownership in the project, it is also important to consider the extent of the input and its certainty in consideration of that the input is realistic and not excessive expectation of the unstable input of the counterpart.



A woman pumping water at Kilangala Village in Lindi Region