Internal Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

	conducted by Senegal Office: December, 2020			
Country Name	Project on the Improvement of Educational Environment Phase I and II (Projet d'			
Republic of Seneg	Amélioration de l'Environnnement Soclaorie :PAES)			
I. Project Outline				
Background	Senegal aimed at the enrollment rate of primary education of 100% by 2010. Although the enrollment rate reached to 82.5% in the year of 2004/2005, the completion rate, the proportion of pupils completing the primary education without retention remained at around 50%. Issues of educational environment to hamper the completion rate varied by school and it was necessary to cope with those issues at school level. On the other hand, since the schools had limited resources, supports by parents and local communities were essential for improvement of educational environment. The school management committee (Comité de Gestion de l'École: CGE) system was introduced in the country for improvement of educational environment by the Presidential Decree in July 2002. However, there were schools without CGE or CGEs not functioning. Therefore, it was necessary to functionalize CGEs and to enhance support systems for CGEs, such as technical supports and monitoring by local education administrations.			
Objectives of the Project	 Through capacity development of CGE members, enhancement of support system for CGEs and dissemination system of the improved CGE model, the project aimed at establishment and dissemination of the improved CGE model in all the 14 regions, thereby contributing to improvement of school environment and reinforcement of access and quality of education. <phase i=""></phase> 1. Overall Goal: 1) Improvement of school environment through community participation, 2) Dissemination of new model of school management by functional CGE in other regions. 2. Project Purpose: A new model of school management by functional CGE is established and implemented. <phase ii=""></phase> 1. Overall Goal: 1) School environment and PDEF (10 Year Program of Education and Training) management system are improved by functional CGE, 2) Access and quality of education is reinforced. 2. Project Purpose: The model of functional CGE is stabilized and disseminated in all the regions. 			
Activities of the Project	 Project site: <phase i=""> Louga Region, <phase ii=""> All the 14 regions (Pilot regions: Fatick Region and Kaffrine Region)</phase></phase> Main activities: <phase i=""> i) Workshops and training for establishment of functional CGEs, ii) Trainings on planning of Voluntary Action Plan (Plan d'Action Volontariste: PAV) and CGE management for the CGE members, iii) Capacity enhancement of support system at regional level and workshops for promotion of CGEs, iv) Trainings on establishment of CGE and planning of PAV for school directors, teachers and CGE members, iii) National workshops for approval on the revised model of functional CGE and planning of dissemination of the revised CGE model and capacity enhancement of the dissemination system. </phase> Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side CPhase I> (Phase I>) (Phase I>) Departion cost: cost for consultant and project staff. (Phase II>) (Phase II>) (Phase II) Experts from Japan: 7 persons (Phase II>) (Phase II>) (Phase II) <			
Project Period	5) Operation cost: cost for project implementation <phase i=""> May, 2007 – May, 2010 <phase ii=""> September 2010 – August, 2015 (Extension: August 2014 – August 2015) September 2010 – September 2010 – August 2014 – August 2014 – August 2015</phase></phase>			
Implementing	<phase and="" i="" ii="" phase=""> Ministry of National Education (The Ministry of Education changed to the Ministry of National Education (The Ministry of Education changed to the Ministry of National Education (The Ministry of Education changed to the Ministry of National Education).</phase>			
Agency Cooperation Agency	National Education since 2012)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	<phase and="" i="" ii="" phase=""> None</phase>			

II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation >

[Verification of Overall Goal]

Since the Overall Goals for the Phase I can be covered by the Overall Goals for the Phase II, this ex-post evaluation integrally verified the achievement level of the Overall Goals for the two projects by using the verifiable indicators for the Overall Goals for the Phase II.

1)

[Continuation of the Project Effect]

For verifying continuation status of the project effects by the Phase I and Phase II, the indicators for the Project Purpose of the Phase II are used since the Phase I was implemented as a pilot basis in only one region (Louga) and the Overall Goal of the Phase I is dissemination of the functional CGE model. 1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Senegal at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with the development policies of the government of Senegal aiming at the primary education enrollment rate of 100% and prioritizing functionalization of management organizations in "the 10 Year Plan of Education and Training (Plan décennal d'éducation et de formation: PDEF)" (2000-2015) which policy priorities had not changed throughout the project periods. In addition, CGE has been institutionalized as management organization of PDEF by the "Declaration No. 2002-652" (2002).

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Senegal at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Senegal for improvement of school management and school environment by functional CGEs because of the limited dissemination of the functional CGEs model for improving school management. The development needs had not changed throughout the project periods.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA Policy to Senegal. One of two priority areas for the "Country Assistance Program for Senegal" (the draft version in 2007 and the final version in 2009) was "Improvement of living conditions of the rural poor" including improvement of basic services for the rural poor.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose of Phase II at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose for the Phase II was partially achieved. 8,285 out of total 9,328 schools (88.8%) in the country established CGEs in a democratic way, and CGEs were established by more than 80% of the schools in 13 regions except Dakar (Indicator 1). Three regions of Kaolack, Fatick and Kaffrine organized education forum and 100% of the commune in each region established UCGE in the three regions (Indicator 2). 4,028 out of total 8,285 CGEs (48.6%) in the country submitted PAV to the Education and Training Inspector Office (Inspection d'Education and de Formation: IEF) and only three regions of Diourbel, Fatick and Kaffrine achieved the target value of 80% of CGEs submitting PAV to IEF (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been continued. In 13 regions except Dakar¹, 98% of the schools established CGEs in 2019. CGEs has continued to submit their PAVs to IEFs since the project completion. The proportion of CGEs submitting their PAVs to IEF has improved to 65% since the project completion. On the other hand, there was no data available on the number of UCGEs established after the project completion because there has been no obligation for CGE to set up UCGEs and no follow-ups for them by the Ministry of Education. In terms of support for CGEs, each time inspectors carry out pedagogical supervision, they are dealing with issues related to the organization and functioning of the CGEs at the same time. In addition to this, the Ministry of Education, through the Directorate of General Administration and Equipment (Direction de l'Administration Générale et de l'Equipement: DAGE), has organized an annual mission to monitor and evaluate the subsidies allocated to schools. This monitoring and evaluation mission is also a means of support and follow up the CGEs and this mission produces a report that gives an overall situation. The support and follow up system are part of the inspectors' visits to schools and the activities have been carried out by the inspectors at IEF level for all the primary schools. However, the monitoring of the CGEs is not done at the regional level. The monitoring to strengthen the functioning of CGEs is the direct responsibility of IEFs. <Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal 1 has been partially achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. According to the monitoring report of CGEs by the Ministry of National Education, CGEs have contributed to improvement of school environment through implementation of small construction and rehabilitation works for school facilities including classrooms, kitchen canteens, blackboards in classrooms, and so on, which have been included in their PAV and financed with the community contributions. On the other hand, it was not clear whether CGEs had contributed to improvement of capability of teachers, initiatives of school directors and people's awareness for education. The Overall Goal 2 has been partially achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. The educational indicators to verify improvement of access and quality of primary education, such as the proportion of entrance age population entered in primary school (TBA), the numbers of students in the 1st grade, the repetition rate and the certification rate for primary education, were improved in more than 8 regions. For the period from 2015 to 2018, with the World Bank-funded Project for "the Improvement of Quality and Equity in Basic Education (PAQEEB)", the Ministry of Education initiated the implementation of Quality Improvement Contracts (Contrat d'Amélioration de la Qualité: CAQ) which essentially focused on issues of improving the quality of teaching and learning. However, this new initiative (CAO) has not been developed in all schools. Although there is no data on the number of CGEs that have implemented CAQs in their schools, a significant number of schools have begun to take action on education quality issues. On the other hand, the CGEs invested a lot in the aspect of accessibility to school through sensitization activities to ensure that parents enroll their children in school. This explains the evolution of the number of pupils enrolled in the first grade from 2015 to 2018. It is only in 2019 that the PAV take charge of activities related to quality with the organization of reinforcement courses and so on.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

¹ Since Dakar is divided into three academies (Rufisque department, Pikine department and Guédiawaye department, and Dakar department) by the Ministerial Order No.13508 issued in August 2013.

Some positive impacts by the project have been observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. The project has enabled some women to take on more responsibility in the management of the school as CGE members. There are women who hold treasurer and president positions in some schools. In addition, women are more interested in the education of their children, especially girls. Before the project, the allocation of the grant to the CGEs was done through the IEFs, now the allocation has been done directly to the school's account which is managed by the CGE. The direct allocation of the grant to the CGEs facilitate the implementation of PAVs.

No negative impact was observed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Pro	iect Purnose and	d Overall Goal
Achievement of 110	feet I uipose an	

A inc		Ject Purpose and Ov			
Aim	Indicators	Results			
(Project Purpose)	Indicator 1		vement: Achieved (Continued)		
<phase ii=""></phase>	80% of schools in all the regions	(Project Completio	-		
	l established CGE with members elected	- 88.8% of schools in the country established CGEs democratically.			
CGE is stabilized and	-		schools establishing CGEs by re	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
disseminated in all the	2	Level	Reg		
regions.		100%	Kaolack, Kédougou, Fatic, Ma		
		More than 90%	Kolda, Louga, Saint-Louis, So Ziguinchor, Kaffrine	èdhiou, Tambacounda,	
		More than 80%	Diourbel, Thiès		
		Less than 50%	Dakar		
		(Ex-post Evaluation)			
		 In 13 regions except Dakar, 7,926 out of 8,050 schools (98%) established CGEs. The 13 regions except Dakar reached 96-99% of schools with CGEs in 2019. 			
	Indicator 2	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Not verified)			
	70% of communes which has organized a	(Project Completion)			
	forum in all the regions establish UCGE			ck Kaffrine and Kaolack	
	with support of the Project.	 100% of communes established UCGE in Fatick, Kaffrine and Kaolack which had organized a forum. 			
(Ex-post Evaluation)					
		· •	No data available a there is no obligation for communes to set up UCGE		
	Indicator 3	and no specific follow-ups for CGEs by the Ministry of Education. Status of the Achievement: Not achieved (Achieved)			
	80% of the CGE submit PAV to UCGE and				
	IEF respectively.	- 48.6% of CGEs in the country submitted PAV to IEF.			
		- More than 80% of CGEs submitted PAV to UCGE in Diourbel, Fatick and			
		Kaffrine but the necessary trainings to set up UCGE were not delivered in			
		other 11 regions.			
		(Ex-post Evaluation)			
		- In the 13 regions except Dakar, 65% of CGEs have submitted their PAV to			
		IEF.			
(Overall Goal 1)	Indicator 1		nent: Partially achieved.		
School environment and	Improvement of school environment at	(Ex-post Evaluation	n)	has the Minister of National	
PDEF (10 Year Program	school level (infrastructure, furniture,	Education CGEs of	monitoring report of CGEs	of school environment through	
of Education and	textbook, school hours,	Education, CGEs contribute to the improvement of school environment through the implementation of the following activities: small constructions related to the			
Training) management	motivation/capability of teachers, initiative	repair of ceilings, enclosing walls, classrooms, doors, windows and even kitchen			
system are improved by	of school directors, people's awareness of		chools with school canteens, sin		
functional CGE	education, etc.)	kinds of activities are included in the PAV and are financed with the communicontribution. However, it was not clearly verified whether CGEs had contributed			
		to improvement of motivation/capability of teachers, initiative of schoo			
		directors, and people's awareness of education other than physical improvement			
			ture and equipment.		
(Overall Goal 2)	Indicator 2: Improvement of educational		nent: Partially achieved		
Access and quality of	indicators (the gross enrollment rate (TBS)*	[Educational Indica			
education is reinforced.	for primary education, the gross access rate		Regions with	Regions without	
	(TBA)**, the number of students in 1st		improvement/achievement	improvement	
	grade, the repetition rate, the completion	TDC	to the sufficient level		
	rate, the certification rate for primary	TBS	7 regions: Dakar, Thiès,	7 regions: Louga, Fatick,	
	education)		Diourbel, Saint-Louis,	Kaffrine, Kaolack,	
	*TDS, the mon-stire -f1 1		Kolda, Kédougou,	Matam, Tambacounda,	
	*TBS: the proportion of school age		Ziguinchor	Sèdhiou	
	population enrolled in primary school **TBA: the proportion of entrance age	TBA	10 regions: Fatick, Dakar,	4 regions: Louga,	
	population entered in primary school.		Thiès, Diourbel,	Kaffrine, Kaolack, Matam	
			Saint-Louis, Tambacounda, Kolda,		
<u> </u>	1	11	rumouvounua, ryona,	1	

	Kédougou, Ziguinchor, Sèdhiou	
No. of students in 1 st grade	12 regions: Louga, Fatick, Kaffrine, Thiès, Diourbel,	2 regions: Dakar, Sèdhiou
1 grude	Kaolack, Saint-Louis,	
	Matam, Tambacounda,	
	Kolda, Kédougou,	
-	Ziguinchor	
Repetition rate*	8 regions, Lourga, Fatick,	6 regions: Kaffrine, Thiès,
(Data not	Dakar, Saint-Louis,	Diourbel, Kaolack,
available for	Matam, Kolda,	Tambacounda, Ziguinchor
2018)	Kédougou, Sèdhiou	
Completion rate	6 regions: Dakar,	8 regions: Lourga, Fatick,
	Diourbel, Saint-Louis,	Kaffrine, Thiès, Kaolack,
	Kolda, Kédougou,	Matam, Tambacounda,
	Sèdhiou	Ziguinchor
Certification rate	All the 14 regions	None
for primary		
education		

Source : Terminal Evaluation Reports (Phase I and II), Information provided by Directorate of Planning and Education Reform (Direction de la Planification et de la Réforme de l'Education: DPRE), Monitoring Report of CGEs by the Ministry of National Education, Questionnaire survey to 5 regions of Louga, Fatick, Saint Louis, Kaolack and Kaffrine

3 Efficiency

The total project cost and the total project period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 138% and 114%, respectively. The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair. 4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The decentralized management policy has been still maintained. The proof is that all the major projects implemented by the Ministry of National Education have articulated about community involvement. Dissemination of the functional CGE has been well supported by the Sectorial Policy Letter developed in 2013 which gave the main orientations of the educational policy and the sectoral program called "Program for Improving the Quality, Equity and Transparency in Education and Training (Programme d'Amélioration dela Qualité, del'Equité et de la Transparence en Education et Formation: PAQUET-EF" (2018-2030) as the operationalization framework. One of the components of PAQUET-EF remains "participatory and inclusive governance". Through the implementation of PAQEEB, the generalization of the establishment of functional CGE has been insured. Currently, as part of several projects (Project for the Improvement of Learning of Mathematics at the Elemental School/Projet d'Amélioration des Apprentissages des Mathématiques à l'Elémentaire-PAAME, (supported by JICA), Reading For All/Lecture Pour Tous-LPT (supported by USAID), Girls' Education Improvement Project/Projet d'Amélioration des Fille, Plus-PAE by Italian Cooperation, etc.) the community involvement policy is strengthened through the improvement of the PAV which has been internalized in the system and used by projects funded by other partners. Community involvement is an important part of many donor-funded projects such as "Reading for All" (LPT), like PAEF Plus financed by and so on. As part of the support provided to the CGEs, emphasis has been placed on planning with the PAV, its implementation and evaluation. At the school level, this will result in the establishment of the functional CGEs. <Institutional Aspect>

The diffusion of the model is maintained, all the public elementary schools of Senegal are required to have a CGE to be able to benefit from the funds allocated by the Government and the PAQEEB grants which affect all the elementary schools. In addition, as part of the implementation of the PAQEEB, the new CGEs of the new schools are trained in implementation and functionalization. In the same vein, each year IEFs organize capacity building training for CGEs, especially in financial management. However, there is no specific staff in charge of the CGEs in the Ministry of National Education.

At the level of the IEFs, it is the inspectors themselves who deal with issues relating to CGEs The IEF is divided into Districts. In each District there are a number of schools supervised by an inspector. The inspectors use their pedagogical supervision to monitor the functioning of the CGEs. However, even if there is one inspector in charge of a District, field supervision is done in teams of several inspectors. This is an internal organization at the level of each IEF. <Technical Aspect>

In fact, every year, the Directorate in charge of Elementary Education (DEE) and the Directorate of General Administration and Equipment (DAGE) organize, within the framework of the PAQEEB, meetings with the holding of pools of sharing and reinforcement of inspectors' ability for supervising CGEs. Although the Offices of Academic Inspection (IAs) and IEFs have sustained sufficient skills/knowledge to provide follow-ups and technical support for CGEs but not to deliver CGE trainings.

In general, the trained actors have kept their basic skills, especially with the implementation of the PAQEEB where the operation of the CGEs is annually evaluated. In this same process, the PAQEEB under the aegis of the World Bank and the MEN conducted an evaluation of the operation of the CGEs with a view to making recommendations in the direction of improving the functions of the CGEs and UCGEs. The DEE has been implementing its annual action plan works to integrate the recommendations into a strategy document which will ultimately be addressed to the capacity building trainings of the members of the CGEs.

The manuals prepared by the projects have been well used. There is now a document called "Manuel de procedures de gestion des fonds alloués par l'Etat aux écoles élémentaires" (Manual for procedures of management of fund allocated by the government to elementary school), the first part of which is a review of the guides developed by the Phase II, except for the management of financial and material resources. This is understandable because the resource management guide produced by the Phase II only took into account the resources collected by the community (endogenous resources). At the time of the Phase II, the government of Senegal had not yet started allocating funds to the CGEs. This manual of procedures that integrates the implementation guide and the planning guide is used by all actors as it is the reference document.

<Financial Aspect>

For each year, in the implementation of the PAQEEB, an annual budget for the training of CGE members has been transferred to IEFs. The amount of budget depends on size of IEF and the number of schools covered by IEF. For the improvement plan, the DEE has been working to produce a document that incorporates recommendations from the CGE Performance Assessment Report to strengthen the capacity of members of management bodies to improve their functioning. As part of the PAQEEB, the budget allocated to the activities every year and even other projects that have resources to strengthen the functional of CGEs. On the other hand, there is no budget in Senegal exclusively for the implementation of PAV. However, there is an operating budget allocated by the government of Senegal and the development partners to schools, the use of which, in principle, goes to the development and implementation of PAV. Besides that, municipalities can create specific budget lines for the functional CGEs.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, there has been some problems in institutional and technical aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal 1 and partially achieved the Overall Goal 2 through the dissemination of the model of functional CGEs to improve school environments and accessibility and quality of primary education. As for sustainability, there have been some issues on the institutional and technical aspects while the educational policies have endorsed the activities to promote establishment of CGEs at primary schools. As for efficiency, the total project cost and the total project period exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

(For the Ministry of National Education)

- The Ministry of National Education needs to set up and institutionalize a monitoring system. In fact, it is important to create a directorate or division specifically in charge of monitoring CGEs at the national and regional levels (IA and IEF).
- In order to better ensure the sustainability of project results, it is important to teach the model for setting up and operating the CGEs during initial teacher training. at the level of regional centers for teacher training called the Regional Training Center for Education Staff (Centre Régional de Formation des Personnels de l'Education: CRFPE). The Ministry may make arrangements to include the training module on CGEs in the pre-service teacher training programme with a view to making the practices sustainable.
- The Ministry of National Education must put in place a mechanism to facilitate access to data related to the CGE, especially with respect to the budget.

(For IEFs)

- The IEFs need plan and implement follow-up and support the CGEs in terms of renewal, the setting up of commissions, and the regular holding of general assemblies and meetings.
- Instead of taking advantage of the pedagogical supervisions to deal at the same time with issues related to the organization and operation of the CGEs, inspectors should plan missions specifically reserved for the CGEs. This will encourage the renewal of the CGE office's bodies and monitor their functioning to ensure the sustainability of the CGE model.

(For CGEs)

• The CGEs must increasingly take into consideration the quality of education in their PAV in order to contribute to the improvement of student performance. Beyond activities related to promoting access to education, activities and initiatives that contribute to the improvement of student performance must be at the forefront, for example, the organization of reinforcement courses for weak students, sensitization of parents for the follow-up of students at home. Contributing to the improvement of student performance is a challenge to be taken up by the CGEs.

• It is necessary that a regular renewal of the (enlarged) bureau of the CGE be carried out every two years through a real General Assembly in order to avoid any weariness or lethargy harmful to the good functioning of the management body.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- There are assets to be consolidated within the framework of Community involvement. Certain practices that have been in place for 5 years need to be revisited at the time of ex-post evaluation (the modality of capacity building for CGE actors, etc.) in order to draw useful lessons learned for future projects. As the Ministry of National Education should provide their leadership in the implementation of any activities in the education sector and have responsibility for taking initiatives to improve performance and for conducting evaluation of their practices. While it is up to the Ministry of National Education to take initiatives and evaluate everything that has been done with a view to deriving all good practices. it is preferable for JICA support to such initiative from the implementation stage to the ex-post evaluation stage. For example, JICA can support for a study that provides information on good practices in terms of the functionality of CGEs or difficulties and challenges, as well as formulation of strong recommendation that enables to help strengthen community participation in the management of education in order to improve quality of education.
- -Senegal should organize exchange visits with other countries such as Niger, which is well ahead of the education decentralization policy, and Madagascar, where communities are taking charge of issues related to quality of education in order to further improve the CGE model based on the good practices in other countries. JICA needs to support Senegal to realize such "knowledge sharing" among the countries with experiences of CGEs because JICA has a lot of experience in the field of community involvement for a better management of education.



Kitchen for school canteen built by a CGE

AGA. FHICKHNA. FHICKHNA. The de melden Ide Viele A & Viele A & Viele 2510/2 rolaire LOUGA THIOKHINA, PLAN NACTION A THIOKHINA, VOLANTARISTE Activity & Realized Actives Responsellas Thetics grand do Pade CGE Patrice Anne Pett du CGE tes clas Filt 119 GE tilladi 13 CGE 30/02/13. E.P. E.P 10/02/15 E.P strefto. E.P. 30/11/10 THIOKHNA Late

Action Plan of CGE