

Country Name	<b>Project for Strengthening Capacity of Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and Academy of Public Administration in Training of Public Leaders and Civil Servants<sup>1</sup></b>
Socialist Republic of Viet Nam	

## I. Project Outline

Background	<p>Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and Public Administration (HCMA; currently Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics (HCMA)) had a mandate to manage training program for public leaders and civil servants of director level and higher in the whole country. After the merger with National Academy of Public Administration (NAPA) in May 2007, HCMA was responsible for training of both politics and state administration and expected to be the leading training institution to implement education and training of both theories and practical skills. However, many of the trainings provided by HCMA had traditionally been theoretical in nature. It was difficult for trainees to apply the knowledge acquired in the trainings to the practice in their work. In addition, to develop capacity of strategic leaders for the 12th tenure of the Communist Party of Viet Nam (2016-2020), HCMA was assigned to implement the Training Program for Potential National Leaders, who were candidates for Central Party Committee members and would be the top leaders of central and local governments responsible for making public policy. To successfully implement this first ever training program, HCMA was expected to improve practicality of its lectures and introduce national policy issues to this important Training Program.</p>				
Objectives of the Project	<p>The project aimed to enhance framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA in Viet Nam through strengthening capacity of HCMA to implement and manage the Training Program for Potential National Leaders<sup>2</sup> and capacity of NAPA to formulate Master of Public Policy Program (MPP Program), thereby enhancing capacity of public leaders and civil servants after participating in Capacity Development Programs conducted by HCMA and NAPA.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall Goal: Capacity of public leaders and civil servants is enhanced after participating in Capacity Development Programs conducted by HCMA and NAPA.</li> <li>Project Purpose: Framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA is enhanced.</li> </ol>				
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project Site: Hanoi.</li> <li>Main Activities: Strengthening capacity of HCMA to implement and manage Training Program for Potential National Leaders and strengthening capacity of NAPA to formulate the MPP program.</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Experts: (long-term) 2 persons, (short-term) 55 persons</li> <li>Trainees Received: 187 persons</li> <li>Local cost</li> </ol> </td> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> <p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff Allocated: 57 persons</li> <li>Building and facilities: Office spaces for JICA experts in HCMA and NAPA and the seminar rooms</li> <li>Local cost</li> </ol> </td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Experts: (long-term) 2 persons, (short-term) 55 persons</li> <li>Trainees Received: 187 persons</li> <li>Local cost</li> </ol>	<p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff Allocated: 57 persons</li> <li>Building and facilities: Office spaces for JICA experts in HCMA and NAPA and the seminar rooms</li> <li>Local cost</li> </ol>
<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Experts: (long-term) 2 persons, (short-term) 55 persons</li> <li>Trainees Received: 187 persons</li> <li>Local cost</li> </ol>	<p>Vietnamese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff Allocated: 57 persons</li> <li>Building and facilities: Office spaces for JICA experts in HCMA and NAPA and the seminar rooms</li> <li>Local cost</li> </ol>				
Project Period	May 2013-May 2016	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 277 million yen, (actual) 366 million yen		
Implementing Agency	<p>Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics (HCMA) and National Academy of Public Administration (NAPA)  *HCMA and NAPA were separated again due to transfer of NAPA to Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA) in December 2013.</p>				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	<p>National Personnel Agency, Japan Association for Public Human Resources Development, University of Tokyo, Waseda University, National Institute of Population and Social Security Research, and National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies (GRIPS).</p>				

## II. Result of the Evaluation

### <Constraints on Evaluation>

- The questionnaire survey for Overall Goal Indicator 1 (More than 75% participants of the Policy Research Modules respond in the follow-up survey that they have applied what they have learned through Policy Research Module Program.) could not be completed: most the ex-participants, who were very high-ranking officials, were very busy for preparation of the Party Congress in their organizations (this is the most important event of the Vietnam's Communist Party in every five years) so that the response rate was extremely low. Thus, qualitative information was collected and used in making evaluation judgment together with the existing information on the utilization rate of the modules conducted in Japan at the time of terminal evaluation.

### <Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

- Continuation status of the Project Purpose Indicator 1 ("Satisfaction ratings for the Policy Research Module (reach average more than 85%)" was verified under the Overall Goal Indicator 1 ("More than 75% participants of the Policy Research Modules respond in the follow-up survey that they

<sup>1</sup> The project name was originally "Project for Strengthening Capacity of Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and Public Administration in Training of Public Leaders and Civil Servants". It was changed to the current one in order to reflect organizational change of Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics and Public Administration (HCMA) in December 2013 and January 2014: National Academy of Public Administration (NAPA) was transferred from HCMA to Ministry of Home Affairs (MOHA) and the name of HCMA was changed to Ho Chi Minh National Academy of Politics.

<sup>2</sup> Training Program for Potential National Leaders or Strategic Leadership Training (SLT) was training for senior officials conducted by HCMA under the direction of Government of Viet Nam from 2013 to 2015. SLT was composed of several modules, and the project supported one of them i.e. Policy Research Modules. Policy Research Modules consisted of training by JICA experts in Viet Nam and training in Japan.

have applied what they have learned through Policy Research Module Program”). because Policy Research Modules were completed in 2015, and their effects were designed to be verified under the Overall Goal Indicator 1.

- The target year for the Overall Goal was set to be 2019 as the Overall Goal is defined as “the positive impacts to be realized in about three years after the Project” in the English version of the terminal evaluation summary of the project.
- Overall Goal Indicator 2 (“Satisfaction ratings for NAPA’s MPP program by the participants of the program will reach more than 75%”): “Satisfaction ratings for NAPA’s MPP program” was defined as “Satisfaction ratings for the ten subjects prepared with the assistance from the project in NAPA’s MPP program” as there are other subjects offered by the program. The satisfaction level in the latest school year completed (October 2018-October 2019) was subject to evaluation.

## 1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Viet Nam at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the project was consistent with the Socio-Economic Development Strategy (SEDS) (2011-2020), which highlighted improvement of “capacity and effectiveness of state administration.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Viet Nam at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the project was consistent with the needs of Viet Nam for enhancement of framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA as shown in “Background”.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the project was consistent with the Country Assistance Policy for Viet Nam (2012), which included “Good Governance” in the three prioritized areas, and emphasized to support for strengthening administration, recognizing the needs to improve the capacity for policy formulation and implementation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose had been achieved by the time of project completion. The average satisfaction rating of the 6 Policy Research Modules of the Strategic Leader Training (SLT) by the participants was 88% for the modules in Viet Nam and 98% for the modules in Japan, which exceeded the target figure of 85% (Indicator 1). The average satisfaction rating for the training management courses conducted at all 4 regional academies of HCMA, using the draft textbooks compiled by the HCMA lecturers, was 85%, which achieved the target figure of 85% (Indicator 2). The syllabuses and materials for the 10 subjects prepared with the assistance from the project were utilized for NAPA’s MPP program, which was open in December 2015 (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects partially continued to the time of ex-post evaluation. After the project completion, HCMA conducted 8 training management courses to 63 provincial political schools nation-wide and training institutes of central ministries in 8 regions using the textbooks compiled through the project. Since these courses covered almost all institutions under its supervision, HCMA, from 2019, conducted the training management courses at the request of political schools and under its annual plan. In 2020, HCMA planned to organize 2 training management courses for the staff in its headquarters (HQ), thematic institutes of HCMA and the regional academies. HCMA was considering using the textbooks supported by the project. If it was to be used, the textbooks must be updated as some contents had become outdated. HCMA also continued training cycle management of the training management courses. Although the satisfaction ratings were not consolidated for all the courses<sup>3</sup>, given the available data, they were 91% on average. At NAPA, the syllabuses and materials for the 10 subjects prepared through the project were continuously used in the MPP Program until the school year 2018/19, but, not in 2019/20 as NAPA was unable to enroll the new students for 2019/20 mainly due to competition with similar master’s programs at NAPA and HCMA<sup>4</sup>. It is noted that NAPA was making efforts to increase enrolment by sending information of the program to all central ministries, local governments and businesses as well as visiting some provinces to promote the program so that it could reopen the MPP Program for 2020/21.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was partially achieved in the target year (2019) because one of the indicators was partially achieved and the other one was achieved. The ratio of the ex-participants of the Policy Research Modules of the SLT, who responded in the follow-up survey that they had applied what they had learned, could not be calculated as the response rate of the follow-up questionnaire survey conducted for the ex-post evaluation was extremely low. To the knowledge of HCMA, many of the ex-participants of the Policy Research Modules had applied what they had learned to their work and various policies were formulated by them, including policies of the central ministries and local agencies such as Ministry of Transport, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, Ministry of Public Security, etc. For example, the policy on regional collaboration and coordination in infrastructure development (Ministry of Transport) was formulated by the ex-participant using the ideas and experiences of the Policy Research Modules. It should be also noted that, at the time of terminal evaluation, over 90% of the ex-participants of the modules conducted in Japan already applied what they learned to their work in some way (Indicator 1). The average satisfaction rating for the NAPA’s MPP program by the participants was 99% according to the results of the questionnaire survey to the current MPP students conducted by NAPA for the ex-post evaluation, which exceeded the target figure of 75% (Indicator 2).

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Various other positive impacts were observed. The training methodology and training management model introduced by the project were adopted by the current SLT (i.e. Strategic Potential Leaders Training Program) of HCMA (2019-2020). Lecture notes provided under the project were compiled by HCMA and published as a reference book entitled “Policy Experience of Japan”, which was distributed to the

<sup>3</sup> According to HCMA, they distributed the questionnaires to the participants and checked all answer sheets but mainly paid attention to comments of participants in order to improve the next training courses.

<sup>4</sup> According to NAPA, Master of Public Management (MPM) program of NAPA, which was launched before MPP, had a very good reputation. Moreover, MPM was a broader discipline and offers more opportunity for application, so potential participants tended to choose MPM rather than MPP. HCMA also offered an MPP program, which had some advantages over the NAPA’s one thanks to the special status of HCMA. This made the NAPA’s program less competitive and attractive to potential target group as compared with the HCMA’s program.

participants of the above-mentioned SLT and the concerned central ministries and local agencies for their reference. The contents of the improved training management course were integrated into a 3-month training program for political schools of Lao People's Democratic Republic conducted annually at HCMA from 2018. HCMA maintained the human network between Vietnamese and Japanese high-rank officials created through the SLT under the project by (i) organizing reunion meetings and receptions together with Embassy of Japan and JICA Viet Nam Office and (ii) inviting the ex-participants and Japanese partners such as JICA, Embassy of Japan, Japan External Trade Organization, etc. to meetings, seminars, and other events. NAPA used the materials and lecturers of the 10 subjects of the MPP program developed under the project for a short-term training program targeting high-rank public officials conducted 30-50 times annually. NAPA also formulated a short-term training program targeting young public officials using the expertise and materials of the project, which was yet to open because of the Coronavirus Disease (COVID)-19 pandemic. In addition, NAPA lecturers whose capacity had been improved during the project implementation participated in compilation of case studies for training and refresher training in public policy of NAPA. In 2020, NAPA published these case studies with the active participation of these lecturers. There was a synergetic effect between this project and the subsequent technical cooperation of JICA (i.e. Advisor on training management to HCMA (2016-2019), which helped HCMA adjust and disseminate the training management methods improved under the project to provincial political schools, as a unified training management approach from HCMA HQ to provincial political schools (central to local level) was established. Meanwhile, negative impacts were not observed.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																																				
(Project Purpose) Framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA is enhanced.	1. Satisfaction ratings for the Policy Research Module reach average more than 85%.	Status of the Achievement: achieved (Project Completion) -The average satisfaction rating by the participants was 88% for the modules conducted in Viet Nam, and 98% for the modules in Japan.																																				
	2. Satisfaction ratings for the training management courses delivered using the draft textbooks compiled by the HCMA lecturers, reach average more than 85%.	Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued) (Project Completion) -The average satisfaction rating for all of 4 training management courses, delivered using the draft textbooks compiled by the HCMA lectures, was 85%. (Ex-post Evaluation) -Although the satisfaction ratings were not consolidated for all the courses, the average satisfaction rating for 4 out of 8 training management courses delivered in 2017 and 2018, using the textbooks compiled through the project, was 91%.																																				
	3. Syllabuses and materials for nine subjects prepared with the assistance from the Project are utilized for NAPA's MPP program.	Status of the Achievement: achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) -The syllabuses and materials for the 10 subjects prepared through the project were utilized for the NAPA's MPP program. (Ex-post Evaluation) -The syllabuses and materials for the 10 subjects were utilized for the NAPA's MPP program until the school year 2018/2019. They were not utilized in 2019/20 as NAPA was unable to enroll new students mainly due to competition with similar master's programs. -NAPA was aiming to reopen the MPP program for 2020/21 and was making effort to promote the program to the potential target group.																																				
(Overall Goal) Capacity of public leaders and civil servants is enhanced after participating in Capacity Development Programs conducted by HCMA and NAPA.	1. More than 75% participants of the Policy Research Modules respond in the follow-up survey that they have applied what they have learned through Policy Research Module Program.	(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved -At the time of terminal evaluation, over 90% of the ex-participants of the modules in Japan replied that they had applied what they had for their work in some way in the questionnaire survey. -Application status at the time of ex-post evaluation could not be verified quantitatively. The questionnaire was distributed to 108 out of 511 ex-participants by HCMA <sup>5</sup> , but only one replied (the answer was that he/she applied what he/she had learned). -According to Director General of International Cooperation Department of HCMA, many of the ex-participants of the modules conducted in Viet Nam and Japan had utilized what they had learned and many policies were formulated by them.																																				
	2. Satisfaction ratings for NAPA's MPP program by the participants of the program will reach more than 75%.	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved 1.Number of total MPP students (current students): 17 2.Number of students to which questionnaire was distributed: 17 3.Number of students who responded to the questionnaire: 14																																				
		<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Subject</th> <th>No. of respondents who completed the subject in 2018/19 =(A)</th> <th>No. of respondents who answered they are satisfied with the subject=(B)</th> <th>Ratio (%) =(B/A)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1) Public Policy Formulation</td> <td>14</td> <td>14</td> <td>100</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Public Policy and Politics</td> <td>14</td> <td>14</td> <td>100</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Public Policy Process Management</td> <td>13</td> <td>13</td> <td>100</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Stakeholder Analysis</td> <td>13</td> <td>13</td> <td>100</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5) Economics in Public Policy</td> <td>12</td> <td>11</td> <td>92</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6) Public Policy and Law</td> <td>14</td> <td>14</td> <td>100</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7) Philosophy in Public Policy</td> <td>14</td> <td>13</td> <td>93</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8) Scenario Planning</td> <td>14</td> <td>14</td> <td>100</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Subject	No. of respondents who completed the subject in 2018/19 =(A)	No. of respondents who answered they are satisfied with the subject=(B)	Ratio (%) =(B/A)	1) Public Policy Formulation	14	14	100	2) Public Policy and Politics	14	14	100	3) Public Policy Process Management	13	13	100	4) Stakeholder Analysis	13	13	100	5) Economics in Public Policy	12	11	92	6) Public Policy and Law	14	14	100	7) Philosophy in Public Policy	14	13	93	8) Scenario Planning	14	14	100
Subject	No. of respondents who completed the subject in 2018/19 =(A)	No. of respondents who answered they are satisfied with the subject=(B)	Ratio (%) =(B/A)																																			
1) Public Policy Formulation	14	14	100																																			
2) Public Policy and Politics	14	14	100																																			
3) Public Policy Process Management	13	13	100																																			
4) Stakeholder Analysis	13	13	100																																			
5) Economics in Public Policy	12	11	92																																			
6) Public Policy and Law	14	14	100																																			
7) Philosophy in Public Policy	14	13	93																																			
8) Scenario Planning	14	14	100																																			

<sup>5</sup> The questionnaire was sent out to the ex-participants whose contact number HCMA had.

	9) Public Policy Evaluation	14	14	100
	10) Cost-benefit Analysis	14	14	100
	Average			99

Source: Terminal Evaluation Report; internal documents of JICA; questionnaire and interview survey to HCMA and NAPA; questionnaire survey to 108 out of 511 ex-participants of the Policy Research Modules; and questionnaire survey to all of 17 current students of the MPP program.

### 3 Efficiency

While the project period was within the plan, the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 100% and 132% respectively). The Outputs of the project were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

The SEDS (2011-2020) mentioned in “Relevance” and the Five-Year Socio-Economic Development Plan (SEDP) (2016-2020), which set forth establishment of “modern, professional, disciplined, dynamic and effective public administration”, were effective.

#### <Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

At HCMA, Training Management Department was responsible for training management of training of political leaders and civil servants, including training management courses. There were about 120 staff (around 7% of total staff) in charge of training management in total at HCMA HQ and the regional academies. At NAPA, Training Management Division of Department of Postgraduate Studies was in charge of promotion and organization of the MPP program, to which 6 staff members were allocated. In addition, Center for Examination and Training Quality Assurance at NAPA conducted activities for monitoring and evaluation of the training programs of NAPA, including the MPP program. According to NAPA, evaluation and quality assurance mechanism was functioning, but it was yet to be effective due to lack of criteria for quantitative and reliable evaluation. Both HCMA and NAPA confirmed that the necessary number of staff was allocated and no problem associated with shortage of staff was observed.

#### <Technical Aspect>

HCMA maintained the technical capacity to promote the improved training management by organizing training management conference at least once a year for staff in charge of training management of HCMA HQ and regional academies. The training management textbooks compiled though the project were widely utilized as stated in “Effectiveness/Impact”; however, it was not updated based on the feedback of the training participants. NAPA also sustained the technical capacity to implement the MPP program by regularly organizing internal training courses and workshops/seminar to strengthen capacity of their lecturers.

#### <Financial Aspect>

HCMA basically secured the budget to continue the improved training management courses at its HQ. It secured the budget to disseminate the improved training management courses to almost all of the training institutions under its umbrella in 2017 and 2018, which was partly supported by the succeeding technical cooperation of JICA. HCMA would need to secure additional financial support in the future for implementation of refresher courses at the training institutions under its umbrella. NAPA continuously secured necessary budget from MOHA to promote the MPP program developed under the project. MOHA also approved the scheme on development of syllabus and training materials of 5 master programs (including MPP,) and the doctoral program of public management of NAPA for the period of 2018-2020 with total amount of VND 8 billion (roughly USD 340,000).

#### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of institutional/organizational aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose of enhancement of framework to promote capacity development of public leaders and civil servants in HCMA and NAPA. The effects of the project partially continued (i.e. the syllabuses and materials for the 10 subjects developed under the project were not used for the NAPA’s MPP program in 2019/20 and it was not yet certain if NAPA could open MPP program for 2020/21) and the Overall Goal of enhancement of capacity of public leaders and civil servants is enhanced after participating in Capacity Development Programs conducted by HCMA and NAPA was partially achieved (i.e. the ex-participants of the Policy Research Modules applied what they had learned in their work but quantitative information on the application rate was not available). Regarding the sustainability, slight problems were observed in terms of the institutional /organizational aspects (i.e. NAPA was yet to establish the criteria for quantitative and reliable evaluation of its training program, including the MPP program) but no problems were observed in terms of the policy, technical and financial aspects. As for the efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- It is recommended that HCMA (training of trainer group or Training Management Department) update the training management textbooks based on feedback of participants of the recent training management courses by the time HCMA organizes 2 training courses on training management under its annual plan for 2020/21 so that the textbooks can be continuously used.
- It is recommended that NAPA make great efforts to promote and advertise its MPP program to not only public officials and civil servants but also other target group and make the MPP program more competitive so that the syllabuses and materials of the 10 subjects prepared though the project will be continuously used.
- It is recommended that NAPA make great efforts to improve the evaluation mechanism of MPP program with quantitative and reliable criteria so that MPP program’s quality will be improved in more systematic manner and the program will become more competitive.

### Lessons Learned for JICA:

- NAPA was unable to enroll students in the MPP program for the school year 2019/20 mainly due to competition with the existing similar master’s programs of NAPA and HCMA. During project formulation process, analysis of similar master programs of NAPA and other training institutions could have been made to identify possible risks and consider the counter measurement in advance with the Japanese project team and NAPA.



Reunion of SLT Training Ex-participants



Group Discussion Section of Training of Trainers for Provincial Political Schools