

Country Name	<b>The Project for Capacity Development on Transportation Planning and Database Management in the Republic of the Philippines</b>
Republic of the Philippines	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	The acceleration of economic activities and the concentration of population in Metro Manila and other urban areas in the Philippines caused serious social problems, such as traffic congestion, traffic accidents, and deterioration of the living environment. Planning of integrated public transportation network was, therefore, crucial in tackling not only these problems but also global warming issues. However, the Department of Transportation and Communication (DOTC) separately managed air, rail, and sea transportation and the relevant databases required for a comprehensive national transport planning were also managed by sub-sectors without sufficient coordination among related agencies.												
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through the development of a transportation database, preparation of public transportation network plan and its implementation strategies in the target area, and coordination among related agencies for public transportation planning for Metro Manila, the project aimed at improving public transportation planning for Metro Manila spearheaded by DOTC, thereby contributing to preparing a public transportation plan for Metro Manila by DOTC.<sup>1</sup></p> <p>Note: preparing a public transportation plan for Metro Manila denotes consideration, preparation and suggestion of a public transportation plan for strategic corridors in relation to important transportation issues in Metro Manila based on an analysis of a database developed by the project (target 2-3 years)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Overall Goal: Public transportation plan for Metro Manila is prepared by DOTC.</li><li>Project Purpose: to improve public transportation planning for Metro Manila, including coordination among relevant agencies, spearheaded by DOTC.</li></ol>												
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Project Site: Metro Manila</li><li>Main Activities: 1) Trainings to staff of DOTC and other transportation-related agencies/institutions on transportation database, public transportation planning and update of transportation database, 2) Development of a public transportation network plan and its implementation strategies in the target area, 3) Preparation of recommendations based on findings of the working groups on issues of inter-organizational coordination, etc.</li><li>Inputs (to carry out above activities)<table><tr><td>Japanese Side</td><td>Philippine Side</td></tr><tr><td>1) Experts: 11 persons</td><td>1. Staff allocated: 31 persons</td></tr><tr><td>2) Training in Japan: 25 persons</td><td>2. Land and facilities: project office in DOTC</td></tr><tr><td>3) Equipment: traffic analysis software, desktop computers, Arc GIS, a projector, etc.</td><td>3. Local expenses: costs for traffic survey and office equipment</td></tr><tr><td>4) Local expenses: cost for project activities</td><td></td></tr></table></li></ol>			Japanese Side	Philippine Side	1) Experts: 11 persons	1. Staff allocated: 31 persons	2) Training in Japan: 25 persons	2. Land and facilities: project office in DOTC	3) Equipment: traffic analysis software, desktop computers, Arc GIS, a projector, etc.	3. Local expenses: costs for traffic survey and office equipment	4) Local expenses: cost for project activities	
Japanese Side	Philippine Side												
1) Experts: 11 persons	1. Staff allocated: 31 persons												
2) Training in Japan: 25 persons	2. Land and facilities: project office in DOTC												
3) Equipment: traffic analysis software, desktop computers, Arc GIS, a projector, etc.	3. Local expenses: costs for traffic survey and office equipment												
4) Local expenses: cost for project activities													
Project Period	September 2011 – December 2015 (Extension: September 2014 – December 2015)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 280 million yen, (actual) 283 million yen										
Implementing Agency	The Department of Transportation and Communication (DOTC was reorganized to the Department of Transportation (DOTr) in June 2016.)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	ALMEC Corporation Oriental Consultants Co., Ltd.												

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

1 Relevance
<p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of the Philippines at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the Philippines' development policy of "The Philippine Development Plan" (2011-2016) aiming at "inclusive growth" through "massive investment on infrastructure", "high transparent and responsive government", human development" and "creation of employment" at the time of ex-ante evaluation and at the time of project completion.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of the Philippine at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion &gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the Philippines' development needs of development of an integrated database on air, rail, and sea transportation for solid national transportation planning in coordination with related agencies.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with "The Country Assistance Program for the Republic of the Philippines" (2008) positioning "sustainable economic growth for creation of employment opportunities", including enhancement of a policy implementation capacity as well as development of infrastructure in Metro Manila, as one of the three prioritized areas.</p> <p>&lt;Evaluation Result&gt;</p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact
<p>&lt;Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion&gt;</p> <p>The project was achieved by the time of project completion. Through the project, a transportation database named MUCEP database was developed as an update version of the Metro Manila Urban Transportation Integration Study (MMUTIS) database. Two requests to use</p>

the MUCEP database were already raised and approved in July 2015. The Database Management Manual was also prepared in November 2015. Furthermore, through trainings and pilot activities, capacity of counterpart study members from DOTC and other transportation-related agencies/institutions on transportation database, public transportation planning and update of transportation database was enhanced.

#### <Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been partially continued since the project completion. The management system for the MUCEP has been sustained through DOTr's issuance of Department Order No. 2017-003 which provides for the guidelines related to requests for information / access to the MUCEP database. The said Guidelines stipulate the requirements and conditions for the access and use of the database. It has already been shared to different stakeholders such as government agencies, funding institutions, consultancy firms, academic institutions, etc. On the other hand, it should be noted that the database have yet to be updated since the project completion due to low prioritization of updating the database and lack of dedicated personnel.

#### <Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. According to DOTr, the MUCEP database developed by the project is continuously utilized by a wide range of organizations such as DOTr itself, the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA), other national government agencies, consultancy firms, and academic communities. Also, several public transportation plans for Metro Manila were prepared by using the database, including DOTr's "Manila Bay Corridor Mass Transit Pre-Feasibility Study" (2017) and NEDA's "Follow-up Survey on Road Map for Transport Infrastructure Development for GCR" (2017) (Indicator 1 and 2).

#### <Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Two positive impacts of the project were confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. Sex-disaggregated data and other gender-related information are included in the MUCEP database, which has largely contributed to the improvement of transportation planning and the formulation of transportation plans in order to respond to gender requirements. Furthermore, the MUCEP database has been utilized to measure the reduction of CO<sup>2</sup> emission by transportation projects to verify the Philippines' NDC<sup>1</sup>. No other positive or negative impacts of the project were confirmed.

#### <Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) To improve public transportation planning for Metro Manila, including coordination among relevant agencies, spearheaded by DOTr.	1. The management system for the new transportation database is established by 2014.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Partially Continued) (Project Completion) • The management system for the new transportation database was established by the time of project completion. (Ex-post Evaluation) • The management system for the transportation database has been sustained but the database has yet to be updated after the project completion.
(Overall Goal) Public transportation plan for Metro Manila is prepared by DOTr.	1. Prepared public transportation plan for Metro Manila based on an analysis of the new transportation database.  2. Utilization of the new transportation database.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved • Several public transportation plans for Metro Manila were prepared based on an analysis of the MUCEP database as follows. ➢ DOTr "Manila Bay Corridor Mass Transit Pre-Feasibility Study" (2017) ➢ DOTr "Feasibility Studies on Rail, Public Transport, Greenways, Port and Airport Projects throughout the Philippines" (2019-Present) ➢ DOTr "Point-to-Point Route Planning" (2016-2018) ➢ NEDA "Follow-up Survey on Road Map for Transport Infrastructure Development for GCR" (2017) ➢ DOTr "Conduct of the Metro Manila Comprehensive Public Transport Evaluation Study" (2017) ➢ Land Transportation Franchising and Regulatory Board "Route Rationalization Study for the MUCEP Area" (2019-Present) • Other organizations such as consultancy firms and academic communities have also used the database for their projects/research.

Source : Terminal Evaluation Report, Project Completion Report, Interview and questionnaire to DOTr

### 3 Efficiency

The project cost and period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 101% and 144%, respectively). The main reason for the delay for the project period was because a DOTC-funded household interview survey was also delayed by 15 months. The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

"The Philippine Development Plan" (2017-2022) emphasizes the importance of the transportation sector in facilitating the movement of people, goods and services in support of the performance of other productive sectors and in the provision of equitable access to basic services. As the project aimed to improve public transportation planning for Metro Manila, it has been supported by the national policy.

#### <Institutional Aspect>

There were major changes in the institutional structure for public transportation planning for Metro Manila targeted by the project. First of all, DOTC, which was an implementing agency during the project, was reorganized to DOTr in June 2016 after the project completion. Additionally, decentralization of responsibility for the transport planning was implemented. As a result, local government units have been tasked to craft their own local transportation plans, and DOTr has played a role in providing a national policy direction for the plans,

<sup>1</sup> Nationally Determined Contribution is a goal to reduce greenhouse gas emissions set by each country taking into account its domestic circumstances at 21th Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Convention on Climate Change held in Paris in December 2015.

managing the MUCEP database, and facilitating coordination with related agencies for efficient and effective public transportation planning. However, it should be noted that the Transport Planning Unit (TPU), the main unit responsible for the project, was dissolved after the project and the staff assigned to the TPU during the project was reassigned to other units while keeping some of their responsibilities in the TPU. Due to this, the staff has only spontaneously fulfilled their responsibilities on an ad hoc basis, and there is no specific unit focused on public transportation planning for Metro Manila targeted by the project. Yet, the public transportation planning has been done to some extent, taking into account that the transportation database has been managed even though not updated and the Overall Goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. The situation is expected to continue.

#### <Technical Aspect>

The staff of DOTr has sustained the necessary knowledge and skills to perform their roles through their tasks such as preparing and evaluating of terms of reference for transport development plans even though there are no internal trainings or programs. To complement their knowledge and skills, a comprehensive course on transport is planned to be provided under financial support by the Asian Development Bank (ADB).

The manuals prepared by the project (manuals on traffic survey, manual on demand forecasting, manuals on policy formulation, etc.) are continuously utilized by DOTr, the Department of Public Works and Highways, and other government agencies.

#### <Financial Aspect>

There is no specific budget for planning and implementation of public transportation plans for Metro Manila. The necessary budget for the planning and implementation has been allocated from the whole budget for implementation of programs/projects in the transportation sector. The budget has been provided by the Government of the Philippines almost every year after the project (the data on 2016 was not available). Considering that the management system for the transportation database has been managed even though not updated and the Overall Goal has been achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation, the necessary budget has been secured to some extent.

Budget of DOTr for programs/projects in a transportation sector  
(Unit: Philippine Peso)

2017	2018	2019
7,221,000	433,677,652	886,778,000

#### <Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose aiming for the improvement of public transportation planning for Metro Manila, including coordination among relevant agencies, spearheaded by the DOTr and the Overall Goal aiming for the preparation of public transportation plan for Metro Manila by the DOTr. As for sustainability, even though the project effects have been sustained and the Overall Goal has been achieved due to the efforts by the staff trained by the project, there is no specific unit directly involved in public transportation planning for Metro Manila, and there are no internal trainings or programs to sustain the staff's knowledge and skills. As for efficiency, the project cost and period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- Regular updating of the transport database has not been sustained as there is no established dedicated unit/staff to assume the responsibilities for managing and updating the database. In order to address this situation, it is better for DOTr to decide to establish a dedicated unit with clear and focused responsibilities on transportation database management to ensure that the database (including the knowledge, skills, systems and technologies derived from it) remain relevant to the Philippines' transport planning in the future.

#### Lessons Learned for JICA:

- The project included sex-disaggregated data and other gender-related information in the MUCEP database, which largely contributed to the improvement of transportation planning and the formulation of transportation plans in order to respond to gender requirements in the country. Such data and information are very basic information to transportation planning and plans. Therefore, it is better for other similar/future projects to develop a transportation database integrating such perspectives.
- Changes in the organizational structure of an implementing agency might impact the sustainability of projects such as those which introduces institutional changes. In this project, institutional change was made through the establishment of TPU in 2014 as one way to ensure the sustainability of the project particularly the updating of the MUCEP database developed by the project. However, TPU was affected by the change in organizational structure implemented by DOTr in 2016. In this regard, continued communication with counterparts even after project completion leads JICA to be informed of the developments in a timely manner and possibly make representations to the implementing agency about the sustainability concerns.



Meeting between the Consultants and Counterparts were held



A Training on the use of CUBE software is conducted for the counterparts