

Country Name	Strengthening Human Resources Development System of co-medicals in Cambodia
Kingdom of Cambodia	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Cambodia, the medical and health care system was underdeveloped throughout the country under the influence of civil war, and the country faced many challenges relating to the medical personnel such as absolute shortage of medical workers, underdevelopment of basic national system including the medical law and the national examination for registration system.</p> <p>Under the above circumstances, a technical cooperation project in the field of Co-medical education system was started as "Project for Human Resources Development for Co-Medicals" (2003-2010) by JICA. The project contributed to develop regulations on the "school approval criteria" and "guidelines for approved schools" for co-medicals (Nurse, Laboratory technician, Physiotherapy and Radiology) with short refresher courses for school teachers in Cambodia. However, some issues still remained, i.e. lack of systematic mechanism for capacity building of teaching staff, insufficient regulations for controlling the quality of health professionals, and difficulties in harmonization and alignment among partners on pre-service and in-service training needs.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through drafting Nursing and Midwifery Regulations and improving quality of nursing/midwifery teachers, the project aimed at improving the educational basis for quality co-medicals (mainly nursing/midwifery human resources), thereby contributing to production of quality co-medicals.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Quality co-medicals are produced through the human resource development system Project Purpose: The educational basis for quality co-medicals (mainly nursing/midwifery human resources) is improved by enhancement of HRDD management capacity 										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Cambodia nationwide Main activities: (i) drafting Nursing and Midwifery Regulations and (ii) improving quality of nursing/midwifery teachers through dispatching nurses and teachers to Bachelor of Science in Nursing (BSN) bridging course at Saint Louis College (SLC) in Thailand. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Cambodian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 34 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 9 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 6 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Office space within MOH, meeting room, office furniture, electricity, printer, security, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: PC, Anti-virus software, power supply stabilizer, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Cambodian Side	1) Experts: 34 persons	1) Staff allocated: 9 persons	2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space within MOH, meeting room, office furniture, electricity, printer, security, etc.	3) Equipment: PC, Anti-virus software, power supply stabilizer, etc.	
Japanese Side	Cambodian Side										
1) Experts: 34 persons	1) Staff allocated: 9 persons										
2) Trainees received: 6 persons	2) Land and facilities: Office space within MOH, meeting room, office furniture, electricity, printer, security, etc.										
3) Equipment: PC, Anti-virus software, power supply stabilizer, etc.											
Project Period	June 2010-June 2015	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 380 million yen, (actual) 262 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Human Resources Development Department (HRDD), Ministry of Health (MOH) National Maternal and Child Health Center (NMCHC)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	National Center for Global Health and Medicine										

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance	<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Cambodia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with Cambodia's development policies of "the National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP)" (2006-2010 and 2014-2018) and, "the Health Strategic Plan" (2003-2007 and 2008-2015) emphasizing the importance of capacity building and human resource development in the health sector for improving health services.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Cambodia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion ></p> <p>The project was consistent with development needs of Cambodia for improving the educational basis for quality co-medicals as described in "Background" at the time of ex-ante evaluation. These needs had continued at the time of ex-post evaluation. Furthermore, the requirement from ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) to comply the mutual recognition arrangement has been acknowledged. As a result, this project approach to urgently develop a National Licensing System has been relevant to the development needs of Cambodia at the time of ex-post evaluation.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with "the Country Assistance Program for Cambodia" (2002) putting priority on strengthening the provision of services of basic human needs (BHN) including the basic medical service as an assistance for socially vulnerable people.</p> <p><Evaluation Result></p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact	<p><Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion></p> <p>The Project Purpose was partially achieved by the time of project completion. As the Law on Health Professionals was not enacted during the project period, the National Nursing Licensing System was not started at the project completion (Indicator 1). On the other hand,</p>

the reports from the medical schools were summarized and reported by HRDD/MOH in the Annual Health Sector Review (Indicator 2). The reports of returned teachers from the Bachelor Bridging Course¹ were shared among nursing/midwifery teachers in Cambodia through the workshops (Indicator 3). The number of classes taught by the graduates from the Bachelor Bridging Course in Thailand increased (Indicator 4). Through the sampling survey, more than half of the Saint Louis College (SLC) graduates interviewed during the terminal evaluation reported that they either increased the number of subjects and/or increased the number of teaching hours.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been partially continued after the project completion. The Law on Regulation of Health Practitioners was enacted by the National Assembly on November 22, 2016, and the national registration and licensing system for health professionals was introduced in Cambodia. However, the draft of Joint Prakas on School Accreditation has remained in draft due to the fact that there have been concerns over the process of administration procedure for opening new health educational training program and challenge of financial support for its implementation. The school accreditation is a system to assure the qualification of medical school graduates, and it is one of the essential legal frameworks to support functionalizing the national registration and licensing system for health professionals. In this regard, it is considered that the national registration and licensing system is still incomplete at the time of ex-post evaluation. On the other hand, the Annual Health Sector Review has been conducted by HRDD continuously. As described in the technical aspect of sustainability, the SLC graduates have held seminars and workshops every year to share their technical knowledge and skills learned through their experience studying in Thailand. Although the number of classes taught by the SLC graduates was not confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation, SLC graduates have taught for five bachelor or associate degree courses in the teaching institutions. Among these five courses, the Bachelor of Science in Midwifery (BSM) and the Bachelor of Nursing-Midwifery (BNM) were upgraded in 2016 with the contribution and lectureship by SLC graduates.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. The number of certified nurses/midwives under the new system increased by more than twice from 8,280 in 2016 to 19,429 in 2018 (Indicator 1). In addition, the number of graduates of the public medical schools such as University of Health Science (UHS) and regional training centers who had studied the academic course of Associate Degree in Nursing (ADN) increased constantly from 613 in 2016 to 628 in 2017 and 734 in 2018. While, the number of graduates of the public medical schools who had studied the academic course of Associate Degree in Midwifery (ADM) were 675 in 2016, 497 in 2017, and 511 in 2018.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No other positive or negative impacts of the project were confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) The educational basis for quality co-medicals (mainly nursing/midwifery human resources) is improved by enhancement of HRDD management capacity.	Indicator 1 The National Nursing Licensing System (registration-licensing) is started.	<p><u>Status of the achievement: not achieved (Partially achieved)</u></p> <p>(Project completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Law on Health Professionals was prepared and submitted to MOH by a law firm hired by MOH just before the end of the project. However, this law was not enacted by the project completion, therefore, the National Nursing Licensing System was not started. <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Law on Regulation of Health Practitioners was enacted by the National Assembly on November 22, 2016 based on the draft sub-decree on nursing regulation. All five health professional councils ^(Note), including the Cambodian Council of Nurses started the national registration and licensing system within 12 months as obliged duty following enactment of the law in 2016. The national registration and licensing system using the online platform was established based on the condition and criteria set up by the Cambodian Council of Nurses with support of the United State Agency for International Development (USAID). The Government of Cambodia decided to authorize the Ministry of Health to control technical aspects of health educational training. However, the draft of Joint Prakas on School Accreditation has remained in draft due to the fact that there have been concerns over the process of administration procedure for opening new health educational training program and challenge of financial support once the Joint Prakas is endorsed. <p>(Note) The five councils of doctor, nurse, midwife, pharmacist, dentist are mandated to operationalize registration and licensing for respective health professions. They are public administration institutions with self-autonomy.</p>
	Indicator 2 Reports from the schools are summarized and reported by HRDD in the Annual Health Sector	<p><u>Status of the achievement: achieved (continued)</u></p> <p>(Project completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The reports were submitted by the public medical schools and some of private medical schools and reported in the Annual Health Sector Review by HRDD.

¹ The Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) signed the Mutual Recognition Arrangement (MRA) in 2015 as part of its free trade policy. The MRA aims to (i) facilitate the movement of professionals within the ASEAN region, (ii) exchange and share information on regulations and qualifications among member countries, (iii) adopt best practices, and (iv) provide opportunities for capacity development and training and education for professionals. In this circumstance, this project conducted a dispatch of Cambodian nurses and teachers to BSN bridging course in Thailand as an example of cooperation among ASEAN member countries to harmonize education and qualification systems in the field of nursing.

	Review.	(Ex-post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Annual Health Sector Review has been conducted by HRDD continuously. 																																																														
	Indicator 3 The reports of returned teachers from the Bachelor Bridging Course are shared among nursing/ midwifery teachers in Cambodia.	<u>Status of the achievement: achieved (continued)</u> (Project completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The two workshops were organized in January and May 2015 for debriefing from the graduates of Bachelor Bridging Course and their reports were shared among stakeholders. (Ex-post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The SLC graduates have held seminars and workshops every year. 																																																														
	Indicator 4 The number of classes taught by the graduates from the Bachelor Bridging Course in Thailand is increased.	<u>Status of the achievement: achieved (continued)</u> (Project completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All of the SLC graduates successfully completed their bridging course and returned to school to teach or be involved in management and/or coordination of training. Therefore, the number of classes taught by Bachelor holders is increased. Through the sampling survey, more than half of SLC graduates interviewed during the terminal evaluation reported that they teach either increased number of subjects and/or increased number of teaching hours (both from teaching institutions and hospitals). In addition, all of SLC graduates were promoted to higher positions. (Ex-post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Although the number of classes taught by the SLC graduates at the time of ex-post evaluation was not confirmed, their teaching subjects and teaching hours were increased upon their return from Thailand. SLC graduates teach for five bachelor or associate degree courses in the teaching institutions. Among these five courses, the Bachelor of Science in Midwifery (BSM) and the Bachelor of Nursing-Midwifery (BNM) were upgraded in 2016 with the contribution and leadership by SLC graduates. Syllabus of all subjects including clinical practice syllabus were developed and available at public health training institutions. <u>Academic courses taught by SLC graduates</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Associate Degree in Nursing (ADN) Associate Degree in Midwifery (ADM) Bachelor of Science in Nursing (BSN) Bachelor of Science in Midwifery (BSM) Bachelor of Nursing-Midwifery (BNM) (Students study ADN for 3 Years and continue Midwifery specialty for 1 year) 																																																														
(Overall Goal) Quality co-medicals are produced through the human resource development system	Indicator 1 Number of certified nurses/ midwives under the new system	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved No. of certified nurses/midwives under the new National Nursing Licensing System <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2"></th> <th>Before</th> <th colspan="2">After</th> </tr> <tr> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>No. of certified nurses</td> <td>3,680</td> <td>12,461</td> <td>13,041</td> </tr> <tr> <td>No. of certified midwives</td> <td>4,600</td> <td>6,015</td> <td>6,388</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>8,280</td> <td>18,476</td> <td>19,429</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> Source: Health Professional Councils, Cambodia, USAID ASSIST Project Performance Monitoring Report, Nov 2018		Before	After		2016	2017	2018	No. of certified nurses	3,680	12,461	13,041	No. of certified midwives	4,600	6,015	6,388	Total	8,280	18,476	19,429																																											
	Before	After																																																														
	2016	2017	2018																																																													
No. of certified nurses	3,680	12,461	13,041																																																													
No. of certified midwives	4,600	6,015	6,388																																																													
Total	8,280	18,476	19,429																																																													
	Supplemental information Number of graduates of the public medical schools who studied nursing/ midwifery	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved 1) No. of graduates who studied ADN course <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2"></th> <th>Before</th> <th colspan="2">After</th> </tr> <tr> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>University of Health Science (UHS)</td> <td>192</td> <td>230</td> <td>149</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham</td> <td>93</td> <td>105</td> <td>224</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Battambang</td> <td>137</td> <td>130</td> <td>130</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Kampot</td> <td>119</td> <td>109</td> <td>139</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Stung Treng</td> <td>72</td> <td>54</td> <td>92</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>613</td> <td>628</td> <td>734</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> Source: Annual Health Progress Report 2016, 2017, 2018 2) No. of graduates who studied ADM course <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2"></th> <th>Before</th> <th colspan="2">After</th> </tr> <tr> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>University of Health Science (UHS)</td> <td>207</td> <td>163</td> <td>99</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham</td> <td>102</td> <td>113</td> <td>157</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Battambang</td> <td>142</td> <td>103</td> <td>101</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Kampot</td> <td>133</td> <td>100</td> <td>99</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regional Training Center in Stung Treng</td> <td>91</td> <td>18</td> <td>55</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>675</td> <td>497</td> <td>511</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> Source: Annual Health Progress Report 2016, 2017, 2018 Note: It should be noted that the number of entrance students are varied year by year. And the number of students passing national exit exam are also varied in this		Before	After		2016	2017	2018	University of Health Science (UHS)	192	230	149	Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham	93	105	224	Regional Training Center in Battambang	137	130	130	Regional Training Center in Kampot	119	109	139	Regional Training Center in Stung Treng	72	54	92	Total	613	628	734		Before	After		2016	2017	2018	University of Health Science (UHS)	207	163	99	Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham	102	113	157	Regional Training Center in Battambang	142	103	101	Regional Training Center in Kampot	133	100	99	Regional Training Center in Stung Treng	91	18	55	Total	675	497	511
	Before	After																																																														
	2016	2017	2018																																																													
University of Health Science (UHS)	192	230	149																																																													
Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham	93	105	224																																																													
Regional Training Center in Battambang	137	130	130																																																													
Regional Training Center in Kampot	119	109	139																																																													
Regional Training Center in Stung Treng	72	54	92																																																													
Total	613	628	734																																																													
	Before	After																																																														
	2016	2017	2018																																																													
University of Health Science (UHS)	207	163	99																																																													
Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham	102	113	157																																																													
Regional Training Center in Battambang	142	103	101																																																													
Regional Training Center in Kampot	133	100	99																																																													
Regional Training Center in Stung Treng	91	18	55																																																													
Total	675	497	511																																																													

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and project period are within the plan (69% and 100% against plan respectively), and the outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The Human resource development of co-medicals under the National Nursing Licensing System has been prioritized in the existing health sector policies in Cambodia such as “the Health Strategic Plan III” (2016-2020) and “the Health Workforce Development Plan” (2016-2020).

<Institutional Aspect>

There has not been any change in the institutional structure for human resources development system of co-medicals in Cambodia. The Human Resources Development Department (HRDD), MOH is responsible for policy planning for human resource development of health workers, formulation of training master plan and program, and registration and certification of health workers. Under MOH, there are public educational schools and institutions for medical field in Cambodia such as the University of Health Science (UHS) and the 4 Regional Training Center in Kg. Cham, Battambang, Kampot, and Stung Treng. Following the enactment of Law on Regulation for Health Practitioners, the health professional councils including the Cambodian Council of Nurses (CCN) and the Cambodian Midwives Council (CMC) have been in charge of establishment of necessary umbrella legal framework to operationalize registration and licensing system. Upon return from Thailand, majority of 32 SLC graduates (27 nurses, 5 midwives) have been promoted to responsible positions in both teaching and health service management at their respective workplaces, and they have been serving continuously.

<Technical Aspect>

The SLC graduates have shared and disseminated their technical knowledge and skills to other teachers, nursing and midwifery staffs and students in the respective schools and medical institutions through seminars and workshops every year. They have contributed to developing the syllabus of nursing and midwifery science related subjects including clinical practice for the public health training institutions. On the other hand, there has been a challenge in regular monitoring of quality of health education due to insufficient monitoring tools, lack of technical capacity and financial constraints to functionalize the HRD Database System necessary for the above monitoring activities.

<Financial Aspect>

The registration and licensing system of health professionals has been mandated under the authority of health professional councils. However, the health professional councils have faced limitation in financing its operation costs by themselves. There is no national budget allocation to the councils due to its basically autonomous institutional structure, and weak financial foundations with little external financial supports to sustain the operation. Sending teachers and preceptors, who hold Associate Degree, to the academic programs of Bachelor in Nursing and Midwifery Science at the overseas health educational institutions is critical in order to upgrade their educational levels and expertise in their respective fields. Although there is limitation of national budget for meeting this demand, opening of academic programs for Bachelor in Nursing and Midwifery Science are becoming widely available in the country. In this respect, financial contributions from development partners have been required.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project partially achieved the Project Purpose and archived the Overall Goal to produce quality co-medicals through the improvement of human resource development system for health workers. In terms of sustainability, no major problems have been observed in the policy and institutional aspects, but there is a concern about a regular monitoring of quality of health education by HRDD/MOH due to insufficient operation of the HRD Database System as well as a weak financial foundation of the health professional councils.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned**Recommendations for Implementing Agency:**

- As there is an uncertainty in budget planning to continue capacity development of teachers and preceptors for co-medical professionals, it is recommended that MOH develop clear strategic direction with secured budget plan on strengthening technical capacity of core teachers and staffs in the area of nursing and midwifery profession.
- The Joint Prakas on School Accreditation required for implementation of the National Nursing Licensing System in Cambodia is one of the important legal frameworks for strengthening the standard quality of health educational institutions. Therefore, in order to obtain the approval of the Joint Prakas on School Accreditation as soon as possible, it is recommended that MOH continue to make their efforts to cope with challenges such as how to regulate administration procedure for opening new health educational training program and how to secure necessary financial sources for implementation of the system.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- Upon their return from Thailand, the core team of SLC graduates demonstrated a meaningful contribution to improve quality of education through sharing their knowledge and experience in public platforms as well as lectureship and health service management for betterment of nursing and midwifery field in particular. Therefore, an approach of capacity development focusing on the capacity of core nursing/midwifery teachers and preceptors, who are playing key role in training, lectureship, and clinical practice management, through dispatching to overseas higher educational schools for obtaining a degree in respective subjects and fields could be a good reference to explore for subsequence planning of JICA project on strengthening quality nursing and midwifery education.



Annual Nursing Conference by SLC Graduates



Compilation of Legal Frameworks for Health Sector