

Country Name	Project for Capacity Development for Local Government Training Phase 2
United Republic of Tanzania	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>Capacity building of local government staff in Tanzania had been under responsibility of each local government. On the other hand, the central government had been responsible to build an effective national training system that enables to provide appropriate training to meet local needs.</p> <p>Under those circumstances, the Prime Minister's Office-Regional Administration and Local Governance (PMO-RALG, currently President's Office, Regional Administration Local Government (PO-RALG) and JICA jointly implemented the "Capacity Development for Local Government Training" project. Based on the training strategy formulated in this project, most of the authority and budget for training management was transferred to the Local Government Training Institute (LGTI) under the umbrella of PO-RALG, which was newly appointed as the "Lead Training Institution" (LTI). By strengthening that newly established functions, it was needed to create an environment where training could be implemented more effectively.</p>														
Objectives of the Project	<p>Though strengthening LGTI's coordination capacity, strengthening capacity of LGTI on organizing existing/new practical training and others, the project aimed at establishing an effective Local Government Authority (LGA) training framework, thereby contributing to providing quality training by LGAs to their staff.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: LGAs provide quality training (long-term and short-term) to its staffs. Project Purpose: Effective LGA training provision framework is established. 														
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Dodoma Main activities: (i) strengthening function of working group for implementation of training strategy, (ii) strengthening of LGTI's coordination capacity, and (iii) strengthening capacity of LGTI on organizing existing/new practical training and others, Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td colspan="2">Tanzanian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 6 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 18 persons</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Equipment: PCs, scanners, projectors, vehicle</td> <td>2) Facilities: Project office</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Local Operational Cost: general operating cost, cost for local consultant, staff salary, travel expenses, etc.</td> <td>3) Local Operational Cost: Allowance, per diem, training expenses, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side		1) Experts: 6 persons	1) Staff allocated: 18 persons		2) Equipment: PCs, scanners, projectors, vehicle	2) Facilities: Project office		3) Local Operational Cost: general operating cost, cost for local consultant, staff salary, travel expenses, etc.	3) Local Operational Cost: Allowance, per diem, training expenses, etc.	
Japanese Side	Tanzanian Side														
1) Experts: 6 persons	1) Staff allocated: 18 persons														
2) Equipment: PCs, scanners, projectors, vehicle	2) Facilities: Project office														
3) Local Operational Cost: general operating cost, cost for local consultant, staff salary, travel expenses, etc.	3) Local Operational Cost: Allowance, per diem, training expenses, etc.														
Project Period	July 2011-July 2015	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 370 million yen, (actual) 219 million yen												
Implementing Agency	Local Government Training Institute (LGTI), Prime Minister's Office- Regional Administration and Local Government (PMO-RALG) (Division of Local Government, Division of Organizational Development)														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	-														

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special perspectives of evaluation to be considered >

- The continuing status of the Project Purpose was analyzed under the Overall Goal.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Tanzania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with the development policy of Tanzania. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the government of Tanzania had implemented the Local Government Reform Program Phase2 (LGRP2) between 2009 and 2013 as a policy framework for decentralization. As one of the important measures to realize the "improvement of local government capacity", the program's main task, LGPRP2 aimed at formulating and implementing training strategy in order for LGAs to implement the training policy of local government officials. At the time of project completion, under the "Policy Paper on Local Government Reform, 1998" (effective to date), autonomy was provided for LGAs to manage their training and the "Training Strategy for Local Government Authorities, 2010" (2010-2014) gave mandate to LGTI as Lead Training Institution

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Tanzania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Tanzania for capacity development of local government officials. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, strengthening the capacity of newly established functions of LGTI was needed. At the time of completion, the project was consistent with the development needs because capacity enhancement of LGA officials was essential for the government service to functions under Decentralization by Devolution.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy to Tanzania. "Governance and Accountability" was one of the priorities areas under the "Country Assistance Program for the United Republic of Tanzania" (2008).

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

The approaches for training of LGA staff depended on the LGRP2 scheme. However, its feasibility was significantly diminished because LGRP2 was terminated without realizing devolution of human resource management. Lack of authority for human resource management did not give incentives for LGAs to pursue human resource development, therefore, needs for LGA's training became very low. Nonetheless, the project has taken measures including PDM revision, such as reducing the number of outputs from five to three in response to the mid-term review.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is fair.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was not achieved at the project completion. Among the indicators set to measure the effect of the project, “Capacities of LGTI to develop new courseware have been developed enough to embark on other courses using the same methodologies.” (Indicator 1) and “Training Course Evaluation Reporting System has been developed and LGTI could utilize collected information for further improvement of training courses” (Indicator 3) were partially achieved, but “Capacities to disseminate new courseware to training providers and resource persons have been developed” (Indicator 2) was not achieved.

< Continuation Status of Effectiveness of Project Purpose after Project Completion>

The effects of the Project Purpose have partially continued. The project noticed it was essential to capacitate LGTI first to provide quality training to LGAs after the mid-term review, therefore, the focus was put to strengthen its core functions before adding executive and administrative responsibilities on. Although Project Design Matrix (PDM) had not changed in the last minutes of the project so it remains focusing on development of strategic plan and dissemination to other Training Providers (TPs), it should be highlighted that LGTI has managed to transcend and become a Lead Training Institute in the Local Government context as is suggested in the Project Completion Report. In conclusion, At the terminal evaluation, the project team seriously had felt the needs to change the project strategy and had made efforts to reach the intended goal by diminishing its scope to concentrate on institutional capacity development of LGTI in terms of curriculum development (indicator 1), disseminating the curriculum to its lectures within LGTI (not for other TPs) (indicator 2) and establishing the training course evaluation reporting system (within LGTI) (indicator 3). It is imperative to note even after project completion LGTI’s institutional development as LTI of LGA trainings has enhanced, which can be said sustainable because the technics and human capacities remain at the ground level.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has partially achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. Since a “Training Strategy” was still a draft and has not finalized by the PO-RALG, the training framework for LGAs can be said that is has not been updated (Indicator 1). Hence, who should be responsible for the roles such as coordination, training quality assurance, provision of Training of Trainers (TOT), development of TOT and so on, has not been assigned. However, courseware for additional courses were developed using modality and methodologies of the prior courses (Indicator 2) and a number of TOT courses were conducted from 2015 to 2018 (Indicator 3) by LGTI’s efforts. Further training to LGAs by those personnel trained at ToT was conducted. Some of the trained trainers conducted lecturers at LGTI to teach the courses to LGAs. In terms of budget of trainings, LGAs, who bear the cost of training, have not had it, so instead of LGAs, LGTI itself have made tremendous efforts to obtain funds and manage to keep the sustainability of the training courses.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

There have been some impacts for women, as priority was given to women attendants and participation of female staff was encouraged. No negative impact on the natural environment by this project has been observed and there was no land acquisition and resettlement.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Effective LGA training provision framework is established.	Indicator 1: Capacities of LGTI to develop new courseware have been developed enough to embark on other courses using the same methodologies.	Status of the Achievement: Partially achieved (Continued) (Project Completion) - LGTI has acquired certain levels of technical capacity to develop courseware using the similar methodologies that have been deployed during the curriculum development exercise under the Project. - Some methodologies would not be applicable as they require significant financial capacities to replicate such as writing workshops, field survey, and engagement of external advisors. (At the time of ex-post evaluation) Refer to the Indicator 2 of the Overall Goal
	Indicator 2: Capacities to disseminate new courseware to training providers and resource persons have been developed.	Status of the Achievement: Not achieved (Partially achieved) (Project Completion) - Technical capacity building of LGTI staff to conduct TOT to training provider, etc. was still on the way. At this stage, before receiving TOT as participants, the capacity to conduct TOT was regarded to be limited. - Dissemination of the courseware developed by LGTI to LGAs was a role to be played by PMO-RALG. It was to be decided how specifically PMO-RALG would disseminate it to LGAs with what kind of positioning (mandatory or optional, etc.). (At the time of ex-post evaluation) Refer to the Indicator 3 of the Overall Goal.
	Indicator 3: Training Course Evaluation Reporting System has been developed and LGTI could utilize collected information for further improvement of training courses	Status of the Achievement: Partially achieved (Not continued) (Project Completion) A format of Training Course Evaluation was scheduled to be produced by reflecting the result of training in March, 2015. On the other hand, the evaluation reporting system for further improvement of the course was piloted, however, was not fully institutionalized by PMO-RALG and LGTI by July 2015. (Ex-post Evaluation)

		There was no existing system of Evaluation Reporting System to evaluate TOT. However, LGTI is trying to establish a system to evaluate TOTs																							
(Overall Goal) LGAs provide quality training (long-term and short-term) to its staffs. National Park.	Indicator 1: With many changes in environment surrounding LGAs, overall training framework targeting LGAs has been updated and enforced by PO-RALG.	Status of Achievement: Not achieved (At the time of ex-post evaluation) A new Training Strategy was drafted in June 2015. At the time of ex-post evaluation, communication between LGTI and PO-RALG on finalization and implementation of the new strategy was underway. Prospects for the date of approval is not set.																							
	Indicator 2: Courseware of additional courses are being developed using modalities and methodologies of priority courses.	Status of Achievement: Achieved (At the time of ex-post evaluation) Courseware developed <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Name of Course</th> <th>Modalities and Methodologies Used</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Contract Management</td> <td>Part of the Local Revenue Enhancement Course (TNA)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>LGA Legal Framework</td> <td>Part of the Local Revenue Enhancement Course (TNA)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Councilors Training Manual (Handbook)</td> <td>Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA</td> </tr> <tr> <td>LGAs Staff Induction Manual</td> <td>Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Improved O&OD DTF (CTF) and WF Manual</td> <td>Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Name of Course	Modalities and Methodologies Used	Contract Management	Part of the Local Revenue Enhancement Course (TNA)	LGA Legal Framework	Part of the Local Revenue Enhancement Course (TNA)	Councilors Training Manual (Handbook)	Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA	LGAs Staff Induction Manual	Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA	Improved O&OD DTF (CTF) and WF Manual	Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA											
	Name of Course	Modalities and Methodologies Used																							
Contract Management	Part of the Local Revenue Enhancement Course (TNA)																								
LGA Legal Framework	Part of the Local Revenue Enhancement Course (TNA)																								
Councilors Training Manual (Handbook)	Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA																								
LGAs Staff Induction Manual	Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA																								
Improved O&OD DTF (CTF) and WF Manual	Team comprised of Stakeholders from PO-RALG, Regional Secretariat, LGTI, Curriculum Development, testing and Dissemination and LGA																								
Indicator 3: Increased number of trained providers to conduct training courses using developed courseware	Status of Achievement: Achieved. (At the time of ex-post evaluation) 1) TOT <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Name of Courses for TOT</th> <th>Number of training (Cumulative)</th> <th>Number of Participants (Cumulative)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Accountability for Good Governance</td> <td>1 (2015)</td> <td>25</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Conflict Resolution and Negotiation (CR+N)</td> <td>2 (2015)</td> <td>60</td> </tr> <tr> <td>LGA Revenue Enhancement (LRE)</td> <td>4 (2015)</td> <td>200</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Fundamentals of Effective Communication Skills</td> <td>2 (2015)</td> <td>60</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Contract Management</td> <td>(Part of LRE)</td> <td>(Part of LRE)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>LGA Legal Framework</td> <td>(Part of LRE)</td> <td>(Part of LRE)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Councilor Training</td> <td>Phase 1 (13 times) (2015) Phase 2 (1 time) (2016)</td> <td>Phase 1 (10 – 15 in 13 Regions) Phase 2 (30 in 5 Zones)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> 2) In 2017 and 2018, some of those trained trainers conducted 12 training courses in total to LGAs at LGTI.	Name of Courses for TOT	Number of training (Cumulative)	Number of Participants (Cumulative)	Accountability for Good Governance	1 (2015)	25	Conflict Resolution and Negotiation (CR+N)	2 (2015)	60	LGA Revenue Enhancement (LRE)	4 (2015)	200	Fundamentals of Effective Communication Skills	2 (2015)	60	Contract Management	(Part of LRE)	(Part of LRE)	LGA Legal Framework	(Part of LRE)	(Part of LRE)	Councilor Training	Phase 1 (13 times) (2015) Phase 2 (1 time) (2016)	Phase 1 (10 – 15 in 13 Regions) Phase 2 (30 in 5 Zones)
Name of Courses for TOT	Number of training (Cumulative)	Number of Participants (Cumulative)																							
Accountability for Good Governance	1 (2015)	25																							
Conflict Resolution and Negotiation (CR+N)	2 (2015)	60																							
LGA Revenue Enhancement (LRE)	4 (2015)	200																							
Fundamentals of Effective Communication Skills	2 (2015)	60																							
Contract Management	(Part of LRE)	(Part of LRE)																							
LGA Legal Framework	(Part of LRE)	(Part of LRE)																							
Councilor Training	Phase 1 (13 times) (2015) Phase 2 (1 time) (2016)	Phase 1 (10 – 15 in 13 Regions) Phase 2 (30 in 5 Zones)																							

Source : JICA documents, questionnaires and interviews with PO-RALG and LGTI

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and project period were within the plan (the ratio against the plan: 59%, 100%). Two outputs were deleted from the original plan in order to cope with the termination of LGPR2. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The government policy has supported human resource development of LGAs. Under the Policy Paper on Local Government Reform (1998), which had been effective at the time of ex-post evaluation), LGAs have been required to set aside sufficient fund to ensure their staff training. Under the “Training Strategy for Local Government Authorities, 2010” (effective at the time of ex-post evaluation), the following mandate was given to LGTI: (i) LGTI as an LTI to undertake induction training to all new recruited personnel in LGAs. (ii) LGTI to undertake training to LGA staff and officials on matters pertaining to LGAs.

<Institutional Aspect>

The organizational structures of PO-RALG and LGTI have been appropriate and the sufficient number of staff has been assigned, respectively. If there are any issues of concern, PO-RALG through its Division of Local Governance (DLG) are involved and DLG may encourage LGTI to work with Development Partners (DPs), who could support the LGTI from various aspects, to improve performance in

LGA. However, no clear demarcation of roles has been written as the Training Strategy has not been finalized.

<Technical Aspect>

LGTI has had sufficient skills because of the following reasons: (i) the quantity and quality of academic staff at the institute has increased. In terms of quality, training courses were updated and implemented depending on the priority, which was decided based on the needs and gaps of PO-RELG and available resources from LGTI. Also, the number of PhD holders among lecturers in LGTI increased from 1 at the start of the project to 9 at the time of ex-post evaluation and Master’s degree holders occupied 20 out of 98 lecturers. (ii) A substantial number of short courses, research and consultancy services has been conducted, (iii) some outreach activities such as O&OD has been conducted, (iv) they have capability to produce curriculum, (v) they have had training of trainers and master trainers, and (vi) they have produced different courseware and other training manuals.

As a main policy maker, PO-RALG has had skills to finalize the Training Strategy. On the other hand, implementation of training have been the duty of LGTI. However, according to PO-RALG, PO-RALG may suggest a training strategy based on operational tools of the PO-RALG. PO-RALG may update their orientation manuals, online training and indicate the need or demand for training

Most ex-counterpart staff of the project have retired or left the positions. Both LGTI and PO-RALG have training systems. LGTI have carried out (i) orientation of new staff who are introduced to roles of LGTI and LTI as well as roles of Department of Coordination and Quality Assurance (DCQA), (ii) TOT, (iii) On the Job Training (OJT), (iv) in-house training during management meetings, and (v) facilitation activities. PO-RALG have strengthened skills through (i) orientation, (ii) OJT, (iii) in-house training during management meetings and (iv) facilitation activities

<Financial Aspect>

The budget of LGTI has not been sufficient enough but they have managed to maintain their courses with limited budget they obtained from various sources. Therefore, LGTI has not been able to implement all the planned activities, but they are managing a part of their courses. LGTI have had plans to strengthen own revenue sources by establishing (i) hostel and accommodation, (ii) increasing student admission, (iii) introducing short courses, (iv) conducting consultancy services, and (v) writing research proposal for grants.

Budget of LGTI

(Unit: Tsh)

	2016	2017	2018
Applied Budget	223,000,000	213,700,000	250,000,000
Approved Budget	223,000,000	213,700,000	250,000,000
Sources	Own Revenue	Own Revenue	Own Revenue

There has been no available budget for PO-RALG for the implementation of the Training Strategy, as it has not been approved yet. The Capacity Building Grant (CBG), which was the main source for LGAs to implement training, was suspended in year 2013-2014. Reallocation through the Local Government Development Grant (LGDG) System¹ where CBG was 10% of the Grant provided by the Government; which was active only for one year (2016-2017), and the Fund has not been allocated since year 2017-2018.

<Evaluation Result>

Problems have been observed in the financial aspect; therefore, the sustainability of the effects through project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project did not achieve the Project Purpose at the project completion. Capacities of LGTI to develop new courseware was somewhat developed, and evaluation report system was developed to some extent. However, “Capacities to disseminate new courseware to training providers and resource persons have been developed” was not achieved. The Overall Goal has been partially achieved. Training Strategy have not been finalized, however, training to LGAs by the personnel who participated in TOT under the project have been reported to conduct a lecture to LGAs personals at LGTI. As for the sustainability, some problems have been observed in the financial aspect, however, the institutional capacities on planning and implementation of LGA training have been well enhanced.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Lessons Learned for JICA:

1. Consider Baseline Surveys before formulation of project – there was no pilot study that provide quantitative data i.e. the number of TOTs that were there to the number we aspire to achieve by the end of the project; hence making sustainability difficult and having a quantitative assessment impossible.
2. Involvement other Departments like the Planning Department or other related departments for purposes of Sustainability – It was apparent information sharing with other departments was low; aside from the DLG no other department had any information and could not provide insight. If we as JICA deal with the Ministry, we should also see other departments that influence either policy or planning issues for future sustainability.
3. The approaches for training of LGA staff depended on the LGRP2 scheme. However, its feasibility was significantly diminished because LGRP2 was terminated without realizing devolution of human resource management. Much consideration must have been made during the initial stages of project design, dependency on policies that lack either formal institutionalization or a particular sense of legal framework may not help avoid abrupt changes due to uncontrolled situations during the implementation stage. Additionally, in practice, it is not at all that easy to make such radical decision as to reflect and modify PDM based on the change of frequent policy framework with flexibility, which resulting in enlarging the risk of not reflecting the reality of the situation surrounding the project.
4. Proper reflection of the reality on project design even towards the end of the project should be done. – The project had realized the necessity of the modification of some part of the PDM after the midterm review, so they modified the PDM at that moment. However, since nobody ever expected the very base of the strategy, which the project was designed on, ‘LGRP2’ had abolished, the project had to reconsider

¹ The LGDG system is the only main reliable vehicle for allocating development grants to LGAs in mainland Tanzania. The system was introduced as a unified national transfer method of providing development funding to LGAs.

its scope and goals, which took a certain time towards the end, resulting in little time left at the time of project termination. To avoid this, it would be important to make as much consideration as possible at the initial stage of the project designs as is mentioned above 3, as well as always to prepare for contingency plans for unexpected situations being happened in the developing countries' settings.

Contents	
Factors Affecting Conflicts Resolution between Elected and Appointed LGA Leaders: Experience from Selected LGAs in Tanzania Elisei H. Lubuva, Laurent D. Ngoyo and Einstern Alexander	
The Property Tax Valuation Status in Local Government Authorities around Tanzania Mainland Moghaleno Zacharia Kutanzi, Bahati Desalegn Mfango, Daudi Hezron Manumbu	
Citizen Participation in Village Assembly Meetings: A Case Study of Chamwino District in Tanzania Rose Likongga	
Factors Affecting Internal Revenue Mobilization in Local Government Authorities in Tanzania Laurent Ngoyo, Elisei Lubuva and Einstern Alexander	
The Use of ICT to Support Revenue Collection in Local Government Authorities in Tanzania Justice M. Gratton & Einstern Alexander	
Contribution of Investments towards Revenue Enhancement, Services Delivery and Cooperation in Local Government Authorities in Tanzania Mainland Einstern Alexander, Laurent Ngoyo and Elisei Lubuva	
Patterns of Service Levy Administration in District Councils around Tanzania Mainland Einstern Alexander, Daudi H. Manumbu and Justice M. Gratton	<p>VOLUME 3 No. 1 OF NOVEMBER, 2015</p> <p>PUBLISHED BY: THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TRAINING INSTITUTE (LGTI) P.O. Box 1125, DODOMA, TANZANIA Tel: +255 26 2961311, Fax: +255 26 2961140 website: www.lgti.ac.tz Email address: rc3@lgti.ac.tz</p>



Classroom set-up at LGTI2

Cover Page of “LOCAL GOVERNMENT DEVELOPMENT JOURNAL” published by LGTI after the Project Completion Based on the knowledge / expertise gained through curriculum development exercise in the Project