

Country Name	<b>Project on Community Tourism Development through Public-Private Partnership in Simien Mountains National Park and Surrounding Areas</b>
Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	In order to solve problems of damaged environment of the Simien Mountains National Park (SMNP), caused by the expansion of agricultural land as well as grazing, the Ethiopian federal and regional governments promoted voluntary immigration as well as alternative livelihood measures including tourism as an incentive for the community people within the core zone to resettle in the buffer zone of SMNP. Although progress such as increase in foreign visitors and tourism revenue, measures for sustainable tourism promotion was not sufficient.				
Objectives of the Project	Through (1) mutual cooperation by establishing working groups of tourism related organizations and providing training, (2) providing training on tourism marketing and promotion, (3) developing tourism products, and (4) developing Simien Community Tourism Management and Development Plan (SIMCOT-MDP), the project aimed at establishing mechanism for the community tourism to benefit local communities, thereby contributing to improvement in livelihood of the local communities and realization of sustainable community tourism. 1. Overall Goal: Local communities improve level of livelihood and realize sustainable community tourism through increasing participation in tourism activities in the Simien Mountains National Park. 2. Project Purpose: Mechanism for the community tourism to benefit local communities is established through Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in the Simien Mountains National Park, which is registered as World Heritage Site.				
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: the Simien Mountains National Park and surrounding areas (Kosoye, Wunania, Gondar Town Debarq Town, and Amhara Region)</li> <li>Main activities: (1) mutual cooperation by establishing working groups of tourism related organizations and providing training, (2) providing training on tourism marketing and promotion, (3) developing tourism products, and (4) developing SIMCOT-MDP.</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> <b>Japanese Side</b>            1) Experts: 14 persons            2) Trainees received: 15 persons            3) Equipment: PCs, photocopying machine, facsimile, projector, generator and others            4) Local Operational Cost: General local cost, cost for local consultant, conference cost         </td> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> <b>Ethiopian Side</b>            1) Staff allocated: 5 major officials/personnel and 14 other personnel            2) Facilities: Two office spaces in Gondar Town and Debarq Town            3) Local Operational Cost: per diem, fuel cost, electricity cost, cost for office &amp; conference hall, etc.         </td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			<b>Japanese Side</b> 1) Experts: 14 persons 2) Trainees received: 15 persons 3) Equipment: PCs, photocopying machine, facsimile, projector, generator and others 4) Local Operational Cost: General local cost, cost for local consultant, conference cost	<b>Ethiopian Side</b> 1) Staff allocated: 5 major officials/personnel and 14 other personnel 2) Facilities: Two office spaces in Gondar Town and Debarq Town 3) Local Operational Cost: per diem, fuel cost, electricity cost, cost for office & conference hall, etc.
<b>Japanese Side</b> 1) Experts: 14 persons 2) Trainees received: 15 persons 3) Equipment: PCs, photocopying machine, facsimile, projector, generator and others 4) Local Operational Cost: General local cost, cost for local consultant, conference cost	<b>Ethiopian Side</b> 1) Staff allocated: 5 major officials/personnel and 14 other personnel 2) Facilities: Two office spaces in Gondar Town and Debarq Town 3) Local Operational Cost: per diem, fuel cost, electricity cost, cost for office & conference hall, etc.				
Project Period	November 2011-February 2016 (Extended period: December 2014-February 2016)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 270 million yen, (actual) 481 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Ethiopian Wildlife Conservation Authority (EWCA), Amhara National Regional State, Bureau of Culture, Tourism and Parks Development (ANRS-BCTPD)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Hokkaido University, PADECO Co., Ltd.				

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

<Special perspective of evaluation to be considered>

- Continuation Status of the project effects (Indicator 1 and 2) was evaluated under the Overall Goal, as some indicators of the Overall Goal were set as the continuing status of project effects.

1 Relevance
<p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of Ethiopia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policy of Ethiopia. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, the “Growth and Transformation Plan” (GTP) (2010/11-2014/15), the five-year national development plan, articulated that culture and tourism play a critical role in socio economic and political strategy of Ethiopia. The objectives of the culture and tourism sector in GTP included sustainable tourism development and promotion of community participation. At the time of project completion, the policy on the tourism development stipulated that the promotion of Community Based Tourism (CBT) was one of the important elements for the development.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of Ethiopia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion &gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the development needs of Ethiopia for community tourism. At the time of ex-ante evaluation, SMNP was described in the world heritage list in 1978. However, the environment was damaged by the expansion of agricultural land as well as grazing, and the park was put on the list of the World Heritage sites in danger in 1996. At the time of project completion, the risk of environmental damage by the society continued as though there is no clear data, as even during project implementation, the number of people in the premises of SMNP was increasing.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation&gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with Japan’s ODA policy to Ethiopia. Poverty reduction was an objective of the “Country Assistance Program for the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia” (June 2008). It prioritized agriculture and rural development.</p>

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

Although the project design was consistent with the needs, the project lacks coordination of the two counterparts (Amhara Culture and tourism Bureau and Ethiopian wild life conservation authority) as well as follow-up problem due to political instability in the area after project completion.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was partially achieved at the project completion. While Simien Mountains Community Charity Association: SIMCOT-CA, as a destination marketing organization, was established and community fund was proposed (Indicator 1), viable public policy support program for community tourism was not included in SIMCOT-MDP, though the project developed concrete and specific knowhow to implement the activities indicated in the plan and tried to disseminate that plan to other sectors (Indicator 2) and the meetings on the preparation of ordinances or other policies regarding the promotion of community tourism and PPP were not held (Indicator 3).

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has not been achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. During the project implementation, the project established two community cooperative associations (number of founding members were 152 and 99 respectively) in Argin Joana Kebele<sup>1</sup> as model associations for which community tourism products were developed to scale up to other communities under SMNP (Indicator 1), have not been functional (Indicator 2), due to lack of support from the governments and limited revenue sources. However, community people were benefitted from the tourism products developed under the project such as coffee ceremony, Injera baking, local beer, weaving, and black smith, hair dressing and herbs as products to attract tourists and to improve the livelihood of the community, according to the officials of the Kebele and community people. No information was obtained on the number of community members who participated in tourism activities. Some positive effects on a newly established eco-tourism association was found as some members participated in the training under the project and developed the idea given by the project.

A mechanism of community tourism established by the project has not continued, as SIMCOT-CA which was established in order to market community tourism with its own fund has not been active and functional after the project was completed, because SIMCOT-CA was not institutionalized and cooperation mechanism with the government organizations was not set up before the project was terminated. Hence, no community tourism fund has been established (Indicator 3).

There is no clear evidence that show SIMCOT-MDP referred during the preparation of tourism development strategies (Indicator 4). However, during annual plan preparation by Office of Culture and Tourism at Debark Woreda and North Gonder Zone, the tourist destination identified by the project has been taken as a good model to use it as source of tourism.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impact on the natural environment by this project has been observed. During the project period, resettlement of communities was done two times by continuous efforts by the Government of Ethiopia to protect the park from endanger. The resettlement program was carried out and compensation was paid. 206 household left their farmland and resettled around Debark City. Out of 206 households, 166 households have gotten residence land from Debark City Administration freely and 40 of them are still waiting. After the resettlement program, UNESCO erase the park from the endanger list. Those people were farmers and may not have exposure to generate their own income in the urban area, and they may suffer to improve their livelihood in their future life.

The project may have created a sense of unfairness among the communities. Although two model communities were selected as a pilot to use this experience to scale up throughout the park, other communities located in different area of SMNP did not understand this higher goal and complained about the unfair selection of the tourist destination.

Some positive impacts have been observed on gender aspect. The project encouraged the involvement of the women in the tourism sectors. In rural area of Ethiopia, people consider, as women are not generating their income. However, the project introduced new products as source of tourism and some of those products were prepared by women. Thus, women started to be involved with the income generation through tourism.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is low.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Mechanism for the community tourism to benefit local communities is established through Public-Private Partnership (PPP) in the Simien Mountains National Park, which is registered as World Heritage Site.	Indicator 1: As a result of evolution of Project Coordination Committee (PCC) and Working Group (WG), the establishment of a kind of destination marketing organization (DMO) and community tourism fund are proposed for the promotion of community tourism, and necessary legal framework is proposed, in consideration of mainstreaming/integration into the existing institutional mechanism.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Not continued) (Project Completion) <b>Establishment of the organization:</b> On 10 June 2015, SIMCOT-CA was formally registered. SIMCOT-CA was established with the participation of various stakeholders in order to market community tourism with their own fund. <b>Source of fund:</b> The following source of fund was proposed. a. Heritage Cooperation Donation: In addition to the entrance fee, a certain amount of money will be collected from tourists as a Heritage Cooperation Fund by clarifying the use of said funds. b. Revenue from tour operations: Revenue from tour operations through the activities of SIMCOT-CA is one of expected sources of funds. c. Donations: Clear explanations of the objective or activity plan of the foundation will be made to domestic and international donors, to acquire donations. Heritage Cooperation Donation requires changes in the current regulation

<sup>1</sup> Kebel is an administrative unit under Woreda, which belongs to Zone, then Region

		and system. Though the general director of EWCA had been making positive comments on these sources of income. However, the discussion has stopped as EWCA was occupied in other issues. Also, discussions on revenue from tour operations were suspended as there was a possibility that additional tax would be charged (the money put on top of the normal package price would be considered as their income). (Ex-post evaluation) Refer to Indicator 2 of Overall Goal
	Indicator 2: Based on the project experiences, viable public policy support programs are included in SIMCOT-MDP for executing and promoting community to tourism.	Status of the Achievement: Partially achieved (Partially continued) (Project Completion) The project developed concrete and specific knowhow to implement the activities indicated in the plan such as promotion and developing community tourism products and tried to disseminate that plan to other sectors. The counterparts, the final beneficiaries group and the communities were satisfied with the result of the project during the project life. However, no policy support programs were included in SIMCOT-MDP. (Ex-post evaluation) Refer to Indicator 4 of Overall Goal
	Indicator 3: At least concerned 3 Woredas and 1 Town hold meetings on the preparation of ordinances or other policies regarding the promotion of community tourism and PPP, based on the recommendations and plans indicated in the SIMCOT-MDP.	Status of the Achievement: Not achieved (Not achieved.) (Project Completion) - They did not prepare any kind of policies regarding the promotion of community tourism based on the recommendation plans indicated in the SIMCOT-MDP. - The meetings on the preparation of ordinances or other policies regarding the promotion of community tourism and PPP were not held (Ex-post evaluation) At the time of ex-post evaluation, though no policies have been prepared, the ex-post evaluation survey found that EWCA have been developing a strategy that incorporates promotion of Ecotourism
(Overall Goal) Local communities improve level of livelihood and realize sustainable community tourism through increasing participation in tourism activities in the Simien Mountains National Park.	Indicator 1: Number of local community members participating in tourism activities will increase from 4,200 participants by at least 50%.	Status of Achievement: Partially achieved (Ex-post Evaluation) - The charity associations established by the project have not been active and functional at the time of the ex-post evaluation. Interviewed with personnel at Argin Jona Kebele indicated that the communities had started to get benefit through participating tourism activities. However, after the project termination, there is no evidence that shows how many people are getting benefit from the project and it is not possible to compare status with the base line figure. - However, an eco-tourism association that was established after SIMCOT-CA have been strongly working in SMNP. This association has about 7,000 members. Some of the eco-tourism association members participated in the training that was provided by SIMCOT project and they have developed the idea of SIMCOT on how to participate on tourism activities.
	Indicator 2: A mechanism of community tourism established by the Project is continuously working through PPP.	Status of Achievement: Not achieved Both of SIMCOT-CA, as well as two Argin Jona cooperative associations have not been functioning.
	Indicator 3: A community tourism fund, which will be used for management of tourism destination, will be established by contribution from local tourism revenue.	Status of Achievement: Not achieved No community tourism fund has been established.
	Indicator 4: There will be a clear evidence that the SIMCOT-MDP is referred to during the preparation of national tourism strategies.	Status of Achievement: partially achieved - There is no clear evidence that shows SIMCOT-MDP referred during the preparation of tourism development strategies. However, during annual plan preparation by Office of Culture and Tourism, the tourist destination identified by SIMCOT has been taken as a good model to use it as source of tourism. - In addition, there was an agreement between ANRS-BCTPD and EWCA has been started to develop the overall master plan for tourism sector in Amhara Region based on SIMCOT project idea. However, not yet implemented because of budget constraint, high turnover of officers and officials and others.

Source : JICA documents, questionnaires and interviews with ANRS-BCTPD, Debark Zone and Debark Woreda Culture and tourism office and EWCA

### 3 Efficiency

The project cost significantly exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 178%) and the project period exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 142%). The project period exceeded the plan because in accordance with the result of terminal evaluation, the project was extended in order to improve village tour products and strengthen the promotion. The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the

efficiency of the project is low.

#### 4 Sustainability

##### <Policy Aspect>

The government policy has given special emphasis to promote tourism. After H.E. Dr. Abiy Ahmed came to power, he made drastic reforms to strengthen the tourism industry. This organizational reform has been done and published by the Federal Negarit Gazette on 29 November 2018 by proclamation No. 1097/2018. The duties and power of Tourism Ethiopia, which is a new organization formed under Prime Minister Office have been mentioned clearly on this proclamation. The tourism sector was reorganized under Prime Minister Office to give high emphasis for the tourism sector. And tourism is a pillar on the new economic reform by the government. However, there has been no specific policy on promoting community tourism.

##### <Institutional Aspect>

SIMCOT-CA, which was established during the project and was expected to market community tourism with its own fund, however, it has not been functioning at the time of ex-post evaluation. It was found that both EWCA and ANRS-BCTPD had no clear demarcation to support the tourism sector in general and SIMCOT-CA or SITCOM-MDP in particular. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the interviewed government officials both at tourism organizations at different level and EWCA said that they would support SIMCOT-CA and SIMCOT-MDP, however, there has been no written document or they have not been incorporated on their annual plan.

##### <Technical Aspect>

Although SIMCOT-CA was not active, still one of the community associations (Arginjona Kebele Chennek Community Handicraft Cooperative Association) wanted to reactivate the association to be actively involved on the tourism sectors. The community had an idea how to attract the tourist in their area. However, they need refreshment training and support from the government officials. On the government side, due to budget and logistic constraint, it has been difficult to give special support to the associations in Arginjona Kebele, because of the distance from the Debarq city where the North Gondar and Debarq Woreda Culture and Tourism office is located.

##### <Financial Aspect>

No budget was secured as no institutional set up is clear.

##### <Evaluation Result>

Problems have been observed in terms of institutional, technical and financial aspects as a result of discontinuity of institutional setup, the sustainability of the effects through the project is low.

#### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose was partially achieved at the project completion. SIMCOT-CA as the destination marketing organization was established, however, viable public policy support program for community tourism was not developed and the meetings on the preparation of ordinances or other policies were not held. The Overall Goal has not been achieved. There has been no clear evidence on the number of community members who has participated in the community tourism activities, SIMCOT-CA, which was expected to function as a mechanism of community tourism has not continued. As for sustainability, some problems have been observed in institutional, technical and financial aspect. As to the efficiency, both the project cost and the project period considerably exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- SIMCOT-CA and community cooperative associations should reactivate their functions to generate income for the community and to improve the livelihood of the community in the park. In addition to that, there should be a discussion with responsible government organizations such as North Gondar Zone and Debarq Woreda Culture and Tourism Office, Ethiopian Wildlife Conservation Authority, Debarq Woreda Micro and Small Scale Enterprises to include SIMCOT-CA support into their annual plan. Especially, North Gondar Zone and Debarq Woreda Culture and Tourism Office need to take initiatives. Also, it is recommended that sufficient resource has to be allocated to provide refreshment training for all relevant counterparts, as reshuffling of the higher officials as well as turnover of experts happen frequently.
- The Government of Ethiopia needs to provide the way to generate their sustainable income to improve their livelihood. Also, the government may need to raise awareness on resettlement to appreciate the resettlement program rather than complain.

#### Lessons Learned for JICA:

Considering the situation that SIMCOT-CA, Arginjona Kebele Chennek Community Handicraft Cooperative Association, and Arginjona Kebele Ambarass Community Cultural Production Processing Cooperative Association have not been functional after the project was completed, JICA has to take into consideration about the sustainability of the project that have more than one counterpart organization.



The interview with Ambarass local community



The satellite center at Ambarass local Community

