

Country Name	<b>Project for Sustainable Tourism Development through Public Private Partnership (Phase 2)</b>
Palestine	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	<p>Palestine is rich in tourism resources such as Bethlehem, Jericho, and Jerusalem. Jericho is considered as one of the world's oldest cities. The number of tourists to Jericho had been sometimes affected by security matters but there were issues, other than public safety, facing the promotion of tourism in Jericho region, for example, the way of using cultural heritage, the lack of development of local souvenirs and tourism products and the lack of tourism information availability. JICA implemented technical cooperation "Project for Sustainable Tourism Development in Jericho through Public-Private Partnership" (hereinafter referred to as Phase 1) from 2009 to 2012 in Jericho as the target area. It was required to further develop the activities of Phase 1 to bring benefits to overall regional economy as well as to extend the acquired knowledge and experience of Phase 1 to other areas in Palestine.</p>												
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through clarification of the issues in tourism development benefitting local community, implementation of the tourism promotion of Palestine, carrying out of sustainable Community Based Tourism (CBT) activities in Jericho through Public-Private Partnerships, utilization of tourism development based on lessons learned for Jericho in other target areas, and promotion of mutual cooperation with neighboring countries (such as Jordan, Israel and Egypt), the project aimed at the establishment of the methodology of tourism development in Palestine, considering CBT, thereby contributing to active implementation of the established methodology for tourism development as well as to increase of the number of tourists visiting the developed tourist sites to benefit the local community.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall Goal: The methodology of tourism development established by the project is actively implemented in Palestine and the number of tourists visiting the developed tourist sites by the project is increased to benefit the local community.</li> <li>Project Purpose: The methodology of tourism development in Palestine, considering CBT, is established.</li> </ol>												
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project Site: Jericho and other five target areas (Hebron, Bethlehem, Ramallah-Al Bireh, Nablus, Tulkarem)</li> <li>Main Activities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Implementation of baseline survey, Identification of the issues to be tackled about tourism development in Palestine, Implementation of endline survey, etc.</li> <li>Implementation of activities for national tourism promotion, Summarizing of recommendations for sustainable tourism development, etc.</li> <li>Compilation of strategy and action plan to implement CBT, Organization of workshops to enhance the participation of local residents and the private sector in Jericho for CBT, Implementation and evaluation of activities to embody CBT, Revision of Jericho's tourism vision, strategy and action plan, etc.</li> <li>Verification of the condition of the tourism sector in other target areas, Support of a part of CBT activities in other target areas through a pilot project, Compiling recommendations and a guideline for incorporating CBT into tourism development for entire Palestine, etc.</li> <li>Conducting of a study to analyze the conditions of the regional tourism industry among neighboring countries, Compilation of a proposal on the future direction of linkages with neighboring countries, etc.</li> </ol> </li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Palestine Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 9 persons</td> <td>1) Staff Allocated: 18 persons (MOTA) and working group (WG) members from 6 target areas</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees Received: 31 persons (in Japan and in third countries)</td> <td>2) Office space at MOTA offices in Jericho and Ramallah and meeting space</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Vehicles, DVD player/sound system/other digital equipment, equipment for CBT activities (bottle labelling machines, signs, display show-case, etc.)</td> <td>3) Expenses: utility cost of the offices, consumables, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local expenses</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Palestine Side	1) Experts: 9 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 18 persons (MOTA) and working group (WG) members from 6 target areas	2) Trainees Received: 31 persons (in Japan and in third countries)	2) Office space at MOTA offices in Jericho and Ramallah and meeting space	3) Equipment: Vehicles, DVD player/sound system/other digital equipment, equipment for CBT activities (bottle labelling machines, signs, display show-case, etc.)	3) Expenses: utility cost of the offices, consumables, etc.	4) Local expenses	
Japanese Side	Palestine Side												
1) Experts: 9 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 18 persons (MOTA) and working group (WG) members from 6 target areas												
2) Trainees Received: 31 persons (in Japan and in third countries)	2) Office space at MOTA offices in Jericho and Ramallah and meeting space												
3) Equipment: Vehicles, DVD player/sound system/other digital equipment, equipment for CBT activities (bottle labelling machines, signs, display show-case, etc.)	3) Expenses: utility cost of the offices, consumables, etc.												
4) Local expenses													
Project Period	June 2013 – June 2016	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 463 million yen, (actual) 467 million yen										
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities (MOTA)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	JTB Corporate Sales Inc.												

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

## &lt;Constraints on Evaluation&gt;

- The evaluation study was somewhat affected by the epidemic of COVID-19, therefore face-to-face interview to municipalities was not conducted and information on municipalities was collected through questionnaire and telephone interview.

## &lt;Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation&gt;

- It is considered that the Indicator 1 of the Project Purpose, i.e., incorporation of CBT into MOTA's strategy and action plan, is included in a part of the Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal (continuation of activities based on the methodology for tourism development established by the project). Therefore, the continuation status of the Indicator 1 of the Project Purpose is examined as a part of assessment of the achievement of the Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal.
- Regarding the Indicator 2 of the Project Purpose, CBT activities in Jericho were implemented as "pilot" during the project period and it is considered that this Indicator is included in the Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal after the project completion. Therefore, the continuation status of this Indicator is assessed as a part of the Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal.

## 1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Palestine at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

In the Tourism Development Strategy (2011-2013), the strategic objectives were: high-quality tourism products, marketing of Palestine as independent and characteristic sightseeing destination, and effective conservation of historical ruins and heritage.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Palestine at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

In Jericho, tourism was expected to be important industry as well as agriculture. It was required to promote effective utilization of cultural heritage, to strengthen tourism products and services, to diversify tourist sites, and to promote purchase of tourism products and services for tourists.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

According to the Country Assistance Policy towards Palestine (2012), assistance to promotion of sustainable economic growth was listed in one of the three priority areas. Tourism was expected to have high potential to contribute to economic growth.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was partially achieved by the project completion. "The tourism development methodology that considers CBT" established through project activities was not documented in the MOTA's tourism strategies and action plans (Indicator 1). However, the methodology was shared within MOTA as internal circular notice and CBT was functioning. Six items of CBT activities out of seven were being implemented by the end of the project period (Indicator 2). At project completion, the City of Jericho entrusted the remaining one item ("Tree of Zacchaeus Market") to a private developer, and the development was underway. MOTA's 2016 promotion action plan specified continuous implementation of the four types of promotion activities introduced by the project (creation of promotion tools as well as participation in tourism expos, media FAM, and agent FAM). Preparation of these promotion activities was actually started by the end of the project for some of them, for example, tourist trade fairs in Italy and Romania as well as media FAM in Indonesia and South Korea. As these activities constituted the major components in the action plan, it was considered that the planned activities would be continuously implemented, although the percentage of the promotion activities actually sustained could not be precisely calculated, so this indicator was not verifiable (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have partially continued to the time of ex-post evaluation. A majority of the activities, although not all of them, introduced by the project are implemented. Activities such as participation in fairs and promotion through brochures and website are described in the action plan in 2020 and are actually implemented, although the percentage of implementation is not clear and the Indicator 3 is not verifiable.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been partially achieved. Regarding the Indicator 1, the concept of CBT was not incorporated in the New Tourism Law or the MOTA Strategy (2017-2022). In the six target areas during the project, some projects introduced by the project are described in action plan and continuously being implemented in good conditions, while others are not being implemented well because of lack of fund and human resources. During the project, MOTA was planning to newly introduce the methodology established in the project to Qalqilya, Tubas and Salfit, but new projects have not been started in these areas due to lack of fund. As to the Indicator 2, new tourist sites have not been developed since the project completion because MOTA does not have funds to develop new tourist sites. Regarding the Indicator 3, the number of tourists visiting the sites has been clearly increasing, more than 30% until 2019 in all of the target sites except Nablus, where Tourist Information Center (TIC) has been closed, although the number of tourists dramatically decreased in 2020 due to the COVID-19 crisis (information was not available at two sites, Bethlehem and Hebron). Regarding the Indicator 4, according to the interview with MOTA, According to the information of MOTA, more than 70% of those involved in the activities have been satisfied in total. On a regional basis, all the target sites have achieved the target level except for Bethlehem, where those who are engaged with tourism sector expected more creative activities.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

There have been positive impacts in terms of gender through participation of women in pilot projects on mosaic, weaving, and embroidery, etc. In addition, the relationship with Jordan has been strengthened as tourism agent in Palestine and Jordan started mutual visits. No negative impact has been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

### Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) The methodology of tourism development in Palestine, considering CBT, is established.	(Indicator 1) The methodology for incorporating CBT into Palestine tourism development is explicitly outlined into MOTA's tourism strategy and action plan.	Status of the Achievement: partially achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) • "The tourism development methodology that considers CBT" established through project activities was not documented in the MOTA's tourism strategies and action plans, although the methodology was shared within MOTA by internal circular notice and it was functioning. (Ex-post Evaluation) • Refer to the Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal
	(Indicator 2) CBT activities in Jericho that are described in the action plan are sustained (at least 7).	Status of the Achievement: achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) • Six items of CBT activities out of seven were being implemented. (Ex-post Evaluation) • Refer to Indicator 1 of the Overall Goal

	(Indicator 3) Promotion activities in Palestine that are described in the action plan are sustained (at least 70%).	<p>Status of the Achievement: not verifiable (not verifiable)</p> <p>(Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Four types of activities introduced by the project were described in the action plan in 2016 as further development and expansion of the project activities but the percentage is not clear.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Activities described in the action plan in 2020 are actually implemented: participation in fairs, promotion through brochures and website although the percentage is not clear.</li> </ul>																																															
<p>(Overall Goal)</p> <p>The methodology of tourism development established by the project is actively implemented in Palestine and the number of tourists visiting the developed tourist sites by the project is increased to benefit the local community.</p>	<p>(Indicator 1) Tourism strategies and/or action plans are drafted or revised, and activities in 9 areas are begun or continued based on the methodology for tourism development established by the project.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved</p> <p>Current Situations in Activities in the Latest Action Plan in Six Target Areas</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="568 338 1533 1234"> <tr> <td data-bbox="568 338 711 752">Jericho</td> <td data-bbox="711 338 1533 752"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package project for “The Tree of Zacchaeus Market”: All studies and preparations already done but not continued very well. Since tourists usually don’t have time to visit all the stalls in the Market, there was no motivation for the vendors to pay the rent and make the stalls in the market. Moreover, there were not enough human resources.</li> <li>Bedouin Lifestyle Experience: The cleanness and hospitality of the Bedouin Tent were improved after the project and the activity attracts overseas guests.</li> <li>Honey Project and Mosaic Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Embroidery Project: The association became not so active due to lack of the capacity to sell their products. They limited the production demand-based only and the project is suspended.</li> <li>Bedouin Woven Product Project: The association lacks fund and infrastructure to continue the woven product making.</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="568 752 711 819">Hebron</td> <td data-bbox="711 752 1533 819"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs and Pottery Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="568 819 711 887">Bethlehem</td> <td data-bbox="711 819 1533 887"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Specialty Shop Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Wool products business: No information available</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="568 887 711 954">Ramallah-Al Bireh</td> <td data-bbox="711 887 1533 954"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing TIC: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Soap business: No information available</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="568 954 711 1144">Nablus</td> <td data-bbox="711 954 1533 1144"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Package Project for developing TIC: Just after project completion, a part of the TIC facility was damaged because of demonstration against the municipality. MOTA headquarters and MOTA Nablus have a plan to repair the facility and nominate staff to work there.</li> </ul> </td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="568 1144 711 1234">Tulkarem</td> <td data-bbox="711 1144 1533 1234"> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs, Package Project for developing TIC, Package Project for producing pamphlets: Continued in very good conditions</li> </ul> </td> </tr> </table> <p>• Qalqilya, Tubas, Salfit : In addition to above 6 target areas, MOTA added these 3 areas as sites to plan to develop new tourist activities with the methodology established in the project. However, no projects have been implemented due to lack of fund.</p>	Jericho	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package project for “The Tree of Zacchaeus Market”: All studies and preparations already done but not continued very well. Since tourists usually don’t have time to visit all the stalls in the Market, there was no motivation for the vendors to pay the rent and make the stalls in the market. Moreover, there were not enough human resources.</li> <li>Bedouin Lifestyle Experience: The cleanness and hospitality of the Bedouin Tent were improved after the project and the activity attracts overseas guests.</li> <li>Honey Project and Mosaic Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Embroidery Project: The association became not so active due to lack of the capacity to sell their products. They limited the production demand-based only and the project is suspended.</li> <li>Bedouin Woven Product Project: The association lacks fund and infrastructure to continue the woven product making.</li> </ul>	Hebron	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs and Pottery Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> </ul>	Bethlehem	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Specialty Shop Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Wool products business: No information available</li> </ul>	Ramallah-Al Bireh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing TIC: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Soap business: No information available</li> </ul>	Nablus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Package Project for developing TIC: Just after project completion, a part of the TIC facility was damaged because of demonstration against the municipality. MOTA headquarters and MOTA Nablus have a plan to repair the facility and nominate staff to work there.</li> </ul>	Tulkarem	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs, Package Project for developing TIC, Package Project for producing pamphlets: Continued in very good conditions</li> </ul>																																			
Jericho	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package project for “The Tree of Zacchaeus Market”: All studies and preparations already done but not continued very well. Since tourists usually don’t have time to visit all the stalls in the Market, there was no motivation for the vendors to pay the rent and make the stalls in the market. Moreover, there were not enough human resources.</li> <li>Bedouin Lifestyle Experience: The cleanness and hospitality of the Bedouin Tent were improved after the project and the activity attracts overseas guests.</li> <li>Honey Project and Mosaic Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Embroidery Project: The association became not so active due to lack of the capacity to sell their products. They limited the production demand-based only and the project is suspended.</li> <li>Bedouin Woven Product Project: The association lacks fund and infrastructure to continue the woven product making.</li> </ul>																																																
Hebron	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs and Pottery Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> </ul>																																																
Bethlehem	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Specialty Shop Project: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Wool products business: No information available</li> </ul>																																																
Ramallah-Al Bireh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing TIC: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Soap business: No information available</li> </ul>																																																
Nablus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs: Continued in very good conditions</li> <li>Package Project for developing TIC: Just after project completion, a part of the TIC facility was damaged because of demonstration against the municipality. MOTA headquarters and MOTA Nablus have a plan to repair the facility and nominate staff to work there.</li> </ul>																																																
Tulkarem	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Package Project for developing information signs, Package Project for developing TIC, Package Project for producing pamphlets: Continued in very good conditions</li> </ul>																																																
	(Indicator 2) 9 new tourist sites are developed after the project.	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) not achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No new tourist sites have been developed due to lack of funds<sup>1</sup>.</li> </ul>																																															
	(Indicator 3) Number of tourists visiting the sites developed based on the methodology of the project increases by 30%.	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved</p> <p>Number of Tourists Visiting the Sites Developed based on the Methodology of the Project</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="616 1503 1485 1993"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Name of tourist site</th> <th colspan="5">No. of tourists visiting the site</th> </tr> <tr> <th>before 2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> <th>2019</th> <th>2020</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Jericho TIC</td> <td>5,174 (2015)</td> <td>6,623</td> <td>5,925</td> <td>7,239</td> <td rowspan="7">No information (Dramatically dropped due to COVID 19 crisis)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Bedouin Lifestyle Experience in Jericho</td> <td>Approx. 50*</td> <td>416</td> <td>501</td> <td>489</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Bethlehem Select Shop</td> <td>Approx. 715**</td> <td colspan="3">No information</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hebron Pottery (Oriental Handmade Pottery Factory)</td> <td>1,000 (2015)</td> <td colspan="3">No information</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Al Bireh TIC</td> <td>722</td> <td>1,819</td> <td>2,320</td> <td>2,402</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Nablus TIC</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tulkarem TIC</td> <td>933</td> <td>3,211</td> <td>2,815</td> <td>2,916</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Name of tourist site	No. of tourists visiting the site					before 2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	Jericho TIC	5,174 (2015)	6,623	5,925	7,239	No information (Dramatically dropped due to COVID 19 crisis)	Bedouin Lifestyle Experience in Jericho	Approx. 50*	416	501	489	Bethlehem Select Shop	Approx. 715**	No information			Hebron Pottery (Oriental Handmade Pottery Factory)	1,000 (2015)	No information			Al Bireh TIC	722	1,819	2,320	2,402	Nablus TIC	0	0	0	0	Tulkarem TIC	933	3,211	2,815	2,916
Name of tourist site	No. of tourists visiting the site																																																
	before 2016	2017	2018	2019	2020																																												
Jericho TIC	5,174 (2015)	6,623	5,925	7,239	No information (Dramatically dropped due to COVID 19 crisis)																																												
Bedouin Lifestyle Experience in Jericho	Approx. 50*	416	501	489																																													
Bethlehem Select Shop	Approx. 715**	No information																																															
Hebron Pottery (Oriental Handmade Pottery Factory)	1,000 (2015)	No information																																															
Al Bireh TIC	722	1,819	2,320	2,402																																													
Nablus TIC	0	0	0	0																																													
Tulkarem TIC	933	3,211	2,815	2,916																																													

<sup>1</sup> New tourist sites are under development at the time of ex-post evaluation with external support. For example, Japan is continuing its support for construction and management of protective shelter and presentation of the Great Bath at Hisham Palace in Jericho. World Bank supported the Abraham Path Initiative to create job for youth and women.

		*Calculated 100 in 2 years from April 2014 to April 2016. Average No. of persons per year is 50. **Calculated 5,000 in 7 years from 2009 to 2016. Average No. of persons per year is approximately 715.
	(Indicator 4) 70 % of those involved in the activities developed based on the methodology of the project are satisfied.	(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved • According to the information of MOTA, more than 70% of those involved in the activities have been satisfied in total. On a regional basis, all the target sites achieved the target level except for Bethlehem, where they expected to have more creative activities and the activities developed did not meet their expectation <sup>2</sup> .

Source: JICA documents, Questionnaire and interview to MOTA headquarter office, Questionnaire to municipalities

### 3 Efficiency

Although the project cost slightly exceeded the plan, the project period was within the plan (ratio against the plan: 101% and 100%, respectively). The outputs of the project were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

In the MOTA Strategy (2017-2022), tourism is considered as the fastest growing economic sector and the priority in tourism sector is given to high quality tourism product, including development of tourism sites as well as improvement of competitiveness and the service level. The concept of CBT was not incorporated in the MOTA Strategy (2017-2022). However, according to MOTA, it is supposed that the concept of CBT be included within the new version of the Strategy. In Jericho, a program of municipality includes the guiding services and promotion of local products supported by the project.

#### <Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

MOTA has sufficient number of staff members, with 150 at headquarters and a total of 300 in 10 branch offices. In the municipality offices, two to three staff members are engaged in tourism sector. In general, they are conducting their duties based on their mandate and responsibilities, and there is not so much organizational difficulty except the fact that the number of staff is not sufficient in one municipality. The Jericho Heritage Tourism Committee (JHTC) developed by the project (Phase 1) is not functioning currently, as all the members have their own work at other organizations and nobody could dedicate enough time and efforts to the activities at JHTC and the idea of formulating the JHTC was not matching with the ministry's top priorities. Representative for JHTC from Jericho municipality was changed frequently, which affected the smooth implementation of JHTC activities. MOTA considers that the private sector can lead this kind of effort better, since it could directly impact on their business but that the private sector cannot afford to lead JHTC.

#### <Technical Aspect>

The MOTA staff have capacity necessary to implement their duties such as skills in communication, ICT, marketing/promotion, and management, although their skills need to be further improved. MOTA participates in international tourism fairs abroad at MOTA's own budget and it is a good opportunity for them to improve their marketing and promotion skills. Training programs are not implemented with MOTA's own budget but donors provide training opportunities. Various tourism brochures (general brochures, tourism maps, brochures for archeological sites/cuisine/CBT and Jericho book, etc.) developed by the project have been still utilized. Currently, the new design website of MOTA developed by the project is a helpful tool, which is being used by MOTA in tourism promotion and marketing since its launch until now.

#### <Financial Aspect>

MOTA has annual budget for the management and maintenance of the cultural heritages, but there is no fund to develop new tourist sites or to rehabilitate the existing sites in an appropriate manner. In order to develop new tourist sites, MOTA needs to get funds, including those from donors.

#### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the policy, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is fair.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project partially achieved the Project Purpose, i.e., establishment of the methodology of tourism development, considering CBT. Although CBT was not documented explicitly in MOTA's Strategy or action plan, most of the CBT activities in action plan in target areas were implemented as well as promotion activities. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, a majority of the activities, although not all of them, introduced by the project are implemented, therefore, the project effects have been partially continued. The Overall Goal, i.e., implementation of the methodology of tourism development established by the project and increase of the number of tourists, is partially achieved. A majority of activities in action plan are being implemented and the number of tourists was increasing until 2019 but new tourist sites have not been developed due to lack of funds. Regarding sustainability, some problems have been observed in the policy, institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects, because of shortage of training opportunities and financial resources. In the efficiency, the project cost slightly exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

## III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- To ensure sustainability, it is necessary to clarify communication channel through the focal point of the project. The person of the focal point, preferably the project director, should be involved in all the details of the implementation stage even for the other directorates to ensure sustainability even in the case of the job rotation. If there is one main contact person who knows everything about the project, it

<sup>2</sup> Tourism in Bethlehem is much advanced than other areas in Palestine and they thought they could do more advanced activities such as making film for promotion. Therefore, the relative satisfaction was low.

is more likely to assure the sustainability of the project and to enhance its impact.

#### Lessons learned for JICA:

- When designing a project, which targets several different areas, it is necessary to take into consideration the diversity of the needs among each target area. It is desirable to implement activities, depending on the priorities of each area. Needs of each city differ based on the tourism attractions available, number of tourists visiting, and people's experience in tourism industry. Thus, customizing the activities based on such analysis would be more satisfactory to those involved and raise the future commitment and sustainability. Deeper investigation that considers the opinion of all counterparts, not only implementing agency, will increase the satisfaction as well as the commitment of the counterpart and sustainability of the activities.



TIC in Jericho which was developed by JICA project (Phase 1) is providing the information to the tourists.



New design website of MOTA. It was developed by the project as one of the most important priorities of MOTA.