

Country Name	Project for Urban Development Management
Lao People's Democratic Republic	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Vientiane Capital, the capital city of Laos, with a population of 800,000 (as of 2009), significant urban expansion from city centers to rural areas has been progressing along with the growth of economy and population. The government of Laos prepared urban development plans and regulations placing high priority on simultaneous pursuit of economic growth, social development, and environment protection. However, the master plan at that time was not necessarily suited to the situation and consistent with other rules and regulations. In order to address those issues, the government implemented the “Project for Urban Development Master Plan Study in Vientiane Capital” (2010-2011) with the assistance of Japan and updated the master plan for Vientiane Capital by preparing the “Vientiane Capital Urban Development Master Plan” (2011) (hereinafter the Master Plan) to realize comprehensive and integrated urban development. Following the project, enhancement of the capacity of staff of the city government for urban planning and development management consistent with the Master Plan was highly required.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through the enhancement of the capacity of the staff of Vientiane Capital City for urban development management including legal documents analysis, database creation, planning and project management, the project aimed at the strengthening of the capacity of staff to implement urban planning and development management, thereby contributing to the consistent management of urban development with the Master Plan for Vientiane Capital.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overall Goal: Urban development in Vientiane Capital will be managed consistent with the established Master Plan. 2. Project Purpose: The capacity of staff regarding urban development in Vientiane Capital to implement urban planning and development management will be strengthened. 										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project Site: Vientiane Capital 2. Main Activities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Enhancement of the capacity for analyzing structure of legal documents related to urban development management and proposing improvement, 2) Enhancement of the capacity for creating basic data base (land use plan) for urban development management, 3) Enhancement of the capacity for urban planning of related agencies (focus on Inner Zone¹ and Historic Area²), 4) Enhancement of the capacity for urban development control (focus on Historic Area), 5) Enhancement of the capacity for implementing cityscape projects through the pilot project (focus on activities for cityscape in Historic Area). 3. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Lao Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 10 persons</td> <td>1) Staff Allocated: 11 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees Received: 15 persons</td> <td>2) Land and Facilities: project office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: PCs, printers, projectors, GIS software, etc.</td> <td>3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water and telephone)</td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Lao Side	1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 11 persons	2) Trainees Received: 15 persons	2) Land and Facilities: project office	3) Equipment: PCs, printers, projectors, GIS software, etc.	3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water and telephone)
Japanese Side	Lao Side										
1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 11 persons										
2) Trainees Received: 15 persons	2) Land and Facilities: project office										
3) Equipment: PCs, printers, projectors, GIS software, etc.	3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water and telephone)										
Project Period	September 2013 - March 2017 (extension: October 2016 - March 2017)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 199 million yen, (actual) 267 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Public Works and Transport Research Institute (PTRI), Department of Housing and Urban Planning (DHUP), Department of Public Works and Transport (DPWT)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd., Tamano Consultants Co., Ltd.										

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

Indicator 1 for the Project Purpose (Improvement of control system of urban development) was unspecific and not clarified even in the terminal evaluation (2016). Therefore, in this ex-post evaluation, according to the Completion Report (2017), three measures out of the four measures aimed to be improved by the project for improving the control system of urban development, excluding the revision of building code which was out of the scope of the project, were used as the Indicator 1. The three measures were 1) proper control system (permission system, countermeasures against violation, etc.), 2) reasonable land use plan and zoning code, and 3) qualified operation of these measures.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Laos at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The “7th Five Year Social and Economic Development Plan for Vientiane Capital 2011-2015” aimed at the achievement of a good balance between socio-economic development and preservation of urban environment in simultaneous pursuit of economic development,

¹ One of the six planning zones proposed by the Master Plan, which located outside the historic area and inside the inner ring road characterized with the stock of past industrial investment and accumulated urban functions.

² One of the six planning zones proposed by the Master Plan, which located in the central part of the City characterized with historic heritages and low-rise shop houses.

social development and environment protection. Therefore, the project was consistent with the development policies of Laos at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Laos at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

Development and construction in Vientiane Capital in the late 1990's was controlled by the ministerial orders and city acts whose regulatory values were not necessarily reasonable, and the same regulations were applied to different structures. Therefore, the master plan at that time compliant with those regulations was not effectively executed. After getting the new Master Plan and experience of theoretical and practical exercises of urban planning through the "Project for Urban Development Master Plan Study in Vientiane Capital" (2010-2011), it was required for the staff of the city government to apply their knowledge and skills to the urban development management for Vientiane Capital and improve the effectiveness of the Master Plan. Therefore, the project was consistent with the development needs of Laos at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The "Country Assistance Policy for Lao People's Democratic Republic (Lao PDR)" (April 2012) set the development of economic and social infrastructure as one of its four priority areas (intermediary goals). To realize a balanced economic growth, the Policy planned to provide the assistance in the fields of environmental management, water treatment plants, and urban planning that contributed to building an environmentally harmonious and comfortable society. Therefore, the project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy for Laos at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was partially achieved by the time of project completion. The project improved control systems of urban development in Vientiane Capital by formulating the Urban Development Control System, and the Detail Land Use Plan and Detail Zoning Code for Inner Zone (Indicator 1). Proper operation of these control systems including the monitoring and control enforcement activities were not realized due to the delay of approval of the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code waiting for the approval of the Master Plan³ by the government (Indicator 2).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have partially continued. Although the Master Plan was waiting for the Prime Minister Decree on its enactment, the development control systems updated and improved by the project have been used for the management and control of urban development in Vientiane Capital as they were approved by the Provincial Assembly of Vientiane Capital.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Although the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code prepared by the project were not yet approved by the National Assembly, most development activities including construction projects have been managed and controlled with reference to the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code. Besides, DPWT and the Office of Public Works and Transport (OPWT) have utilized the on-site inspection check list developed by the project for inspection and monitoring of building constructions in Vientiane Capital.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

According to the questionnaire survey on DPWT, the local residents and business operators such as shop owners and companies involved in the pilot project⁴ have been playing important roles for the maintenance of streetlights and gardens constructed by the pilot project including cutting of trees and grass, changing lightbulbs, decorating trees for events, etc. Moreover, those local residents and business operators have tried to apply the experience of maintenance works in the project to other places. Besides, after the dissemination of the Detail Land Use Plan and Detail Zoning Code to the districts and villages in the Inner Zone Areas, the number of districts and village heads, including female heads, who participated in the urban planning and development management activities conducted by the administrative authorities has been increased. No resettlement and land acquisition were caused by the project and the projects proposed by the Master Plan. No other negative impact on natural, social and economic environment has been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
Project Purpose: The capacity of staff regarding urban development in Vientiane Capital to implement urban planning and development management will be strengthened.	Indicator 1: Improvement of control system of urban development.	Status of the Achievement: Partially achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) The project formulated the Urban Development Control System, and the Detail Land Use Plan and Detail Zoning Code for Inner Zone. However, proper operation of these control systems was not realized during the project period waiting for their approvals by the government. (Ex-post Evaluation) The Land Use Plan and Zoning Code have been waiting for the approval by the government. However, the urban development control systems updated and improved by the project have been applied to the management and control of urban development in Vientiane Capital as they were approved by

³ The Master Plan prepared in 2011 by the "Project for Urban Development Master Plan Study in Vientiane Capital" (2010-2011) has been revised to be the "Mater Plan for Vientiane Capital 2030." The Master Plan 2030 was approved by the National Assembly in December 2020 but Decree on the Master Plan Enactment has not been issued by Prime Minister.

⁴ The pilot project consisted of a soft component and a hard component. The soft component was composed of workshops and events for promoting stakeholders' understanding on cityscape refining, and the hard component was composed of cityscape refining construction works.

		the Provincial Assembly of Vientiane Capital.
	Indicator 2: Improvement in construction monitoring and construction control enforcement.	Status of the Achievement: Partially achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) The system for construction monitoring and construction control enforcement was prepared by the project. However, the monitoring and control enforcement activities were not implemented due to the delay of approval of the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code waiting for the approval of the Master Plan by the government. (Ex-post Evaluation) The Land Use Plan and Zoning Code developed by the project were accepted by the Vientiane Capital Assembly, the Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MPWT), and the Political Bureau Central Committee, and waiting for Prime Minister Decree on the enactment of the Master Plan.
Overall Goal: Urban development in Vientiane Capital will be managed consistent with established Master Plan.	Newly constructed buildings are aligned with the revised Master Plan.	(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved According to the questionnaire survey on DPWT, although the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code were not yet officially authorized by the National Assembly, most development activities including construction projects have been managed and controlled with reference to the Master Plan, e.g. land-use ratio, floor-area ratio, building coverage ratio, building height, etc. DPWT and OPWT have utilized the on-site inspection check list developed by the project for inspection and monitoring of building constructions in Vientiane Capital.

Source: DPWT

3 Efficiency

Due to the delay of the commencement of pilot project, both of the project period and cost exceeded the original plan (the ratio against the plan was 117% and 134% respectively). The outputs were produced as originally planned by the end of extension period of the project. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The Mater Plan and the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code prepared by the project were not yet enacted by the Government. The “Political Bureau Resolution on New Period for Development of Vientiane Capital” (2020) defined the direction and policies of the urban development of Vientiane Capital for the New Period (2021-2025) in line with the direction and policies of urban development stated in the Master Plan. The resolution also referred to the 56 priority projects proposed by the Master Plan.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

The Urban Planning Management Unit was established in DPWT after the project in 2017 for construction monitoring, land use and building construction control, and housing and urban development patrol. However, activities of the unit have been limited due to limited human resources.

<Technical Aspect>

According to the questionnaire and interview surveys on PTRI, the researchers, technical and managerial staffs of PTRI have kept using the knowledge and skills learned in the project to their daily works including urban planning, technical improvement, control and management. They are currently working on the extension of GIS application introduced by the project to make detail land use plans for districts and villages and to improve the database of inventory and statistical data of urban development. Brochures, references, and design reference books produced by the project have been utilized for direct and indirect urban development activities. OPWT, for example, distributed the brochures to districts, villages, and public and private organizations for promoting their understanding of and cooperation with building construction management and control.

<Financial Aspect>

DPWT, PTRI and DHUP have managed to perform their mandated activities with the government budget though it's limited, and the financial support from development partners. Although the budget for implementing the projects proposed by the Master Plan has been limited, it is expected to be increased once the Master Plan is approved by the National Assembly.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the policy, institutional/organizational and financial aspects of the implementing agencies. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was partially achieved by preparing proper control systems for urban development and the land use plans and zoning codes but not realizing qualified operation of these measures based on the approved rules and regulations because the rules and regulations have not been approved by the government during the project period. The Overall Goal was partially achieved by promoting urban development in Vientiane Capital consistent with the Master Plan although the Master Plan has not yet been approved by the National Assembly. As for sustainability, approval of the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code, limited human and financial resources have remained as issues. As for efficiency, both of the project period and cost exceeded the plan. Considering all of these points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- Due to the delay of approval of the legal documents prepared by the project including construction regulations and the Land Use Plan and Zoning Code, the plans and rules and regulations updated by the project have not been officially executed. It is recommended that the counterpart agencies including DHUP, PTRI, Vientiane Capital, and DPWT make efforts as much as possible to accelerate the approval process of the government.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- Though the project aimed at updating rules and regulations for urban development and strengthening their enforcements, the approvals of them by the government were set aside as important assumptions. Therefore, despite the approvals of rules and regulations were critical for the achievement of project purpose and overall goals, no specific activities were implemented by the project. As for a project having approvals by the government as critical issues, not putting the approvals aside as external factors, some specific activities for ensuring and accelerating the approvals are to be included in the project plan.
- Though DHUP was the major counterpart to get the approvals on the plans and legal documents prepared by the project, DHUP's involvement in the project was limited. As for a project having approvals by the government as critical issues, it is recommended to identify the process, schedule, and responsible players for approval at the planning stage of the project, and to plan accordingly getting involve the necessary players.



Dissemination Meeting on Regulatory Reforms for Construction Permits held on 7th February, 2020



Current situation of cityscape improved area
Well maintained lights and gardens
along Anou Road in Historic Area