

Country Name	The Project for the Study on Togo Logistics Corridor Development
Republic of Togo	

I. Project Outline

Background	In West Africa, the West African Economic and Monetary Union (UEMOA) has taken the lead to promote measures with the aim of facilitating physical distribution in the area. In 2001, eleven corridors were designated as priority development corridors to harmonize the transportation and infrastructure development sector strategies of the member countries through a regional integrated program. The Togo Logistics Corridor (TLC) was one of the eleven designated corridors that supplied materials to landlocked countries including Burkina Faso, Mali, and Niger. Due to the great potential of TLC, various projects related to TLC had been separately considered and partly implemented. However, these projects did not realize synergy effects due to lack of cohesive coordination among them under the situation with insufficient comprehensive analysis and consideration of integrated development strategy and planning on the entire TLC. c								
Objectives of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Expected goals through the proposed plan¹: Physical distribution of the TLC will be facilitated through implementation of the priority projects. Expected utilization of the proposed plan: 1) A development plan to be formulated based on the study will be adopted as the corridor development plan of the government of Togo, 2) The projects with a feasibility study under this study will be operationalized. 								
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Whole of Togo Main activities: 1) Surveys on the current status of social and economic conditions and TLC, 2) formulation of a TLC development plan, 3) Feasibility study on priority projects, 4) Initial assessment and recommendations Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table style="width: 100%; border: none;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Togolese Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>(1) Experts from Japan: 18 persons</td> <td>(1) Staff allocated: 11</td> </tr> <tr> <td>(2) Training in Japan: 9persons</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Togolese Side	(1) Experts from Japan: 18 persons	(1) Staff allocated: 11	(2) Training in Japan: 9persons	
Japanese Side	Togolese Side								
(1) Experts from Japan: 18 persons	(1) Staff allocated: 11								
(2) Training in Japan: 9persons									
Project Period	August, 2012 – September, 2013	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 400 million yen (actual) 279 million yen						
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MPWT)								
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Central Consultant Inc., Yachiyo Engineering Co., Ltd.								

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance
<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Togo at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policies of Togo at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion. “The Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP)” (2011-2015) aimed at achievement of economic growth through economic revitalization using Lomé Port. In addition, “the Strategy for Accelerated Growth and Promotion of Employment (SCAPE: Stratégie de croissance accélérée et de promotion de l'emploi)” (2013-2017) prioritized strengthening of TLC under the economic infrastructure development which was one of the five pillars.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Togo at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion></p> <p>The project was consistent with the needs of Togo for a comprehensive development plan of TLC in order to ensure efficient and effective development of the corridor at the time of ex-ante evaluation and project completion.</p> <p><Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with the Japan’s ODA policy for Togo² prioritizing support for infrastructure development and human resource development</p> <p><Evaluation Result></p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact

¹ The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

² Ministry of Foreign Affairs, “ODA Country Databook 2012”

<Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the time of Project Completion>

The objectives of the project were achieved by the time of project completion. A TLC development plan with implementation program including the existing development projects for 2030 was developed (Output 1). Feasibility studies (FS) were conducted on projects for bypass construction between Bouzalo and Binako of the National Road (Route Nationale: RN) 17 and for bridges construction on roads between Katchamba and Sadori (Output 2). A seminar was held in August 2013 in order to discuss about the TLC development plan and the results of the feasibility studies with the development partners and stakeholders (Output 3). The capacity of counterpart staff in how to develop and maintain the logistic network was improved (Output 4).

<Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The proposed plan has been utilized. The TCL development plan was included in the SCAPE (2013-2017) and the government of Togo approved the “National Development Plan” (2018-2022) based on the “Project on the Corridor for West Africa Growth Ring Master Plan (WAGRIC)” (2015-2018) supported by JICA which was an updated version of the project (Indicator 1). Out of the total 20 prioritized projects with the feasibility studies by the project, including 17 road projects, 1 railway projects, axle load control project and a dry port construction project, construction of bypass of RN 17 and rehabilitation of the railway have been under preparation (Indicator 2). In addition, out of the 17 road projects prioritized by the project, 6 projects have been under preparation/implementation with financial support by the development partners, including the African Development Bank (AfDB), the Islamic Development Bank (IsDB) and the West African Development Bank (WADB)

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The expected goals through the proposed plan have been partially achieved. According to the traffic volume data for the period from 2013 to 2018, the traffic volume increased globally though the latest traffic survey had been conducted at the different observation points from the baseline traffic survey under the project.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No other negative impact, including impact on natural environment and social environment, was observed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Status of Achievement of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan and Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan

Aim	Indicators	Results
Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan: 1) A development plan to be formulated based on the study will be adopted as the corridor development plan of the government of Togo,	1) The development plan through this study is approved.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ The TCL development plan was included in the “Strategy for Accelerated Growth and Employment Promotion (SCAPE)” (2013 -2017). ➢ In 2018, the government of Togo approved the National Development Plan (2018-2022) based on the Project on the Corridor for West Africa Growth Ring Master Plan を (2015-2018), which was updated version of the TLC development plan, supported by JICA.
2) The projects with a feasibility study under this study will be operationalized.	2) The projects prioritized by this project are implemented by Japan and other donors.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved. The following priority projects have been under preparation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Construction of bypass of RN 17 connecting between Bouzalo and Binako has been under preparation but the bidding process has been behind the schedule. ➢ Rehabilitation of the railway section between Lomé and Bitta has been under preparation by AfDB. ➢ Construction and Asphaltting of the Sokode bypass road by JICA has been under preparation and FS will be starting in 2020 The following projects listed by the project have been completed. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Rehabilitation of fishery port in Lomé by JICA ➢ Interconnection of customs clearance systems between Togo and Burkina Faso by JICA in order to improve and accelerate flow of logistics in RN1 between the two countries of Togo and Burkina Faso.
Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan Physical distribution of the TLC will be facilitated through implementation of the priority projects.	1) Increase in the traffic volume in the TLC (The baseline data should be collected by the traffic survey under the project)	(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved According to the traffic data for the period from 2013- 2018, the traffic volume increased globally. However, it is difficult to compare exactly with baseline date because the government of Togo took different method for data collection and different observation points from the ones conducted by the project.

Source: Final Report, Information provided by MPWT

3 Efficiency

The project cost and the project period were within the plan (ratio against the plan: 70% and 100%, respectively). Therefore, efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The latest “National Development Plan” (2018-2022) included WAGRIC which is the updated version of the TLC development plan. Therefore, the implementation of the TLC development plan has been endorsed by the development policies of the government of Togo.

<Institutional Aspect>

MPWT is a responsible ministry for implementation of the TLC development plan. Under MPWT, the Directorate of Survey Plan, Monitoring and Evaluation is responsible for the TLC development plan with 11 staff members. The Directorate of Road Construction is responsible for implementation of road construction projects with 12 staff members and the Directorate of Road Transport and Railway has 5 staff members. Sufficiency of personnel in each directorate has not been clarified without no response to the inquiries by the ex-post evaluation team.

<Technical Aspect>

The counterpart staff of MPWT who were engaged in the project of WAGRIC has further improved their capacity for planning and implementing projects under the corridor development plans with the technical support by JICA after the project completion. In particular, they have been enhancing their capacity of coordination among stakeholders for the corridor development, including the development partners and the neighboring countries.

<Financial Aspect>

The government of Togo made continuously lots of efforts to assure the budgets for priority project as below. However, it is hard to say the government has a certain perspective for secure all the necessary budget.

In January 2013 when project had been implemented, UEMOA and JICA organized joint seminar three times for finance mobilization and enhancement awareness to invest more of other development partners such as the European Union (EU) and AfDB.

More recently, in mid-i July 2019, EU and the government of Togo organized an event named “Rencotnre B2B” (Meeting B to B).

In the end of July 2019 UEMOA and JICA organized a round table for finance mobilization and the government of Togo participated in the meeting to find more finance. On behalf of the Ministry of Infrastructure and Transport, the Director of Plan, Survey and Monitoring and Evaluation had joined as a member of the delegation of Togo.

In addition, in August, 2019, the government of Togo organized a business forum with inviting Japanese private companies in merge with the 7th Tokyo International Conference for African Development (TICAD7) held in Japan.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, there have been problem observed from the financial aspect of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the objectives to formulate the TLC development plan and the TLC plan have been utilized for the development and rehabilitation of the transport infrastructure including roads and bridges, port and railway. As for sustainability, the government of Togo has faced some difficulties to mobilize funds for the implementation of the projects in the TLC plan in despite of their various efforts.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

(For MPWT)

Since the TLC development plan is a mid-term or long term development plan, it is necessary to arrange a monitoring system for the progress of the priority projects. Also, it is essential to consider clarify responsibilities of MPWT and other relevant ministries, including the responsible ministries for development plans and to follow the process to implement the development plan continuously because the TLC development plan is a part of the national development plan. In addition, it is inevitable to select a directorate to coordinate the development partners since the projects related RN 1, which is a part of the target of the TLC development plan, have attracted interests by the other donors.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

The output of the project is a part of the national development plan and has been consistent with the development policy of Togo. In addition, after the project completion, TLC has been updated as one of the major corridors in the WAGRIC master plan, which was supported by JICA, from the viewpoint of the regional corridor development in West Africa, and became a major part of the current national development plan of Togo. Technical cooperation supporting formulation of master plan is an important tool for JICA in case of ODA for countries including Togo and very effective. On the other hand, the recipient government often requests JICA to support implementation of the prioritized projects which are selected in the master plan. Therefore, it is essential to continuously advocate the related ministries, such as the Ministry of Planning and the Ministry of Finance as well as to involve them in the project in order to make the master plan be approved and utilized as the national policy.



RN1: Truck with trouble and congestions on the road



Concept meeting with the government of Togo