

Country Name	<b>Project on Regional Development Planning of the Southern Region in the Republic of Tunisia</b>
Republic of Tunisia	

## I. Project Outline

Background	<p>One of the major challenges in Tunisia was correcting regional disparities through promoting a dynamic convergence across the regions. The integrated regional development aimed, by sustainably utilizing the socio-economic and environmental potential of respective regions, at consolidating the competitiveness of the economic players and regions so that finally the standard of living and quality of life can rise for their populations.</p> <p>The Ministry of Development, Investment, and International Cooperation (MDICI) was responsible for strategic orientation of relevant inter-ministry partnership development. On the other hand, insufficient public-private partnership, less competitive domestic industries and less attractive logistical and investment environment had resulted in insufficient availability of qualified personnel, a dynamic and effective distribution system and attractive living environment. The Southern Region was a typical region lagging behind which was covered almost by desert except coastal areas.</p> <p>The formulation of integrated regional development plan through participatory approach to solve the above situation was needed especially in the Southern Region. At the same time, capacity of planning and administrative management for participatory approach needed to be developed as well.</p>								
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through formulation of regional development strategy for the period from 2015 to 2035 and regional development plan for the period from 2015 to 2025 as well as capacity development of planning and administrative management for participatory approach to Tunisian counterpart, the project aimed at developing a regional development plan through public consultation as a participatory approach, thereby contributing to promote sustainable regional development for reducing regional disparity by utilizing available resources and advantages, and promoting the living environment and quality in the Southern Region.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Expected goal through the proposed plan<sup>1</sup>: Sustainable regional development is promoted to reduce regional disparity by utilizing available resources and advantages of the Southern Region.</li> <li>Expected utilization of the proposed plan: The regional development plan formulated through public consultation as a participatory approach will be approved by the Tunisian government.</li> </ol>								
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: 6 Governorates in the southern region (Gabes, Tozeur, Kebilli, Gafsa, Medenine, and Tataouine)</li> <li>Main activities: Formulation of regional development strategy for the period from 2015 to 2035 and regional development plan for the period from 2015 to 2025, and capacity development of planning and administrative management for participatory approach to Tunisian counterpart</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities): <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Tunisian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Mission members: 21 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 20 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 16 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Offices with necessary equipment</td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Tunisian Side	1) Mission members: 21 persons	1) Staff allocated: 20 persons	2) Trainees received: 16 persons	2) Land and facilities: Offices with necessary equipment
Japanese Side	Tunisian Side								
1) Mission members: 21 persons	1) Staff allocated: 20 persons								
2) Trainees received: 16 persons	2) Land and facilities: Offices with necessary equipment								
Project Period	March 2013 – December 2015 (Extension period: November 2014 – December 2015)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 300 million yen, (actual) 323 million yen						
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Development, Investment and International Cooperation (Ministère du développement de l'investissement et de la coopération internationale: MDICI) South Development Office (Office de Développement du Sud: ODS)								
Cooperation Agency in Japan	None								

## II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation >

[Definition of Expected utilization of the proposed plan by the project in the ex-post evaluation]

- There is an inconsistency in Expected utilization of the proposed plan by the project between the R/D and ex-ante evaluation sheet as below:
  - R/D:** The regional development plan will be developed through public consultation as a participatory approach
  - Ex-ante evaluation sheet:** The regional development plan formulated through public consultation as a participatory approach will be approved by the Tunisian government.
- As drafting the regional development plan is considered as an output of this project, therefore, this ex-post evaluation utilizes “Expected utilization of the proposed plan” defined by the ex-ante evaluation sheet.

### 1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Tunisia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion>

The project was consistent with Tunisia’s development policies of “the 12th Five-Year Development Plan” (2010-2014), “the Economic and Social Programme (Jasmine Plan)” (2011-2016), and “the Five-Year Development Plan” (2016–2020) emphasizing promotion of regional development.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Tunisia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation and Project Completion >

The project was consistent with Tunisia’s development needs of formulation of integrated regional development plan through

<sup>1</sup> The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

participatory approach in the Southern Region to mitigate the regional economic disparity.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Japan's ODA policy for Tunisia at the time of appraisal in 2012 putting priority on (i) upgrading the industries, (ii) mitigation of regional disparities, (iii) environmental protection and (iv) South-South cooperation<sup>2</sup>.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the time of Project Completion>

The objectives of the project were achieved by the time of project completion. The project could successfully formulate the regional development strategy for the period from 2015 to 2035 (Output 1) and the regional development plan for the period from 2015 to 2025 (Output 2). Through the project, the capacity of Tunisian counterpart for planning and administrative management for participatory approach was developed (Output 3).

< Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Proposed Plan has been partially utilized at the time of ex-post evaluation. The regional development plan (2015-2025) formulated by the project has not been officially approved by the Tunisian government yet (Indicator 1), due to an inconsistency in understanding the definition of expected utilization of the proposed plan between the Tunisian government and JICA. However, the plan and the strategy formulated by the project has served as a reference for Tunisian national and regional development plan, and many infrastructure development projects in the priority sectors in the South Region such as transport and logistics, social services infrastructure, energy, water and environment, tourism, urban development and science and technology, industry, etc. were actually implemented by the government. For example, there were five investment activities/projects in 2017 and eight investment activities/projects in 2018 in the Southern Region (Indicator 2).

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Expected Goals have been partially achieved by the time of ex-post evaluation. There was an increase in the number of newly established enterprises in the priority sector in the Southern Region. Although there is a variation in the number of newly established enterprise among the different sectors, the sectors of agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing indicated a strong growth of number of newly established enterprise from 822 in 2015 to 1,452 in 2018. Also, the improvement of social services was observed in the Southern Region. For example, number of beds in hospitals for 1,000 inhabitants increased from 1.67 in 2015 to 1.86 in 2017, and the ratio of number of inhabitants / basic health center improved from 3,769 in 2015 to 3,611 in 2017. The water supply connection rate in the Southern Region was almost stable at 99.2-99.3% from 2015 to 2017. However, it was reported that the quality of supplied water has improved in Djerba and Tozeur after the operation of seawater and groundwater desalination plants.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No other positive or negative impacts of the project were confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

### Status of Achievement of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan and Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan) The regional development plan formulated through public consultation as a participatory approach will be approved by the Tunisian government.	Indicator 1 The regional development plan formulated by the project is approved by the Tunisian government as the government plan.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not achieved a) Date of approval: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The regional development plan (2015-2025) formulated by the project has not been officially approved by the Tunisian government.</li> <li>The Tunisian government did not recognize the approval of the plan as an indicator of expected utilization of the proposed plan as there was an inconsistency in understanding the definition of expected utilization of the proposed plan between the Tunisian government and JICA as mentioned earlier at Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation.</li> <li>However, the regional development plan (2015-2025) and the regional development strategy (2015-2035) formulated by the project has served as a reference for the elaboration of the orientation note and the regional contents for the south regions under the 5-year development plan (2016-2020) of the Tunisian government.</li> <li>The project plan has also been shared by MDICI and ODS with sectoral ministries concerned with the regional development to elaborate their sectoral strategies.</li> <li>The Tunisian government approved a series of major projects in priority sectors in the South Region such as transport and logistics, social services infrastructure, energy, water &amp; environment, tourism, urban development and science and technology poles, industry, etc. proposed in the regional development strategy (2015-2035).</li> </ul>
	Indicator 2 Number of investment activities implemented in the Southern region based on the regional development strategy and plan formulated by the project.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved (2017) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No. of investment activities: 5</li> <li>Type of investment activities/projects: (i) Sfax-Gabès Highway, (ii) Zarzis port development, (iii) Ground water quality improvement in Tozeur, (iv) Industrial zone for gypsum cluster, (v) Authentic tourism federation of Dhafer (Berber destination)</li> </ul> (2018) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No. of investment activities: 7</li> </ul>

<sup>2</sup> Source: ODA Country Data Book 2012, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Japan.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Type of investment activities/projects:</b> (i) Médenine-Ras Jedir highway, (ii) Gabès-El Hamma expressway (under implementation), (iii) Tataouine expressway connecting with A1 highway (under implementation), (iv) Railway network extension to Médenine (under study phase), (v) Gabès port rehabilitation, (vi) Djerba seawater desalination plant, (vii) Ground water quality improvement in Ben Guerdane.</li> </ul>																																													
<p>(Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan) Sustainable regional development is promoted to reduce regional disparity by utilizing available resources and advantages of the Southern Region.</p>	<p>Indicator 1 The number of newly established enterprises in the priority sector in Tunisia as well as the Southern Region.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved</p> <p>1) No. of newly established enterprises in the priority sector <b>in Tunisia</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Priority sector</th> <th>2015</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing</td> <td>4,726</td> <td>4,763 (+1%)</td> <td>4,898 (+4%)</td> <td>5,199 (+10%)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mining, and other industries</td> <td>1,028</td> <td>928 (-10%)</td> <td>898 (-12%)</td> <td>596 (-42%)</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total</b></td> <td><b>5,745</b></td> <td><b>5,691 (-1.1%)</b></td> <td><b>5,796 (0.7%)</b></td> <td><b>5,795 (0.7%)</b></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Percentages of variation are calculated by considering 2015 as a base year for comparison.</p> <p>2) No. of newly established enterprises in the priority sector <b>in the Southern Region</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Priority sector</th> <th>2015</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2017</th> <th>2018</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing</td> <td>822</td> <td>930 (+13%)</td> <td>1,129 (+37%)</td> <td>1,452 (+77%)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mining, and other industries</td> <td>143</td> <td>152 (+6%)</td> <td>120 (-16%)</td> <td>89 (-38%)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Handicraft</td> <td>1,147</td> <td>1,006 (-12%)</td> <td>1,225 (+7%)</td> <td>959 (-16%)</td> </tr> <tr> <td><b>Total</b></td> <td><b>2,112</b></td> <td><b>2,088 (-1%)</b></td> <td><b>2,474 (+17%)</b></td> <td><b>2,500 (+18%)</b></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Percentages of variation are calculated by considering 2015 as a base year for comparison.</p>	Priority sector	2015	2016	2017	2018	Agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing	4,726	4,763 (+1%)	4,898 (+4%)	5,199 (+10%)	Mining, and other industries	1,028	928 (-10%)	898 (-12%)	596 (-42%)	<b>Total</b>	<b>5,745</b>	<b>5,691 (-1.1%)</b>	<b>5,796 (0.7%)</b>	<b>5,795 (0.7%)</b>	Priority sector	2015	2016	2017	2018	Agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing	822	930 (+13%)	1,129 (+37%)	1,452 (+77%)	Mining, and other industries	143	152 (+6%)	120 (-16%)	89 (-38%)	Handicraft	1,147	1,006 (-12%)	1,225 (+7%)	959 (-16%)	<b>Total</b>	<b>2,112</b>	<b>2,088 (-1%)</b>	<b>2,474 (+17%)</b>	<b>2,500 (+18%)</b>
	Priority sector	2015	2016	2017	2018																																										
Agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing	4,726	4,763 (+1%)	4,898 (+4%)	5,199 (+10%)																																											
Mining, and other industries	1,028	928 (-10%)	898 (-12%)	596 (-42%)																																											
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,745</b>	<b>5,691 (-1.1%)</b>	<b>5,796 (0.7%)</b>	<b>5,795 (0.7%)</b>																																											
Priority sector	2015	2016	2017	2018																																											
Agriculture, fishery, livestock breeding, food processing	822	930 (+13%)	1,129 (+37%)	1,452 (+77%)																																											
Mining, and other industries	143	152 (+6%)	120 (-16%)	89 (-38%)																																											
Handicraft	1,147	1,006 (-12%)	1,225 (+7%)	959 (-16%)																																											
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,112</b>	<b>2,088 (-1%)</b>	<b>2,474 (+17%)</b>	<b>2,500 (+18%)</b>																																											
	<p>Indicator 2 Social services are improved such as improvement in accessibility to hospitals, water supply and schools in the Southern Region.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved</p> <p>1) Accessibility to hospitals</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Number of beds in hospitals for 1,000 inhabitants increased from 1.67 in 2015 to 1.86 in 2017.</li> <li>The ratio of number of inhabitants / basic health center improved from 3,769 in 2015 to 3,611 in 2017.</li> <li>On the other hand, number of inhabitants for 1 doctor indicator regressed from 1,210 in 2015 to 1,399 in 2017.</li> </ul> <p>2) Accessibility to water supply</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The quality of supplied water has improved after the operation of Djerba seawater desalination plant and groundwater desalination plants in Tozeur.</li> <li>As for the rate of connection to the network, it was almost stable at 99.3% in 2016 and 2017 against 99.2% in 2015.</li> </ul> <p>3) Accessibility to schools</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The preschool level has been generalized in primary schools.</li> <li>The number of students in one classroom and the number of teachers per students did not change from 2015 to 2017.</li> </ul>																																													

Source: Terminal Evaluation Report, Answer to the questionnaire by MDICI and ODS

### 3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and the project period exceeded the plan (Ratio against the plan: 107% and 170%, respectively). The main reasons for the delay were delays in the project activities from 2013 to 2014 due to the deteriorated security situation in the Southern Regions, the general elections in 2014, and the frequent change of counterpart staff. The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is **low**.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

The government of Tunisia gives a high importance to the participatory approach for formulation of the regional development plan, and has recommended to all administrations concerned to consider applying this approach for preparation of the next development plan for the period from 2021 to 2025.

#### <Institutional Aspect>

There has not been any change in the institutional structure for the regional development in Tunisia. MDICI supervises ODS for the monitoring and evaluation of the regional development strategies, plans and actions in the Southern Region and coordinates between all regional development departments and sectoral departments (ministries) with regard to the approach, methods and procedures applied for monitoring and evaluation. ODS is responsible of the coordination of implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the regional development strategies, plans and actions in the Southern Region under the supervision of MDICI. Although there is an issue of insufficient human resources in MDICI and ODS, the existence of a plan for reshuffling of civil servants is likely to secure a reinforcement of the human resources of MDICI and ODS in the future. Also, the development taskforces, which had been established by the project as a coordination body for the public-private partnership at the governorate level, was reorganized to the "Regional Development Committees" composed of representatives of public and private sectors, NGO's, members of Parliament, and so on. Also, "Public-Private dialogue

platforms” were established for promotion of the economic development in the governorates of Gafsa, Gabès and Medenine under the EU funded project, “Regional Initiative of Support to a Sustainable Economic Development” (2015-2019). At the national level, “Sectoral Committees” with representatives from the related ministries, labor and trade unions, NGOs, private sector, and so on were established. The above coordination mechanisms at national and regional levels have been maintained at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Technical Aspect>

ODS has regularly carried out monitoring and evaluation for implementation of the government’s 5-year development plan for 2016-2020 in the six governorates of the Southern Region according to guides and manuals prepared by MDICI with support of experts from the German TC Agency (GIZ) and UNDP. MDICI and ODS have participated to seminars and workshops to maintain and disseminate the knowledge and skills for planning and administrative management for participatory approach developed by the project.

<Financial Aspect>

MDICI received 475 million Tunisian Dinar (TND) in 2015, 568 million TND in 2016, 534 million TND in 2017 and 569 million TND in 2018 for their annual budgets, which included the budgets for monitoring and evaluation of the 5-year development plan. Based on the allocated annual budgets, MDICI and ODS have conducted their activities without major problems.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is high.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The expected goal through the proposed plan and the expected utilization of the proposed plan were partially achieved by formulation of the regional development strategy and the regional development plan as well as by capacity development of Tunisian counterpart for planning and administrative management through participatory approach. Although the regional development strategy formulated by the project has not been officially approved by the Tunisian government, its visions was shared by the government and proposed projects and activities were incorporated into the government development plan. In terms of sustainability, no major problems have been observed in the policy, institutional, technical, and financial aspects. As for efficiency, both the project cost and the project period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- It is necessary to establish a database with all data and statistics for an effective monitoring and evaluation of indicators related to the effectiveness /impacts of the project. For this purpose, a data collection process has to be conducted in coordination with other ministries and administrations and even through specific surveys, as necessary.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- In order to secure the sustainability of the project effects, the implementing agency should secure enough human resources to maintain an appropriate implementation of the main activities developed by the project. At least, as such a shortage of resources was predictable, JICA should have discussed with the implementing agency a plan to improve the situation and reach the level of resources that secures the sustainability of the project activity.
- Some good practices in relation with the dissemination of the knowledge and skills developed by the project have been realized by MDICI and ODS who followed an effective approach in this regard. Mainly two interesting examples are noted:
  - MDICI elaborated, with support of experts from the German TC Agency (GIZ) and UNDP, Guidelines about the management and the practice of the participatory approach for development planning, and employed experts for a best application of such a new approach in the planning process; and
  - MDICI and ODS disseminated, through participations in seminars and workshops, the knowledge and skills obtained from the project to different target groups, including staffs of ministries, development project stakeholders, NGOs, academia, etc.



Steering Committee Meeting at the central level (MDICI)



One of the 21 public consultation meetings held in the Southern Region during the project implementation period