

Country Name	Project on Small and Medium Industry Development based on Improved Service Delivery in Indonesia		
Republic of Indonesia			

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The government of Indonesia had promoted fiscal and economic structural reforms since the Asian Financial Crisis in 1997. As a result, the economy rebounded and were annually growing by over 6% since 2007 except for 2009. As for industrial policies, the “Regulation of the President No.28, 2008 on the National Industrial Policy” was issued in May 2008, aiming to further promote industrial development. Under the situation, JICA implemented a developing planning project, “Cooperation for Strengthening Clusters (SENTRA) of Small and Medium Industries” (2009-2010). Through the project, prepared were the guidelines to deal with challenges in industrial development such as the establishment of a system for efficient cluster development across administrative divisions and departments. Those guidelines were expected to be used by the central and regional governments and to contribute to acceleration of cluster development in small and medium industries (SMIs). However, some issues remained in service deliveries for the cluster development, and the services did not function well. Therefore, it was necessary to improve and/or strengthen such service deliveries.</p>				
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through the establishment of Local Working Groups (LWGs), trainings to their members on SMI development, the development of a Service Directory, the planning, implementation and evaluation of the Local Industry Action Plan (LIAP) and the development of a model for SMI development, the project aimed at arranging the preparation for expansion of a model for SMI development based on the efficient service delivery platform (the SMIDeP model¹) in the Ministry of Industry, thereby contributing to increases in the production and competitiveness of SMIs in target regions and practices of the established model in other regions.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: SMIs in target regions will increase the production and competitiveness and the established model for SMI development based on the efficient service delivery platform (“the SMIDeP model”) will be also practiced in other regions. Project Purpose: Preparation for expansion of the model for SMI development based on the efficient service delivery platform is arranged in MOI. 				
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Jakarta city, Samosir regency in North Sumatra province, Tegal regency in Central Java province, Palu city and its surrounding regencies in Central Sulawesi province, Pontianak city in West Kalimantan province, and Mojokerto city in East Java province Main Activities: 1) Establishment of LWGs, 2) Trainings to the members of LWGs on SMI development, 3) Development of a Service Directory, 4) Planning, implementation, and evaluation of the LIAP, 5) Development of a model for SMI development, etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;"> <p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 8 persons Trainees received: 39 persons (including observers) Equipment: PCs, photocopier, laser printer, etc. Local expenses: cost for project activities </td> <td style="width: 50%;"> <p>Indonesia Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 114 persons Land and facility: a project office in Directorate General of Small and Medium Industry of the Ministry of Industry and a project office in Dinas Industry & Trade in each target region Local expenses: travel cost and honorarium </td> </tr> </table> 			<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 8 persons Trainees received: 39 persons (including observers) Equipment: PCs, photocopier, laser printer, etc. Local expenses: cost for project activities 	<p>Indonesia Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 114 persons Land and facility: a project office in Directorate General of Small and Medium Industry of the Ministry of Industry and a project office in Dinas Industry & Trade in each target region Local expenses: travel cost and honorarium
<p>Japanese Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Experts: 8 persons Trainees received: 39 persons (including observers) Equipment: PCs, photocopier, laser printer, etc. Local expenses: cost for project activities 	<p>Indonesia Side</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Staff allocated: 114 persons Land and facility: a project office in Directorate General of Small and Medium Industry of the Ministry of Industry and a project office in Dinas Industry & Trade in each target region Local expenses: travel cost and honorarium 				
Project Period	April 2013 – April 2016 (Extended period: April 2016)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 351 million yen, (actual) 382 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Directorate General of Small and Medium Industry (DG-SMI) of the Ministry of Industry (MOI)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	KRI International Corp. (currently Koei Research & Consulting Inc.) UNICO International Corporation				

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

- In the process of evaluating this project, it was difficult to access to some of necessary data and information due to the facts that many of the related officials have already transferred and retired, and many officials had to work from home due to the COVID-19 pandemic. In addition, no field survey (including on-site interviews) was conducted to find necessary data and information. Amid these constrains, JICA made an evaluation judgment by collecting and analyzing information that was possible to access and by sending and collecting questionnaires through telephone and e-mail interviews with persons concerned.

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

- The project set the indicator 2 in the Project Purpose, “Budgetary and organizational arrangement of MOI to expand the established model to other regions” to verify the financial and organizational status to expand the SMIDeP model. However, it would be appropriate to verify such status from a “Sustainability” perspective. Therefore, the continuous status of the indicator 2 at the time of ex-post evaluation was verified at the institutional/organizational and financial aspects of the “Sustainability”.²

1 Relevance

¹ The SMIDeP model is the model to make budgetary and organizational provisions necessary for preparing and implementing guidelines as a foundation to provide services for SMI development.

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Indonesia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Indonesia's development policies of the "Strategic Plan" (2010-2014) aiming to promote cluster development and local industry development and the "Masterplan for Acceleration and Expansion of Indonesia's Economic Development" (2011-2025) setting the expansion of value-chain, the integration of regional development and sectoral development, the development of local industry and the strengthening of connectivity between regions as goals.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Indonesia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with Indonesia's development needs of the improvement of service deliveries for efficient cluster development in SMIs to promote industrial development in the country.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with "Country Assistance Policy for Indonesia" (2012) raising "support to further economic growth" as one of the prioritized areas, including support to improve various regulations and systems for the improvement of business and investment environments.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the time of project completion. During the project, a model for SMI development based on the efficient service delivery platform (the SMIDeP model) was established, and a technical guideline for facilitation of local industry development (the technical guideline) was prepared. Both were officially adopted by the DG-SMI, and the project also disseminated them to other regional governments with interests in them (Indicator 1). Then, in order to further disseminate the SMIDeP model based on the technical guideline, the DG-SMI was committed to the following preparatory arrangements: 1) narrowing down regional governments and industries according to their capacity of staffing and budgeting, 2) establishing a specialized internal team for the dissemination, and 3) making financial arrangements for necessary activities such as the provision of the technical guideline (Indicator 2). Through the project, a certain number of producers in the target industries attained their goals set in the LIAP (Ulos² fashion industry: 20 producers, Ship-part industry: 4 producers, Cacao processing industry: 16 producers) (Indicator 3).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been partially continued since project completion. The SMIDeP model and the technical guideline have still been adopted by the MOI and used in all the target areas except for West Kalimantan province. It was confirmed that 26 success cases in the cacao-processing industry and 20 success cases in the rattan furniture industry have made use of the model at the time of ex-post evaluation. According to the regional governments, although the exact number of the success cases for other industries targeted by the project was not confirmed, the industries have also continued. According to the MOI and the regional governments, this is because the model is a good approach and the guideline is also a good reference in developing SMIs. It was also reported that the MOI has disseminated/promoted the model based on a request from regional governments due to its decentralization system in the country. For instance, after project completion, receiving a request from Pasuruan city, a non-target city in East Java province, the MOI expanded the model to the automotive-part industry and the metal industry in the city. It should be noted that the entry point to an industrial cluster development has moved away from LWG, one of the components of the model, and shifted to the so-called field-facilitator approach named TPL-IKM after the end of the project. In the background, the establishment, operation and management of LWG necessitate much time, staff and effort. The MOI reported that the TPL-IKM approach has played a role in disseminating/promoting the model. As mentioned above, it was also confirmed that the model has no longer been adopted in West Kalimantan province due to turnaround of staff and limited human resources and that the staff in the province have endeavored to develop SMI's business by providing different trainings than the model.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was not achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. According to the regional government of Central Sulawesi province, the turnover and market segments of SMIs in the chocolate industry have been increasing along with the recognition of the chocolate products and the expansion of the marketing area. It was also reported that the rattan product becomes much easier to find due to the expansion of the marketing area. However, data on turnover and market channel of SMIs in all the target areas was not available at the time of ex-post evaluation. This was partly because the data is not properly managed in some of the SMIs, they are even not able to make their financial reports to be presented to government, and there has not been any database to store the data. Therefore, it could not be verified whether the SMIs could increase their productivity and competitiveness after applying the SMIDeP model (Indicator 1). In terms of the number of provinces which adopt the model, South Sulawesi province is the only province among non-target provinces that started a preparation to introduce the model into gold and silver crafter after project completion even though it has yet to be fully realized due to COVID-19 (Indicator 2). According to the MOI, the reasons why the model had not been well-disseminated/promoted after the project were because non-target provinces do not have any interests in it due to LWG requiring much time, staff, and effort, and under the decentralization system in the country, the national government cannot force regional governments to adopt it. Therefore, the MOI has currently set out to disseminate/promote the model with the TPL-IKM approach which imposes less burden on regional governments.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts were observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. Even though gender-based targeting was not originally planned in the project, some industries with the SMIDeP model have involved more women's income generating activities. For example, as for chocolate products, most of the business actors are women. Other than that, local governments in Central Sulawesi province started to support SMIs there in ways that they established a regional technical service unit for chocolate product to develop processed chocolate commodities and set up infrastructure (buildings and equipment) for the Small Industry Center on rattan processing.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

² Ulos is the traditional cloth of the Batak people in North Sumatra province.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results																
<p>(Project Purpose) Preparation for expansion of the model for SMI development based on the efficient service delivery platform is arranged in MOI.</p>	<p>1. Official adoption of developed guideline for SMI development by MOI.</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Continued) (Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The SMIDeP model and the technical guideline were officially adopted by the DG-SMI, and the project also disseminated them to other regional governments with interests in them. <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The SMIDeP model and the technical guideline have still been adopted by the MOI and used in the target areas as shown in the table below. <p>[The continuous status of the SMIDeP model among the target areas]</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="775 465 1520 698"> <thead> <tr> <th>Target areas</th> <th>Continuous status of the model (Yes/No)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>North Sumatra province (Samosir regency)</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Central Java province (Tegal regency)</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Central Sulawesi province (Palu city)</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> <tr> <td>West Kalimantan province (Pontianak city)</td> <td>No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>East Java province (Mojokerto city)</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Target areas	Continuous status of the model (Yes/No)	North Sumatra province (Samosir regency)	Yes	Central Java province (Tegal regency)	Yes	Central Sulawesi province (Palu city)	Yes	West Kalimantan province (Pontianak city)	No	East Java province (Mojokerto city)	Yes				
	Target areas	Continuous status of the model (Yes/No)																
North Sumatra province (Samosir regency)	Yes																	
Central Java province (Tegal regency)	Yes																	
Central Sulawesi province (Palu city)	Yes																	
West Kalimantan province (Pontianak city)	No																	
East Java province (Mojokerto city)	Yes																	
<p>2. Budgetary and organizational arrangement of MOI to expand the established model to other regions.</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In order to further disseminate the SMIDeP model based on the technical guideline, the DG-SMI was committed to the following preparatory arrangements: 1) they narrowed down regional governments and industries according to their capacity of staffing and budgeting, 2) they established a specialized internal team for the dissemination and 3) they made financial arrangements for necessary activities such as the provision of the technical guideline. <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> This will be confirmed at “Sustainability”. 																	
	<p>3. Number of success case (SMIs/producers which realized the goal set in the Local Industry Action Plan).</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Partially Continued) (Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The following success cases were observed in each target industry. <table border="1" data-bbox="775 1182 1520 1765"> <thead> <tr> <th>Target Industry</th> <th>No. of SMIs/Producers which attained the goal</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Ulos fashion</td> <td>20 producers entered and continued the transactions with the buyers & sales channels in the tourist/local markets of the handicraft products.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ship-part</td> <td>4 SMIs received Indonesia’s Classification Society (BKI) certification, entered the transactions with ship-building/industries, and received inquiries for transaction in the subsequent years.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cacao processing</td> <td>16 producers entered and continued the transactions with the buyers/sales channels in the modern segment market of chocolate products.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rattan furniture</td> <td>Not observed. Although 5 SMIs became capable of producing according to the standard manufacturing practice which was set by the LWG, tangible transaction with the buyers/users in the local modern segment was not reported.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Note: Concerning aloe processing and footwear industries targeted by the project in the latter stage, achievement of the main goal was not reviewed since the LWGs recognized that LIAP implementation was only half-way facilitated.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The following success cases were confirmed. According to regional governments, other industries targeted by the project have also continued. However, the exact number of the success cases was not confirmed. <table border="1" data-bbox="775 2056 1520 2145"> <thead> <tr> <th>Target Industry</th> <th>No. of SMIs/Producers with the SMIDeP model</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Cacao processing</td> <td>26</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rattan furniture</td> <td>20</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Target Industry	No. of SMIs/Producers which attained the goal	Ulos fashion	20 producers entered and continued the transactions with the buyers & sales channels in the tourist/local markets of the handicraft products.	Ship-part	4 SMIs received Indonesia’s Classification Society (BKI) certification, entered the transactions with ship-building/industries, and received inquiries for transaction in the subsequent years.	Cacao processing	16 producers entered and continued the transactions with the buyers/sales channels in the modern segment market of chocolate products.	Rattan furniture	Not observed. Although 5 SMIs became capable of producing according to the standard manufacturing practice which was set by the LWG, tangible transaction with the buyers/users in the local modern segment was not reported.	Target Industry	No. of SMIs/Producers with the SMIDeP model	Cacao processing	26	Rattan furniture	20
	Target Industry	No. of SMIs/Producers which attained the goal																
Ulos fashion	20 producers entered and continued the transactions with the buyers & sales channels in the tourist/local markets of the handicraft products.																	
Ship-part	4 SMIs received Indonesia’s Classification Society (BKI) certification, entered the transactions with ship-building/industries, and received inquiries for transaction in the subsequent years.																	
Cacao processing	16 producers entered and continued the transactions with the buyers/sales channels in the modern segment market of chocolate products.																	
Rattan furniture	Not observed. Although 5 SMIs became capable of producing according to the standard manufacturing practice which was set by the LWG, tangible transaction with the buyers/users in the local modern segment was not reported.																	
Target Industry	No. of SMIs/Producers with the SMIDeP model																	
Cacao processing	26																	
Rattan furniture	20																	

(Overall Goal) SMIs in target regions will increase the production and competitiveness and the established model for SMI development based on the efficient service delivery platform (“the model”) will be also practiced in other regions.	1. Turnover and market channel of SMIs in target regions are increased.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Unverified • Data on the turnover and market channel of SMIs in target provinces was not available. This was because some of the SMIs have not been managed professionally and not been able to make their financial reports to be presented to government. In addition, there has not been any database to store such data.
	2. Number of regions which opt the established model and improve SMI development service are increased.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not Achieved. • South Sulawesi province, which was not originally a target province for the project, started to adopt the SMIDeP model for gold and silver crafts after the project completion. However, the activities were being suspended due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The model has yet to be expanded to other non-targeted provinces.

Source : Project Completion Report, Interview and questionnaire to the MOI and regional governments of North Sumatra province, Central Java province, Central Sulawesi province, West Kalimantan province and East Java province

3 Efficiency

The project cost and period slightly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 109% and 103%, respectively). The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

“Master Plan for National Industrial Development” (2015-2035) is a guideline for the government and industry players in industrial planning and development including SMIs. “National Industrial Policy” (2015-2019) and the draft of “National Industrial Policy” (2020-2024) represents the direction and action for implementing the “Master Plan for National Industrial Development” (2015-2035). As the project aims to develop SMIs, it has been endorsed by these policies.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

There were some changes in the organizational structure of the MOI in 2018 after the project completion. The DG-SMI, the implementing agency during the project, changed to the Directorate General of Small, Medium and Multifarious Industry. In addition, during the project, the MOI adopted a territorial approach, for instance the Directorate SMI Region I (covered area: Sumatra and Kalimantan), the Directorate SMI Region II (covered region: Java, Bali and Nusa Tenggara) and the Directorate SMI Region III (covered area: Sulawesi, Maluku, Maluku Utara, Papua Barat and Papua) whilst it changed to the following commodity approach; the Directorate SMI of Food, Wood Products and Furniture, the Directorate SMI of Chemical, Clothing, Crafts and Multifarious Industry and the Directorate SMI of Metal, Machine, Electronics and Transport Equipment. According to the MOI, the changes enable more comprehensive and sustainable SMI development.

[The Directorate General of Small, Medium and Multifarious Industry of the MOI]

The Directorate General of Small, Medium and Multifarious Industry (particularly, the Legal and Cooperation Division of Secretary) takes responsibilities of formulating a strategy/program for the SMI development. They also financially support regional governments to disseminate/promote the SMIDeP model, such as the provision of budget for salary or honoraria for a facilitator to implement the model. According to the MOI, 21 staff members are allocated to the Division but are not devoted to disseminating/promoting the SMIDeP model, and instead, the TPL-IKM approach mentioned in the <Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation> has played the role on a demand basis from regional governments. There has currently been one facilitator deployed to Pasuruan city to guide the SMI development with the model.

[Regional governments]

The regional government controlling North Sumatra province has 3 staff who are responsible in SMIs development, the one controlling Central Sulawesi province has 32 staff members, the one controlling Central Java province has 13 staff members, the one controlling East Java province has 20 staff members and the one controlling West Kalimantan province does 6 staff. Considering that North Sumatra province, Central Sulawesi province, Central Java province, and East Java province have continued the SMIDeP model even at the time of ex-post evaluation, it is considered that the number of the staff has been sufficient. West Kalimantan province has also secured a certain number of staff to promote the model but has not had an interest in doing it as LWG necessitates much time, staff, and effort as mentioned above.

[The Service Directory]

The web-based service directory was developed by the project. However, after project completion, the directory became discontinued due to lack of human resources who handle it. Thereafter, the Directorate General of Small, Medium and Multifarious Industry launched a new website (<http://ikm.kememperin.go.id/>) as a platform for SMIs development and operates the website at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Technical Aspect>

[The Directorate General of Small, Medium and Multifarious Industry of the MOI]

The staff of the Legal and Cooperation Division of the Secretariat of the Directorate General of Small, Medium and Multifarious Industry have sustained the skills and knowledge necessary to disseminate/promote the SMIDeP model. In the background, they regularly participate in internal and external workshops/trainings.

[Regional governments]

The staff of regional governments have had the knowledge and skills to continue the SMIDeP model to some extent. However, they have not been given any specialized trainings to disseminate/promote the model due to the budget constraints. They mostly rely on invitations from the MOI to participate in training/workshop.

[The Technical Guideline for the Facilitation of Local Industry Development]

As mentioned in the Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation, the technical guideline for the SMIDeP model has still been used by the MOI and the regional governments. The technical guideline can help the TPL-IKM solve the problems they face in the development of SMIs by placing facilitators in their groups/association. The group/association regularly holds meetings to

discuss various problems.

<Financial Aspect>

[The MOI]

The budget data for the MOI is shown in the table. According to the MOI, they have stably secured their budget every year and allocated a certain amount of budget for the dissemination/promotion of the SMIDeP model even though the specific budget is publicly undisclosed. Its source is the national budget. As mentioned in <Institutional/Organizational Aspect>, the dissemination/promotion of the model is a demand base from regional governments, so when regional governments make a request to introduce the model, the MOI can allocate a necessary budget affiliated to deploy a facilitator as well as to organize LWG meetings in order to implement the SMIDeP model.

Budget for the MOI ³					
(Unit: Trillion Indonesian Rupiah)					
2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021 (plan)
3.25	2.83	2.83	3.61	2.10	2.99

[Regional governments]

The budget data for regional governments was not available. According to the regional governments, they have not had a sufficient amount of budget for the SMIDeP model so that there have been some problems in the operation and dissemination/promotion of the model. For instance, they cannot hold any training to their staff. The budget to implement the model needs to be secured by the regional government.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose aiming to establish and disseminate the SMIDeP model but not achieved the Overall Goal aiming to increase the production and competitiveness of SMIs in target provinces by applying the model and practice the model in other provinces. As for sustainability, lack of personnel has occurred at provincial levels, regular workshop/training opportunities have not been given to staff at a provincial level, and a sufficient amount of budget for the dissemination/promotion of the SMIDeP model has not been secured. As for efficiency, the project cost and period slightly exceeded the plans.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- To enable the evaluation of the effectiveness of the assistances provided by the Ministry of Industry, inclusive of SMIDeP model, it is recommended that the ministry may consider putting a mechanism and database to trace the performance (inclusive of financial performance) of the SMIs supported.
- It is also recommendable to incorporate the SMIDeP model into the Trainings of Trainers' curriculum of TPL-IKM so that the model would become more familiar to the trainers and the application of the model (or its essence) could be considered in the field.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- The entry point of an industrial cluster development has shifted from LWGs, which was one of the components of the SMIDeP model facilitating a cluster development, to the TPL-IKM approach after the end of the project. Although being recognized since the time of project planning, the TPL-IKM approach saw some problems in its sustainability so that the project did not adopt it as a tool to disseminate/promote the model. Instead, the project determined to establish LWGs. However, formulation and facilitation of LWGs need to get through a process of making stakeholders for the development of local industries engage in the preparation of LIAP, and the process necessitates much time, staff, and effort. This has been the significant obstruction for regional governments to introduce the SMIDeP model. Therefore, it is recommended that projects should carefully consider how to make well use of or improve an existing system to maximize the project effects at the time of project planning and/or implementation.



2019 Focus Group Discussion for Follow up of the SMIDeP Model on the Development of Metal and Automotive Part SMI in Pasuruan city



2018 Focus Group Discussion among Stakeholders for the Adoption of the SMIDeP Model in Pasuruan city

³ The budget data are referred from Ministry of Industry's website (from 2016 to 2018) as well as from Ministry of Industry (from 2019 to 2021)