Country Name)	The Project for Enhancement of the Capacity for Waste Management toward Sound Material-cycle Society						
Republic of Koso	0V0	Sound Material-cycle Society						
I. Project Outline								
Background	After the independence in February 2008, the Republic of Kosovo put high priorities to reconstruct its econom and social development, while less emphasis to the environmental field. Consequently, waste collection servic was not sufficient enough to cope with the increasing solid waste due to the population upsurge especially in the urban area. Those problems made the sanitary conditions of Prizren municipality severely worsened. Government of Kosovo (GOK) formulated the waste management strategies for the period of 10 years (2013-2022) a development policy for solid waste management (SWM). The strategies referred to the achievements of reduction of environmental pollution caused by waste, the improvement of waste collection service throughout the countr and realization of a sound material-cycle society through 3R (reduce, reuse and recycling of waste).							
Objectives of the Project	 Through the development of solid waste master plan based on the situation analysis of Prizren municipality ar the implementation of SWM plan through pilot activities and awareness raising of citizens, the project aims strengthen the SWM capacity of Municipality of Prizren (MOP), thereby contributing to the enhancement of the SWM capacity of other municipalities and to improve the conditions of SWM in Kosovo. 1. Overall Goal: The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhancement and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo will be improved. 2. Project Purpose: The capacity of solid waste management in Prizren municipality will be strengthened. 							
Activities of the Project	 Mai (1) S pilot plan Inp Japanese Exp 2) Tra Equ 	t activities to confirm the feasibility, (4) Awa uts (to carry out above activities)	Ko 1)	(2) Development of SWM plan, (3) Implementation of ss raising for the people, (5) Implementation of SWM sovo Side Staff allocated: 16 persons (4 persons from Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning, 7 from MOP, 5 from Ekoregjioni Regional Waste Company) Land and facilities: Office space Others: Manpower for sample collection, sorting processing; Equipment for removal of residue				
Project Period	(extende	per 2011 – September 2015 ed period: September 2014 – September 2015)		oject Cost (ex-ante) 290 million yen (actual) 328 million yen				
Implementing Agency	* Reorga	y of Environment and Spatial Planning (MESP nized as Ministry of Economy and Environment (M pality of Prizren (MOP), Ekoregjioni Regional	IEE)					
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Kokusa	i Kogyo Co., Ltd.						

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

• Due to the state of emergency caused by COVID-19, all information was obtained through questionnaires and follow up phone calls/emails to MOP, Ekoregjioni RWC and MEE. No site visits were conducted.

• The outcome of the project studied under this ex-post evaluation is the combined effects with the preceding JICA Grant Aid Project, namely, "The

Project for Improvement of Solid Waste Management (2011-2012)" which provided the collection vehicles and the equipment for vehicle maintenance for MOP.<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

[Evaluating Achievement Status of Overall Goal]

• In order to examine the achievement level of Overall Goal, "The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo will be improved", the only one indicator, "Local governments that develop SWM plans increase" is originally set. Since this indicator alone does not suffice to examine the project effects on the improvement of waste management issue in Kosovo, "Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the project completion" and "Waste collection rate improves in other municipalities after the project completion" are used as Supplementary Information 1 and 2.

• In regard to the Indicator 1 "Local governments that develop SWM plans increase", the judgmental standard is not clearly defined. Considering that the Overall Goal is targeted for the areas of Kosovo as a whole but that the data collection was limited under the COVID-19, this ex-post evaluation study made an evaluation judgement based on the status of four neighboring municipalities whose data was obtainable for the given time period and who all have received the waste collection services from the same RWC, as well.

[Evaluating the sustainability]

• Considering that the Overall Goal is targeted for the areas of Kosovo as a whole but that the data collection was limited under the COVID-19, this ex-post evaluation study made an evaluation judgement based on the status of four neighboring municipalities for the same reasons on the above.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Kosovo at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, this project was consistent with "Strategy of the Republic of Kosovo on Waste Management 2013-2022" which emphasized the establishment of a sound material-cycle society through reduction of environmental pollution caused by waste, the improvement of the waste collection service nation-wide and waste minimization through 3Rs (reduce, reuse and recycle).

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Kosovo at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, this project was consistent with Kosovo's development needs to enhance the capacity of waste management as described in "Background" above.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the basic policy of Japan's assistance to Kosovo in 2011 and beyond which was to implement bilateral economic cooperation in the areas of economic and social stabilization, including human resource development, and the environment¹. \leq Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

By the time of project completion, the project achieved its purpose, "The capacity of solid waste management in Prizren municipality will be strengthened". MOP could acquire the related knowledge and skills through pilot activities of the project in which the waste collection system was improved by the optimized allocation of collection vehicles, the introduction of a bell collection, on-time notification of collection service to residents and the coverage expansion of waste collection service, etc. Furthermore, MOP could manage to introduce the environmental education to the pupils at schools and the community-based public education and awareness raising as well. Through implementation of this Project, the roles of residents, business entities and the local government in Prizren municipality became clear and each of them started fulfilling their roles. MOP has reached a level where it disseminates knowledge and experience, as a SWM model city, to other municipalities. As a result, MOP became able to secure funding to sustainably implement the five-year SWM Plan through introducing the waste tax system (Indicator 1). Before the end of the project, MOP organized the seminars several times and shared their knowledge and experiences obtained through the project by inviting most of municipalities in Kosovo, so that they were guided to receive instructions from MOP on how to start with the new form of SWM. It was judged that the capacity of MOP in terms of SWM was enhanced and thus MOP was fully prepared to disseminate the acquired knowledge and experiences to other local governments (Indicator 2).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

After the project completion, the project effects have continued. MOP has continued to secure funding for SWM. The amount secured for SWM increased from Euro 1,000,000 which represents 2.63% of MOP's annual budget for 2015 to Euro 1,300,000, 3.25% of the same for 2020. MOP has also continued providing the support to other local governments in the form of administrative advice in which staff of the other municipalities has visited MOP (WMS Section) to learn on the system which is being implemented in Prizren municipality. Frequency and the participants for administrative advice varied depending on the needs of each municipality. In 2016, all of four neighboring municipalities received the administrative advice. Since then, Dragash municipality received it every year up to 2019. Malisheve did it again in 2017. In case of Rahovec and Suhareke, they took interval and received it for the second time in 2019. In 2020, partly due to the effect of COVID-19, no activities on dissemination have been done. Furthermore, according to MOP, the Association of Kosovo Municipalities has a Collegium for Waste Management whose member are consisted of all SWM officers from all Kosovo Municipalities. They organize meetings six times a year and discuss about all relevant topics in waste management field. Through this Collegium, knowledge and experiences learned from JICA projects has been shared as well.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It is observed that the Overall Goal, i.e. "The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo will be improved" has been achieved. With administrative advice from MOP, two out of the four neighboring municipalities successfully developed their own SWM plans. One of them, the Municipality of Rahovec, has already started the implementation of their SWM Plan from 2016. The other, the Municipality of Suhareke, will start its implementation in 2021. In addition, another neighboring municipality, the Municipality of Dragash, developed the draft plan and it is expected that they will complete the plan by the first half of 2021 with the support of external donors (Indicator 1). The improved status of SWM for Prizren municipality and four neighboring municipalities was confirmed by the increasing amount of collected waste as well as the improving waste collection rate of each municipality. As shown in the table blow, the amount of collected waste for Prizren as well as 4 neighboring municipalities have shown the increasing trends. Likewise, waste collection rate for Prizren municipality alone improved from 76.8% (2015) to 85.3% (2019) (Supplementary Information 1). A positive trend is also observed for the waste collection rate for these four municipalities, which in average improved from 47.5% (2015) to 71.7% (2019) (Supplementary Information 2).

No specific ripple effect other than the above was observed during the study.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

		Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal
Aim	Indicators	Results

¹ Source: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, "ODA Country Data Book in 2011"

	Indicator 1:	Status of the Ac		t: achieved (c	ontinued)						
The capacity of	Municipality of	(Project Comple			41		. f	014 4 201		2012 1	
solid waste	Prizren becomes able										
nanagement in	to secure funding to	budget for SWM depending on the five-year SWM Plan. In order to secure the financial sources that net necessary for the realization of proper waste management, MOP introduced the waste tax syste									
Prizren	· –				er waste	manager	ment, M	OP introdu	ced the wast	e tax system	
municipality will be strengthened.	the five-year Solid Waste Management	improve the tax (Ex-post Evalua		n rate.							
be strengthened.	Plan.			secure fundi	ng to sus	tainably	impleme	ont the five	wear SWM P	lan after pro	
	r 1a11.	• MOP has continued to secure funding to sustainably implement the five-year SWM Plan after proje									
		completion. (Currency unit: Euro								n. Luio)	
				Completion	2016	20	017	2018	2019	2020	
				2015							
		Amount of secured for S	0	1,000,000	1,200,0	00 1,2	200,000	1,300,000	1,300,000	1,300,000	
		Percentage of	of SWM								
		budget out budget of municipality year	of total Prizren	2.63%	3.12	2%	3.00%	3.25%	3.25%	3.25%	
	Indicator 2:	Status of the Ac	hievemen	t: achieved (c	ontinued)						
	Dissemination of	(Project Comple		× ×	,						
	experience and	• MOP was fully prepared to disseminate the experience and knowledge obtained through the project and									
	knowledge obtained in				-			-	-		
	the project to other	collection service			-				-		
	local governments is	• Before the en	nd of proje	ect, MOP orga	nized the	seminars	s in July	2014 with 2	22 participants	, in March 20	
	ready.	with 59 particip	ants and i	n July 2015 w	ith 53 pa	rticipants	s from 35	municipal	ities, where the	e presentation	
		the entire waste	e manage	ment reform v	was made	and the	experier	nce and kn	owledge obtai	ned through	
		project were dis	sseminated	d. These semi	nars serve	d to incre	ease the i	interests an	nong local gov	ernments wh	
		representatives		OP to get the	necessary	instruction	ons on ho	ow to start	with the new f	orm of SWM	
		(Ex-post Evalua									
		The experien							ed from MOP	to other local	
		governments af		-							
		• Through the Collegium for Waste Management whose member are consisted of all SWM officers from									
		Kosovo Municipalities, knowledge and experiences learned from JICA projects has been shared as well.									
		Status of the Achievement: partially achieved									
(Overall Goal)	Indicator 1:	Status of the Ac	hievemen	-	-			JICA projec	ts has been sh	ared as well.	
	Indicator 1: Local governments	Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua		-	-				ts has been sh	ared as well.	
The capacity for	Indicator 1: Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua	ation)	-	nieved					ared as well.	
	Local governments	(Ex-post Evaluation • Two out of the	ation) ne followin	t: partially acl	nieved governmen	nts devel		SWM plan	s.		
The capacity for solid waste management of	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua	ation) ne followin	t: partially acl	nieved governmen nt	nts devel Imp	oped the	SWM plan			
	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit	ation) ne followin zy	ng four local g Developmer	nieved government ns	nts devel Imp	oped the	SWM plan	s.	resolved	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evaluation • Two out of the	ation) ne followin zy	ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan	nieved governmen nt ns ion	nts devel Imp	oped the	SWM plan	s. Issues to be	resolved	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced,	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve	ation) ne followin ry	t: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed	nieved governmen nt ns ion	nts develo Imp of s	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement	SWM plan tion ans ed	s. Issues to be Lack of l	resolved	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit	ation) ne followin ry	t: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss	nieved governmen nt ns ion	nts develo Imp of s	oped the plementat SWM pla	SWM plan tion ans ed	s. Issues to be Lack of l	resolved	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve	ation) ne followin y y I De I	It: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d to be develope	nieved governmen nt ns ion I plan raft d by	nts develo Imp of s	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma	resolved human /budget n resources	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec	ation) ne followin y y I De I	It: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d	nieved governmen nt ns sion I plan raft d by	nts develo Imp of : Im f	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 -	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, –	resolved human /budget n resources	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec	ation) ne followin y , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	It: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d to be develope	nieved governmer nt ns sion I plan raft d by 21	nts devel Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma	resolved numan /budget n resources m donors	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash	ation) ne followin y I Dev I T Dev	t: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d to be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM	nieved governmer nt ns sion I plan raft d by 21	nts devel Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro	resolved numan /budget n resources m donors	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase.	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke	ation) ne followin y	t: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d to be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM	nieved governmer nt ns sion I plan raft d by 21	nts devel Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro	resolved numan /budget n resources m donors	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase.	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac	ation) ne followin y	It: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 200 veloped SWM	nieved governmen nt sion I plan raft d by 21 I plan	nts devel Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1:	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac	ation) ne followin y Dev Dev thievemen ation)	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved	nieved governmer nt ns ion f plan raft d by 21 f plan t plan	nts devel Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement	SWM plan tion ans ed 6	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua	ation) ne followin y Dev Dev thievement ation) Waste	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commisss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved	nieved governmer nt ns ion f plan raft d by 21 f plan t plan	nts develo Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua	ation) ne followin y Dev I Dev hievemen ation) Waste amoun (ton) Generat	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d to be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec tt 2015 ed 52 52	nieved governmen nt ns ion ion i f plan f plan f plan	nts develor Imp of 3 Im f To be 016	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019	resolved numan /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua	ation) ne followin y I Dev Dev hievemen ation) Waste amoun (ton) Generat waste (tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commisss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved tt: achieved e Projec Complet 2015 ed 1) 52,52	nieved governmen nt ns ion ion i f plan f plan f plan	nts develo Imp of : Im f To be	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua Municipality	ation) te following y Dev I Dev I T Dev Ation) Waste amoun (ton) Generat waste (Collector	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 200 veloped SWM tt: achieved tt: achieved e Projec tt Complet 2015 ed 52,52 ed 40.36	nieved government is ion if plan raft d by 21 f plan f plan t ion 2 1 52	nts devel Imp of 3 Im f To be 016	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources. – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua	ation) ne followin y Dev Dev hievemen ation) Waste amoun (ton) Generat waste Collecte waste	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec tt Complet 2015 ed 52,52 ed 40,36	nieved government is ion if plan raft d by 21 f plan f plan t ion 2 1 52	nts develor Imp of 3 Im f To be 016	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources. – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521	resolved numan /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua Municipality	ation) ne followin y Dev Dev hievemen ation) Waste amoun (ton) Generat waste Collecte waste	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commisss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec tt Complet 2015 ed 52,52 ed 40,36	t ion 2 t 1 42	nts devel Imp of 3 Im f To be 016 2,521 2,175	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521 44,775	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52 45,74	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, - Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521 5 44,775	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260 24,767	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua Municipality	ation) te following y Dev I Dev I T Dev Ation) Waste amound (ton) Generatt waste Collector Waste collector	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commisss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 200 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec tt: achieved p 52,52 ed 40,36 e 76.8%	t ion 2 t 1 42	nts devel Imp of 3 Im f To be 016	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, - Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521 5 44,775	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua Municipality Prizren	ation) ne followin y Dev Dev hievemen ation) Waste amoun (ton) Generat waste Collecte waste	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commisss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 200 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec tt: achieved p 52,52 ed 40,36 e 76.8%	t ion 2 t 1 42	nts devel Imp of 3 Im f To be 016 2,521 2,175	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521 44,775	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52 45,74	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources, - Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521 5 44,775	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260 24,767	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua Municipality Prizren Note:	ation) te following y Dev I Dev I T Dev Ation) Waste amound (ton) Generat waste Collection rate (%)	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec Complet 2015 ed 10 52,52 ed 40,36	t ion t t t t t t t t t t t t t t t t t t t	nts develo Imp of : Im f To be 016 2,521 2,175 0.3%	oped the olementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521 44,775 85.3%	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52 45,74 87.1%	s. Issues to be Lack of H resources. – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521 5 44,775 5 85.3%	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260 24,767 94.3%	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Act (Ex-post Evalua Municipality Prizren Note: (1) Amount of g	ation) te following y Dev I Dev I T Dev Ation) Waste amound (ton) Generatt waste Collection rate (%) generated	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commiss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d o be develope 1 st half of 202 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Projec Complet 2015 ed 40,36 e n (2) waste in ton is	t ion 2 t ion 2 t plan 42 t s s estimate	nts develo Imp of : Im f To be 016 2,521 2,175 0.3% d as: 0.83	oped the olementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521 44,775 85.3% 337 kg (a	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52 45,74 87.1% werage amore	s. Issues to be Lack of I resources. – Lack of huma Support fro. Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521 5 44,775 5 85.3% pount of general	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260 24,767 94.3%	
The capacity for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo will be enhanced, and thus the waste management issue in Kosovo	Local governments that develop SWM plans increase. Supplementary Information 1: Waste collection rate achieved by the project is maintained in Prizren municipality after the	(Ex-post Evalua • Two out of th Municipalit Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Suhareke Status of the Ac (Ex-post Evalua Municipality Prizren Note:	ation) te following y I Dev I Dev I T Dev thievement ation) Waste amount (ton) Generat waste Collector vaste collection rate (%) generated ays x 172	tt: partially acl ng four local g Developmer of SWM plan Draft commisss was formed veloped SWM Prepared the d to be develope 1 st half of 200 veloped SWM tt: achieved e Project Complet 2015 ed 40,36 e n (2) waste in ton is ,594 (populati	t ion 2 f plan t t f plan t f on 2 f plan f on 2 f plan f on 2 f plan f on 2 f	nts develo Imp of : Im f To be 016 2,521 2,175 0.3% d as: 0.83 zren from	oped the plementat SWM pla - nplement from 2010 - e implement in 2021 2017 52,521 44,775 85.3% 337 kg (a n census i	SWM plan tion ans ed 6 ented 2018 52,52 45,74 87.1% werage among n 2011 / 10	s. Issues to be Lack of H resources. – Lack of huma Support fro Lack of huma 2019 1 52,521 5 44,775 5 85.3% pount of generat 00)	resolved human /budget n resources m donors n resources 2020 as of July 26,260 24,767 94.3% ted waste per	

Waste collection rate	I)	Status of the Achievement: achieved (Ex-post Evaluation)							
improves in other municipalities after	Municipality	Waste amount (ton)	Project Completion 2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020 as of June	
the project	Malisheve	Generated waste ⁽¹⁾	14,609	14,609	14,609	14,609	14,609	na	
I I		Collected waste	6,842	7,493	8,475	9,001	9,368	4,186	
		Waste collection rate (%) ⁽²⁾	46.8%	51.3%	58.0%	61.6%	64.1%	na	
	Rahovec	Generated waste	15,020	15,020	15,020	15,020	15,020	na	
		Collected waste	5,027	7,599	8,471	8,279	8,853	3,863	
		Waste collection rate (%)	33.5%	50.6%	56.4%	55.1%	58.9%	na	
	Dragash	Generated waste	8,985	8,985	8,985	8,985	8,985	na	
		Collected waste	4,557	5,205	5,531	5,797	6,067	2,560	
		Waste collection rate (%)	50.7%	57.9%	61.6%	64.5%	67.5%	na	
	Suhareke	Generated waste	15,995	15,995	15,995	15,995	15,995	<u>na</u>	
		Collected waste	9,449	10,771	11,647	12,751	15,384	na	
		Waste collection rate (%)	59.1%	67.3%	72.8%	79.7%	96.2%	na	
	Average Waste collection rate for 4 municipalities		47.5%	56.8%	62.2%	65.2%	71.7%	na	
		-			-	-	-		
	completion.	completion. Malisheve Rahovec Dragash Dragash Suhareke Average Waste rate for 4 mar Note: (1) Amount of person for sma 1,000 (2) Waste colle	Interpreterwastecompletion.MalisheveWasteMalisheveWasteCollection rate (%) (2)RahovecGenerated wasteRahovecCollected wasteRahovecCollection rate (%)DragashGenerated wasteDragashGenerated wasteSuharekeCollected wasteSuharekeCollected wasteVaste collection rate (%)Generated wasteVaste collection rate (%)Generated wasteSuharekeCollected wasteVaste collection rate (%)Generated wasteSuharekeCollected wasteNote: (1) Amount of generated of person for smaller munici 1,000 (2) Waste collection rate (%)	and positive completion.Malishevewaste (i)14,609MalisheveCollected waste6,842Waste collection rate (%) (2)46.8%RahovecGenerated waste15,020RahovecCollected waste5,027Waste collection rate (%)33.5%DragashGenerated waste8,985DragashCollected waste4,557Waste collection rate (%)50.7%SuharekeGenerated waste15,995SuharekeCollected waste9,449Waste collection rate (%)59.1%Average Waste collection rate for 4 municipalities47.5%Note: (1) Amount of generated waste in ton i person for smaller municipalities) x 361 1,000 (2) Waste collection rate (%) = Collected	$\begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \text{and project}\\ \text{completion.} \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \text{waste} & (1) & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 14,609 & 16,600 & 15,600 & 15,600 & 15,600 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 15,000 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 14,609 & 15,000 & 14,000 & 15,000 & 1$		$\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	$\frac{ \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf{x} _{\mathbf{x}} \mathbf$	

3 Efficiency

Both of the project period and project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against plan: 136% and 113%, respectively). The project period was extended for the purpose to complete the transformation of the financial resource of its SWM from collected fees to the waste tax newly introduced under the five-year SWM Plan, which was intended to sustain the project effects. The excess cost was to cover the operation of extended period. The Outputs of the project were produced as planned.

Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

GOK has adopted "Strategy of the Republic of Kosovo on Waste Management 2013-2022", whose main objective is to create measures for the Republic of Kosovo in order to reduce the amount of waste and to establish a sustainable system of waste management. Furthermore, "Kosovo Integrated Waste Management Strategy (2021-2030)" and "Action Plan (2021-2023)" are under development, addressing the current shortfalls and constraints in the waste management sector by setting and delivering four strategic objectives: to develop a new generation of integrated waste management services and infrastructure, to professionalize the waste management and recycling sector, to strengthen regulation and control in the waste management sector by filling gaps and clarifying implementation mechanisms and to promote the values and practices of a Circular Economy.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

In the central level, MEE is responsible for environmental policy and supervises activities related to the environmental protection and spatial planning. The Division for Waste Management and Chemicals, in charge of SWM, has six staff and three of them are well-trained in SWM. According to MEE, the number of staff for SWM is insufficient considering the large volume of workload they need to cope with.

In the municipality level, MOP newly created the Waste Management Section (WMS) under the Directorate of Public Service in 2017. WMS is in charge of commissioning, monitoring, reporting and tax collection from citizens. With five staff and one inspector, WMS also supervises the Ekoregjioni RWC which provides daily waste collection services to Prizren municipality. According to MOP, the current staff number is less than what was projected under the SWM plan and is not sufficient for the smooth operation. Therefore, two more staff would be necessary, especially to reinforce the monitoring activities. Ekoregjioni RWC was transformed from a government-run company

to the regional company in 2003 and has become a shareholding company funded by five municipalities since 2007. Ekoregjioni RWC is consisted of the Board Directors and those representing five municipalities as members, with total number of 448 employees, including 244 for Prizren, 51 for Suhareka, 56 for Malisheva, 44 for Rahovec, 33 for Dragash and 20 for Board Directors and other administrative staff in Head Office of Ekoregjioni. According to Ekoregjioni RWC, the number of staff is sufficient to provide the waste collection services.² As for the four neighboring municipalities, Malisheve municipality and Dragash municipality have not yet developed the SWM plan yet. It is reported that these two municipalities have not had sufficient human resources to work for it. <Technical Aspect>

The staff of MOP and Ekoregjioni RWC have sustained necessary skills and knowledge to enhance the SWM system introduced by the project. The WMS of MOP has closely cooperated with Prizren Unit of Ekoregjioni in developing monitoring system through installment of GPS³ on waste collection vehicles and proper reporting to the WMS. The manuals and guidelines on operational plans and on cost efficiency have been continuously utilized after the project completion. As for the staff of four neighboring municipalities, it is reported that they have not had necessary skills and knowledge to actively promote the SWM system introduced by the project. <Financial Aspect>

MOP has a self-sustained mechanism to secure the budget through waste tax system based on their financial plan. Citizens of Prizren municipality should pay tax on waste disposal and the amount collected through this system is used for commissioning Ekoregjioni RWC. According to MOP, the waste tax system introduced by the project has contributed not only to promoting the SWM system but also improving the financial situation of SWM in MOP. As for the other four municipalities, they have not prepared the financial plan and they have some problems in financing the SWM. It is anticipated that financial situation in terms of the SWM of those four municipalities will be improved with proper guidance and experiences practiced by the project.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspect. Therefore, the sustainability of the effects through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose of strengthening the capacity of solid waste management in Prizren municipality. The effects of the project have continued after the project completion, and the Overall Goal to enhance the capacity of SWM in municipality level and to improve the waste management issue in Kosovo has been achieved. As for the sustainability, there are no problems in the policy aspect, but slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspect. As for the efficiency, both of project cost and project period exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendation to Implementing Agency:

To MEE:

• It is recommended that MEE should newly recruit the staff for the Division for Waste Management and Chemicals. It was identified by the study that the current number of staff for SWM is insufficient considering the large volume of workload they need to cope with. To MOP:

• It is recommended that MOP should increase the number of staff of WMS by 2. The WMS was newly created under the Directorate of Public Service, in charge of commissioning, monitoring, reporting and tax collection from citizens. It was identified that for the smooth operation of SWM plan, two more staff is needed, especially to reinforce the monitoring system.

• It is recommended that MOP should continue their supports in terms of capacity development of SWM for neighboring municipalities, which would certainly contribute to the capacity improvement for solid waste management of municipality level in Kosovo as a whole.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

In order to sustain and expand the project effects, it is effective to create the built-in mechanism in which the capacity development is further promoted by the target population who directly received the technical assistance by the project.

MOP, the municipality which benefited from JICA Grant Aid Project, had further improved their capacity of SWM and accumulated the knowledge and skills of SWM with this technical cooperation project. Then, MOP has played a role of trainers to disseminate the knowledge and skills to other neighboring municipalities in the form of seminars. MOP continued their support in the form of administrative advices to other municipalities after the project completion. It should be well noted that knowledge sharing was not only the one of the strategies of this particular project, but also a constant requirement from MEE to MOP to have an open-door policy for other municipalities, so that MOP supported anyone who requested advice on SWM. It is reported that other neighboring municipalities who were not directly supported by the project, has gradually improved their capacities by the administrative advice from MOP.

Photos

² Municipalities in Kosovo have a legal obligation to manage waste in accordance with the Law on Waste No. 04 / L-060 and a by-law to establish the

body or unit. In practice, the targeted municipalities have usually one or two officials in charge of waste management duties.

³ GPS: Global Positioning System

