

Country Name	Project of Strengthening School-based Collaborative Teacher Training (SBCT)
Republic of Rwanda	

I. Project Outline

Background	Education is a priority sector for the Government of Rwanda. The Rwanda Education Board (REB) implemented the “Strengthening Mathematics and Science in Secondary Education Project (SMASSE)” from 2008 to 2011 in collaboration with JICA, which aimed at improving the subject content knowledge and pedagogical practice of science and mathematics teachers in secondary schools. While SMASSE achieved its project purpose as the trained teachers improved their lesson performance in a way that promotes student-centered learning, several challenges remained. The trainees did not share the acquired knowledge and skills with their colleagues, so the project fell short of meeting the increased training needs due to the expansion of basic education. The Government of Rwanda requested JICA another technical cooperation project aiming at improving the quality of lower secondary education by capacity development of teachers through revitalized school-based in-service teacher training (SBI).												
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through building an institutional framework of introduction, implementation, coordination and monitoring of SBI at the national, district, sector and school levels, the project aimed at promoting schools with O-level (7th to 9th grades)^{Note 1} nationwide to implement SBI activities, thereby contributing to improved classroom lessons and students’ learning.</p> <p>Note 1: The schools with O-level include the three types of schools; 9-year basic education schools (1st to 9th grades), 12-year basic education schools (1st to 12th grades) and secondary schools (7th to 12th grades).</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Lessons become more effective to “let students be capable to do it.”^{Note 2} Project Purpose: Planned School-based INSET (SBI) activities are implemented. <p>Note 2: The phrase “let students be capable to do it” is used based on students’ achievements being described as such “Students should be capable/able to XXX” in the national curriculum of Rwanda at the time.</p>												
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: Nationwide (30 districts and 416 sectors in total) Main activities: Building an institutional framework to implement SBI, Conducting the district-level SBI induction workshops and the school-level SBI induction workshops, Conducting coordination activities for promoting SBI among the Teacher Development and Management Department of REB (REB-TDM), District Education Offices (DEOs) and Sector Education Offices (SEOs), etc. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Rwandan Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 7 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 7 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 3 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: Project office with facilities in REB</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: PCs, Laser printers, Video cameras, etc.</td> <td>3) Local cost: Workshop implementation costs, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local cost: Personnel cost for hiring local staff, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Rwandan Side	1) Experts: 7 persons	1) Staff allocated: 7 persons	2) Trainees received: 3 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office with facilities in REB	3) Equipment: PCs, Laser printers, Video cameras, etc.	3) Local cost: Workshop implementation costs, etc.	4) Local cost: Personnel cost for hiring local staff, etc.	
Japanese Side	Rwandan Side												
1) Experts: 7 persons	1) Staff allocated: 7 persons												
2) Trainees received: 3 persons	2) Land and facilities: Project office with facilities in REB												
3) Equipment: PCs, Laser printers, Video cameras, etc.	3) Local cost: Workshop implementation costs, etc.												
4) Local cost: Personnel cost for hiring local staff, etc.													
Project Period	January 2013 – December 2015 (Extended period: April 2015 to December 2015)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 204 million yen, (actual) 254 million yen										
Implementing Agency	Rwanda Education Board (REB), Ministry of Education (MINEDUC)												
Cooperation Agency in Japan	PADECO Co. Ltd.												

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on the ex-post evaluation>

- The project targets nationwide and the two indicators set for the Project Purpose needs the data on 1) the number of schools which conducted the school-level induction workshop and 2) the number of schools which implemented SBI out of all target schools nationwide both at the time of project completion and ex-post evaluation. Since the number of schools is increasing at a pace of about 100 schools every year in Rwanda and their exact data were not obtained both at the time of project completion and ex-post evaluation, the results of both indicators are calculated based on the estimated values of implementation rate obtained from the limited sample size.

<Special perspectives of evaluation to be considered>

- The successor project of SBCT, “Project for Supporting Institutionalizing and Improving Quality of SBI Activity (SIIQS)” (2017-2019) and a number of teacher training projects incorporating the SBI approach conducted by other development partners have been conducted in Rwanda and the results confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation include the impact of these other projects.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Rwanda at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

“Teacher Development and Management Policy in Rwanda” formulated in 2007 addressed the improvement of the status of school-based training through on-the-job mentoring system. “Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) 2010-2015” addressed the improvement of quality of education and the importance of continuous professional development (CPD) of teachers. Thus, the project was consistent with Rwanda’s educational development policies at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Rwanda at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

As mentioned in the background, there were high needs for providing training to in-service teachers as well as promoting CPD for

capacity development of teachers in Rwanda at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Country Assistance Policy for Rwanda (2012) which placed the human resources development for sustainable growth (science and technology education and training) as one of the priority areas.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved by the project completion. More than 80% of schools which attended the district-level SBI induction workshops conducted the school-level induction workshops at their schools (Indicator 1) and more than 80% of the schools which conducted the school-level induction workshops implemented SBI at their schools (Indicator 2). Although the district-level SBI induction workshops were held for 19 districts out of 30 districts due to a shortage of budget for conducting the workshops, another workshop, the orientation workshops for introducing the newly adopted Competence-based Curriculum (CBC) had been conducted by REB from 2015 and the introduction of SBI to the remaining 11 districts was realized by incorporating the SBI approach into the CBC training. Furthermore, the CBC training was targeted at all teachers of primary schools (1st to 6th grades), 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools unlike SBI, which was targeted at teachers in charge of 7th to 9th grades, so primary schools were also included in the SBI implementation.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have continued since the project completion. According to the survey result conducted by the ex-post evaluation, SBI was introduced to more than 99% of primary schools, 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools nationwide and more than 99% of them have implemented SBI activities.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal is achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. According to the results of interview survey for 3 DEOs, 3 SEOs and 9 schools conducted by the ex-post evaluation, the three indicators set for the Overall Goal such as student satisfaction to lessons (Indicator 1), teachers' perceptions on lesson improvement (Indicator 2) and DEOs'/SEOs' perceptions on student performance (Indicator 3) have improved by the SBI implementation. For example, teachers have provided more effective lessons to improve students' learning and students are more satisfied with lessons and their level of participation to lessons, display of creativity and innovative thinking have also improved.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

As mentioned above, while it was necessary for REB to provide the CBC training to all teachers of primary schools, 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools nationwide, it was difficult to cover all teachers due to cost and system constraints. Conducting in-school training of CBC using the SBI approach enabled REB to provide the CBC training to all teachers nationwide. In addition, the SBI approach is based on the concept of CPD and through the implementation of SBI, CPD has been activated and promoted in the education sector in Rwanda. For example, the Technical Working Group on Teacher Professional Development chaired by REB-TDM and co-chaired by the development partners including JICA recognized the contribution of the SBI approach to CPD. Also, in response to increasing needs of CPD in Rwanda, the District CPD Committees (DCCs) with DEOs as the main member and the Sector CPD Committees (SCCs) with SEOs as the main member were established in all districts and sectors by a proposal of the Technical Working Group. Furthermore, many development partners such as British Council, USAID, VVOB (Belgian organization), UNICEF, international NGOs, etc. have implemented their CPD projects incorporating the SBI approach, one of which is JICA's successor project of SBCT called the "Project for Supporting Institutionalizing and Improving Quality of SBI Activity (SIIQS)" conducted from 2017 to 2019.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is high.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results
(Project Purpose) Planned SBI activities are implemented.	1. More than 80% of schools which attend district-level SBI induction workshops conduct school-level induction workshop at their schools.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Continued) (Project Completion) In the 19 districts where the district-level SBI induction workshops were held, more than 80% of 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools conducted the school-level induction workshops. (Ex-post Evaluation) According to the result of questionnaire survey to DEOs, after incorporating the SBI approach into the CBC training, SBI was introduced to more than 99% of primary schools, 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools.
	2. More than 80% of above schools implement SBI at their schools.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Continued) (Project Completion) In the 19 districts where the school-level induction workshops were held, more than 80% of 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools implemented SBI activities. (Ex-post Evaluation) According to the result of questionnaire survey to DEOs, more than 99% of primary schools, 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools have implemented SBI activities.
(Overall Goal)	1. Student satisfaction to lessons	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved

Lessons become more effective to “let students be capable to do it.”		According to the interview with 9 schools conducted by the ex-post evaluation, all of them answered that students were more satisfied with lessons and their level of participation to lessons, display of creativity and innovative thinking had also improved.
	2. Teachers’ perceptions on lesson improvement	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved According to the interview with 9 schools conducted by the ex-post evaluation, teachers’ lessons have improved by the SBI implementation as follows. 1) The spirit of teamwork among teachers has improved. They prepare lesson plans together and share skills. They have learned how to utilize locally available materials. Peer learning among teachers has improved and teachers share best teaching practices. 2) Teachers mindset has changed for the better, with more effort at peer learning among themselves and less absenteeism. Their pedagogical skills have also improved with more group work introduced as part of lessons. 3) Teachers have improved their group work facilitation and presentation skills as well. 4) Teachers are more committed to their work and there are less cases of teacher absenteeism. 5) Teachers have learned how to motivate students through rewarding their work. Best students are rewarded while under-performing students are encouraged to think more.
	3. DEOs’/SEOs’ perceptions on student performance improvement	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved According to the interview with DEOs and SEOs conducted by the ex-post evaluation, they mentioned that students’ academic performance improved thanks to more effective delivery of CBC-based lessons by teachers through SBI. Teachers and students work closer now; for example, teachers work more as group and deliver better lessons and this results in students’ participation in class more actively. Students are also engaged in extra-curricular activities more actively, such as debate clubs.

Source : Project Completion Report, Questionnaire survey to 23 DEOs, Interview survey to 3 DEOs (Bugesera, Gasabo and Musanze districts), 3 SEOs (Nyamata sector in Bugesera district, Kimihurura sector in Gasabo district, and Musanze sector in Musanze district) and 9 schools in Bugesera, Gasabo and Musanze districts.

3 Efficiency

Although outputs were produced as planned, both the project period and the project cost exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 133%, 125%, respectively). Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The current ESSP (2018/19 to 2023/24) prioritizes strengthening CPD including SBI activities. ESSP further stipulates that CPD activities should be school-based to ensure close and timely mentoring. Similarly, the National Teacher CPD Framework adopted in 2019 recommends school-based CPD as preferred mode of in-service teacher training.

<Organizational/Institutional Aspect>

Due to the reorganization of REB in 2018, while the Teacher Development and Management Department of REB (REB-TDM) was changed to the Teacher Development & Management and Career Guidance & Counseling Department (TDMCGC), one of the 4 units in TDMCGC, the Teacher Training Unit remains after the reorganization of REB and in charge of all activities related to CPD of teachers including coordination of SBI activities. After the reorganization, although the current staff members of Teacher Training Unit have all changed except one from the members at the time of project implementation, according to the Director of Teacher Training Unit, there has been no special problem in the current management system of CPD activities.

The Technical Working Group on Teacher Professional Development chaired by TDMCGC and co-chaired by the development partners also remains in place after the project completion and plays coordination roles across the CPD projects conducted by the development partners. The members of the Technical Working Group meet quarterly to jointly monitor the progress of all CPD activities conducted in all districts and sectors. However, as mentioned in the financial aspect below, the monitoring of CPD activities at district and sector levels has identified some challenges due to financial constraints.

<Technical Aspect>

There have been still challenges in the monitoring and feedback of SBI activities at the national, district and sector levels. The submission of monitoring reports on CPD activities including SBI activities should be improved at the district, sector and school levels. Although the Technical Working Group has developed an online monitoring form to track the progress of CPD activities at the district and sector levels, it is yet to be approved by the management of REB and its full operation has not yet started.

<Financial Aspect>

REB receives their budget for CPD activities from the Ministry of Education. The development partners cover the cost of their CPD projects either by handling the budget by themselves as JICA does or by channeling the funding through the Single Project Implementation Unit of REB, which coordinate project implementation. REB considers that the lack of recurrent budget for monitoring of CPD activities is the major challenge. DEOs and SEOs also face a challenge of insufficient funding to cover transport and other expenses for the monitoring of CPD activities as well as to hold DCCs and SCCs meeting regularly.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the technical and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal, and the project effects have continued. SBI was introduced to more than 99% of primary schools, 9-year basic education schools, 12-year basic education schools and secondary schools nationwide, and more than 99% of them implement SBI activities at the time of ex-post evaluation. Through the implementation of SBI, teachers have provided more effective lessons to improve students' learning and students have been more satisfied with lessons with more participation to lessons. In addition, CPD of teachers has been activated and promoted in Rwanda by the implementation of SBI and many development partners have implemented their CPD projects incorporating the SBI approach. Regarding the sustainability of the project, although the organizational framework for implementing and coordinating CPD activities including SBI activities has been sustained, there have been a concern on the shortage of budget for monitoring of CPD activities at the national, district and sector levels. As for the efficiency, both the project period and the project cost exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- To secure time for CPD activities including SBI, close coordination across government offices in charge of teacher professional development (e.g. REB TDMCGC) and those in charge of curriculum (REB Curriculum) will be essential. Joint monitoring of CBC implementation by these offices would help understand how much space schools currently have in their timetables for CPD activities, and how best additional time could be created for more frequent and quality in-service teacher education. Curriculum office may use the information to revisit the curriculum design and propose revisions to ensure space for CPD. This would help REB TDMCGC to institutionalize SBI further.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- The Rwandan government's recurrent budget for education prioritizes the allocation to teachers' salaries and the budget for activities for professional development of teachers including SBI is not sufficient, and this has posed risk to JICA project's sustainability after completion. For future projects, detailed analysis of Rwandan government's fiscal space should be conducted jointly by MINEDUC, REB and JICA, and project sustainability should be thoroughly discussed during the project formulation phase. Availability of budget at REB, district and sector office as well as schools should be included in this analysis. Also, it is necessary for JICA to have a continuous discussion with MINEDUC and REB to secure the recurrent budget for project activities during the project period.



Interview with a Sector Education Inspector



Reading room established to address the shortage of textbooks identified by SBI activities.