

United Republic of Tanzania

FY2020 Ex-Post Evaluation Report of Technical Cooperation Project

“The Capacity Development Project for

Improvement of Dar es Salaam Transport (Phase 2)”

External Evaluator: Mayumi Hamada

Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development

## **0. Summary**

This project was implemented for the organizations concerned to function coordination mechanism for improvement of traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam City by enhancing coordination capacity among the members of the Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Steering Committee (hereinafter referred to as Steering Committee) and the Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Secretariat (hereinafter referred to as Secretariat) toward establishment of Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Authority (hereinafter referred to as DUTA), strengthening organizational capacity for planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation, as well as improving technical capacity to address urban transport issues. The project’s direction to aim at improvement of traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam City corresponded with Tanzanian policy and development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy. Thus, the relevance of the project is high. As for the status of the outputs at the time of project completion, Secretariat members’ technical capacity to address urban transport issues was achieved through training. However, organizational capacity improvements in planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation were fair, and coordination capacity improvement among the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat toward establishing DUTA was low. Therefore, the functional status of coordination mechanism among the concerned organizations, which was the project purpose, remained fair. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the achievement of the overall goal—i.e., improved traffic conditions—was fair, with some positive impacts such as improved scenery, decreased street parking, and so on. Thus, the project’s effectiveness and impact were fair. Although the project cost was within the plan, the project period exceeded the plan. Therefore, the project efficiency was fair. Some minor problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational and financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project’s effects is fair.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

## 1. Project Description



Project Location



Clock Tower Roundabout  
on Samora Avenue

### 1.1 Background

In Dar es Salaam City, which holds an important position in Tanzanian national traffic, traffic congestion at arterial roads had been deteriorated year by year due to the increased number of registered cars and disorganized urban development. *The Dar es Salaam Transport Policy and System Development Master Plan* was established by *The Study for Formulation of Dar es Salaam Transport Policy and System Development Master Plan* supported by JICA from 2007 to 2008. The master plan recommendations included establishing DUTA, indicating that the effects of policy and projects had not emerged because of the insufficient coordination of the transport policies and projects among the multiple government bodies and business organizers. Based on the master plan, JICA implemented *the Capacity Development Project for Improvement of Dar es Salaam Transport* (hereinafter referred to as the phase 1) for two years beginning in 2010. Consequently, Steering Committee and Secretariat, which undertakes practical operation, were established for comprehensive coordination to function among existing government bodies and business organizers. Since then, Steering Committee and Secretariat have played key roles to strengthen related organizations, keeping an eye on the possibility of establishing DUTA. This project was expected to accelerate the establishment of DUTA, which was not accomplished by the phase 1, improve the whole transport system through the related organizations such as Steering Committee and Secretariat, and support formulation of viable policies. This project was implemented under the circumstances described above. Incidentally, in November 2015, approximately one year after the project commencement, ex-President Jakaya Kikwete was replaced by former President John Magufuli, who emphasized fiscal austerity and so on.

## 1.2 Project Outline

Table 1 Project Outline<sup>1</sup>

Overall Goal		Traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam are improved.
Project Purpose		A coordination mechanism in related organizations is well-functioning which ensures coordination in planning and implementation of selected projects.
Output	Output 1	Coordination capacity among the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat is enhanced towards establishment of DUTA.
	Output 2	Organizational capacity on planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation (PDCA) of the relevant agencies of Steering Committee and Secretariat is strengthened through selected project(s).
	Output 3	Technical capacities to address urban transport issues are improved through various training methods.
Total cost (Japanese Side)		287 million yen
Period of Cooperation		October 2014 – November 2017
Target Area		Dar es Salaam City
Implementing Agency		President's Office – Regional Administration and Local Government <sup>2</sup> (hereinafter referred to as PO-RALG)
Other Relevant Agencies/Organizations		Steering Committee (17 government organizations such as PO-RALG, MOWT, Ministry of Finance, Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS)) and Secretariat (16 government organizations such as Regional Administrative Secretary – Dar es Salaam (RAS-DSM), Dar es Salaam City Council (DCC)).

<sup>1</sup> Concerning the overall goal, the project purpose, and some of the outputs of the PDM, there are some differences in the expression between the English and the Japanese language versions. Table 1 above is described based on the English version, which was agreed upon between the Tanzanian and Japanese sides. The difference with the Japanese versions is as follows.

(1) Overall Goal: Traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam are improved by implementation of the selected projects. (2) Project Purpose: The selected projects are implemented through capacity of Steering Committee and Secretariat is enhanced, after appropriate coordination. (3) Output 2: Organizational capacity on planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of Steering Committee and Secretariat is strengthened through selected project(s).

<sup>2</sup> At project commencement, the implementing organization was PO-RALG, but this was changed to Ministry of Works, Transport and Communications (hereinafter referred to as MOWTC) later. This consisted of two separate ministries, the Ministry of Works and Ministry of Transport, which were merged into MOWTC. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, MOWTC changed again to become the Ministry of Works and Transport (hereinafter referred to as MOWT). Throughout this report, the agency's latest name, MOWT was adopted, to avoid confusion.

Consultant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- International Development Center of Japan</li> <li>- Oriental Consultants Global Co., Ltd.</li> </ul>
Related Projects	<p><b>Technical Cooperation Project</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Capacity Development Project for Improvement of Dar es Salaam Transport (Phase 1) (2010 – 2012)</li> <li>- The Project for the Comprehensive Transport and Trade System Development Master Plan (2011 – 2014)</li> <li>- Dar es Salaam Comprehensive Urban Transport System Formulation Study (2008)</li> </ul> <p><b>Japanese Grant Aid</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The Project for Widening of New Bagamoyo Road (2010)</li> <li>- The Project for Improvement of Transport Capacity in Dar es Salaam (2012)</li> <li>- The Project for Improvement of Tazara Intersection (2013)</li> </ul> <p><b>Other International Organizations and Donors</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Dar es Salaam Metropolitan Development Project (hereinafter referred to as DMDP) (2012 - 2017) (World Bank, hereinafter referred to as WB)</li> </ul>

### 1.3 Outline of the Terminal Evaluation

The Terminal Evaluation was not conducted for this project.

## 2. Outline of the Evaluation Study

### 2.1 External Evaluator

Mayumi Hamada, Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development

### 2.2 Duration of Evaluation Study

This ex-post evaluation study was conducted with the following schedule.

Duration of the Study: November 2020 – November 2021

Duration of the Field Study: December 2020 – October 2021 (conducted by a local consultant)

### 2.3 Constraints during the Evaluation Study

Due to the spread of COVID-19, the filed surveys by the external evaluator were cancelled, and remote surveys utilizing a local consultant were conducted instead. In

addition to the information collection through email and online communication, the local consultant conducted on-site information collection under instruction of the external evaluator such as collection of questionnaires, interview surveys to those who were concerned such as the implementing organization, project site visits, a travel speed survey, a pedestrian interview survey, a resident interview survey. The external evaluator scrutinized the collected information, made evaluation analysis and assessment.

### **3. Results of the Evaluation (Overall Rating: C<sup>3</sup>)**

#### 3.1 Relevance (Rating: ③<sup>4</sup>)

##### 3.1.1 Consistency with the Development Plan of Tanzania

At the time of planning, *Tanzania Development Vision 2025* aimed to improve Tanzanian citizens' quality of life, achieve good governance based on laws, and realize a competitive and strong economy. The *National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (MKUKUTA)* (Phase 1: formulated in 2005, Phase 2: formulated in 2010), which was formulated based on *Tanzania Development Vision 2025*, positioned the transport sector as a priority sector. At the time of project completion, *Tanzania Development Vision 2025* was still effective. Furthermore, the *Second Five-Year Development Plan* (hereinafter referred to as *FYDP II*) (2016/17 – 2020/21) was established in 2016, and the government of Tanzania has addressed further economic development and poverty alleviation issues accordingly.

Based on the above, the project's direction to aim to improve traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam City was consistent with Tanzanian policy from the planning stage until the completion.

##### 3.1.2 Consistency with the Development Needs of Tanzania

Dar es Salaam City was the central city for Tanzanian domestic economic activities and a strategic place for all transport (i.e., roads, railroads, airport, port). Moreover, the city played an important role as the starting point of an international corridor for landlocked countries. On the other hand, the traffic congestion along arterial roads in Dar es Salaam City had worsened year by year due to an increased number of registered cars as well as disorganized urban development. Improvement of transport policies and systems, as well as developing human resources to carry them out, was crucial for any infrastructure development to have an effect to promote distribution as well as improve transport efficiency. At the time of project completion, no change was observed in that Dar es Salaam City was the center of the Tanzanian domestic economy and the strategically important city for

---

<sup>3</sup> A: Highly satisfactory, B: Satisfactory, C: Partially satisfactory, D: Unsatisfactory

<sup>4</sup> ③: High, ②: Fair, ①: Low

domestic and international transport. The number of registered cars<sup>5</sup> increased as follows.

Table 2 Number of Registered Cars in Tanzania

(Unit: cars)

Fiscal Year	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16
Number of Registered Cars	187,589	283,137	276,558	248,472

Source: Tanzania Revenue Authority

Thus, no change is observed in Dar es Salaam’s economic and transportation importance upon project completion. The project’s aim to improve the city’s traffic conditions was consistent with Tanzania’s development needs.

### 3.1.3 Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy

Japan’s *Country Assistance Program for Tanzania* (June 2012) adopted “infrastructure development to support economic growth and poverty alleviation” as a priority area. Thus, the consistency with the Japanese ODA policy at the time of planning was high.

### 3.1.4 Appropriateness of the Project Plan and Approach

The change of Tanzania’s president and the resulting policy shift greatly affected this project, resulting in delayed activities for Output 1 (enhancing coordination capacity of Steering Committee and of Secretariat toward establishment of DUTA). Those who were concerned with the project discussed their exit strategy with the related organizations, and it was decided that Steering Committee would coordinate at the policy level under the MOWT’s umbrella, existing Regional Road Board (hereinafter referred to as RRB) would coordinate at the project level. This decision is regarded as unavoidable under the circumstances. Thus, it cannot be said there were serious problems in terms of project planning or changes during implementation.

Based on the above, this project was highly relevant to Tanzania’s development plan and needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy. Also, as there were no significant problems with the appropriateness of the project plan and the approach, the project’s relevance is high.

## 3.2 Effectiveness and Impact<sup>6</sup> (Rating: ②)

### 3.2.1 Effectiveness

The Project Design Matrix (hereinafter referred to as PDM) of this project had mainly

<sup>5</sup> There is no data at a city level alone, but only at a national level (Tanzania Revenue Authority).

<sup>6</sup> Sub-rating for Effectiveness is to be put with consideration of Impact.

two issues: a gap between Japanese and English versions, and the PDM’s logic itself, including indicators. These issues compelled the external evaluator to realign part of the PDM before confirming achievement status, analyzing effectiveness, and so on. More specifically, the issues were: (1) a gap between expressions in the Japanese and English versions of the PDM (Objectives: the overall goal, the project purpose, and Output 3. Indicators: some indicators for Outputs 1 & 3), (2) Issues with the appropriateness of indicators (the project purpose and Output 2). Therefore, the phrasing of the Japanese version of the PDM was modified in accordance with the English version, which was agreed on by both countries concerning (1). As for (2), Output 3’s Indicator 2 was deleted because the indicator (travel speed) was regarded as unnecessary. The overall goal, the project purpose, the outputs, and the indicators after re-alignment are shown below.

Table 3 Objectives and Indicators of the Re-Aligned PDM

Overall Goal	Traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam are improved.	(1) Travel data (e.g., travel speed, congestion, user satisfaction) is improved when compared to that in 2014.
Project Purpose	A coordination mechanism that ensures planning and implementation of the selected project(s) functions in related organizations.	(1) 70% of selected projects in line with the Urban Transport Investment Plan and Action Plan appear in the budget plan/pipeline of concerned implementing agencies by the end of the project.
Output 1	Coordination capacity among Steering Committee and Secretariat is enhanced towards the establishment of DUTA.	(1) DUTA establishment bill is developed during the first year of the project and further actions towards the establishment of DUTA are taken after the second year of the project. (2) Action plan(s) in accordance with the Urban Transport Investment Plan is approved by the (provisional) <sup>7</sup> board of management of DUTA in each fiscal year.
Output 2	Organizational capacity on planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation (PDCA) of Steering Committee and Secretariat is strengthened through the selected project(s).	(1) All implementing agencies of Secretariat encompass PDCA project management cycle by the end of the project.

<sup>7</sup> In the Japanese version of the PDM, the word “(provisional)” is described as “(or Steering Committee).”

Output 3	Technical capacities to address urban transport issues are improved through various training methods.	(1) 90% of Secretariat members acquire practical skills in planning, implementation, and data analysis of traffic surveys by the end of the project. (2) 80% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills to conduct comprehensive demand forecast by the end of the project. (3) 70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced knowledge in the network analysis and in planning optimum network improvement plan, identifying the priority corridor(s) by the end of the project <sup>8</sup> . (4) 70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills to conduct the feasibility study of the priority project by the end of the project.
----------	---	---

Remarks: “the selected projects” indicated in the project purpose mean the pilot projects designed and approved through this project.

### 3.2.1.1 Project Output

Regarding the achievement of the outputs by the project completion, the indicators and the achievement status are shown in Table 4.

The achievement of Output 1 (enhancement of Steering Committee and Secretariat coordination capacity toward the establishment of DUTA) was low upon project completion. This was due to long delays in activities resulting from the policy changes brought about by the inauguration of a new president (reducing government expenses by dismantling existing organizations and resisting establishment of new organizations, as well as the shift of DUTA ownership from PO-RALG to MOWT), which hampered the establishment of DUTA. The achievement of Output 2 (strengthening of organizational capacity for planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of Steering Committee and Secretariat) is assessed to be fair. Although the implementing organizations monitored and reported on the pilot projects by the project completion, the number of pilot projects whose project management cycles were completed by the end of the project was only three out of seven – fewer than half. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, although some questions were asked to the related organizations and those who were concerned with the project during implementation, sufficient information to assess this achievement was not obtained, as there were mixed answers. Thus, the achievement of Output 2 at the time of project completion is assessed as fair. Concerning Output 3 (improvement of technical capacities to address urban transport issues), the rate at which trainees acquired knowledge was high, according to their own evaluation of the training and questionnaires given to the institutions which dispatched the trainers and the institution for the training. Hence, the achievement of Output 3 was high.

In light of the above, the achievement of the outputs upon project completion was fair.

---

<sup>8</sup> The indicator 3-3 is described in the Japanese version of the PDM as follows. "70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills on the optimum network and the network analysis regarding selection of priority projects."



Table 4 Achievement of Outputs by Project Completion

Output	Indicator	Achievement	Achievement Level
1. Coordination capacity among the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat is enhanced towards establishment of DUTA	1-1. DUTA establishment bill is developed during the first year of the project and further actions towards establishment of DUTA are taken during the second/third year of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>By October 2014, the concept paper and the bill were prepared by the task force (TF) of PO-RALG.</li> <li>On the other hand, the organizations concerned did not agree with the above bill because it included establishment of an Urban Transport Authority (UTA), which targeted the entire country and required transition of power and budget of the concerned organizations. Consequently, the bill was modified to Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Authority (DUTA), which targeted the local government without transition of power. After that, DUTA was not established because a new president acceded to office and changed the policy, and the ownership of this project was transferred from PO-RALG to MOWT. As a result, the initial activity plan was significantly delayed (<i>Project Completion Report</i> [p5, p35]). (Achievement Level: Low)</li> </ul>	L
	1-2. Action plan(s) in accordance with the Urban Transport Investment Plan is approved by the (provisional) board of management of DUTA in each fiscal year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The DUTA Operation Plan formulated in December 2016 was discussed together with the exit strategy.</li> <li>It could not be confirmed whether the action plan in accordance with the Urban Transport Investment Plan was approved by the provisional board of management (Steering Committee) in each fiscal year. The DUTA board of management was not established (<i>Project Completion Report</i>, Questionnaire to the implementing organizations). (Achievement Level: Fair)</li> </ul>	
2. Organizational capacity on planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation (PDCA) of the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat is strengthened through selected project(s).	2-1. All implementing agencies of Secretariat encompass PDCA project management cycle by the end of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Indicator 2-1 was assessed to have been achieved at the project completion, because the implementing organizations monitored and reported on the pilot projects.</li> <li>On the other hand, only three pilot projects out of seven were completed by the project completion, one was partially implemented, and one was planned only. The remaining two were not implemented. Namely, although the related organizations made progress reports during the project implementation period, the number of the pilot projects for which related organizations could actually experience the project management cycle by PDCA was less than half.</li> <li>The replies to the questionnaires and interviews at the ex-post evaluation from the related organizations and the key persons during the project period showed mixed responses regarding to what extent the implementing organizations of Secretariat acquired skills on project cycle management by PDCA. Therefore, sufficient information was not obtained to assess the achievement of this indicator.</li> </ul>	F
3. Technical capacities to address urban transport issues are improved through various training methods.	3-1. 90% of Secretariat members acquire practical skills in planning, implementation and data analysis of traffic surveys by the end of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Based on the result of the skill test conducted at the completion of the training, practical skills were acquired as follows and the indicators were achieved; 57% of the trainees acquired a "capacity to sufficiently utilize the training results in practice," and 32% acquired a "capacity to mostly utilize the training results in practice," which meets the requirement "70% - 90% of the trainees of Secretariat acquire practical skills on traffic planning" (<i>Project Completion Report</i> [p38]).</li> <li>The trainers from National Institute of Transport (hereinafter referred to as NIT) and Ardhi University who taught the above training responded that the trainees' levels of understanding by the project completion was 5 or 4 out of 5 scales (Questionnaire).</li> </ul>	H
	3-2. 80% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills to conduct comprehensive demand forecast by the end of the project.		
	3-3. 70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced knowledge in the network analysis and in planning optimum network improvement plan, identifying the priority corridor(s) by the end of the project.		
	3-4. 70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills to conduct the feasibility study of the priority project by the end of the project.		

Source: Questionnaire to the implementing organization, *Project Completion Report*  
 Remarks: The marks shown in the Achievement Level column indicate the following:  
 H: High (achieved by 80% and above) F: Fair (50% - 79%) L: Low (Less than 50%)

### 3.2.1.2 Achievement of Project Purpose

Regarding the achievement status of the project purpose by the project completion, the indicators and the achievement are shown in Table 5.

Table 5 Achievement of Project Purpose by Project Completion

Project Purpose	Indicator	Achievement	Achievement Level
A coordination mechanism in related organizations is well-functioning which ensures coordination in planning and implementation of selected project(s)*.	70% of selected projects in line with the Urban Transport Investment Plan and Action Plan appear in the budget plan/pipeline of concerned implementing agencies by the end of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>At the time of the ex-post evaluation, questions were asked in the questionnaires to the implementing and related organizations on the status of coordination mechanisms at project completion on a scale from 1 to 5 (5 is the best, 1 is the worst). The average of the answers received from six organizations and two persons who worked as the key persons for the Steering Committee and Secretariat was 3.4, which is fair (Questionnaire).</li> <li>Among the seven pilot projects adopted, three of them were fully implemented, one was partially implemented, and one was planned only. Therefore, the project purpose was assessed to be completed at the time of project completion, because more than "70% of the selected projects appeared in the budget plan" and half of the pilot projects proceeded to the implementation stage (<i>Project Completion Report</i> [p35]).</li> </ul>	F

Source: Questionnaire to the implementing organization, *Project Completion Report*  
 Remarks: The marks shown in the Achievement Level column indicate the following:  
 H: High (achieved by 80% and above) F: Fair (50% - 79%) L: Low (Less than 50%)

At the time of project completion, the project purpose (creating a functioning coordination mechanism) was assessed to have been achieved based on its indicator (70% of selected projects appearing in the budget plan of the implementing organizations). Not only did 70% of the selected pilot projects appear in the implementing organizations' budget plans, but more than half of the pilot projects proceeded to the implementation stage, as well. On the other hand, the appropriateness of this indicator to measure the functioning status of the coordination mechanism is questionable. According to the questionnaire survey at the ex-post evaluation, the functioning status of the coordination mechanism at the time of project completion was fair as shown in Table 5. Thus, the achievement of the project purpose at the time of project completion is assessed as fair.

As stated above, the achievement of both the project purpose and the outputs upon project completion was fair. Therefore, the project effectiveness is assessed as fair.

### 3.2.2 Impact

#### 3.2.2.1 Achievement of Overall Goal

##### (1) Achievement of Overall Goal

The indicators and the achievement status of the overall goal at the time of the ex-post evaluation is shown in Table 6.

The indicator (improvement of travel data) for the overall goal (improvement of traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam) included travel speed, congestion, and user satisfaction (satisfaction with the pedestrian space and evaluation of Pilot Project 1 (parking and footpath renovation on Samora Avenue)). The travel speed survey<sup>9</sup> and user satisfaction survey (pedestrian interview survey<sup>10</sup> and resident interview survey<sup>11</sup>) were conducted as similarly as possible with the baseline survey conducted by the project during its implementation in terms of survey site, interviewees, and so on. However, because the 2014 survey data could not be confirmed, comparison was made with 2016 travel speed survey data (before implementation of Pilot Project 1, hereinafter referred to as the baseline survey) for travel speed survey, and the data in to 2017 resident survey data (after implementation of the pilot project, hereinafter referred to as the end line survey) for the resident interview survey, and both baseline and end line survey record for the resident interview survey<sup>12</sup>.

As shown in Table 6, the travel speed survey showed that travel speed improved on Azikiwe St. (ex-Maktaba St.) during all time slots, and on Railway St. (ex-Station St.) at all time slots except for 14:00 – 17:00 at the time of the ex-post evaluation compared with the 2016 baseline survey. On the other hand, no improvement was observed on Uhuru St. at any of the time slots except for 05:00 – 08:00; to the contrary, speeds significantly slowed there

---

<sup>9</sup> Two probe cars ran the same route as the baseline survey (Travel Speed Survey) conducted by the project in 2016, in the same time slots and same frequency (five circuits on the same route between 5:00 am and 9:00 pm with the same starting time for each circuit as the baseline survey) on a week day. Speeds were measured for the same sections as the baseline survey.

<sup>10</sup> The pedestrian interview survey was conducted from April to May 2021. In the same way as the baseline and the end line survey conducted by the project, the same questions were asked to the pedestrians on Samora Avenue, the target area of Samora Improvement Pilot Project, based on the equal sampling interval method. The sample size was 214 persons, with the breakdown of 147 males and 67 females. By age bracket, (1) 18-25 years old: 23 persons, (2) 26-35 years old: 60 persons, (3) 36-45 years old: 59 persons, (4) 46-55 years old: 47 persons, (5) 56 years and above: 15 persons, (6) no response to the age question: 10 persons.

<sup>11</sup> The resident interview survey was conducted in May 2021. In the same way as the surveys conducted during the implementation period, it was implemented around Samora Avenue, i.e., the target area of Samora Improvement Pilot Project, at the three wards (Kisutu, Kivukoni, and Mchafukoge). Since population registry could not be obtained, based on the equal sampling interval method at each Ward, the same questions were asked to 123 residents, the number of which exceeded that of the end line survey. The breakdown of the respondents was 74 males and 49 females. By age bracket, (1) 18-25 years old: 15 persons, (2) 26-35 years old: 49 persons, (3) 36-45 years old: 35 persons, (4) 46-55 years old: 12 persons, (5) 56 years and above: 8 persons, (6) no response to the age question: 4 persons. The breakdown of respondents by the categories (in the same categorization with the surveys conducted during the project duration) was as follows. (1) retail shop: 29 persons, (2) office: 40 persons, (3) money exchange bureau: none, (4) hotel: none, (5) restaurant: 5 persons, (6) bank: 6 persons, (7) residence: 7 persons, (8) others: 31 persons, (9) no response to category question: 5 persons.

<sup>12</sup> The available data which could be compared in the travel speed survey was only the one in 2016.

Table 6 Achievement of Overall Goal (at the time of the Ex-post Evaluation)

Overall Goal	Indicator	Achievement	Achievement Level																																																																						
Traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam are improved.	Travel data (e.g., travel speed, congestion, user satisfaction) is improved when compared to that in 2014.	<p>(1) Travel speed and congestion The result of the travel speed survey, which was conducted as similarly as possible to the baseline survey, is shown below. Although the survey record in 2014 was not confirmed, the survey record in 2016 was obtained. Therefore, a comparison was made based on the assumption that the survey result in 2016 (before implementation of the pilot project) was the baseline survey.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="3"></th> <th colspan="8">Average Speed per hour (Unit: km)</th> </tr> <tr> <th colspan="2">Samora Ave.</th> <th colspan="2">Azikiwe St. (Maktaba St.)</th> <th colspan="2">Uhuru St.</th> <th colspan="2">Railways St. (Station St.)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>2016</th> <th>2021</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2021</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2021</th> <th>2016</th> <th>2021</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>05:00 - 08:00</td> <td>32</td> <td>21</td> <td>24</td> <td>33</td> <td>23</td> <td>33</td> <td>15</td> <td>20</td> </tr> <tr> <td>08:00 - 11:00</td> <td>10</td> <td>20</td> <td>13</td> <td>26</td> <td>12</td> <td>11</td> <td>7</td> <td>22</td> </tr> <tr> <td>11:00 - 14:00</td> <td>18</td> <td>17</td> <td>17</td> <td>18</td> <td>13</td> <td>12</td> <td>5</td> <td>15</td> </tr> <tr> <td>14:00 - 17:00</td> <td>4</td> <td>4</td> <td>18</td> <td>30</td> <td>12</td> <td>2</td> <td>11</td> <td>3</td> </tr> <tr> <td>17:00 - 19:00</td> <td>2</td> <td>7</td> <td>14</td> <td>20</td> <td>3</td> <td>2</td> <td>3</td> <td>16</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Source: Traffic Survey Results (pp11-12), Travel Speed Survey Remarks: The cells highlighted shows improvement.</p>		Average Speed per hour (Unit: km)								Samora Ave.		Azikiwe St. (Maktaba St.)		Uhuru St.		Railways St. (Station St.)		2016	2021	2016	2021	2016	2021	2016	2021	05:00 - 08:00	32	21	24	33	23	33	15	20	08:00 - 11:00	10	20	13	26	12	11	7	22	11:00 - 14:00	18	17	17	18	13	12	5	15	14:00 - 17:00	4	4	18	30	12	2	11	3	17:00 - 19:00	2	7	14	20	3	2	3	16	F
				Average Speed per hour (Unit: km)																																																																					
				Samora Ave.		Azikiwe St. (Maktaba St.)		Uhuru St.		Railways St. (Station St.)																																																															
2016	2021		2016	2021	2016	2021	2016	2021																																																																	
05:00 - 08:00	32	21	24	33	23	33	15	20																																																																	
08:00 - 11:00	10	20	13	26	12	11	7	22																																																																	
11:00 - 14:00	18	17	17	18	13	12	5	15																																																																	
14:00 - 17:00	4	4	18	30	12	2	11	3																																																																	
17:00 - 19:00	2	7	14	20	3	2	3	16																																																																	
<p>(2) User satisfaction Concerning Pilot Project No.1 (Samora improvement), pedestrian interview surveys and resident interview surveys were conducted as similarly as possible to the baseline and end line surveys conducted by the project. The results are shown below. As the survey record in 2014 was not confirmed, comparison was made with the 2016 data (before implementing the Samora improvement pilot project) and 2017 data (after implementing the same pilot project).</p> <p>1) Satisfaction with Pedestrian Space</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>APR 2016</th> <th>AUG 2017</th> <th>MAY 2021</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Satisfaction Level of the Pedestrians (%)</td> <td>20</td> <td>95</td> <td>58</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Source: <i>Project Completion Report</i> (pp16-17), Pedestrians Interview Survey on Samora Ave. at the time of the ex-post evaluation (214 persons)</p> <p>2) Evaluation of the Pilot Project (Resident Interview)</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>AUG 2017</th> <th>MAY 2021</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Satisfaction Level of the Residents (%)</td> <td>97</td> <td>65</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Source: <i>Project Completion Report</i> (pp16-17), Resident Interview Survey near Samora Ave. at the time of the ex-post evaluation (123 persons)</p>		APR 2016	AUG 2017	MAY 2021	Satisfaction Level of the Pedestrians (%)	20	95	58		AUG 2017	MAY 2021	Satisfaction Level of the Residents (%)	97	65																																																											
	APR 2016	AUG 2017	MAY 2021																																																																						
Satisfaction Level of the Pedestrians (%)	20	95	58																																																																						
	AUG 2017	MAY 2021																																																																							
Satisfaction Level of the Residents (%)	97	65																																																																							

Source: *Project Completion Report*, Travel Speed Test result, Pedestrian Interview Survey result, and Resident Interview Survey result  
Remarks: The marks shown in the Achievement Level column indicate the following:  
H: High (achieved by 80% and above) F: Fair (50% - 79%) L: Low (Less than 50%)

in another time slot (14:00 – 17:00). Furthermore, on Samora Ave., improvement was seen from 08:00 – 11:00 and 17:00 – 19:00, but conditions were aggravated or unchanged in the remaining three time slots. Therefore, the traffic congestion differed depending on time and place, and no common tendency throughout the city could be observed. Thus, the

improvement of the travel speed and congestion is assessed as fair.

As for the satisfaction on the pedestrian space, among the user satisfaction surveys, we conducted the pedestrian survey under the same conditions as the baseline and end line surveys in terms of survey site, target respondents, and questions. The satisfaction rate at the baseline survey was 20%, and 95% at the end line survey. Satisfaction was 58% at the time of the ex-post evaluation, which significantly exceeded the values at the baseline survey but significantly fell below the end line value. Thus, improvement of satisfaction is assessed to be as fair. Furthermore, resident interview survey results on the Pilot Project 1 (Samora improvement) showed a satisfaction rate of 65% at the time of the ex-post evaluation. This fell below the end line survey response of 97%. Therefore, the users' satisfaction rates for both indicators were fair. However, the information on actual values of these indicators at the time of the ex-post evaluation was based on information collected in the target area of Pilot Project 1 (Samora improvement), where the baseline and end line surveys were conducted during the project implementation. Analysis was made using the same survey method and target populations as the above surveys as much as possible. Therefore, there is a concern about the representativeness of our dataset for Dar es Salaam City as a whole.

Based on the above, the achievement of the overall goal is assessed as fair.

## (2) Continuation of Outputs and Project Purpose

The continuation status of the outputs after the project completion up to the ex-post evaluation is shown in Table 7.

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the DUTA had not been established. However, this does not mean that the government was no longer engaged in discussions related to its establishment. On the contrary, there is information that the discussions started again<sup>13</sup>. Even so, the specific progress was unclear, and the annual approval of the action plan was not observed. Thus, the continuation status of Output 1 after project completion was low. As for the strengthening of the organizational capacity for planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation (Output 2), sufficient information on the level of the capacity could not be obtained because many Secretariat staff members involved in the project's implementation were transferred after its completion. Because sufficient information for assessment could not be obtained, the continuation status of Output 2 after project completion is assessed fair. As for the technical capacity to address urban transport issues (Output 3), the questionnaire response from a person concerned who was a trainer of the training during the project implementation period from NIT indicated that this capacity was maintained even at the time of the ex-post evaluation. On the other hand, one response from an organization that dispatched trainers for the training to the questionnaire to the implementing organization and

---

<sup>13</sup> JICA Tanzania Office at the time of the ex-post evaluation

Table 7 Continuation of Outputs after Project Completion

Output	Indicator	Achievement	Achievement Level
1. Coordination capacity among the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat is enhanced towards establishment of DUTA.	1-1. DUTA establishment bill is developed during the first year of the project and further actions towards establishment of DUTA are taken during the second/third year of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Only one organization replied to the questionnaire indicating that the activities for establishment of DUTA were continued after the project completion, while others replied they did not know (Questionnaire and the interviews to the related organizations).</li> </ul>	L
	1-2. Action plan(s) in accordance with the Urban Transport Investment Plan is approved by the (provisional) board of management of DUTA in each fiscal year.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>At the time of the ex-post evaluation, DUTA has not been established. Sufficient information was not available to prove that action plan in accordance with the Urban Transport Investment Plan was approved by the provisional board of management (Steering Committee) in each fiscal year after project completion (Questionnaires and interviews to the related organizations).</li> </ul>	
2. Organizational capacity on planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation (PDCA) of the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat is strengthened through selected project(s).	2-1. All implementing agencies of Secretariat encompass PDCA project management cycle by the end of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Since many of the Secretariat members during the project period were transferred to other sections after project completion, information on the understanding level of the project management cycle by PDCA was not sufficiently obtained (Questionnaires and interviews with the related organizations).</li> </ul>	F
3. Technical capacities to address urban transport issues are improved through various training methods.	3-1. 90% of Secretariat members acquire practical skills in planning, implementation and data analysis of traffic surveys by the end of the project.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Concerning the capacity of the related organizations such as Secretariat at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the trainers from NIT who were involved in Output 3 responded that they still have sufficient capacity (Interview with the related organization).</li> <li>There were mixed responses regarding the continuation status of the training after project completion (Questionnaire to the related organizations).</li> </ul>	F
	3-2. 80% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills to conduct comprehensive demand forecast by the end of the project.		
	3-3. 70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced knowledge in the network analysis and in planning optimum network improvement plan, identifying the priority corridor(s) by the end of the project.		
	3-4. 70% of Secretariat members acquire advanced skills to conduct the feasibility study of the priority project by the end of the project.		

Source: Questionnaire to the implementing organization, *Project Completion Report*

Remarks: The marks shown in the Achievement Level column indicate the following:

H: High (achieved by 80% and above) F: Fair (50% - 79%) L: Low (Less than 50%)

related entities indicated that training continued after project completion. However, the majority of the responses from Secretariat members indicated the training ceased after project completion. Thus, the continuation of Output 3 is assessed as fair. Based on the above, the continuation of all the outputs after project completion is assessed to be fair.

Regarding the continuation of the project purpose after completion, neither Steering Committee, which was expected to take a policy coordination role, nor the Regional Road Board (hereinafter referred to as RRB), which was to coordinate at the project level, continued its activities. Although each organization reports its plans and the progress of

implementation at RRB four times a year, substantial coordination has not occurred at these meetings. Some organizations pointed out that RRB members had insufficient knowledge about or awareness of the selected projects<sup>14</sup>. Furthermore, the departure of key staff members at Secretariat due to transfer had a negative effect<sup>15</sup>.

As noted above, three of the seven selected pilot projects had been implemented by project completion. Among these, in Pilot Project 3 (Daladala and bus service improvements (i.e., introduction of ticketing system, improvement of business model), Daladala fare collection rates nearly doubled. However, eight months later, the pilot project encountered a setback due to sabotage by Daladala conductors. The reasons for this sabotage were regarded as the conductors' fear of losing their jobs and shifting the role of fare collection to Daladala drivers<sup>16</sup>. The ticketing system is expected to be integrated into the Bus Rapid Transit (hereinafter referred to as BRT), which is operated by the Dar Rapid Transit Agency (hereinafter referred to as DART) after completion of introducing e-ticket system. However, this had not yet occurred at the time of the ex-post evaluation. Concerning the two pilot projects not implemented by project completion, Pilot Project 6 (the introduction, and optimize & synchronize traffic signals & tidal flow along Ali Hassan Mwinyi Road (with bus priority)) has not been implemented afterwards either. On the other hand, improved traffic signals have been installed, and some actions have been taken for improvement of traffic congestion by the BRT Project, TANROADS, Ubungo Flyover Project, and so on. However, these actions, which were taken after project completion, do not seem to have resulted from coordination among the related organizations. Instead, they were implemented and coordinated by their respective organizations in accordance with its own plan.

Likewise, Pilot Project 7 (Fringe Park & Ride with shuttle bus services from parking spaces around Central Business District) was not implemented by project completion. And whether the project has continued after the project completion remains unconfirmed. However, former President Magufuli instructed DART and TANROADS to proceed with the improvement of park and ride services and related facilities at Kimara in Dar es Salaam City in 2017. Although DART completed its design for the park and ride facility, construction has not yet begun due to government budget shortages. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, discussions regarding the construction of the facility had been held between DART and TANROADS. On the other hand, taking the importance of the above facility, TANROADS has been providing park and ride services at Kimara and Korogwe in Kimara Ward under contracts with six domestic investment companies. DART also secured the BRT development budget for designing and constructing the Kimara park and ride facility for FY2017 and

---

<sup>14</sup> Questionnaire to the related organizations

<sup>15</sup> Questionnaire to the related organizations

<sup>16</sup> Interviews to those who were concerned

FY2018. However, the facility remained unbuilt at the time of the ex-post evaluation<sup>17</sup>. Thus, the continuation of the project purpose after completion is low.

Based on the above, the continuation of the outputs at the time of the ex-post evaluation is fair, the continuation of the project purpose is low, and achievement of the overall goal is fair. Concerning the cause for the overall goal remained fair, there is a possibility that the discontinuation of the project purpose (i.e., ensuring the functioning of the coordination mechanism) negatively affected the achievement of the overall goal.

#### 3.2.2.2 Other Positive and Negative Impacts

No impact on the natural environment was observed. And neither relocation of residents nor land acquisition was caused by the project<sup>18</sup>. Concerning other indirect impacts, no negative impact was observed. It was pointed out that Pilot Project 1 (Samora improvement) led to positive results such as the improvement of scenery and a decrease in street parking<sup>19</sup>.

Concerning impact, as stated above, improvements to travel speed and congestion levels at the time of the ex-post evaluation were fair. Although pedestrian satisfaction significantly exceeded baseline data, it fell significantly below the end line data. Resident satisfaction also fell below the end line data. Therefore, the achievement of the overall goal was fair. The continuation of the outputs from project completion to the ex-post evaluation was fair, but the continuation of the project purpose was low because the coordination mechanism no longer functions. Other indirect impact such as the improvement of scenery and a decrease in street parking were pointed out. Therefore, impact is fair.

In terms of effectiveness and impact, the achievement of the project outputs and the project purpose at the time of project completion was fair. Thus, the effectiveness was fair. The achievement of the overall goal at the time of the ex-post evaluation was fair, and the low continuation status of the project purpose after project completion might have hampered the achievement of the overall goal. Other positive impacts included improved scenery and decreased street parking. Therefore, the project had fair effectiveness and impact.

---

<sup>17</sup> Interviews to DART and TANROADS

<sup>18</sup> Questionnaire and interview to the implementing organization

<sup>19</sup> Questionnaire to the implementing and related organizations



### 3.3 Efficiency (Rating: ②)

#### 3.3.1 Inputs

The project's planned and actual inputs at the time of project completion are shown in Table 8.

Table 8 Project Inputs

Inputs	Planned	Actual (Project Completion)
(1) Experts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Approximately 33 M/M</li> <li>● Fields: Traffic administration, traffic planning, road planning/construction management, human resources development, etc.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Approximately 59.47 M/M</li> <li>● Fields: Traffic administration, traffic planning, road planning/and construction management, human resources development, etc.</li> </ul>
(2) Trainees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Training in Japan</li> <li>● In-country training or third-country training (Number of persons was not specified.) The fields are such as traffic planning and traffic policy.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Training in Japan: 8 persons in 7 courses</li> <li>● Third-country training: 25 persons in 2 courses <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- South Africa: 19 persons</li> <li>- Indonesia: 6 persons</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
(3) Equipment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Provision of equipment (Amount was not specified.)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Provision of equipment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Office equipment (computers, photocopy machine, printer, projector)</li> <li>- Office furniture (book shelf, table)</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>(USD2,470 and 16,197,323 Tanzanian shillings)</p>
(4) Local Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Local cost (Amount was not specified.)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Local cost (Amount was not specified.)</li> </ul>
Japanese Side Total Project Cost	Total: 300 million yen	Total: 287 million yen (including the cost for the Detailed Planning Formulation Study)
Tanzanian Side Total Project Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Allocation of counterparts (permanent and part-time) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- PO-RALG (several staff from some sections, including the Urban City Development Bureau)</li> <li>- Dar es Salaam City (city director and several staff from some sections)</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Provision of office space for the experts</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Allocation of counterparts <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Steering Committee/JCC members: 25 persons</li> <li>- Secretariat members: 20 persons</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Office space</li> <li>● Operational and running expenses (actual data unavailable)</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Operational and running expenses (including electricity, and cost for consumables, etc.)</li> </ul>	
--	--	--

\* M/M stands for “man month.”

### 3.3.1.1 Elements of Inputs

As the major inputs from the Japanese side, the key counterpart<sup>20</sup> who was previously engaged with the project during project duration at the implementing organization was asked to rate the quality, quantity, and timeliness of dispatch of experts and training-in-Japan using a scale ranging from 1 (worst) to 5 (best). All elements and aspects received scores of 4. The response indicated that training in Japan contributed to enhancing participants’ capacity. Both the experts and the training-in-Japan were evaluated highly. Although the actual input data for the Tanzanian side was unavailable, the inputs were made in accordance with the plan, and no problems emerged in terms of quality, quantity, and timeliness.

### 3.3.1.2 Project Cost

The total project cost borne by the Japanese side was 287 million yen (96% of the intended amount), which was within the plan.

### 3.3.1.3 Project Period

The project period was 3 years and 2 months. This exceeded the planned period (127% of the plan). The excess resulted from the long delay of the activities for Output 1 due to the inauguration of the new president and the resulting policy changes.

As stated above, although the project cost was within the plan, the project period exceeded the plan. Therefore, the project’s efficiency was fair.

## 3.4 Sustainability (Rating: ②)

### 3.4.1 Policy and Political Commitment for the Sustainability of Project Effects

*The Tanzania Development Vision 2025* and the *FYDP II (2016/17-2020/21)* were valid at the time of the ex-post evaluation. Furthermore, *Phase Three of the Transport Sector Investment Programme* (hereinafter referred to as TSIP III) (2018/19-2020/21) pointed out traffic congestion as an issue affecting urban transportation and stressed the necessity of a holistic approach that includes the overall transportation network. MOWT recognizes the importance of urban transportation in the national transportation policy, and it is unlikely

<sup>20</sup> At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the person was already retired. Questionnaire survey.

that the direction toward improving urban transportation will be changed. Thus, the sustainability from the aspect of policy and political commitment of the project, which aimed to improve the traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam City, is high.

#### 3.4.2 Institutional/Organizational Aspect for the Sustainability of Project Effects

By the time of project completion, the DUTA had not been established. As an exit strategy for the project, MOWT would be responsible for establishing and managing Steering Committee, which would coordinate policy level, and RRB would address coordination at the project level, so that the organizations would work complementary. At the same time, WB, which conducted DMDP (2012-2017), was expected to continuously support the establishment of DUTA<sup>21</sup>.

After project completion, although WB support (Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Improvement Project) continued (March 2021-December 2023)<sup>22</sup>, the establishment of DUTA was behind the schedule, and it has not been established at the time of the ex-post evaluation. The function of Steering Committee under MOWT and Secretariat, as agreed as the exit strategy, are not working either. In addition, even though the RRB holds quarterly meetings in which each organization reports its plans and progress, joint planning does not occur. Some causes of the coordination mechanism's failure include the departure of key members at Secretariat due to personnel transfers, the lack of an organization with strong initiative to lead the related organizations, and the dissolution of DCC<sup>23</sup>. Among the DCC's functions, those related to multiple municipalities in Dar es Salaam City have been taken over by RAS-DSM. However, RAS-DSM does not function as Secretariat. Furthermore, the RRB lacks knowledge about and awareness of the selected pilot projects by this project<sup>24</sup>. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, MOWT had not received a report from Steering Committee, and does not comprehend the progress of the activities<sup>25</sup>. However, some possibilities are under discussion on establishing the National Urban Transport Authority (hereinafter referred to as NUTA), which is expected to supervise not only Dar es Salaam City but also whole nation's urban transport, but the details remain unclear at present. Therefore, the sustainability of the institutional/organizational aspects is low.

#### 3.4.3 Technical Aspect for the Sustainability of Project Effects

During the project's implementation period, NIT and Ardhi University participated in training related to urban transportation planning (Output 3) and dispatched the trainers. The

---

<sup>21</sup> *Project Completion Report*, p. 40

<sup>22</sup> Information collected through e-mails with *Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Improvement Project*, WB

<sup>23</sup> The DCC was dissolved in February 2021 at the direction of the former president.

<sup>24</sup> Questionnaire to the related organizations

<sup>25</sup> Questionnaire to the implementing organizations

training was registered at the Engineer Registration Board (hereinafter referred to as ERB). Thus, at the time of project completion, the sustainability of the technical aspects was high because these institutions were considered to have sufficient capacity to train implementers<sup>26</sup>.

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, many of the training participants who were involved in the project had left due to personnel transfer to outside of Dar es Salaam City<sup>27</sup>. Concerning the continuation of the training, of the eight ministries and agencies that replied to the questionnaire, four indicated that training had not continued, one indicated that training had continued, and three did not answer. As explained above, many training participants who were involved with the project left due to personnel transfer, and no training had been conducted at many related organizations at the time of the ex-post evaluation. Even so, the *Urban Transport Planning Guide Book*, which was developed by the project, has been utilized as teaching material at NIT and Ardhi University. More specifically, this guidebook has been utilized in the Logistic and Transport Management Course for diploma, bachelor's degree, and master's degree students, as well in short-term courses at NIT for working professionals such as engineers working for wards, those involved in urban planning and road planning, and construction company staff<sup>28</sup>. At Ardhi University, the guidebook has been utilized in classes for bachelor's degree and master's degree students. Table 9 presents the number of students who took the courses over the last three years. In addition, Ardhi University has used the guidebook as teaching material for two subjects newly established in FY2021; this information is not included in Table 9<sup>29</sup>. Therefore, the sustainability of the technical aspect is fair.

Table 9 Students Who Took Classes Using the Teaching Material  
Developed by the Project at Ardhi University

(Unit: persons)

Year	2018	2019	2020	Total
Number of Students	165	181	149	495

Source: Questionnaire to Ardhi University

#### 3.4.4 Financial Aspect for the Sustainability of Project Effects

At the time of project completion, the sustainability of the project's financial aspect was regarded as comparatively high because Steering Committee and Secretariat's operational costs were minimal, and regular RRB meetings were held using the

<sup>26</sup> *Project Completion Report*, p. 40

<sup>27</sup> Questionnaire to the implementing organizations

<sup>28</sup> Questionnaire to NIT

<sup>29</sup> Questionnaire to Ardhi University

organization's own budget<sup>30</sup>.

Based on the questionnaire response from the related ministries and agencies, the members of Steering Committee and Secretariat, of the eight organizations that replied to the questionnaire, one replied that its budget was sufficient to continue the project's activities, six reported that their budgets were insufficient, and one did not answer. Among those that reported insufficient budgets, two mentioned that their allocated budget was only 15%-20% of the necessary amount. Although RAS-DSM is now responsible for the issues related to multiple municipalities in Dar es Salaam City due to the dissolution of the DCC, it has no budget for such activities, as the funds for projects such as road construction are allocated to the relevant ministries and agencies. Furthermore, the funds necessary to maintain the coordination mechanism by covering costs such as those related to meetings and training courses were not secured<sup>31</sup>. Thus, the sustainability of the financial aspect is low.

From the perspective of policy and political commitment, the sustainability is high, as the improvement of traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam remained important at the time of the ex-post evaluation. However, the DCC, which was responsible for coordination as Secretariat during the implementation period, has been dissolved at the time of the ex-post evaluation. The implementing structure has been changed so that the RAS-DSM took over the functions of the former DCC related to the multiple municipalities. However, Steering Committee under MOWT, which was part of the agreed-upon exit strategy, is nonfunctional, and this system has engaged in no policy coordination. Moreover, the RRB does not sufficiently function as the coordination mechanism for project implementation at the related organizations. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, there was some discussion of the possibility of establishing the NUTA, a nationwide version of the DUTA. However, the details remain unclear. Therefore, the sustainability of the project's institutional/organizational aspects remains low. Many training participants who were involved in the project left due to personnel transfer, and training has not continued at many related institutions. However, the teaching material developed by the project has been utilized to facilitate human resource development in the transportation field in courses taught to students and working professionals. Thus, the sustainability of the technical aspect is assessed as fair. Because the funding necessary to maintain the coordination mechanism was not secured by the implementing organization and many of the related organizations. Thus, the sustainability for financial aspect is low.

Some minor problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational

---

<sup>30</sup> *Project Completion Report*, p. 40

<sup>31</sup> Questionnaire and interview to the implementing organization

and financial aspects even though the sustainability was high in terms of policy and political commitment and fair in terms of technical aspect. Therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair.

## **4. Conclusion, Lessons Learned, and Recommendations**

### 4.1 Conclusion

This project was implemented for the organizations concerned to function coordination mechanism for improvement of traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam City by enhancing coordination capacity among the members of the Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Steering Committee and Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Secretariat toward establishment of DUTA, strengthening organizational capacity for planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation, as well as improving technical capacity to address urban transport issues. The project's direction to aim at improvement of traffic conditions in Dar es Salaam City corresponded with Tanzanian policy and development needs, as well as Japan's aid policy. Thus, the relevance of the project is high. As for the status of the outputs at the time of project completion, secretariat members' technical capacity to address urban transport issues was achieved through training. However, organizational capacity improvements in planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation were fair, and coordination capacity improvement among the members of Steering Committee and secretariat toward establishing DUTA was low. Therefore, the functional status of coordination mechanism among the concerned organizations, which was the project purpose, remained fair. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the achievement of the overall goal—i.e., improved traffic conditions—was fair, with some positive impacts such as improved scenery, decreased street parking, and so on. Thus, the project's effectiveness and impact were fair. Although the project cost was within the plan, the project period exceeded the plan. Therefore, project efficiency was fair. Some minor problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational and financial aspects. Therefore, sustainability of the project's effects is fair.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

### 4.2 Recommendations

#### 4.2.1 Recommendations to the Implementing Agency

None

#### 4.2.2 Recommendations to JICA

(1) It is desired that the JICA Tanzania Office will continue to collect information on the possibility of establishing the DUTA or NUTA and share relevant information with the JICA headquarters promptly when a new development is expected concerning the establishment

of DUTA/NUTA. To ensure coordination mechanism among the many government organizations in the transportation sector in Dar es Salaam City, it is desirable to continue to monitor the local situation and reconsider the possibility of supporting the establishment of the DUTA or NUTA in cooperation with the WB.

(2) The teaching material entitled “Urban Transport Planning Guide Book,” which was developed by this project, is widely utilized at NIT and Ardhi University for the sake of human resource development in the transportation sector at the time of the ex-post evaluation. It might be effective to utilize those educational institutions when JICA plans future projects in Tanzania that include training in the transportation sector.

#### 4.3 Lessons Learned

##### Establishment of mechanism for coordination among various ministries and agencies in a sector

This project was implemented to create a coordination mechanism among the many relevant organizations prior to the establishment of the DUTA. Although the coordination mechanism was established to a certain extent, the DUTA was not established by project completion. In addition, Steering Committee and Secretariat, which were expected to undertake the roles to maintain the coordination mechanism after project completion, were nonfunctional. This occurred because the key members of Secretariat left due to personnel transfers, and no organization had strong leadership enough to lead the related organizations.

When there are many related ministries and agencies in the same sector and the failure of the relevant coordination mechanism has an undesirable influence on the formulation of sector policy and its implementation, long-term support should be provided to the core counterpart organization until its organizational and technical capacities reach to a sufficient level. At the same time, when the coordination of many government institutions proves difficult, it may be effective in some cases for JICA to urge the partner country through political dialogue to achieve coordination among the related institutions using a top-down approach.