

Country Name	<b>The Project for Supporting Formulation of Industrial Sector Policy Focused on Technology Innovation and Dissemination</b>
Republic of Cote d'Ivoire	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	<p>Since the inauguration of the Ouattara government in 2011, the political turmoil had shown signs of abating and efforts to revive the domestic economy and re-establish the country's position as an economic powerhouse in the region were rapidly underway. In the National Development Plan (Plan National du Développement: PND) (2012-2015), formulated in 2012, "industrial policy planning" was identified as a priority action plan. In response, the Ministry of Industry and Mining – “MIM” (has become since 2019 the Ministry of Commerce and Industry – “MCI”) was working to finalize a new industrial policy by the end of 2014. However, Côte d'Ivoire had not formulated an industrial policy for about 20 years due to the ongoing political crisis, and thus faced many challenges in formulating an effective industrial policy.</p>								
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through (i) identifying needs and issues related to innovation and dissemination of the target technology, (ii) drafting policies for innovation and dissemination of target technologies, (iii) implementing pilot projects, and (iv) enhancing the capacity of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (ex-Ministry of Industry and Mining) and related agencies, the project aimed to implement proposed policies for innovation and dissemination of the target technologies, thereby contributing to the promotion and dissemination of innovation as well as the improvement in productivity and quality of companies in the industry.</p> <p>1. Expected Goals through the proposed plan<sup>1</sup>:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Innovation and dissemination of the target technology* will be promoted.</li> <li>- Productivity and quality of companies in the industry will be improved.</li> </ul> <p>*JICA and MCI agreed that the project targets small and medium industries (“SMI”) which produce processing machines for the agro-industry sector and mechanical parts (“targeted technologies”).</p>								
Activities of the project	<p>1. Project site: Whole country</p> <p>2. Main activities: (i) identifying needs and issues related to innovation and dissemination of the target technology, (ii) drafting policies for innovation and dissemination of target technologies, (iii) implementing pilot projects, and (iv) enhancing the capacity of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry and related agencies.</p> <p>3. Inputs (to carry out above activities)</p> <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Cote d'Ivoire Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Mission members: 11 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 23 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Equipment: equipment for pilot projects</td> <td>(6 staff from ex-MIM, 4 staff from CDT and 13 staff from I2T)</td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side	Cote d'Ivoire Side	1) Mission members: 11 persons	1) Staff allocated: 23 persons	2) Equipment: equipment for pilot projects	(6 staff from ex-MIM, 4 staff from CDT and 13 staff from I2T)
Japanese Side	Cote d'Ivoire Side								
1) Mission members: 11 persons	1) Staff allocated: 23 persons								
2) Equipment: equipment for pilot projects	(6 staff from ex-MIM, 4 staff from CDT and 13 staff from I2T)								
Project Period	(ex-ante) January 2015-March 2017 (actual) January 2015 – September, 2017	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 314 million yen, (actual) 358 million yen						
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Commerce and Industry (ex-Ministry of Industry and Mining)								
Cooperation Agency in Japan	IMG Inc.								

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

1 Relevance
<p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of Cote d'Ivoire at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation &gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policy of Cote d'Ivoire. In the PND 2012-2015, industrial policy planning was identified as a priority action plan.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of Cote d'Ivoire at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation &gt;</p> <p>The project was consistent with the development needs of Cote d'Ivoire for strengthening capacity for industry policy planning. The industry policy planning was identified as a priority under the PND as mentioned above, the policy had not been formulated for about 20 years.</p> <p>&lt;Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation&gt;</p> <p>The project was also consistent with Japan's ODA policy to Cote d'Ivoire. “Accelerating economic growth” was one of the priority areas under the “Country Assistance Policy to Cote d'Ivoire” (2014).</p> <p>&lt;Evaluation Result&gt;</p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness/Impact
<p>&lt;Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the time of Project Completion&gt;</p> <p>At project completion, all outputs were achieved, as (i) needs and issues related to innovation and dissemination of the target technology were identified, (ii) innovation and dissemination of target technologies were drafted, (iii) pilot projects were implemented, and (iv) enhancing the capacity of MCI and related agencies was enhanced. MCI has implemented activities such as preparing and updating</p>

<sup>1</sup> The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

database of enterprises, creating a platform among actors, and conducting training to strengthen manufacturing skills. Though not all the expected activities are implemented after the end of the project, it can be said that the capacities of MCI and related agencies were strengthened.

< Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The proposed plan by the project have been partially utilized. The project proposed to implement 11 actions under three strategic axes within 5 years as specified in the following table. Improving database (Action 1), development of relationships between targeted enterprises and with the public bodies (Action 2), strengthening of design skills (Action 3), strengthening of manufacturing skills (Action 4), and promotion of access to financing (Action 9) has been somewhat progressed. However, others have not been implemented, partly because of the lack of budget, some have not been implemented as the themes were not included in the national development plan. And in some cases, SMIs do not want to share the information on the sales and financial information. Nonetheless, implementation of some of the actions was under discussion and some were planned to be included in the next national development plan.

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

It was expected that the number of companies that receive technical assistance increases. At the time of ex-post evaluation, some technical assistance was provided between 2018 and 2020 by MCI, CDT, and Ivorian Company of Tropical Technology (I2T). The type of technical assistance provided consisted in the organization of training and networking events. A total of 21 companies received the training on manufacturing skills, and 59 companies are to receive the training in 2021.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impacts on the natural environment have been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Aim	Indicators	Axes and Actions	Status of implementation at the time of ex-post evaluation	Source
Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan Proposed policies for innovation and dissemination of the target technologies are implemented	Status of implementation of projects based on the policy for innovation and dissemination of the target technology (approval of the policy, number of projects implemented based on the action plan, etc.)	<b>Axis 1: Strengthening governance of the targeted sector</b>		MCI
		1.Increasing the availability of data and statistics on the targeted sector	A database exists with data from targeted enterprises. The last update was in October 2020	
		2.Support development of relationships between the targeted enterprises as well as between the enterprises and the public bodies	- 5 meetings/events were held from 2018 to 2020 - One network for cashew processing equipment manufacturers is currently being created and will be administered by Center for Technology Demonstration and Promotion (CDT) <sup>2</sup> . In the meantime, a WhatsApp platform was created between CDT and cashew equipment manufacturers	
		<b>Axis 2: Strengthen the technological and managerial skills of enterprises</b>		
		3.Strengthen design skills	- This activity has not been implemented due to a lack of funding and of national expertise in the field of equipment design. - MCI has included this activity in the national 5-year strategy (PND 2021-2026) and hence expects to be able to mobilize funds and partnerships.	
		4.Strengthen manufacturing skills	- 21 enterprises (142 participants) trained in 2018 - 59 enterprises (216 participants) to be trained in 2021 (funding secured) -	
		5.Support vocational and technical training (training of engineers and technicians)	- This activity has not yet been implemented. - Discussions were held between MCI and Felix Houphouet-Boigny University regarding program adaptation and enhancement. However, no major actions were taken due to a lack of funds to hire international experts. As the activity was not included in the PND 2016-2020, it could not benefit from any Government, Private or donor support.	
		6.Strengthen management capacity	- This activity has not yet been organized, neither by MCI nor CDT - The activity was not included in the PND 2016-2020; and hence could not benefit from any Government, Private or donor support. Future prospects expect to implement the activity.	
		7.Introduce the KAIZEN	- This activity has not yet been organized, either.	

<sup>2</sup> Refer to “Institutional aspect” under the Sustainability below.

		method	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The activity was not included in the national development plan (PND 2016-2020); and hence could not benefit from any Government, Private or donor support.</li> <li>- Future prospects include the search for partnerships to implement the activity.</li> </ul> <p>(In 2020, JICA has supported distribution of policy brief on the KAIZEN concept based on the request from a professor in Felix Houphouet-Boigny University. JICA also plans to let some staff from Côte d'Ivoire Small and Medium Enterprises Agency (Agence CI-PME) participate in Kaizen Knowledge Co-creation Cooperation Program training course in 2021 as observers.)</p>	
		<b>Axis 3: Improve the environment of the targeted sector</b>		
		8.Support promotion of products from the targeted SMIs	SMIs do not wish to share information regarding sales. There is no formal system to monitor sales and collect feedback.	
		9.Promotion of access to financing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 3 training sessions were organized from 2018 to 2019.</li> <li>- There are on-going negotiations to facilitate acquisition of materials for 7 SMIs based on their financial capacity.</li> <li>- SMIs do not wish to share any financial information and do not associate authorities to their loan application process. Therefore, MCI and CDT do not have much information on the status of SMIs regarding access to finance. CDT could only confirm that 1 SMI was able to obtain a loan.</li> </ul>	
		10.Promotion of access to industrial land	This activity has not been implemented. The question of access to industrial land is being considered by MCI but as a general issue for all SMEs (not only target SMIs). There are on-going studies on how to facilitate the access of SMEs to industrial land, but no decisions have been made so far.	
		11.Promote price competitiveness of locally manufactured products (machinery and spare parts)	This activity has not been implemented. However, the question of import regulation will be considered in the upcoming PND 2021-2026 as part of the price competitiveness strategy.	
Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan (i) Innovation and dissemination of the target technology will be promoted. (ii) Productivity and quality of companies in the industry will be improved.	Status of implementation of projects based on technological innovation and dissemination policies (number of companies receiving technical assistance, etc.)		Some technical assistance was provided between 2018 and 2020 by MCI, CDT, and Ivorian Company of Tropical Technology (I2T). The type of technical assistance provided consisted in the organization of training and networking events. A total of 21 companies received the training on manufacturing skills, and 59 companies are to receive the training in 2021.	
<b>3 Efficiency</b>				
Both project cost and project period exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 114%, 122%). Outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.				
<b>4 Sustainability</b>				
<Policy Aspect>				

At the time of ex-post evaluation, MCI has included the program for the development of SMIs in the field of agro-industrial machinery and the manufacturing of spare parts in the national development plan (PND 2021-2026). This will allow them to obtain approval at the highest level of Government planning and hence, they expect to obtain funding and partnerships for the implementation of this strategy.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

Ivorian Company of Tropical Technology (I2T) and Center for Technology Demonstration and Promotion (CDT), both the public organization under the auspices of MCI, have supported the target sector. MCI have supported the development of industrial policy, I2T have supported R&D, and CDT have supported promotion and dissemination of technology. There have been no organizational changes within the implementing organizations (MCI, I2T, and CDT). However, a specialized agency, "Agence CI-PME" was created by government decree in 2017 to promote Ivorian SMEs (including the target SMIs) and implement the National SME Development Strategy. Strengthening managerial capacities and improving access to finance for SMEs are among CI-PME's main responsibilities. As the capacities of this agency complement those of MCI and CDT regarding assistance on management/KAIZEN and access to finance, this can be considered as an organizational change which contributes to the continuation of project activities, though no concrete plans for cooperation, as the CI-PME is under the Ministry of promotion of SME, craft industry and transformation of informal sector.

Since the actions proposed by the project were not integrated in the Government's 5 year plan (PND 2016-2020), MCI, I2T, and CDT were not able to receive proper financial support to reinforce the staff.

<Technical Aspect>

During the project implementation, certain needs for strengthening capacity were identified for each organization in order to better support the activities of SMEs directly on the field. I2T needed to strengthen the capacities of its technical unit and CDT needed to hire a specialist in financial management support and create a team dedicated to this field. However, since there have been no structural changes with regards to the dissemination of project activities, these needs have continued to represent an issue hindering the functioning of the organizations.

<Financial Aspect>

MCI, I2T, and CDT did not receive any funding for the activities in the action plan because, the project's dissemination activities were not included in the PND 2016-2020. The funds received were pulled from different sources. Budget for activities such as training or meetings with stakeholders have been prepared from different sources; however, enough budget and resources to implement all activities in the action plan have not been prepared. Nonetheless, budget for activities is expected to be secured, as the program for the development of SMIs in the field of agro-industrial machinery and the manufacturing of spare parts has been included in the new PND.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical, and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

At the project completion, all outputs including drafting innovation and dissemination of target technologies, implementation of pilot projects and capacity development of MCI and others were produced. After the project was completed, the proposed plan under the project have been partially utilized such as database improvement, development of relationships between targeted enterprises and with the public bodies, strengthening of design skills, strengthening of manufacturing skills, and promotion of access to financing. As for the expected goals, some technical assistance was provided to SMIs. As for the sustainability, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical, and financial aspects. As for the efficiency, both project cost and project period slightly exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

### III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

Even though the platform activity and training for making quality parts have been implemented after the termination of the project, some activities have not yet been implemented. There was a lack of collaboration between implementing organisms (MCI, I2T, and CDT) and other government organizations in charge of SMEs. Such collaboration could have allowed them to implement activities related to management. In order to support SMEs, improving their management capacities is crucial. The concept of 5S/KAIZEN can also contribute to improving their management capacity, and the training in this area should be implemented to further support the targeted stakeholders. Cooperation with CI-PME should be considered because as the executing agency in charge of providing assistance to SMEs, they may have the technical capacities (human resources) necessary to contribute to the achievement of intended project effects.

#### Lessons Learned for JICA:

- In this project, there were several governmental organizations involved. In the action plan developed during the project, several institutions are written as responsible for the implementation of each action. Even though collaboration between institutions is essential for the development of this sector, the responsibility of each organization may have been unclear due to the structure of the action plan. It can be said that clarifying the activities and responsibility of each organization in the action plan is essential for the activities to be continued after the end of the project.
- It is also important for JICA to well understand the system of the budget of the counterpart agencies, and to support the counterpart agencies to secure the budget needed to implement activities planned in the proposed plan. It is necessary to understand the relation among the action plan to be developed in the project, the strategies at higher levels, and the system for acquisition of budget to implement the strategies and action plans.