

Country Name	Project for Improving Public Services through Total Quality Management
People's Republic of Bangladesh	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Bangladesh, the civil servant system has been facing a lot of challenges including excessive centralization, rigid hierarchic decision-making structures, poor transparency, insufficient sense of public service ethics, lack of effective personal management system, etc. The government of Bangladesh tackled those challenges by advancing various public sector reforms. In order to accelerate those movements, the government of Bangladesh requested the government of Japan to implement a technical cooperation project titled “Project for Enhancing Capacity of Public Service Training” (2007-2010). The project introduced the concept of Total Quality Management (TQM)¹ to enhance training for public sector service improvements. Based on the outputs of the project, a Public Service Delivery Policy and Management Advisor was dispatched by JICA for one year from 2010 in order to assist formulation of action-oriented TQM training system at the real work settings. While TQM training was introduced and its implementation system was formulated through those activities, its country-wide implementation was not realized. With that background, the government of Bangladesh requested the government of Japan to support another technical cooperation project aiming at the country-wide extension of the TQM training at the field level.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through the development of the mechanism for improving TQM training, development of the mechanism for supporting Small Improvement Plans (SIPs)², enhancement of the capacity of the Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC), and establishment of the framework for policy making and institutionalization for promoting TQM training and SIPs, the project aimed at the establishment of mechanism for sustainably promoting Small Improvement Teams (SITs)³ and SIPs at Upazila⁴ level based on TQM training, thereby contributing to the implementation of SIPs based on TQM training and share the experiences among Upazilas nation-wide.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: SIPs are implemented based on TQM training and their experiences are shared among Upazilas nation-wide. Project Purpose: The mechanism for sustainably promoting SITs and SIPs at Upazila level based on TQM training is established. 										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project Site: 64 Upazilas in 64 districts Main Activities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Development of the mechanism for sustainable improvement and extension of TQM training by BPATC and partner institutions (PIs)⁵, Development of the mechanism for supporting SIPs at Upazila level, Enhancement of the BPATC's capacity of analysing and accumulating case information on SIP, and Establishment of the framework for contributing to policy making and institutionalization for promoting TQM training and SIP. Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Bangladeshi Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 7 persons</td> <td>1) Staff Allocated: 12 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received in Japan: 12 persons</td> <td>2) Land and Facilities: project office</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: vehicles, PCs, printers, video cameras, projectors, etc.</td> <td>3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water and telephone)</td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Bangladeshi Side	1) Experts: 7 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 12 persons	2) Trainees received in Japan: 12 persons	2) Land and Facilities: project office	3) Equipment: vehicles, PCs, printers, video cameras, projectors, etc.	3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water and telephone)
Japanese Side	Bangladeshi Side										
1) Experts: 7 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 12 persons										
2) Trainees received in Japan: 12 persons	2) Land and Facilities: project office										
3) Equipment: vehicles, PCs, printers, video cameras, projectors, etc.	3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water and telephone)										
Project Period	(ex-ante) February 2012 - February 2017 (actual) February 2012 - April 2017	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 500 million yen (actual) 594 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	PADECO Co., Ltd.										

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

- The ex-post evaluation was conducted by the questionnaire to and online interviews with BPTAC officials without field surveys visiting Upazilas due to the incidence of COVID 19.

1 Relevance

¹ Total Quality Management (TQM) is a Japanese style management method aiming at effective and efficient organization operations through continuous and self-motivated implementation of Kaizen. (Source: web site of JICA)

² Small Improvement Plans (SIPs) are small-scale projects to improve work environment and work procedures applying Kaizen activities. They were expected to be implemented by districts and Upazilas to institutionalize TQM/Kaizen in their workplaces. The concept of SIP was developed and introduced by the project.

³ Small Improvement Teams (SITs) are teams organized in Upazilas to implement SIPs.

⁴ Upazilas are sub-districts. Administrative hierarchy in Bangladesh is composed of division, district, Upazila, and union.

⁵ Partner institutions (PIs) are five training institutions jointly implemented project activities. They are the Bangladesh Academy for Rural Development (BARD), the National Academy for Education Management (NAEM), the National Academy for Planning and Development (NAPD), the National Institute of Local Government (NILG), and the Rural Development Academy (RDA).

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Bangladesh at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the development policies of Bangladesh at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In the “National Strategy for Accelerated Poverty Reduction II FY 2009-11” (PRSP II), capacity building of the governmental organizations for the improvement of public service delivery was declared as one of the policy strategies for poverty reduction in the country. In the long-term development plan “Perspective Plan: 2010-2021” (Vision 2021) targeting the achievement of the goals in 2021 which will be 50 years after the independence, the chapter 2 titled as “Economic Growth and Corruption-free Good Governance” discussed the necessity of civil-service reforms. In the “Sixth Five Year Plan FY2011-FY2015,” the last chapter of 9 titled as “Implementing the Plan: the Challenges of Good Governance, Administrative Capacity, and Monitoring and Evaluation” referred to the needs of administrative reforms and institutional reinforcement including the reform of civil-service systems.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Bangladesh at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the development needs of Bangladesh at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Recognizing the challenges in the civil service sector of Bangladesh stated above, from the late 1990s, the public sector reforms were addressed as urgent issues in various policy documents including PRSPs. The Bangladesh government had tackled those challenges by advancing various public sector reforms including the formulation of the policy for administration training systems, the improvement of performance evaluation system, and other various reforms. However, change of the civil servants’ mind-set and improvement of service delivery which were most required had remained as issues to be tackled. Thus, the “Project for Enhancing Capacity of Public Service Training” (2007-2010) established the TQM training system in BPATC for the central authorities’ administrators. After the project, BPATC and the Ministry of Public Administration (MOPA) have recognized the necessity to widely disseminate the effects of TQM training to the level of Upazila and implemented pilot projects in six Upazilas in six districts. Based on this experience, country-wide extension of TQM training at the field level has been expected by BPATC and MOPA.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan’s ODA policy for Bangladesh at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In the “Country Assistance Program for Bangladesh” (May 2006), “governance” was listed as one of the Priority Goals and Sectors, and it was aimed to improve governance at the central, sectoral and local levels. It was planned to reform the civil service system at the central level and to establish effective local administration systems with a view to improving service provision methods.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion. SIPs were implemented in 25 National Building Departments (NBDs)⁶ in the 27 target districts where TQM training conducted (Indicator 1). Case study sessions by Kaizen⁷ practitioners were continually held in the Foundation Training Courses (FTCs)⁸ implemented by BPATC, and some NBDs including the Department of Women’s Affairs, Department of Social Services, Department of Youth Development, Department of Agriculture, Directorate of Registration, and Directorate of Health conducted Kaizen sessions in their training programs (Indicator 2).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The project effects have been partially continued at the time of ex-post evaluation. Although the filed survey could not be conducted due to incidence of COVID-19, it was confirmed that some Upazilas continued to implement SIPs. However, SIPs have not been implemented in Upazilas in a systematic manner and the number of Upazila continuing SIPs and their activities cannot be verified because directives and budget to implement SIPs have not been issued by the central government (e.g., supervisory ministries and HQs of line departments) and technical manpower to implement SIPs has been insufficient due to transfer of the officials trained by the project. BPATC keeps introducing TQM and SIP experiences and cases in its FTCs. PIs and NBDs have not introduced SIP experiences and cases in their training courses after the completion of the project also because no directive and budget has been issued by the central government and insufficient knowledge and experience caused by the transfer of officials.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal was partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. As stated above, interviews with BPATC officials reveal that some Upazilas keep conducting SIPs. However, the data of the number of those Upazilas is not available as the field survey could not be conducted. Therefore, the situation of country-wide extension of SIP cannot be verified (Indicator 1). Kaizen Convention was held in 2017 and 2018 when the budget was available but not after 2019 because the budget has not been allocated for it (Indicator 2).

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts were confirmed at the time of Ex-post Evaluation. Although no data are available, according to the observation of BPATC officials, a considerable number of officials participated in the TQM training have applied what they learned especially 5S⁹ in their workplaces. They apply the concept and practice of 5S to make their work environment neat and clean, standardize the formats and procedures of paper works, reduce unnecessary and unproductive works, and for other various physical and functional work environment improvement. No negative impact on natural, social and economic environment has been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

⁶ National Building Departments (NBDs) are departments in Upazilas responsible for the management of public service delivery at field level. Branch offices of the 24 state-level government departments are located in NBDs and deliver specific thematic-related public services directly to the residents.

⁷ Kaizen refers to a Japanese word which means “improvement” or “change for the better.” Kaizen is a process to address problems recognized by the field staff in continuous small steps under the initiative of field staff at worksite. (Source: web site of JICA)

⁸ Foundation Training Course (FTC) is the basic training program on administration and development conducted by BPATC. FTC is a compulsory training for all new entrants to the Bangladesh civil services.

⁹ 5S is a slogan taken from the initials of “sort, set, shine, standardize, sustain” aiming at positive transformation of staff’s awareness and attitude about improvement of work process and work environment. (Source: web site of JICA)

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
Project Purpose: The mechanism for sustainably promoting Small Improvement Teams (SITs) and SIPs at Upazila level based on TQM training is established.	Indicator 1: SIPs are implemented and promoted in Upazilas in the target districts (at least 20 districts where TQM training is conducted.)	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Achieved (not verified) (Project Completion) One Year One Project (OYOP) for SIP started in 2014/15 in the target districts where TQM courses conducted, and 25 NBDs in 27 districts implemented OYOP in 2016/17. (Ex-post Evaluation) SIPs have not been implemented in Upazilas in a systematic manner because directives and budget to implement SIPs have not been issued by the central government and technical manpower to implement SIPs has been insufficient due to transfer of the officials trained by the project. Although it is confirmed that some Upazilas continue to implement SIPs applying the experiences and knowledge gained through the project, those SIPs activities have not been monitored and followed up. Therefore, the number of Upazilas continuing SIPs is not available.	Project Completion Report, Questionnaire to and interview with BPATC
	Indicator 2: BPATC, PIs and line-departments utilize SIP experiences/cases in their core courses.	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Achieved (partially continued) (Project Completion) Case study sessions by Kaizen practitioners were continually held in FTCs by BPATC. Some NBDs including the Department of Women's Affairs, Department of Social Services, Department of Youth Development, Department of Agriculture, Directorate of Registration, and Directorate of Health conducted Kaizen sessions in their training programs. (Ex-post Evaluation) BPATC keeps introducing TQM and SIP experiences and cases in FTCs. However, PIs and line departments have not introduced SIP experiences and cases in their training courses also because no directives and budget have been issued by the central government and insufficient knowledge and experience caused by the transfer of the officials trained by the project.	Project Completion Report, Questionnaire to and interview with BPATC
Overall Goal: Small Improvement Plans (SIPs) are implemented based on TQM training and their experiences are shared among Upazilas nation-wide.	Indicator 1: At least one SIP each year is implemented in Upazilas nation-wide.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not verified As stated above in Indicator 1 for the Project Purpose, some Upazilas keep conducting SIP activities. However, since those activities have not been monitored, the number of Upazilas conducting SIPs is not available. Therefore, the situation of country-wide extension of SIP cannot be verified.	Questionnaire to and interview with BPATC
	Indicator 2: Kaizen Convention is conducted annually to share SIP good cases.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved Kaizen Convention was held in 2017 and 2018 with the Bangladeshi side project budget. However, it has not been held after 2019 because the budget has not been allocated from current budget after completion of the project budget.	Questionnaire to and interview with BPATC

3 Efficiency

The project period and cost exceeded the original plan (the ratio against the plan was 105% and 118% respectively). The project site was extended from 58 Upazilas to 64 Upazilas (110%) after the commencement of the project. However, the increase in the number of project site did not require the identical rate of increase of project period and cost because most project activities were conducted at central level and field-level activities differed from Upazila to Upazila. The outputs were produced as originally planned by the end of the project period. Therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

In the "Eighth Five Year Plan: 2020-2025," the first strategic key area for improving governance and institutions is public sector capacity improvement. One of the measures to improve public sector capacity is adequate training for civil servants. The Plan states that the government ensures that every official should get a minimum number of hours/days of the training which is included in the Annual Performance Agreement (APA)¹⁰. APA of MOPA for 2021 includes simplification of at least one service delivery process of the department/organization and implementation of SIP for innovation of work method, work environment, and service delivery as ones of the

¹⁰ Annual Performance Agreement (APA) is a record of understanding, which is made between the Cabinet Secretary and the Secretaries of all 52 Ministries/Divisions in the presence of Prime Minister.

mandatory tasks.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

There has been no significant institutional/organizational change took place in BPATC, PIs, and Upazilas during and after the project period. BPATC has 96 officials (grade 9 and above) and more than 150 lecturers. According to the interview survey on BPATC, the number of staff members of BPATC and PIs has been constantly increasing and sufficient for their business including TQM training. Besides, BPATC is planning to impart training on TQM, Kaizen, and 5S to the officials of Upazila level through four regional training centers (RPATCs) located Dhaka, Chattogram, Rajshahi and Khulna. However, the manpower of Upazilas has been insufficient and it is a bottleneck in the extension of TQM at Upazila level.

<Technical Aspect>

Knowledge and skills with formats, guidelines and manuals provided by the project have been utilized by BPATC for its training programs. However, PIs and Upazilas have not utilized them because they ceased to conduct SIP, TQM training and other activities initiated by the project.

<Financial Aspect>

BPATC has been allocated with the budget from the government to conduct FTCs and the Advanced Course of Administration and Development (ACAD) which include TQM training programs. However, PIs and Upazilas have not received budget or any external fund to conduct SIPs and TQM training.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agencies. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The Project Purpose was achieved by implementing SIPs in 24 districts and utilizing the SIPs' experiences/cases in the training courses conducted by BPATC, PIs and line departments. After the project completion, although the field survey could not be conducted due to the incident of COVID-19, it was confirmed that some Upazilas continue SIP by their own initiatives. However, these are not systematically implemented due to lack of directives and budget from the central government (Ministries and HQs of each line department). Overall Goal was partially achieved because Kaizen Convention was held twice after the completion of the project. However, it's difficult to expect its continuous implementation due to insufficient budget. As for sustainability, problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects of PIs and Upazilas. As for efficiency, both the project period and cost exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- The project established the mechanism for promoting SITs and SIPs at Upazila level focusing mainly on the capacity building of BPATC. However, after the completion of the project, SIPs and other TQM activities have not been implemented by Upazilas due to lack of proper instructions by the central governments (e.g., issuance of letters and proper allocation of budget) as well as the transfer of the skilled officials trained by the project. Therefore, it is recommended that 1) MOPA instructs concerned Ministries/Divisions to promote SITs and SIPs to the department/directorates under their jurisdictions, allocate budget to Upazilas offices, and 2) BPATC provides necessary knowledge and skills to Upazilas to restart TQM activities including Kaizen and SIPs.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- The project targeted country-wide extension of SITs and SIPs at Upazila level and improved the capacity of BPATC as a central training institution for supporting Upazilas, and Upazilas implemented SIPs during the project period. However, after the completion of the project, Upazilas have ceased their TQM activities due to the lack proper instructions by the central governments, insufficient funds and technical manpower caused by the transfer of officials trained by the project. From this experience, if a project is aiming at country-wide extension of project effects, it should take into account the available budget and personnel transfers and continue an assistance until the confirmation that the project effects to sustain nation-wide, and if necessary, the project should agree the required institutional setup with plan and budget in order for the project activities to be sustained after the project implementation period.