

Country Name	Project on Promotion of rural development in harmonization with Ecology and Economy: Promotion of Ecovillages
Republic of Senegal	

I. Project Outline

Background	In Senegal, more than 60% of the population lived in rural areas and made their livelihood from agriculture, stockbreeding and fishery which depended on natural resources. Overexploitation of natural resources had caused environmental degradation. It caused a vicious cycle of reduced productivity of agriculture which resulted in a decline in income, further worsening poverty, and acceleration of migration of the young population from rural areas. In this context, in 2008, the government of Senegal launched an initiative of the “Ecovillage Promotion Program” aiming to promote sustainable rural development in harmony with ecology and economy. As an implementing agency of this program, the government established the National Agency for Ecovillage (ANEV) in August 2008. However, the agency did not have specific medium- to long-term operation plans and implemented only some model activities with the limited budget and manpower.		
Objectives of the Project	Through establishing ecovillage platforms and preparing development plans and guidelines and tools for its implementation, the project aimed at implementation of rural development based on the development plans, thereby contributing to promotion of rural development utilizing natural energy in the three target regions.		
	Expected goals through the proposed plan ¹ : Ecovillages will be promoted in the three targeted regions.		
Activities of the Project	<div>1. Project Site: Approximately 2,400 villages in the regions of Louga, Fatick and Thiès</div> <div>2. Main Activities:</div> <div><div>1) strengthening of the mechanism of coordination between ministries and their partners and local authorities concerned at central, regional and local level,</div><div>2) development of the master plan and the tools which allow the implementing agency to promote rural development in harmonization of ecology and economy,</div><div>3) implementation of the pilot activities in the three target areas, at least five sites, and</div><div>4) strengthening of the capacity of the implementing agency and other relevant institutions.</div></div> <div>3. Inputs (to carry out above activities)</div> <div><div>Japanese Side</div><div>Senegalese Side</div><div><div>(1) Mission members:10 persons</div><div>(1) Staff allocated: 2 persons</div><div>(2) Trainees received:2 persons</div><div>(2) Facilities and equipment: project office</div><div>(3) Equipment: vehicles, office equipment</div><div>(3) Local cost: cost for utility of offices (electricity, water, and telephone)</div></div></div>		
Project Period	October 2012 - July 2016 (Extension: April 2016 - July 2016)	Project Cost	Ex-ante: 447 million yen, Actual: 490 million yen
Implementing Agency	National Agency for Ecovillage (ANEV), Ministry of Ecology and Natural Protection (ANEV was dissolved in October 2019. ANEV’s activities were handed over to the Senegalese Agency for Reforestation and Great Green Wall (ASERGMV), Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Earth and Human Corporation		

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

- Statements of the “Expected goals through the proposed plan” and “Expected utilization of the proposed plan” in the Ex-ante Evaluation Sheet (January 2012) and the Record of Discussion (R/D) (July 2012) were somewhat different. The ex-post evaluation was conducted using the statements in the R/D because the R/D was the official document signed by the parties of the governments of Senegal and Japan.
- Since no indicator for the “Expected goals through the proposed plan” and “Expected utilization of the proposed plan” was defined in the R/D, the indicators prepared in the Ex-ante Evaluation Sheet were used for evaluating their achievements in this ex-post evaluation.
- Data for the ex-post evaluation was collected through the questionnaires and telephone interviews on the implementing agencies, other related organizations, and the heads of the villages involved in the project, but the field survey on the villages was not carried out due to the incidence of COVID-19.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Senegal at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The government of Senegal issued the national development strategy of “Economic and Social Policy Document” in November 2011. The document laid out a vision of “a sustainable development and the positive spin-offs distributed in solidarity through an emerging economy.” The strategic orientations to translate this vision into actions and tangible results were based on three pillars, and one of the three pillars was accelerating access to basic social services, social protection and sustainable development. Ecovillage plan was prepared by the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Protection as one of the measures for realizing this pillar. Therefore, the project was consistent with the development policies of Senegal at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Senegal at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The responsibility and mandate of ANEV was the execution of “Ecovillage Promotion Program” targeting 14,000 villages which accounted for around half the total number of villages in the country. However, without specific medium- to long-term operation plans, ANEV has implemented only some model activities with its limited budget and manpower without any collaboration with other

¹ The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

governmental organizations and development partners. Therefore, the project was consistent with the development needs of Senegal at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

In the Japan's "Country Assistance Policy for the Republic of Senegal" (May 2012 revised in April 2014), one of the two priority areas (Medium Goals) was the support for sustainable economic development through promotion of the primary sector in which 71% of the total population engaged. Therefore, the project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy for Senegal at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

ANEV, the major implementing agency of the project, was officially dissolved by the presidential decree in October 2019. As stated below, this has significantly affected the utilization of the proposed plan and sustainability of the project. Although the month and year when the dissolution of ANEV was initially proposed could not be identified.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is fair.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the time of Project Completion>

The objectives of the project were achieved by the time of project completion by preparing the master plans and tools for promoting ecovillage activities, implementing the pilot activities, and improving the capacity of ANEV. With its own manpower and budget, ANEV established platforms in three regions, drafted village inventories (lists of villages to be ecovillages) in two regions, and applied outputs and experience obtained in the pilot activities to those regions.

<Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The proposed plan prepared by the project has not been utilized after the completion of the project. ANEV was officially dissolved in 2019 along with other 14 agencies as a part of the government's administration modernization program. After the cessation of ANEV's activities, the ecovillage activities based on the master plan using the tools developed by the project have significantly reduced. The Ecovillage Platforms formulated by the project have also ceased their activities losing the initiative and leadership of ANEV. But, in the process of the ex-post evaluation, ASERGMV in charge of implementation of the "Ecovillage Promotion Program" has shown the interest in the proposed plan prepared by the project and requested the project documents for their review.

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The expected goal through the proposed plan prepared by the project has not been achieved. Although the necessity of the ecovillage certification system was recognized by ANEV and the related agencies, the system has no longer functioned after the dissolution of ANEV in 2019.

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts and no negative impact have been observed at the time of ex-post evaluation. According to the telephone interviews with the heads of villages in the target areas, although the project has not drastically changed the situation of the villages in the target areas, some positive effects can be observed. For example, the number of farmers equipped with solar systems for water pumping has increased after the project. Beekeeping introduced by the project has extended to some other villages and one of the villages succeeded in securing a contract with a Japanese trading company and has exported tons of beeswax to Japan to this date. Inspired by the success of the village exporting beeswax to Japan, the Japanese Embassy in Senegal funded beeswax processing centers in Dakar and Ziguinchor in 2018 as a part of the assistance to the local projects implemented by the Senegalese government for human security. According to a report made by the Animal Industry Directorate of the Ministry of Breeding and Animal Production, there has been a significant increase in the marketing of honey and beeswax caused by these projects. No negative impact on natural, social and economic environment has been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

Some positive impacts have been observed at the time of ex-post evaluation, although due to the utilization status and the status of achievement for expected goals through the proposed plan at the time of ex-post evaluation, the effectiveness/impact of the project is low.

Status of Achievement of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan, and Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan

Aim	Indicators	Results
Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan	Indicator 1: The percentage of villages implementing rural development based on the master plan utilizing ecovillage implementation tools in the three target regions will be over xx%.	(Ex-post Evaluation) not achieved After the dissolution of ANEV in 2019, the villages implementing rural development based on the master plan using the tools developed by the project have not increased. ASERGMV started its ecovillage activities in 2019 and has implemented an emergency program named Toulou Keur ("house fields" in local language) which put emphasis on food security and agroecology ² in the context of COVID 19 pandemic.
	Indicator 2: Operation status of the Ecovillage Platforms functioning according to the master plan at central and regional levels (the number of meetings periodically held, meeting reports, updating status of the monitoring reports of ecovillage activities, etc.)	(Ex-post Evaluation) not achieved Along with the dissolution of ANEV, it lost the initiative and leadership. As the result, the Ecovillage Platforms have ceased their activities.
Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan: Ecovillages will be promoted in the three	Indicator 1: The number of villages certified as ecovillage in the three target regions.	(Ex-post Evaluation) not achieved Although the necessity of the ecovillage certification system was recognized by ANEV and the related agencies, the system has no longer functioned after the dissolution of ANEV in 2019.
	Indicator 2:	(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved

² Farming that centers on food production that makes the best use of nature's goods and services while not damaging these resources. (Source: website of the Agroecology Fund)

targeted regions. (not to be assessed)	Changes in the villages certified as ecovillages in the three target regions, e.g. the number of facilities using natural energy, area of fruits tree planting, livelihood of households, etc.	According to telephone interviews with the heads of villages involved in the project, the situation of the villages has not been largely changed. They are still facing the difficulties of limited access to water, energy, and food all through the year. However, the number of farmers equipped with solar power systems for water pumping has increased after the project, and their cultivated areas has extended. Beekeeping introduced by the project has been disseminated to some other villages. It is producing cash income and contributed to the improvement of the livelihood of villagers.
	Indicator 3: Achievement status of the targets in the development plans in the three target regions.	(Ex-post Evaluation) not achieved Although the upgrading of certified ecovillages was targeted by the project, ecovillage certification system and grading system have not functioned after the dissolution of ANEV.

Source: ANEV, Final Report (2016)

3 Efficiency

In order to align with the new policy announced by the government in 2013 for promoting local autonomy, the project rearranged its activities, and both of the project period and cost exceeded the original plan (the ratio against the plan: 110% respectively). The outputs were produced as originally planned by the end of extended period of the project. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The “Emerging Senegal Plan (PSE)” (2014) envisioned an emergence of Senegal by 2035 with social solidarity under the rule of law. For realizing this vision, a ten-year plan from 2014 to 2023 was developed, which consists of three pillars: 1) a structural transformation of the economy, 2) promotion of human capital, social welfare, and sustainable development, and 3) reinforcements of governance, system, peace and security. The ecovillage promotion was consistent with the agriculture promotion and utilization of local potential in the pillar 1, the maintaining of food security and promotion of green economy and natural resources management in the pillar 2.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

Taking over the functions of ANEV to promote ecovillage activities, ASERGMV was established in 2019 assigning the former Minister of Environment as the General Director. Although it is still in the start-up process at the time of ex-post evaluation in 2021, ASERGMV has started field operations and social network expansion activities. ARDs involved in the project as regional platform secretaries have been functioning for rural development. However, the ecovillage promotion activities introduced by the project have not been continued by ARDs without the leadership and budget from ANEV.

<Technical Aspect>

ASERGMV has reemployed most of the former staff members of ANEV to take advantage of the knowledge and techniques they learned in the project. Although some equipment provided by the project including biodigesters³ have not functioned due to ceased technical and financial support from ANEV, the number of farmers equipped with solar power systems for water pumping has increased.

<Financial Aspect>

Because ASERGMV is a new agency and still in the institutional arrangement process, the budget for operation has not been fully allocated by the Ministry of Finance. In 2020, for the requested amount of 5 billion FCFA⁴, 500 million FCFA was allocated. However, since the President of Senegal made an instruction at the council of ministers to support ASERGMV's activities, ASERGMV is expected to receive 4 billion FCFA for 2021. Data of the amount of budget for ecovillage promotion is not available because it is not segregated as an expense item. Regardless the amount, the budget for ecovillage promotion is supposed to be allocated mainly to Toulou Keur program but not to the ecovillage promotion activities introduced by the project.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, problems in terms of the institutional/organizational and technical aspects and major problems in terms of the financial aspect of the implementing agency have been observed. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The objectives of the project were achieved by the time of project completion by preparing the master plans and tools for promoting ecovillage activities, implementing the pilot activities, and improving the capacity of ANEV. However, ANEV was dissolved three years after the completion of the project. Because of the dissolution of ANEV, the ecovillage promotion activities introduced by the project have been ceased in the target regions. As for sustainability, problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects. As for efficiency, both of the project cost and period exceeded the plan. Considering all the above points, this project is evaluated to be unsatisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- It is recommended that the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development provides strong support for ASERGMV by providing adequate administrative and technical advice and human and financial resources to accelerate ASERGMV's institutional arrangement process and to start its activities in full scale without any loss of time.
- It is recommended that ASERGMV starts its ecovillage promotion activities in full scale by putting the experiences of the project to use. Tangible assets or the equipment provided by the project may be restored and reused by the villagers with technical and financial assistance from ASERGMV. Intangible assets, particularly, the former staff members of ANEV, who have improved their capacity through the experience of the project and are seeking for chances to be re-employed by ASERGMV, could be substantial workforces to promote ecovillage activities of ASERGMV.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

³ A system that biologically digests animal manure (mainly cow dung) and produces combustible biogas.

⁴ FCFA: Franc de la Communauté Financière Africaine

- Large-scale dissolution or reorganization of a governmental organization usually takes some years from the planning until the execution. In case of the project, ANEV was dissolved three year after the project completion. There is a possibility that the negotiation of the dissolution of ANEV was initiated along with the progressing of the project activities. Based on this experience, it is recommended that a project team has close and frequent communications with the top-level management of the implementing agency, its supervisory agency, and development partners. And when a predictive information is obtained, the project should undertake necessary and possible measures to sustain the project effects including policy, institutional/organizational, technical and financial sustainability.