

Country Name	Project on Enhancing Gender Responsive Extension Services in Kenya
Republic of Kenya	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Kenya, 70% of the agricultural production labor was occupied by women. Despite the fact that women played an important role in small-scale farming, their productivity was estimated to be 20-30% lower than that of male farmers due to their limited access to land, farm inputs, agricultural technology, and markets. Under those circumstances, the Kenya's Agricultural Sector Development Strategy (ASDS) emphasized the women's roles in agriculture and promoted gender equality through gender mainstreaming in agricultural enterprises. The Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries (MOALF, then the Ministry of Agriculture) formulated the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in 2010.</p>																																														
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through (1) developing the Gender Mainstreaming Package (GMP)*, (2) developing capacity of partner project* staff and the target sub-county agricultural staff on GMP, (3) introducing GMP into other smallholder agricultural projects, counties and agricultural training centres, the project aimed at enhancing institutional capacity of MOALF and Counties to promote gender responsive agricultural extension services, thereby contributing to improvement of livelihood for female and male smallholder farmers, pastoralists and fisher folks.</p> <p>*The "Gender Mainstreaming Package" is a set of activities that should be implemented from a gender perspective in small-scale farmer support projects to promote gender-equal farmer management, as well as practical tools such as training modules, checklists, manuals, and guidelines necessary to implement these activities.</p> <p>(Note) During the project implementation, Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) was signed with the Eastern Africa Agricultural Productivity Project (EAAPP)/WB for collaboration towards gender mainstreaming. Implementation of joint activities on gender mainstreaming was also agreed with the Rice-based and Market Oriented Agriculture Promotion Project (Rice MAPP)/JICA. Also, two more partner projects were selected in the last one year of the project period.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Gender responsive agricultural extension services contribute to improvement of livelihood for smallholder female and male farmers, pastoralists and fisher folks. Project Purpose: Institutional capacity of the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries (MOALF) and Counties to promote gender responsive agricultural extension services is enhanced. 																																														
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: <table border="1" data-bbox="347 1032 1517 1361"> <thead> <tr> <th>Site</th> <th>County</th> <th>Product</th> <th>Partner project</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td colspan="4">Initial partner projects</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mathira West Sub-County</td> <td>Nyeri</td> <td>Dairy</td> <td>EAAPP (financed by the World Bank)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Teso South Sub-County</td> <td>Busia</td> <td>Cassava</td> <td>EAAPP (financed by the World Bank)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mwea Irrigation Scheme (MIS)</td> <td>Kirinyaga</td> <td>Rice</td> <td>RiceMAPP (JICA technical cooperation)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="4">Partner projects selected in the last one year</td> </tr> <tr> <td>—</td> <td>Nandi</td> <td>Fisheries</td> <td>Promoting Nutrition Sensitive Agricultural Diversification to Fight Malnutrition and Enhance Youth Employment Opportunities in Eastern Africa (FAO)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>—</td> <td>Isiolo</td> <td>Livestock</td> <td>Regional Pastoral Livelihood Resilience Project (RPLRP) (WB)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> Main activities: (1) developing GMP, (2) developing capacity of partner project staff and the target sub-county agricultural staff on GMP, (3) introducing GMP into other smallholder agricultural projects, counties and agricultural training centres Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" data-bbox="347 1496 1517 1720"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td>Kenyan Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 5 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 11 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 8 persons</td> <td>2) Office and facilities: Office space and basic expenses such as electricity, water and telephone line</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Training in the third countries: 3 persons in South Africa, 15 persons in Tanzania and 1 person at UN headquarters</td> <td>3) Local cost: Part of the operational expenses</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Equipment: Vehicles, PCs, printers, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>5) Local cost: Travel allowance, Honorarium, etc.</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> 			Site	County	Product	Partner project	Initial partner projects				Mathira West Sub-County	Nyeri	Dairy	EAAPP (financed by the World Bank)	Teso South Sub-County	Busia	Cassava	EAAPP (financed by the World Bank)	Mwea Irrigation Scheme (MIS)	Kirinyaga	Rice	RiceMAPP (JICA technical cooperation)	Partner projects selected in the last one year				—	Nandi	Fisheries	Promoting Nutrition Sensitive Agricultural Diversification to Fight Malnutrition and Enhance Youth Employment Opportunities in Eastern Africa (FAO)	—	Isiolo	Livestock	Regional Pastoral Livelihood Resilience Project (RPLRP) (WB)	Japanese Side	Kenyan Side	1) Experts: 5 persons	1) Staff allocated: 11 persons	2) Trainees received: 8 persons	2) Office and facilities: Office space and basic expenses such as electricity, water and telephone line	3) Training in the third countries: 3 persons in South Africa, 15 persons in Tanzania and 1 person at UN headquarters	3) Local cost: Part of the operational expenses	4) Equipment: Vehicles, PCs, printers, etc.		5) Local cost: Travel allowance, Honorarium, etc.	
Site	County	Product	Partner project																																												
Initial partner projects																																															
Mathira West Sub-County	Nyeri	Dairy	EAAPP (financed by the World Bank)																																												
Teso South Sub-County	Busia	Cassava	EAAPP (financed by the World Bank)																																												
Mwea Irrigation Scheme (MIS)	Kirinyaga	Rice	RiceMAPP (JICA technical cooperation)																																												
Partner projects selected in the last one year																																															
—	Nandi	Fisheries	Promoting Nutrition Sensitive Agricultural Diversification to Fight Malnutrition and Enhance Youth Employment Opportunities in Eastern Africa (FAO)																																												
—	Isiolo	Livestock	Regional Pastoral Livelihood Resilience Project (RPLRP) (WB)																																												
Japanese Side	Kenyan Side																																														
1) Experts: 5 persons	1) Staff allocated: 11 persons																																														
2) Trainees received: 8 persons	2) Office and facilities: Office space and basic expenses such as electricity, water and telephone line																																														
3) Training in the third countries: 3 persons in South Africa, 15 persons in Tanzania and 1 person at UN headquarters	3) Local cost: Part of the operational expenses																																														
4) Equipment: Vehicles, PCs, printers, etc.																																															
5) Local cost: Travel allowance, Honorarium, etc.																																															
Project Period	(ex-ante) March 2014 – March 2017 (36 months) (actual) September 2014 – August 2017	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 334 million yen, (actual) 208 million yen																																												
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries (MOALF) (now Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock, Fisheries & Cooperatives (MoALFC))																																														
Cooperation Agency in Japan	-																																														

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance	<p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Kenya at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation ></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policy of Kenya. The “Kenya Vision 2030”, a long-term national sustainable</p>
-------------	--

development policy formulated in 2008, recognizes gender inequality as one of the major factors that impose significant costs on overall national economic growth. In addition to the equal participation of men and women in society, overcoming gender challenges has been set as a priority. ASDS emphasized the role that women play in agriculture and promotes gender equality through gender mainstreaming in agricultural enterprises. MOALF, then Ministry of Agriculture formulated the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in 2010.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Kenya at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Kenya for gender equality in agriculture. As mentioned above (“Background”), there were gender disparities in the process of agricultural production including access to land, farm inputs, agricultural technology, and markets.

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was also consistent with Japan’s ODA policy to Kenya. “Yokohama Action Plan 2013-2017” of the fifth Tokyo International Conference on African Development (TICAD V) mentioned “Special attention is also needed to ensure small holder and small scale, especially women, farmers are afforded equal access and opportunity, given that such farmers produce the majority of food in African countries. In this regard, attention to the specific needs of women farmers and assistance to farmers’ groups to expand their activities is important to increase agricultural production and rural incomes.” In addition, agriculture development was one of the priority areas for Japan’s ODA to Kenya¹.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was partially achieved at the project completion. Although GMP obtained positive response from MOALF through discussions/consultations/regular meetings, GMP was not adopted at the project completion (indicator 1). Three partner projects implemented GMP components in their plans and activities, and three Counties showed their commitments, though the strategies were not developed (indicator 2). Meanwhile, gender relations improved in the target partner projects in terms of decision-making (indicator 3), distribution of workload in productive activities (indicator 4), and access to and adaptation of technologies introduced under the project increased (indicator 5).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The effects of the project have partially continued since the project completion. MoALFC has applied the concept of household participation for gender equality and improved livelihoods, as introduced by GMP in several projects in mainstreaming gender issues, and part of the partner projects (including the succeeding projects) and counties have continuously implemented GMP though Eastern and Central Africa Agriculture Transformation Project (ECCATP) failed to succeed EAAPP. Although the counties are held back by budget issues, they still find other ways to embed gender mainstreaming through every project. On the other hand, the results of beneficiary interviews in the target partner projects have shown that their gender relations have become more enhanced, including the fact that both women and men continuously utilize the technologies introduced in the projects.

<Status of Achievement for Overall Goal at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. At the partner project sites visited during the ex-post evaluation (Dairy production under EAAPP in Nyeri County, Cassava production under EAAPP in Busia County and RiceMAPP, Kiringaya County), productivity (indicator 1), income (indicator 2), and household assets (indicator 3) of the majority of beneficiaries interviewed increased.

The implementation of GMP (indicator 4) partially achieved the targets. Six (6) projects implemented GMP, though the target was 10. Other than Nyeri, Busia and Kiringaya, four (4) counties somewhat implemented GMP, though the target was seven (7). One training institution (the target was two (2)) implemented GMP. While gender mainstreaming has become a central aspect of most projects at the national and county levels, it is apparent that GMP components that are expected have not been implemented to the letter. Further, the counties – including those that participated in the project – failed to develop any conscious strategy for upscaling of the effects of the project. MoALFC is making efforts to provide guidance on dissemination of GMP components but is limited by designation of budget to the Gender Unit (under the State Department for Crop Development and Agricultural Research; SCDC&AR).

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No direct negative impacts on natural environment from the project have been observed. However, in Nyeri County, where the target value chain was dairy production, concerns were raised regarding soil and water conservation. Farmers used chemicals for pest/diseases control and to increase fodder yields thereby causing degradation of the soils and pollution in the streams². The County government initiated programs to ensure soil conservation.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
(Project Purpose) Institutional capacity of the Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Fisheries	Indicator 1 “Gender Mainstreaming Package” is adopted by MoALF.	Status of the Achievement: not achieved (not continued) (Project completion) - GMP was not adopted at the project completion. - The draft GMP was developed and presented in the national workshop in August 2016, and discussions with MoALF and other stakeholders were held thereafter. - Presented the content of the GMP at a regular meeting of the MoALF senior management. Received positive response from participants.	-JICA documents -Questionnaire and interviews with MoALFC

¹ Source: MOFA, ODA Data book 2013

² Based on the account of those interviewed (both beneficiaries and county staff), there have been instances of sicknesses related to pollution of the rivers and to some extent, some farms have experienced reduced soil health though cropping has not been largely affected.

(MOALF) and Counties to promote gender responsive agricultural extension services is enhanced.		(Ex-post Evaluation) MoALFC has identified male dominance in the decision-making process in different areas; including division of labour, distribution of recourses, and the use of household income, hinder women from being more productive and the youth from participating in agriculture.. In line with this, the concept of household participation for gender equality and improved livelihoods, as introduced by GMP, has been applied in several projects in mainstreaming gender issues.											
	Indicator 2 Three (3) partner projects and three (3) counties develop strategies to implement GMP.	<p>Status of the Achievement: partially achieved (partially continued)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The partner projects ((i) EAAPP and the succeeding project named ECAATP, (ii) RiceMAPP and the succeeding project – (Capacity Development Project for Enhancement of Rice Production in Irrigation Schemes (CaDPERP), which was under formulation, and (iii) RPLRP) included GMP components in their plans and activities. - Three county governments (Busia, Nyeri, and Kirinyaga) showed their commitments to utilize the GMP. <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="507 560 1364 1272"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="507 560 683 622">Partner project/ County</th> <th data-bbox="683 560 1364 622">Outline of GMP implementation</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="507 622 683 788">CaDPERP</td> <td data-bbox="683 622 1364 788">Training of Core Farmers (CF) incorporated gender issues while gender friendly technologies such as push-weeders and levelers were introduced. Farmers were sensitized on collaborative planning for rice production activities, and encouraged to invest in reproductive labour saving techniques such as water harvesting to reduce burden on women.</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="507 788 683 981">Busia County</td> <td data-bbox="683 788 1364 981">Since ECAATP failed to succeed EAAPP, the county also did not come up with a specific project or strategy that targets women as beneficiaries or address gender issues as the main goal or objective.. However, the County has managed to implement gender aspects in all its projects as a cross-cutting issue, and participatory decision-making has been incorporated in training to enable households become more productive.</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="507 981 683 1173">Nyeri County</td> <td data-bbox="683 981 1364 1173">Despite ECAATP failing to take off as had been anticipated, the county has tried to mainstream gender perspectives in all trainings provided to farmers. GMP components such as reproductive technologies – water harvesting, smallholder irrigation, kitchen gardening and planning of fodder farms near dairy units are promoted alongside participatory involvement as a household in decision-making.</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="507 1173 683 1272">Kirinyaga County</td> <td data-bbox="683 1173 1364 1272">Youth and women have been looped into the decision-making process committees at the County level and all trainings have conscious focus to include women and the youth.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Partner project/ County	Outline of GMP implementation	CaDPERP	Training of Core Farmers (CF) incorporated gender issues while gender friendly technologies such as push-weeders and levelers were introduced. Farmers were sensitized on collaborative planning for rice production activities, and encouraged to invest in reproductive labour saving techniques such as water harvesting to reduce burden on women.	Busia County	Since ECAATP failed to succeed EAAPP, the county also did not come up with a specific project or strategy that targets women as beneficiaries or address gender issues as the main goal or objective.. However, the County has managed to implement gender aspects in all its projects as a cross-cutting issue, and participatory decision-making has been incorporated in training to enable households become more productive.	Nyeri County	Despite ECAATP failing to take off as had been anticipated, the county has tried to mainstream gender perspectives in all trainings provided to farmers. GMP components such as reproductive technologies – water harvesting, smallholder irrigation, kitchen gardening and planning of fodder farms near dairy units are promoted alongside participatory involvement as a household in decision-making.	Kirinyaga County	Youth and women have been looped into the decision-making process committees at the County level and all trainings have conscious focus to include women and the youth.	-JICA documents -Questionnaire and interviews with MoALFC. - Interviews with County officers
Partner project/ County	Outline of GMP implementation												
CaDPERP	Training of Core Farmers (CF) incorporated gender issues while gender friendly technologies such as push-weeders and levelers were introduced. Farmers were sensitized on collaborative planning for rice production activities, and encouraged to invest in reproductive labour saving techniques such as water harvesting to reduce burden on women.												
Busia County	Since ECAATP failed to succeed EAAPP, the county also did not come up with a specific project or strategy that targets women as beneficiaries or address gender issues as the main goal or objective.. However, the County has managed to implement gender aspects in all its projects as a cross-cutting issue, and participatory decision-making has been incorporated in training to enable households become more productive.												
Nyeri County	Despite ECAATP failing to take off as had been anticipated, the county has tried to mainstream gender perspectives in all trainings provided to farmers. GMP components such as reproductive technologies – water harvesting, smallholder irrigation, kitchen gardening and planning of fodder farms near dairy units are promoted alongside participatory involvement as a household in decision-making.												
Kirinyaga County	Youth and women have been looped into the decision-making process committees at the County level and all trainings have conscious focus to include women and the youth.												
	Indicator 3 Gender relations ³ in at least 15% of the PEGRES* target group members of initial two partner projects is improved. * Abbreviation of the project name (Project on Enhancing Gender Responsive Extension Services)	<p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - According to the end-line survey, there were notable changes in the patterns of decision-making: more household members participate in household decision-making process. The number of the end-line survey respondents who discussed with their spouse on how to spend income derived from the target commodity increased by more than 15%. - As for the reproductive activities, women remained as major doers in all three sites. Even so, in the project sites of Teso South and Kirinyaga, other members of the household started supporting them compared with the time of the baseline survey. The number of the cases in which reproductive activities were carried out by one person without help from other household members decreased by 4% in Teso South and 10% in Kirinyaga. <p>*Reproductive activities include cooking meals, washing kitchen utensils, fetching water, collecting firewoods, cleaning the house, washing cloth, shopping of family necessities, care of pre-school children, care of school children, taking care of the sick/elders, activities to keep security, and community obligation.</p> <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="507 1814 1364 2072"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="507 1814 662 1848">Site</th> <th data-bbox="662 1814 1364 1848">Status</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="507 1848 662 2072">Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County</td> <td data-bbox="662 1848 1364 2072">In the 2 farmer groups visited, the division of labour by fixed gender roles has been changed immensely, and a participatory approach to productive and reproductive activities is well incorporated into activities. Technologies to ease reproductive works for women – such as water harvesting, improved stoves, etc, have been introduced in almost all households and men too, can now perform some reproductive activities like cooking.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Site	Status	Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County	In the 2 farmer groups visited, the division of labour by fixed gender roles has been changed immensely, and a participatory approach to productive and reproductive activities is well incorporated into activities. Technologies to ease reproductive works for women – such as water harvesting, improved stoves, etc, have been introduced in almost all households and men too, can now perform some reproductive activities like cooking.	-JICA documents -Questionnaire and interviews with MoALFC -Interviews with target County and Sub-county officers - Interviews with (i) 2 farmer groups in Nyeri, (ii) 20 farmers in 2 farmer groups in Busia and (iii) 10 farmers in MIS.						
Site	Status												
Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County	In the 2 farmer groups visited, the division of labour by fixed gender roles has been changed immensely, and a participatory approach to productive and reproductive activities is well incorporated into activities. Technologies to ease reproductive works for women – such as water harvesting, improved stoves, etc, have been introduced in almost all households and men too, can now perform some reproductive activities like cooking.												

³ Changes in gender relations will be captured by looking into changes in division labour, patterns of decision making, access to and control over resources among different gender groups

		<p>Teso South Sub-County (Cassava, EAAPP), Busia County</p> <p>Women and men beneficiaries in the two farmer groups visited showed cooperation in their households, including access for women to the decision-making process on household activities and income expenditures.</p> <p>. Further, men have initiated techniques to unburden women and youth of reproductive drudgery such as planting of trees for wood-fuel, installation of improved cooking stoves, sinking of boreholes for water supply, water harvesting, solar panels, and men can now help with such reproductive activities as cooking, washing, etc.</p>										
		<p>MIS (Rice MAPP), Kirinyaga County</p> <p>Gender relations among the household members have insignificantly improved. However, majority of the beneficiaries (>=80%) have embraced technologies and efforts such as installation of improved stoves, water harvesting to improve productivity of women and youth in agriculture by reducing the burden of reproductive activities.</p>										
	<p>Indicator 4</p> <p>Participation in productive activities⁴ by at least 10% for all the gender groups of the PEGRES target group members of initial partner projects is improved.</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued)</p> <p>(Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Distribution of workload in productive activities of the target communities became more equitable among household members. During the baseline survey, 39-47% of total labour contribution in productive activities was made by one particular gender group (i.e. female adults in Nyeri and Busia and the male adults in Kirinyaga), while the rates of those reduced to 31-44% at end-line survey. - Decisions on marketing of the target commodities were now made more jointly with husband and wife in the project sites of Busia and Kirinyaga. In the project sites of Nyeri, more male youths and female youths were taking part in decision-making on milk marketing. <p>(Ex-post Evaluation)</p> <p>See the table in the indicator 3 above.</p>	Same as above.									
	<p>Indicator 5</p> <p>Access to and adoption of technologies introduced by the initial partner projects is increased by at least 10% for all the gender groups of the PEGRES target group members of initial partner projects.</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement: achieved (continued)</p> <p>(Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Adoption of the introduced technologies by household members other than those directly trained by the partner projects increased in all three sites of the projects. These rates increased by 14 to 21%, which indicates that technology transfer was taking place among household members, which were supported by the project. - In comparison between baseline and end-line survey data, in Busia, all both female and male groups increased their adoption of introduced technologies (technology, innovations and management practices: TIMPs of EAAPP). - In the case of Kirinyaga, only the women increased the adoption rate of technologies (Water Saving Rice Culture). This may be because more women were engaged in productive activities using introduced technologies, which used to be carried out by men. <p>(Ex-post Evaluation) See the table in the indicator 3 above.</p>	Same as above.									
<p>(Overall Goal)</p> <p>Gender responsive agricultural extension services contribute to improvement of livelihood for smallholder female and male farmers, pastoralists and fisher folks.</p>	<p>Indicator 1</p> <p>Productivity of target commodities of the smallholder agricultural projects which introduce “Gender Mainstreaming Package” is increased among at least 10% of the target beneficiaries of the respective projects.</p>	<p>(Ex-post Evaluation) achieved</p>	<p>-Questionnaire and interviews with MoALFC</p> <p>-Interviews with target County and Sub-county officers</p> <p>- Interviews with (i) 2 farmer groups in Nyeri, (ii) 20 farmers in 2 farmer groups in Busia and (iii) 10 farmers in MIS.</p>									
		<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Site</th> <th>Changes in productivity, contribution of GMP, other factors</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County</td> <td>Milk production has increased from an average of 6L/cow per day to an average of 14L/cow per day among >95% of the beneficiaries. The improvement is attributed to proper dairy management such as feeding by inclusive household participation and better quality fodder. Since all members of the household benefit from this venture, all are actively undertaking their respective roles in the production process – feeding, milking and marketing, and this adds to the overall production levels. Nonetheless, other factors such as reviving the daily cooperative by the County government affected the improved productivity.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Teso South Sub-County (Cassava, EAAPP), Busia County</td> <td>Farmers in 2 groups visited have experienced good improvement in cassava productivity – from about 2 bags to averagely 10bags per 0.25acres - mainly due to embracing new improved varieties (as received during the project period) and sharing of roles between genders and increase of women participation in productive activities. Over 90% of the farmers in each of the 2 groups have experienced tremendous improvement in cassava production.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>MIS (Rice MAPP), Kirinyaga County</td> <td>Rice productivity of the beneficiaries has improved both for the main crop (from 22 bags/acre to a maximum of 31 bags/acre) and the ratoon (from 8 bags/acre to a maximum of 21 bags/acre) (farmers interviewed stated all beneficiaries improved their productivity, which was</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Site	Changes in productivity, contribution of GMP, other factors	Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County	Milk production has increased from an average of 6L/cow per day to an average of 14L/cow per day among >95% of the beneficiaries. The improvement is attributed to proper dairy management such as feeding by inclusive household participation and better quality fodder. Since all members of the household benefit from this venture, all are actively undertaking their respective roles in the production process – feeding, milking and marketing, and this adds to the overall production levels. Nonetheless, other factors such as reviving the daily cooperative by the County government affected the improved productivity.	Teso South Sub-County (Cassava, EAAPP), Busia County	Farmers in 2 groups visited have experienced good improvement in cassava productivity – from about 2 bags to averagely 10bags per 0.25acres - mainly due to embracing new improved varieties (as received during the project period) and sharing of roles between genders and increase of women participation in productive activities. Over 90% of the farmers in each of the 2 groups have experienced tremendous improvement in cassava production.	MIS (Rice MAPP), Kirinyaga County	Rice productivity of the beneficiaries has improved both for the main crop (from 22 bags/acre to a maximum of 31 bags/acre) and the ratoon (from 8 bags/acre to a maximum of 21 bags/acre) (farmers interviewed stated all beneficiaries improved their productivity, which was	
		Site		Changes in productivity, contribution of GMP, other factors								
		Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County		Milk production has increased from an average of 6L/cow per day to an average of 14L/cow per day among >95% of the beneficiaries. The improvement is attributed to proper dairy management such as feeding by inclusive household participation and better quality fodder. Since all members of the household benefit from this venture, all are actively undertaking their respective roles in the production process – feeding, milking and marketing, and this adds to the overall production levels. Nonetheless, other factors such as reviving the daily cooperative by the County government affected the improved productivity.								
Teso South Sub-County (Cassava, EAAPP), Busia County	Farmers in 2 groups visited have experienced good improvement in cassava productivity – from about 2 bags to averagely 10bags per 0.25acres - mainly due to embracing new improved varieties (as received during the project period) and sharing of roles between genders and increase of women participation in productive activities. Over 90% of the farmers in each of the 2 groups have experienced tremendous improvement in cassava production.											
MIS (Rice MAPP), Kirinyaga County	Rice productivity of the beneficiaries has improved both for the main crop (from 22 bags/acre to a maximum of 31 bags/acre) and the ratoon (from 8 bags/acre to a maximum of 21 bags/acre) (farmers interviewed stated all beneficiaries improved their productivity, which was											

⁴ Changes in participation in productive activities will be measured by looking into the degree of involvement in various activities for agricultural production among the different gender groups.

		confirmed by the project manager). Since RiceMAPP and later CaDPERP introduced such labour saving technologies as push-weeders that has enabled women to be active in productive activities alongside men and combine harvesters (which have increased from zero to 8 in number) that reduced post-harvest losses thus increasing rice production. Further, men have put in more effort to implement technologies for households that reduce time spent by women on reproductive roles and shift this productive time to support useful rice production.	
Indicator 2 Income from target commodities of the smallholder agricultural projects which introduce “Gender Mainstreaming Package” is increased among at least 10% of the target beneficiaries of the respective projects.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially achieved		Same as above.
	Site	Changes in income, contribution of GMP, other factors	
	Mathira West Sub-County (Dairy, EAAPP), Nyeri County	Increase milk productivity per unit was translated directly to income. COVID-19 did not affect adversely the income, and farmers attribute this to the effect of participatory decision-making process on production activities and expenditure plans. More than half of the beneficiaries (represented by the interviewees) have seen their household income increased despite the failure of ECAATP to take off.	
	Teso South Sub-County (Cassava, EAAPP), Busia County	Household income has generally increased among over 80% of all farmers, according to the farmers who responded to the interview on behalf the members. However, this is attributed mainly to other factors (such as utilizing the aggregation centers set up nearby which influenced the market prices of their cassava products, diversifying revenue streams as well as promote value addition to their products).	
	MIS (Rice MAPP), Kirinyaga County	Majority of the beneficiaries (about 90% of farmers interviewed) reported increased income from their rice production activities since there was a shift in reproductive labour to increase productivity of genders at each strata and mechanized harvesting was introduced as well.	
Indicator 3 Household assets of at least 10% of the target beneficiaries of the smallholder agricultural projects, which introduce “Gender Mainstreaming Package”, is improved.	(Ex-post Evaluation): achieved	In each site visited mentioned above (Indicator 1 and 2), beneficiaries have seen changes in the household assets in various forms: purchasing motor vehicles, constructing permanent/improved houses, installing solar energy systems for television and lighting. In Teso South Sub-County (Cassava production under EAAPP), farmers own livestock to diversify their farming. At MIS (RiceMAPP), Kirinyaga County, increased income, coupled with better understanding at household level, farmers made better planning for investment in assets. Consequently, households got better housing, water storage systems for reproductive relief to women, television sets, radio sets, and cattle, among others.	Same as above.
Indicator 4 10 smallholder agricultural projects, 7 Counties and 2 Training Institutions implement components of the “Gender Mainstreaming Package (GMP)”.	(Ex-post Evaluation) partially achieved	<p><u>Smallholder agricultural projects</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Six projects - RiceMAPP/CaDPERP, SHEP-PLUS/SHEP-Biz (SHEP: Smallholder Horticulture Empowerment Project), Kenya Cereal Enhancement Programme (KCEP-CRAL), Kenya Climate-Smart Agriculture Project (KCSAP), Agriculture Sector Development Support Programme – Phase II (ASDSP-II) and Enable Youth Kenya Program - have implemented GMS. Most of the projects have conducted training of staff and farmers on gender mainstreaming, inclusive decision-making, division of labour between genders, access and control of resources, equity of benefits sharing. - KCSAP: Participatory decision making at household level regarding improvement of agricultural productivity in the face of climate change was incorporated - ASDSP-II: There has been deliberate inclusion of the historically disadvantaged groups – women and youth – in committees of agricultural value chains. - Enable Youth Kenya Program: The Project Log-frame was engineered to ensure gender mainstreaming in the project. <p><u>Counties</u></p> <p>In addition to Kirinyaga, Busia, and Nyeri, Taita Taveta, Kilifi, Embu and Kitui Counties have been implementing gender aspects as part of the KCEP-CRAL, mentioned above.</p> <p><u>Training Institutions</u></p> <p>Kenya School of Agriculture has conducted gender training of staff and farmers on integration of gender in project activities; inclusive decision making.</p>	Questionnaires and interviews with MoALFC

3 Efficiency

The project cost was within the plan and the project period was as planned (The ratio against the plan: 62%, 100%). The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

There has been policy support for promoting gender responsive agriculture extension services. The “National Policy on Gender and Development” (2019 -) was established under the State Department for Gender, Ministry of Public Service and Gender to set up a framework for integrating gender issues into development planning across ministries and departments at both levels of government. At the

time of ex-post evaluation, the “Agriculture Gender Policy” (Draft) was being finalized by MoALFC. It is expected to expand the space for development of gender responsive agricultural programs and align them through a well-coordinated gender mainstreaming effort in the agriculture sector.

< Institutional/Organizational Aspect >

The Government of Kenya has had positive intentions to promote gender mainstreaming across sectors.

At the MoALFC level, the Gender Unit that was active during implementation of the project has been on and has been strengthened to deliver its mandate accordingly. Even though, to this day there has been only one staff at the Gender Unit of SDCD&AR, a number of officers that have been allocated for gender mainstreaming roles in almost every agricultural project. A Gender Committee was also set up to ensure gender aspects of project development are promoted across the ministry.

On the other hand, at the County level, Nyeri and Busia Counties indicated that some extent of structural establishment has been put in place in line with gender mainstreaming. In Nyeri, the Directorate of Livestock Production was established to implement livestock policy and extension in this sub-sector. Busia, also came up with a Monitoring & Evaluation section to monitor the implementation and reporting of all related projects. This, however, seem not to be aligned directly to gender mainstreaming components.

The number of staff at MoALFC has not been sufficient, as only one (1) staff member has been assigned at the Gender Unit and there is need for more staff especially, in the area of M&E. The Gender Committee at the MoALFC has got six (6) members who need proper training on such gender related issues to be able to deliver its mandate of gender mainstreaming, effectively. At the Counties, Busia and Nyeri in their establishments for this purpose have allocated 8 and 18 staff members respectively. However, in both Counties, these are perceived to be slightly limited for some are tasked with responsibilities in other sectors/projects (Busia) and almost 34% are about to retire (Nyeri).

< Technical Aspect >

It is notable that most of the staff assigned to ensure gender mainstreaming both at MoALFC and at the Counties, have been undergoing some training geared towards their preparation for the tasks, which is a positive indication for the future of gender mainstreaming.

At MoALFC, the gender focal person has had no proper account of various training that the staff of related assignments have participated in and how this prepared them for the task of maintaining sustainability of GMP dissemination.

County Director of Agriculture (CDA) in Busia and Kirinyaga Counties had no accounts of any such training that may have been conducted recently for County staff to promote gender mainstreaming agenda. However, in Nyeri County, key staff participated in a number of relevant training activities

< Financial Aspect >

There is a growing trend to allocate funds for gender mainstreaming both at the national level and Counties despite the fact that majority of these entities is yet to dedicate a budget slot for specific gender units to run specific agenda on GMP dissemination.

At the national level, MoALFC has allocated and distributed funds for addressing gender issues across many projects, but not in a consolidated manner. In the financial year (FY) of 2020/21, a total of. 300 million Kenyan Shillings (KES) was allocated with half being utilized so far to promote gender mainstreaming in various programs. While the main source of funds is the Government of Kenya, the Gender Unit occasionally has obtained support from other development partners such as UN Women and others in the form of funds and in-kind.

The County Government of Nyeri also has consistently allocated funds for gender activities – 2018 (2 million KES), 2019 (2 million KES), 2020 (4 million KES) and in 2021 a commitment of about 9 million KES. has been made. In an interview with the County staff, these funds have been in all occasions spent to the last coin to promote gender mainstreaming in development of specific agricultural products or value chains such as poultry, bee keeping and dairy activities. In Kirinyaga and Busia, there was no clearer budget lines that targeted gender mainstreaming or activities related to it but this could be because of lack of proper working structure to promote gender activities in agriculture as a clear-cut agenda. However, in Kirinyaga the County government often allocate budget but as part of activities planned by the agriculture department since all projects have embedded to them a gender mainstreaming aspect. About KES. 0.9 million was spent on this manner in FY 2020/21.

< Evaluation Result >

In light of the above, minor constraints have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project partially achieved the Project Purpose at the project completion. Although GMP obtained positive response, it was not adopted at project completion, and three Counties were not able to develop GMP strategies, while three partner projects implemented GMP components. Overall, transformation of gender relations of the beneficiaries has been confirmed, which enabled more women to participate in the decision-making process and productive activities and to have access to and adaptation of technologies. And these effects have partially continued after the project completion. The Overall Goal has been partially achieved, as productivity, income and household assets increased at the target partner projects with the help of other factors. And some components of GMP have been implemented under smallholder agricultural projects, Counties, and training institutions, though the target was not achieved. As for the sustainability, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects, however, no problem has been observed for the policy aspect.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

Sufficient dedicated budget for gender mainstreaming should be secured every fiscal year by MoALFC. The Ministry should consolidate all budgets previously meant for ‘hidden’ gender issues in projects into a single budget under the Gender Unit. This will help to focus and align all programs of the ministry to specific agenda through relevant capacity building of sufficient staff, and dissemination of the gains achieved and developed through GMP. The aim is to expand impact and guarantee sustainability. The County governments also need to secure budget for gender mainstreaming.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

The collaborative approach among development partners to implement technical cooperation projects especially, in agriculture has the capability of bringing out the best in each entity to leverage on linkages for synergy. In the project, farmers manifest huge gains as a result of this path and even when a donor withdraws, like in the case of WB's EAAPP, the gains are likely to be enhanced and sustained. For future agricultural projects in Kenya, JICA should consider partnerships with long-term projects such as KCSAP, National Agricultural and Rural Inclusive Growth Project (NARIGP), ASDSP-II or KCEP-CRAL which are quite sustainable. This project collaboration, however, has limitations since donors are not directly involved in the implementation. Therefore, it would be more effective if JICA directly approaches to donors at the project formulation stage/at the start of the project implementation and collaborates with donors financing these projects to implement a cross-cutting project like this project together for proper sustainability and enhancement of the gains/impact.



Solar-drier and Cassava chipper for cassava value addition by farmer's group in Teso South, Busia County



A household implementing rainwater harvesting system to ease reproductive burden on women, Nyeri County