conducted by Mongolia Office: February, 2023

Country Name	Project for Improvement for Planning and Implementation Skills of Ulaanbaatar Master Plan
Mongolia	1 roject for improvement for realiting and imprementation skins of organization viaster real

I. Project Outline

1. I Toject Outilité			
Background	In Ulaanbaatar city, the capital city of Mongol 1.2 million in 2012 due to population inflow from population increase and urbanization and it was essufficient urban infrastructures. With that backgre implemented a project the "Study on City Maste (2007-2009) to present an ideal city vision of Ulaa of the study, the Governor's Office of the Capital 2020 Master Plan and Development Approaches Khural (the parliament of Mongolia) in February expected to develop an action plan for prompt ideveloped due to the lack of human resources who a technical cooperation project the "Project on Ca (2010-2013) was implemented with the assistance project prepared the draft law of urban redevelopment for the draft law and started urban redevelopment Municipal Government faced with various issue legislation systems and insufficient management of	n rural areas. Hous timated that 60% o ound, the Governmer Plan and Urban nbaatar and promote City (the Municipa for 2030" (MP20) 2013. Following templementation of the had sufficient know pacity Development e of JICA to promote the projects consignities relating projects	sing supply could not catch up with the rapid of the population lived in "ger areas" without ent of Mongolia with the assistance of JICA Development Program of Ulaanbaatar City" the its urban development. Based on the results and Government) formulated the "Ulaanbaatar (20) which was approved by the State Great the approval, the Municipal Government was MP2020. However, the action plan was not owledge and experience of planning. Besides, at in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia" note the redevelopment of ger areas, and the I Government developed rules and regulations and them to private companies. However, the implementation caused by the inadequate
Objectives of the Project	Through the assistance for formulation of M redevelopment projects in Ulaanbaatar city, the prand implementation of urban development, the residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city. 1. Overall Goal: Urban functions and residential urban development based on MP2020 approved. 2. Project Purpose: Capacity of urban planning upgrading residential environment is enhanced.	P2020 Action Plan oject aims at develoreby contributing to environment of Ulad ed by the 23rd Parlia and urban develop	n and promotion of implementation of urban opment of the city staff's capacity of planning to the improvement of urban functions and laanbaatar city are improved through planned ament Resolution in 2013.
Activities of the Project	 Project Site: Ulaanbaatar city Main Activities: Formulation of the MP2020 Action Plan Establishment of the monitoring method Formulation of the urban redevelopment redevelopment Promotion of the land readjustment proje Establishment of the projectization prome Promotion of public participation and inf Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side Experts: 13 persons Trainees Received: 16 persons 	for the MP2020 Ac policy and the 5-ye cts through model p otion strategies for a formation sharing w Mongolian Side 1) Staff Alloca 2) Land and F	ar implementation plan for urban projects urban redevelopment projects rith citizens ated: 27 persons facilities: project office cost for utility of offices (electricity, water
Project Period	(ex-ante) September 2014 – December 2018 (actual) September 2014 – December 2018	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 340 million yen (actual) 441 million yen
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Construction and Urban Developmen Government)	nt (MCUD), Gover	rnor's Office of the Capital City (Municipal
Cooperation Agency in Japan	_		

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance/Coherence

[Relevance]

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Mongolia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the development policy of Mongolia at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In the section of "Economic Growth and Development Policies" in the "Comprehensive National Development Strategy of Mongolia 2007-2021," four strategic objectives were defined as: 1) urban construction and legal system development for urban planning to create appropriate population distribution and favorable living conditions for citizens in urban and other areas, 2) construction of buildings which meet the today's quality standard, 3) acceleration of housing supply, and 4) improvement of land use including promotion of land privatization. MP2020 formulated along the line with those strategic objectives was approved by the parliament in February 2013 and recognized as the Ulaanbaatar city's development policy to attain those strategic objectives.

¹ Residencial areas formed by the inflow of nomad into Ulaanbaatar city consist of gers (traditional portable houses) and simple detached houses.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Mongolia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the development needs of Mongolia at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Following the approval of MP2020, the Municipal Government was expected to develop an action plan for prompt implementation of MP2020. However, the action plan was not developed due to the lack of human resources who had sufficient knowledge and experience of planning. On the other hand, the "Project on Capacity Development in Urban Development Sector in Mongolia" (2010-2013) assisted by JICA prepared the draft law of urban redevelopment, and it was submitted to the parliament. The municipal government developed rules and regulations related to the draft law and started urban redevelopment projects consigning them to private companies. However, due to inadequate legislation systems and insufficient management capacities of the city staff, the municipal government faced with various issues relating projects' implementation.

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

The project design/approach was appropriate. One of the outputs of the project was implementation of housing supply policy for the lower and medium income population in Ulaanbaatar city including residents in ger areas. Since the average annual income of the residents in ger areas was lower than 30% of the national average, it indicated that the project made consideration for socially vulnerable people. Besides, the Urban Development Law (2008) stipulated provisions to ensure the balance of human security, natural environment, ecology, economy, and social development as well as to secure the equal interests of all concerned actors including the residents involved in urban development activities. MP2020 was formulated based on the concept of those provisions. Therefore, aiming at the promotion of implementation of MP2020, the project was designed to secure equal interests of all stakeholders involved in and affected by urban development. No problem attributed to the project design/approach was confirmed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is 3. (4: very high, 3: high, 2: moderately low, 1: low * To be the same afterwards.).

[Coherence]

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Mongolia at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In the "Country Assistance Policy for Mongolia" (April 2012), strengthening of urban functions of Ulaanbaatar city was placed as one of the priority areas (intermediary goals). The policy declared to assist infrastructure development applying Japanese knowledge and technologies along with capacity development of Mongolian agencies' urban planning management in order to sustain and strengthen urban functions through the realization of MP2020.

<Collaboration/Coordination with other JICA's interventions>

Any collaboration/coordination between the project and other JICA's intervention was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework>

Any cooperation with other institutions/ coordination with international framework was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ②.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the Time of Project Completion>

At the time of project completion, the Project Purpose was mostly achieved as planned. The staff of MCUD and the Municipal Government has improved their knowledge and implementing capacity for urban development through various training and on-the-job (OJT) training provided by the project (Indicator 1), which contributed to the drafting of MP2040 after-mentioned. The MP2020 Action Plan was developed by the project and approved by the parliament in 2016 (Indicator 2). Handbooks prepared by the project were utilized for the formulation of urban development rules and regulations, training, pilot projects, and other activities (Indicator 3). The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government for smooth implementation of MP2020 (Indicator 4), and the restructuring was conducted after the completion of the project (Indicator 5).

< Continuation Status of Project Effects at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

By the time of the ex-post evaluation, the project effects have been continued. After the completion of the project, MCUD and the Municipal Government in collaboration conducted monitoring and evaluation of the implementation situation of MP2020. And, based on the results of monitoring and evaluation, at the time of ex-post evaluation, they are drafting MP2040 which is the updated version of MP2020. MCUD and the Municipal Government also prepared the revision of the Urban Redevelopment Law, and it was approved by the parliament in 2021. Handbooks prepared by the project have been utilized for policy making, training, and other activities related to urban development. The Urban Planning and Development Department of the Municipal Government has developed videos and handouts based on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on urban redevelopment. Organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project. The new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up and the number of staff for urban development has increased. The new section is responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of ex-post evaluation, the Overall Goal has been partially achieved. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply) is on the increasing trend. However, according to the Municipal Government, the implementation rate² of MP2020 in 2020 was 29.6%. If the rate had been higher, the larger development effects might be expected.

<Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

² The rate of the number of projects commenced and completed against the number of projects planned in MP2020 to be commenced and completed.

According to MCUD and the Municipal Government, land acquisition and resettlement caused by the project and the projects of MP2020 have not taken place. In the redevelopment of ger areas implemented according to MP2020, apartment houses reconstruction projects remove old houses and newly build apartment houses. Residents in the project sites are granted to exchange their lands for apartments, and the land of 2,427 units³ have been exchanged for apartments. Exchanges of lands are negotiated between residents and developers, and MCUD and the Municipal Government do not participate in the negotiations. Along with the progress of redevelopment projects, the number of residents in ger areas has increased and asset value of land in the areas has risen. As for the citywide development, improvement of environment and soil was expected through installation of sewage lines, improvement and construction of lavatories including public lavatories, and renovations of waste dumping areas. However, specific effects on environment and soil have not been confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

	Achievement of Project Purpo	I	
Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
Project Purpose:	Indicator 1:	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation):	l '
Capacity for urban	Formulation and publication of the	mostly achieved as planned (continued)	Municipal Government
planning and urban	MP2020 Action Plan, and	(Project Completion)	
development project	improvement of knowledge and	Through various training (training in Mongolia, training	
implementation	capacity for the implementation of	in Japan, workshops, and seminars), OJT in pilot	
contributing to upgrading	urban redevelopment projects.	projects, discussion in taskforce meetings, and other	
residential environment is		activities provided by the project, the staff of MCUD	
enhanced.		and the Municipal Government has improved their	
		knowledge and implementing capacity for urban	
		development including legal systems development,	
		institutions development, legal documentations,	
		implementation of surveys, and others.	
		(Ex-Post Evaluation)	
		After the completion of the project, MCUD and the	
		Municipal Government in collaboration conducted	
		monitoring and evaluation of the implementation	
		situation of MP2020. And, based on the results of	
		monitoring and evaluation, they are drafting MP2040	
		which is the updated version of MP2020 at the time of	
		ex-post evaluation. To draft MP2040, MCUD and the	
		Municipal Government conducted interviews with	
		experts, public hearings inviting citizens and private	
		sectors, and various surveys including population	
		survey, economic survey, environmental survey. The	
		revision of the Urban Redevelopment Law was also	
		prepared in the same manner, and the revision was	
		approved by the parliament in 2021.	
	Indicator 2:	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation):	Source: MCUD,
	Approval of the MP2020 Action Plan.	mostly achieved as planned (continued)	Municipal Government
	••	(Project Completion)	•
		The MP2020 Action Plan was approved in 2016 by the	
		Mongolian government ordinance No.174.	
		(Ex-Post Evaluation)	
		As stated above in Indicator 1, MCUD and the	
		Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government are drafting	
		MP2040 which is the updated version of MP2020 at the	
		time of ex-post evaluation.	
	Indicator 3:	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation):	Source: MCUD,
	Utilization of handbooks in daily	mostly achieved as planned (continued)	Municipal Government
	work of the implementation of urban	(Project Completion)	•
	redevelopment projects.	The handbook of "Urban Redevelopment Law and	
	Utilization of handbooks for the	organizations for urban redevelopment" prepared by the	
	training related to urban	project was utilized to formulate urban development	
	redevelopment.	rules and regulations including the "regulation on urban	
	•	and downtown redevelopment site selection model" and	
		the "regulation on rebuilding old apartment houses	
		projects." The handbook was also utilized in training	
		(training in Mongolia, training in Japan, workshops,	
		and seminars) and the pilot projects.	
		(Ex-Post Evaluation)	

³ A legal unit used in Mongolia for land registration. It does not denote land area or the number of households.

Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water 122 145 161 177 175									
MCID and the Municipal Groverment base kept using the handbooks prepared by the project in their daily work of policy making, document preparation, meetings, etc. The handbooks are also utilized in training on whan planning and explatation formulation conducted for the staff of local governments. The Urban Planning, and Development Department of the Municipal Government The Urban Planning and Development Department of the Municipal Government The Urban Planning and Development Department of the Municipal Government Than development. Indicator 4: Re-organization of Ulanabeaur Municipal Consertment (and the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for cirizens on urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation) Government Municipal Government and Status of the Achievement (Status of the Status) Government (The Municipal Government and Status) Government (The Municipal Government Municipal Government (The Municipal Government (The Municipal Government (The Municipal Government (The Government Municipal Government (The Government Government (The Municipal Government (The Government (The Municipal Government (The Government Government (The Municipal Government (The Government (The Municipal Government (The Government (The Municipal Government (The Governmen			After the cor	npletion	of the	oroject, j	policy m	akers in	
the handbooks peopared by the project in their daily work of policy making, document preparation, meetings, etc. The handbooks are also utilized in training on unbrusp planning and regulation formulation conducted for the staff of local governments irecluding the Manicipal Government and Development Department of the Municipal Government make developed wides and handbooks hased on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for difference outline dutter different in project and project completion of the project and proposed on unparticularly and provided project and approach of the project approach of the project and approach of the project approach of the project approach of the project and approach of the project approach of th				•					
work of policy making, document preparation, mestings, are also utilized in training on urban planning and equilation formulation conducted for the staff of local governments. The Urban Planning and Development Department of the Municipal Government That developed videos and handouts based on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for elifonse on urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement Status of the Continuation; Source: Municipal Government from the Municipal Government Policy and Planning was set up, and the municipal and support of implementation of MP2000, preparation of MP2004, along with policy formulation, planning, and restricting of the project proposed an organizational restructing of the Municipal Government for for staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The raw section of Development Policy and Planning was est up, and the muniber of staff for urban development projects. Indicator S: Peoposal of the re-organization of Ulanbasar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban development medical projects of the municipal Government functions effectively to conduct when the municipal Government functions and consolidations of the training at the sensor implication of the municipal Government functions effectively to conduct when the municipal Government arining at the sensor implication of the municipal Government functi									
meerings, etc. The handbooks are also utilized in training on untrap planning and regulation formulation conducted for the staff of local governments including the Manicipal Government for the Manicipal Government has developed videos and handruss hased on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on what networks of the Continuation? Indicator 4: Re organization of Ulanihantar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. States of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation) General Government in the state of the Manicipal Government in the state of the Manicipal Government in the state of the Manicipal Government and the state of t									
training on urban planning and regulation formulation conducted for the staff of local governments including the Municipal Government of the Municipal Government of the Municipal Government bas developed videos and handours based on the handflooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on urban redevelopment. Indicator 4 Re-organization of Ulanabatata Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government attrings of the Municipal Government attrings of the Municipal Government attring of the Municipal Government attring at the suscodi implementation of MP2020. (Es: Post Fostlantion) The organizational restructuring, proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution Na. 500. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2000, preparation of MP2000, government on MP2000, government based on the MP2000 appro			work of p	olicy n	naking,	docume	ent pre	paration,	
training on urban planning and regulation formulation conducted for the staff of local governments including the Municipal Government of the Municipal Government of the Municipal Government bas developed videos and handours based on the handflooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on urban redevelopment. Indicator 4 Re-organization of Ulanabatata Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government attrings of the Municipal Government attrings of the Municipal Government attring of the Municipal Government attring at the suscodi implementation of MP2020. (Es: Post Fostlantion) The organizational restructuring, proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution Na. 500. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2000, preparation of MP2000, government on MP2000, government based on the MP2000 appro			meetings, et	c. The	handboo	ks are	also uti	lized in	
conducted for the staff of local governments including the Municipal Government. The Urban Planning and Development Department of the Municipal Government has developed videos and handwals based on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for titizens on urban redevelopment. Indicator 4: Re-organization of Ulaanbuatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Government (Project Completion) The episcet proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government attraing at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (In September 1) and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No. 360. By the restructuring the new section of Ulaanbuatar Municipal Government (Incutions of Mezived, along with policy formulation, Inlanning and approved in 2021 by the government resolution of MP2040, appropriation of MP204									
the Municipal Government. The Urban Planning and Development Department of the Municipal Government has developed videos and handouts based on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings of the Re-organization of Ulanahatar Municipal Government functions officetively to conduct the MP2020 Action Flam. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among at the smooth implementation of MP2020, (Completion) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government among at the smooth implementation of MP2020, (Completion) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of MP2020, preparation of MP2020, government of MP2020, governm			_	_	_	_			
Development Department of the Municipal Government Bas developed videos and handwise based on the handbrooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on urban redevelopement. Indicator 4 Re-organization of Ulasabautar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Arbivevenent (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among achieved as planned (continued) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Port Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.50, 80, 80, 80 the restructuring, of the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for surban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning and facilitation for surban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for surban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for surban development projects. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Mature of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): The international continuation of MP2000, along with policy formulation and facilitation for surban development projects. (Ex-Post Livational continuation): The number of citizens living in the surban facilitation of the Continuation of the MP2000 and urban residential environment of the Continuation			conducted for	r the stat	ff of loc	al goveri	nments i	ncluding	
Development Department of the Municipal Government Bas developed videos and handwise based on the handbrooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on urban redevelopement. Indicator 4 Re-organization of Ulasabautar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Arbivevenent (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among achieved as planned (continued) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Port Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.50, 80, 80, 80 the restructuring, of the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for surban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning and facilitation for surban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for surban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for surban development projects. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Mature of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): The international continuation of MP2000, along with policy formulation and facilitation for surban development projects. (Ex-Post Livational continuation): The number of citizens living in the surban facilitation of the Continuation of the MP2000 and urban residential environment of the Continuation			the Municipa	l Gover	nment. '	The Urb	an Planr	ning and	
Indicator 4: Re-organization of Ulambastar Municipal Government functions of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government functions of the Municipal Government functions of the Municipal Government (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2D20. GE-Post Evaluation) The project group proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2D20. GE-Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360, By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of Policy Indicator of MP2D40, along with policy formulation, planning and supproved in organization of Continuation of MP2D40, along with policy formulation, planning and subject of the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2D40, along with policy formulation, planning and facilitation for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the competency works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. Overall Goal: Indicator:			_					-	
on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings for citizens on urban redevelopment. Indicator 4: Re-organization of Ulnanbanara Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Activernment (Status of the Continuation): Covernment discussion of MP2020. Action Plan. The project completion of the project completion of the project and approved in Organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution Na. 360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy of Implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of the project proposed on Organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development based on the MP2040 approved by the project proposed on organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government projects. GE-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development projects. GE-Post Evaluation principle and implementation of urban development projects. GE-Post Evaluation principle and implementation of urban development projects. GE-Post Evaluation principle and implementation of urban development projects. GE-Post Evaluation principle and implementation of urban development projects. GE-Post Evaluation principle and implementation of urban development projects. GE-Post Evaluation principle and projec			_	•				_	
Indicator 4: Re-organization of Uluanhautar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government (Station Plan. White Plan. Statis of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Montreal of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2000. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up. and the number of staff for when development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2000, preparation of WP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanibastar Municipal Government functions effectively no conduct urban redevelopment of the distribution of white project is set of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion) Ulanibastar Municipal Government aiming and facilitation for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new feetively by no conduct urban redevelopment of the city and development of the distribution of white and projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As started above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development of the city including MP2001 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As started above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development of the city including MP2001 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As started above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development of the city including MP2001 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As started above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development of the city including MP2001 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As started above in Indicator 4, the			Government has developed videos and handouts based						
Indicator 4: Re-organization of Ulanabastar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. The project proposed un organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Post Faviluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for ultimal continuation: Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabastar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment and the functions of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government functions of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for orban development. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government functions of the Continuation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of			on the handbooks and utilized them in public meetings						
Indicator 4: Re-organization of Ulanabastar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. The project proposed un organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Post Faviluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for ultimal continuation: Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabastar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment and the functions of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government functions of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for orban development. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government functions of the Continuation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation of									
Re-organization of Ulanabatar and Minicipal Government functions effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. Monticipal Government functions of Cligate Completion of the Municipal Government attining at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for athan development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2020, preparation of MP2020, and planning and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2020, and the number of staff for athan development. Indicator 5:			•					Carrage Marriain al	
Municipal Government functions of the project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Its-Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of Development increased from 8 to 15. The new section of Planshaut Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Indicator 5: Indicator 5: Indicator 6: Indicator 6: Indicator 7: Indicator 7: Indicator 8: Indicator 9: Indicator									_
Effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government uniming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No. 360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2040, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for arban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabatatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation). Source: Municipal Government airming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) partially achieved as planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) partially achieved as planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) pa		Re-organization of Ulaanbaatar	mostly achieved as planned (continued)					Government	
Effectively to conduct the MP2020 Action Plan. The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government uniming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No. 360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2040, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for arban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabatatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation). Source: Municipal Government airming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) partially achieved as planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) partially achieved as planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation of urban development projects. (Cx-Post Evaluation) pa		Municipal Government functions	(Project Com	pletion)					
Action Plan. the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of MP2020. (Fix-Post Evaluation) The organizational restricturing proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Planabarat which was resoluted in the project completion) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Proposal of the project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government functions and residential environment of Junabarater city are improved through planned through planned projects. Proverall Goal: Urban functions and residential environment of Junabarater city are improved through planned through planne		_		-	an Orgai	nizationa	1 restruct	uring of	
implementation of MP2020. (Ex. Post Evaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Obevelopment Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Indicator 6: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions seffectively to conduct urban redevelopment projects. Indicator 7: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government aiming at the impose of the Municipal Government of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved a business with utility services (heating, severage, water supply). Wear 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 178 211 211 1 - Sewenge 173 190 197 214 - Sewenge 173 190 197 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 20		1		_					
(Ix-Seves Irvaluation) The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project was carried out after the completion of the project was carried out after the completion of the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Minimized Government (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Minimized Government atming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in indicator 4, the new section of Development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd partialment resolution in 2013. Moster: Sepon Evaluation partially achieved and the supply of the project projects in Ulanabatar city. The supply of the project projects in Ulanabatar city in the project projects and the project projects planned (continued). The supply of the project projects planned (continued). The supply of the project projects planned (continued). The supply of the project projects planned (continued). The project projects planned (continued). The project projects planned (continued). The project projec		Action Plan.	_			aiming	at the	smootn	
The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Minicipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among and support of implementation of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among the Achievement (Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): The Project Proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government among the Achievement (Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in new section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects.			implementati	on of MF	P2020.				
The organizational restructuring proposed by the project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Minicipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among and support of implementation of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among the Achievement (Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): The Project Proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government among the Achievement (Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government among the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in new section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with a section of Development projects.			(Ex-Post Eva	luation)					
project was carried out after the completion of the project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of here-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Indicator 5: Proposal of here-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment or development or d			7		rectructi	irina 🗠	onosed	by the	
project and approved in 2021 by the government resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2020, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation. planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabaatar Minicipal Government (functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government (Project Completion) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. Cas-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects. Cas-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects. Cas-Post Evaluation partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with development projects. Cas-Post Evaluation partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with Government urban development households. Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 16 2017 16 2017 16 2017 17 2014 2019 2019 2019 2019 2019 2019 2019 2019									
resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP200, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation). Source: Municipal Government of the Multicipal Government of Urban functions and residential environment of Urban functions and the MP2002 paper of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation). The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Multicipal Government at urban development of the durban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved with urban to the MP2002 apply and urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved with urban to the MP2002 of partially achieved and some other resons. The number of citizens living in houses with urban to the partially achieved and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of souseho									
resolution No.360. By the restructuring, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP200, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation). Source: Municipal Government of the Multicipal Government of Urban functions and residential environment of Urban functions and the MP2002 paper of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation). The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Multicipal Government at urban development of the durban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved with urban to the MP2002 apply and urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved with urban to the MP2002 of partially achieved and some other resons. The number of citizens living in houses with urban to the partially achieved and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of souseho			project and	approve	d in 20)21 by	the gov	ernment	
of Development Policy and Planning was set up, and the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2002, how the policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban redevelopment projects. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2000 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Source: Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabaatar city until thousand households. Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 [Heating 17 175 175] [Total 18 13 13 13 13 13 13 13 13 13 13 13 13 13			resolution No	.360. Bv	the rest	ructuring	the nev	v section	
the number of staff for urban development increased from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2000, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanahaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Source: Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment are development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of Ulanahaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Indicator: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating sewerage, water supply). Improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 175 1761 1761 177 175 1761 1761 177 1775 1775				-		_			
from 8 to 15. The new section is responsible for the monitoring and support of implementation of MP2000, preparation of MP2000, along with policy formulation. planning, and facilitation for urban development. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation)). The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment Projects. [Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects. [Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects. [Ex-Post Evaluation) The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabatater city Unfire thousand households with utility services in Ulanabatater city Unfire thousand households with utility services in Ulanabatater city Water 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 Total 1013 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204			_		-	_		_	
monitoring and support of implementation of MP2040, preparation of MP2040, along with policy formulation, planning, and facilitation for urban development. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) The proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved The number of citizens living in needevolopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating sewerage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating sewerage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabatar city Water 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating sewerage 122 182 204 Newerage 122 182 204 - Newerage 122 1			the number of	of staff	tor urba	n develo	opment 1	ncreased	
Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion) The project Proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings sewerage, water supply). Water 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 1 63 Sewerage 133 131 313 71 138 160 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 175 1014 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 1014 1014 1014 113 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of completed projects planned for the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as			from 8 to 15	. The no	ew secti	on is res	sponsible	for the	
Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion) The project Proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings sewerage, water supply). Water 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 1 63 Sewerage 133 131 313 71 138 160 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 175 1014 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 1014 1014 1014 113 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of completed projects planned for the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as			monitoring a	nd suppo	rt of im	olementa	tion of N	MP2020	
Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Project Completion The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government are development. Project Completion The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects are comprehensive was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) Care of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects (Ex-Post Evaluation) Source: Municipal Government of Ulananbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city The number of households The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city The number of citizens living in houses with utility services The number of households The number of citizens living in houses with utility services The number of households The number of households The number of households The number of households The number of hous									
Indicator 5: Proposal of the re-organization of Ulanabatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development planned with the projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 1 - 163 1						_			
Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Week project Completion The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects and Implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project Projects and Implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 1 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 2 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 4 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 4 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Fits 1 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure			planning, and	facilitat	ion for u	rban dev	elopmen	t.	
Proposal of the re-organization of Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. Week project Completion The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects and Implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) The project Projects and Implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 1 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 2 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 3 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 4 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 4 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Fits 1 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure 5 (Ex-Post Evaluation) Figure		Indicator 5:	Status of the	Achiever	nent (Sta	itus of th	e Contin	uation):	Source: Municipal
Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment to flowers with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Source: Municipal Government tritises with utility services (heating, sewerage) and the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of complete of process planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as					•			,,,	T
functions effectively to conduct urban redevelopment. The project proposed an organizational restructuring of the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water 121 125 161 177 175 Total 134 134 151 161 177 175 Total 151 175 175 175 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply 175 191 191 191 197 214 - Sewerage 175 185 191 191 191 191 191 191 191 191 191 19								Government	
redevelopment. the Municipal Government aiming at the smooth implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings werage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with tutility services (heatings werage, water supply). Source: Municipal Government of tutility bound development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with tutility services in Ulaanbaatar city and tutility services in Ulaanbaatar city with tutility services in Ulaanbaatar c		_		-					
implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings werage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings werage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water 122 145 161 177 175 Sewerage 133 34 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Sewerage 172 182 204 Total 182 Water 178 211 211 Sewerage 178 211 211 211 Sewerage 178 211 211 211 Sewera		functions effectively to conduct urban	The project proposed an organizational restructuring of						
implementation of urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings werage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heatings werage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water 122 145 161 177 175 Sewerage 133 34 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Sewerage 172 182 204 Total 182 Water 178 211 211 Sewerage 178 211 211 211 Sewerage 178 211 211 211 Sewera		redevelopment.							
(Ex-Post Evaluation) As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. Overall Goal: Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatra city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Sewerage, water supply). (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatra city Unit: thousand households was not met MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. (Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatra city Unit: thousand household Vear 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017. Heating 163 Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water supply 175 10tal 134 137 138 160 Water 122 145 161 177 175 Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Sew		Todo (oropinone)							
As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment of the city including MP2020 and urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. As stated above in Indicator 4, the new section of Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development projects. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Ulit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as									
Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment for the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Unit: thousand households [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] parti			3						
Development Policy and Planning was created which was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment for the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households [Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Unit: thousand households [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] partially achieved [Ex-Post Evaluation] parti			As stated ab	ove in	Indicato	4, the	new se	ction of	
was responsible for the comprehensive works of policy formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. Indicator: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Indicator: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Indicator: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabaatar city unit: thousand households werage, water supply). Indicator: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabaatar city unit: thousand households werage, water supply). Indicator: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulanabaatar city unit: thousand households water unity unit: thousand households water in Ulanabaatar city unit: thousand households water unity unit thousehold water unity unit thousand households water unity unit thousehold water unity unit thousand households water unity unit thousehold water unity water unity unit thousehold water unity unit thousehold water unity water unity unit to water unity unit thousehold water unity water unity water unity unit to water unity unity water unity unit to water unity unit to water unity unity water unity unity water unity unity water unity									
formulation, planning, and implementation of urban development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. GEX-Post Evaluation) partially achieved Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulanabaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects plannade in MP2020 in 2020 was as			-	-		_			
development of the city including MP2020 and urban redevelopment projects. Overall Goal: Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - Sewerage 172 182 204 - Water supply 170 182 182 204 - Water supply 170 182 182 204 - Sewerage 170 183 190 197 214 - Sewerage 170 183 190 197 214 - Sewerage 170 184 141 414 413 180 180 180 180 180 180 180 180 180 180									
Overall Goal: Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - Sewerage 172 182 204 - Sewer									
Overall Goal: Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - Sewerage 172 182 204 - Sewer									
Overall Goal: Urban functions and residential environment of Uluanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Manipulation Sewerage Manipulation Sewerage Manipulation Manipulat			_		-	2			
Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. The number of citizens living in houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply). Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city Unit: thousand households Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 Total 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply 175 Water 173 190 197 214 - Water supply 175 Total 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as						nobio:::a-l	1		C
tresidential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating - - 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water 122 145 161 177 175 Total 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - - Sewerage 172 182 204 - - Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total 387 411 414 413 Note: "." in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as								_	
Unit: thousand households werage, water supply). Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating - - - 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water supply 122 145 161 177 175 Total 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - - Sewerage 172 182 204 - - Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020			Table 1: The number of citizens living in houses with					Government	
Sewerage, water supply). Year 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 Heating - - 163 - Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160 Water 122 145 161 177 175 Total 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - - Sewerage 172 182 204 - - Water 173 190 197 214 - Total 180 180 180 180 Note: "." in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and	The number of citizens living in		utility services in Ulaanbaatar city					
improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water Sewerage 172 182 204 Water Sewerage 173 190 197 214 - Total Sewerage 172 182 204 - Water Sewerage 172 182 204 - Water Sewerage 173 190 197 214 - Total Sewerage 172 182 204 - Water Supply 173 190 197 214 - Total Sewerage 172 182 190 197 190 Total Sewerage 172 182 190 197 190 Total Sewerage 199 197 190 197 190 Total Sewerage 199 197 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 199 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 199 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 199 190 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 199 190 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 190 190 190 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 190 190 190 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 190 190 190 190 190 190 190 190 Total Sewerage 190	Urban functions and	_	utility service	s in Ulaa	nbaatar		11		
resolution in 2013. Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160	Urban functions and residential environment of	houses with utility services (heating,	utility service		ınbaatar U	Jnit: thou			
Sewerage 133 131 137 138 160	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	utility service		ınbaatar U	Jnit: thou			
on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament resolution in 2013. Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	utility service Year		ınbaatar U	Jnit: thou	2016		
water supply 122 145 161 177 175 Total household 334 353 376 381 386 Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 - Sewerage 172 182 204 - Water 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "." in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaarar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating	2013	nnbaatar <u>U</u> 2014 -	<u>Jnit: thou</u> 2015 -	2016 163	2017	
resolution in 2013. Supply Total	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage	2013	nnbaatar <u>U</u> 2014 -	<u>Jnit: thou</u> 2015 -	2016 163	2017	
Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water 173 190 197 214 - Supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water	2013	2014 - 131	<u>Jnit: thou</u> 2015 - 137	2016 163 138	2017 - 160	
Year 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022 Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water 173 190 197 214 - Total 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply	2013	2014 - 131	<u>Jnit: thou</u> 2015 - 137	2016 163 138	2017 - 160	
Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total	2013 - 133 122	2014 - 131 145	Jnit: thou 2015 - 137 161	2016 163 138 177	2017 - 160 175	
Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total	2013 - 133 122	2014 - 131 145	Jnit: thou 2015 - 137 161	2016 163 138 177	2017 - 160 175	
Heating 178 211 211 Sewerage 172 182 204 Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total	2013 - 133 122	2014 - 131 145	Jnit: thou 2015 - 137 161	2016 163 138 177	2017 - 160 175	
Sewerage 172 182 204 Water 173 190 197 214 - Total 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household	2013 - 133 122 334	2014 - 131 145 353	Jnit: thou 2015 - 137 161 376	2016 163 138 177 381	2017 - 160 175 386	
Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year	2013 - 133 122 334	2014 131 145 353	Unit: thou 2015 - 137 161 376	2016 163 138 177 381	2017 - 160 175 386	
Water supply 173 190 197 214 - Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year	2013 - 133 122 334	2014 131 145 353	Unit: thou 2015 - 137 161 376	2016 163 138 177 381	2017 - 160 175 386	
supply Total household Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating	2013 	2014 	Jnit: thou 2015 	2016 163 138 177 381	2017 - 160 175 386	
Total household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage	2013 - 133 122 334 2018 178 172	2014 	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021	2017 - 160 175 386	
household 387 411 414 413 Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water	2013 - 133 122 334 2018 178 172	2014 	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021	2017 - 160 175 386	
Note: "-" in the table indicates no data available due to no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply	2013 - 133 122 334 2018 178 172	2014 	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021	2017 - 160 175 386	
no survey was conducted and some other reasons. As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total Total Water Heating Sewerage Water Supply Total	2013 	2014 	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214	2017 - 160 175 386	
As shown in the table, the number of households with utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household	2013 	2014 	Unit: thou 2015 	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214 413	2017 - 160 175 386 2022 	
utility services in Ulaanbaatar city is on the increasing trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in t	2013 	2014 	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214 413	2017 - 160 175 386 2022 	
trend in terms of every service of heating, sewerage, and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in too survey wa	2013 	2014 	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214 413 a availableer reason	2017 160 175 386 2022 le due to as.	
and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in too survey wa As shown in	2013	2014 131 145 353 2019 211 182 190 411 indicate ted and se, the nu	Unit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214 413 a availabiler reason househo	2017	
and water supply. However, the rate of the number of completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in t no survey wa As shown in utility service	2013	2014 131 145 353 2019 211 182 190 411 indicate ted and se, the nu anbaatar	2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214 413 a available re reason househoon the in	2017	
completed projects planned in MP2020 in 2020 was as	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in t no survey wa As shown in utility service	2013	2014 131 145 353 2019 211 182 190 411 indicate ted and se, the nu anbaatar	2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021 - 214 413 a available re reason househoon the in	2017	
	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in t no survey wa As shown in utility service trend in term and water su	2013	2014 131 145 353 2019 211 182 190 411 indicate ted and se, the nu anbaatar ery serviwever, t	Juit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021	2017 160 175 386 2022	
	Urban functions and residential environment of Ulaanbaatar city are improved through planned urban development based on the MP2020 approved by the 23rd parliament	houses with utility services (heating, sewerage, water supply).	Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Year Heating Sewerage Water supply Total household Note: "-" in t no survey wa As shown in utility service trend in term and water su completed pr	2013	2014 131 145 353 2019 211 182 190 411 indicate ted and se, the nu anbaatar ery serviwever, t	Juit: thou 2015	2016 163 138 177 381 2021	2017 160 175 386 2022	

3 Efficiency

Because the implementation methods of some tasks were changed to produce outputs, the project cost exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 130%), while the project period was as planned (the ratio against the plan: 100%). Outputs were produced as planned. In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ③.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The "Mongolia's Long-Term Development Policy Vision 2050" (2020) is a long-term national development policy for 2020 to 2050. The chapter 9 of it is the "Development of Ulaanbaatar city and its satellite cities." To actualize the vision, at the time of ex-post evaluation, MCUD and the Municipal Government in collaboration with other related agencies are preparing the "Human Settlement Plan" (HSP) and the "Regional Development Plan" (RDP). MP2040, the updated version of MP2020, will be one of the main pillars of HSP. Though RDP is not a development policy specific for Ulaanbaatar city, the development of Ulaanbaatar city is explicitly stated as a significant part of the comprehensive urban development.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

As for the institutional aspect, due to the rules and regulations' development leveraged by the outputs of the project (see achievement of Indicator 3 for the Project Purpose), public participation to development activities, crack down on illegal projects by the government, and landowners' rights protection have been legally strengthened. Because of this, especially in ger areas, positive effects have been observed including prevention of delay or suspension of projects through the public participation in developer's selection process, intensification and speedup of detections of unauthorized development activities, rationalization of real-estate registration to protect landowners. As for the organizational aspect, along with the proposal made by the project, MCUD added "urban redevelopment" to the list of duty outline of the Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Coordination and Implementation Department in 2019, thus urban development was identified as a duty-in-charge of the department. The Municipal Government also restructured its organization following the proposal made by the project (see achievement of Indicator 4 for the Project Purpose) and increased the number of staff in charge of urban development. However, the number of staff of the Urban Development and Land Affairs Policy Coordination and Implementation Department is 9 and the staff of Municipal Government in charge of urban development is 15, which are not sufficient for the volume of their works according to MCUD and the Municipal Government. Since staffing is done by the central government, it is hard to expect further increase of the staff. <Technical Aspect>

After the completion of the project, the staff of MCUD and the Municipal Government involved in the project have drafted policies and plans for urban development including MP2040, the revision of Urban Development Law, HSP, and RDP applying the knowledge and experience gained in the project. On the other hand, technical training for the staff has not been sufficient due to financial constraints on human resource improvement. Hence, the Municipal Government finds it difficult to sustain the knowledge, experience, and skills for urban development. The "Manual on Urban Redevelopment Implementation" prepared by the project was distributed to the staff in charge of urban development and policy making of all of 21 prefectures through prefectural governor's offices. It was also introduced and explained in the study meetings on policy making and planning held nationwide in 2020. The manuals and guidelines prepared by the project including the "Urban Redevelopment Implementation Manual" have been continuously utilized in daily work of policy making, annual action planning, and other works of urban development in MCUD and the Municipal Government.

<Financial Aspect>

Both of MCUD and the Municipal Government do not have sufficient budget for urban development thus the implementation rate of MP2020 was as low as 29.6%. MCUD has a difficulty to secure budget for large-scale development projects including ger areas redevelopment. To cope with the situation, MCUD takes measures such as the dispersion of development budget to some years and some areas to keep conducting urban development activities. The Municipal Government has been undertaking coordination efforts in the city council to resolute an adjustment of annual urban development budget. As an assistance from a development partner, at the time of ex-post evaluation, a grant aid project by the Chinese government for apartment houses' constructions is ongoing.

<Environmental and Social Aspect>

To draft MP2040, various environmental surveys including environmental impact assessment surveys have been conducted referring to opinions and advice from specialized agencies, researchers and experts. The draft revision of Urban Development Law submitted to the parliament in 2020 included a clause which stipulated that prefectural governments and the Urban Development and Planning Department Bureau of the Municipal Government in collaboration with related governmental agencies monitor social and environmental impacts caused by urban development activities including the impacts on air, water, soil, dust, noise, vibration, electromagnetic wave, etc. and take actions if necessary.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical, and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ②.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project mostly achieved the Project Purpose and partially achieved the Overall Goal. As for sustainability, while some problems are observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical, and financial aspects, some positive factors can be observed in the institutional/organizational improvement of MCUD and the Ulaanbaatar Municipal Government, production of draft laws applying the knowledge and experience gained in the project, and continuous assistance from development partners. As for efficiency, the project cost exceeded the plan. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

• The implementation rate of MP2020 was 29.6% mainly due to financial constraints. Therefore, it is recommended that MCUD and the Municipal Government secure the budget for accelerating the implementation of MP2020. Measures to secure the budget could be working on the state government or the city council to increase urban development budget, introduction and promotion of public and private collaboration such as Public Private Partnership (PPP), requesting development partners for financial assistance, and others. It is

- expected that MCUD and the Municipal Government take feasible and practical measures for them as soon as possible.
- The MP2020 Action Plan formulated by the project included budgetary plans and financial schemes for the implementation of the projects. However, the implementation rate of MP2020 has not been high due to financial constraints. It inferred that budgetary and financial plans made by the Action Plan have not functioned effectively, or the budgetary and financial plans have not been fully executed even if they were effective. Therefore, it is recommended that MCUD and the Municipal Government who are drafting MP2040, the updated version of MP2020, identify the issues of the budgetary and financial plans of MP2020 and their executions, and formulate realistic and implementable budgetary and financial plans in MP2040.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

• Implementation of the action plan prepared by the project has been delayed mainly due to financial constraints. Financing can be a critical factor in project implementations for most developing countries. Not a little portion of the action plan was devoted to financial plans for projects implementations. However, financing has not been secured because either the financial plans were not appropriate, or the executing agency did not have enough capacity to implement the financial plans even if they were appropriately planned. Hence, it is suggested that, adding to technical and social analysis and planning, feasibility analysis, strategy formulation, scheduling, and execution capability analysis of the implementing agency for financing would be indispensable to formulate a specific and implementable master plan and to implement it. By incorporating a specific financing strategy in a master plan based on those surveys and analysis and starts its initial activities with the initiative of implementing agency, it might increase the feasibility of implementation of the projects planned in the master plan. Though financing strategies vary from organization to organization, they could be, for example, aforementioned working on the finance ministry, public and private collaboration, requesting development partners for assistance, and others.



A ger area planned to be redeveloped



A result of a ger area redevelopment project