

Country Name	le Projet de Construction d'Ecoles Primaires (Phase IV)
Republic of Madagascar	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In Madagascar, primary education was made free in 2002, and the number of children in primary school had increased from 2,310,000 in 2001 to 5,118,000 in 2010 (source: Ministry of National Education, Education Statistics 2011-2012), an increase of approximately 2.2 times, and was expected to increase further in the future. In addition to the insufficient number of classrooms for the growing number of children, 13.6% of the total number of existing classrooms (2012) (source: same as above) were temporary classrooms built by communities, forcing children to learn in a poor educational environment.</p> <p>The former Toamasina, which includes Atsinanana, suffered more severe damage from the cyclone than other areas, had a two-shift school system due to a lack of classrooms, and faced a variety of problems such as aging facilities.</p>					
Objectives of the Project	<p>To eliminate the classroom shortages and improve the learning environment in the target public primary schools (Ecole Primaire Publique: EPP) in four school districts (circonscriptions scolaires: CISCO) in Atsinanana by building additional classroom buildings and furnishing classrooms, thereby contributing to improving the quality of primary education.</p>					
Contents of the Project	<p>1. Project Site: Four CISCOs in Atsinanana (Toamasina I, Toamasina II, Brickaville and Vatomandry)</p> <p>2. Japanese side <Target schools> 22 primary schools <Construction> 92 classrooms (in 30 classroom buildings), 15 head master rooms/storage, 124 toilet booths (in 30 buildings), 5 rainwater tanks <Procurement of furniture> Desks and chairs for children, desks for headmasters/teachers, blackboards, closet <Technical assistance/soft-component> Provide technical guidance on facility maintenance and management to school management committees, parent-teacher associations, and other school personnel who will be the primary implementers of maintenance and management.</p> <p>3. Madagascar side: - Remove existing facilities and obstacles, and relocate them, as well as clear the land. - New or repaired enclosure fences, installation of gates, etc.</p>					
Project Period	E/N Date	June 24, 2015	Completion Date (Plan)	June 2018	Completion Date (Actual)	April 19, 2019
	G/A Date	June 24, 2015				
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit / G/A Grant Limit : 860 million yen			Actual Grant Amount: 860 million yen :		
Executing Agency	Directorate of Assets and Infrastructure (Direction du Patrimoine Foncier et des Infrastructures: DPFI), Ministry of National Education (Ministère de l'Éducation Nationale: MEN)					
Contracted Agencies	Main Contractor(s): 10 companies (6 for construction and 4 for procurement of furniture) Main Consultant(s): MOHRI, ARCHITECT & ASSOCIATES, INC. Agent: Japan International Cooperation System (JICS)					

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance/Coherence
<p>[Relevance]</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Madagascar at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation ></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development policy of Madagascar at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Improving access to and strengthening of social infrastructure services, including educational development, was on the agenda of Madagascar's National Development Strategy 2014/2015.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Madagascar at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation ></p> <p>The project was consistent with the development needs of Madagascar at the time of ex-ante evaluation. As stated above, the targeted CISCOs faced issues including lack of classrooms and aging facilities.</p> <p><Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach></p> <p>The approaches adopted by the project were to take into account of the equality and make it possible for all the members of the groups to be involved. In fact, the toilets facilities constructed by the project were designed in consideration of the people with disabilities as well as the gender sensitives.</p> <p>As to the project design/approach as a whole, no problem attributed to the project was confirmed.</p> <p><Evaluation Result></p> <p>In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③¹.</p>
<p>[Coherence]</p> <p><Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation></p> <p>The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Madagascar at the time of ex-post evaluation. "Basic livelihoods" was one of the priority areas for assistance². Also, under the Yokohama Action Plan 2013-2017, the Fifth Tokyo International Conference on African Development (TICAD V), "Creating an Inclusive Society for Growth" which includes education was one of the priority areas.</p>

¹ ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low *To be the same afterwards.

² ODA Country Databook 2015

<Collaboration/Coordination with other JICA's interventions>

Any cooperation/coordination with development partners was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework>

Any cooperation/coordination with development partners was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ②.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Effectiveness>

The project objectives were mostly achieved as planned, as the targets of the quantitative effects such as the number of classrooms that can continue to be used in the target schools (Indicator 1), and the number of students per classroom (Indicator 2), have been mostly achieved as planned. As for the Indicator 1, the target value is regarded as achieved, as the number of classrooms constructed was in align with the number clarified at the detailed design stage. As for the Indicator 2, just after the completion of the construction work, the target value was achieved. However, it has been observed that the number set by the target is slightly exceeded after 3 years (2022) since the number of students enrolled increases every year.

About the physical conditions and utilization of facilities and equipment, according to the headmasters of schools as well as the visual confirmation through the site visit during the ex-post evaluation, almost all facilities and furniture constructed/procured under the project have been fully utilized and physically in fairly good condition. Some minor technical damages have been identified. About the classrooms of 11 schools visited, six rooms in EPP Analamalotra faced an issue of collapse of ceiling, due to bat's droppings accumulated between the roof and ceiling of the buildings. The upper part of the buildings has not been ventilated. As a result, it has been dark and moist, and thus, the ceilings of buildings have become privileged haves for bats. As a measure, FRAM (Fikambanan'ny Raiamandrenin'ny Mpianatra/Association of Students' Parents) has hired local workers to clear the droppings of bats and has already requested authorization (not yet accepted) from Regional Directorate of National Education (Direction Régionale de l'Education National: DREN) to put air vents between the ceiling and roof of buildings. One water tank had a problem of support being collapsed, and reinforcement of the support with local materials such as wood and stones was being planned.

As the qualitative effects, it was expected that improvement in the learning environment such as elimination of the two-shift class contributes to the enhancement of quality of education, and the girls' learning environment has improved due to the availability of separate toilets. After the project was completed, the following effects were observed:

(i) Neither two-shift classes nor the multi-grade ones can any more be found in the 10 out of 11 visited schools. Only one school with the multi-grade class was observed. The reason for this is the lack of teachers.

(ii) Thanks to the availability of classrooms, in particular, absenteeism has decreased. The students were motivated to go to school. During the interviews with students, girls got more confident to go to the toilet than before because they now have separated toilets spaces where make it possible to keep away from the prying eyes of boys. Like the case of the EPP Hotsika, the motivation of a disable girl in Grade5 was changed thanks to the improved toilet facilities. This girl expressed that the installation of the access ramp to the toilet is beneficial to her because before she had to ask one of her classmates to go to the toilet. After the project, she went to the toilet alone, moving conveniently between the classroom and the toilet.

(iii) Students and teachers expressed their comfort and satisfaction with the school environment. Some key benefits mentioned are as follows; i) thanks to the spacious classroom, teacher can follow and well supervise each student in class, ii) the well-ventilated air in the classroom makes both students and teachers comfortable to be in the class iii) thanks to the good management of the toilets, the air keeps clean, iv) thanks for procurement of new desks for the students, students became more active in taking notes since the surface of desks became smooth, v) thanks to the installation of water tanks, students can take a wash after the physical education class.

(iv) About the hygiene, during the focus group of students organized in every school, 100% of students in schools with water tanks answered that they have still used the school toilets.

During the interviews with the teachers and students, some concerns were expressed. Though it was beyond the scope of the project, in schools that do not have a water tank, toilets were dirty, and smells make everyone uncomfortable. Some teachers complained about the insecurity, as the school fence, which was expected to be built by the Madagascar side, was not constructed.

As for the effects of soft-component, it was difficult to obtain information, as school headmasters as well as FEFFI (Farimbon'Ezaka ho Fampandrosoana ny Fanabeazan Ifotony/Platform for the Development of Education) committee members were newly assigned/nominated, and no handover on the activities of the soft-component had been made. Nonetheless, the current headmasters and the FEFFI committee members have adopted on their own initiative to maintain the facilities and furniture those were granted by the project. Unfortunately, the manual which was elaborated through the project is no longer used since there was no handover when the predecessor and successor were replaced.

Quantitative Effects

Indicator	Ex-ante Year 2013	Target Year 2021 (3 years after project completion)	Year 2019 Year of project completion	Year 2022 *5 3 years after project completion	Source
1 Number of classrooms that can continue to be used in the target schools	90 *1	203 *2	182 (90+92)	182	Headmasters, CISCO's Chief and ZAP's chief
2 Number of students per classroom in the classrooms mentioned above.	153 *3	68 *4	60	70	Average number of students per class in the 11 EPPs visited
(Number of students in the			Girls 180	Girls 191	Average number of

target schools)			Boys 190	Boys 187	students in the 11 EPPs visited
-----------------	--	--	----------	----------	---------------------------------

Note: Originally, 113 classrooms in 27 schools were planned, but it was subject to the results of detailed design during the implementation. And actual number of classrooms constructed 92 in 22 schools.

- *1 Number of classrooms available for continued use at the target schools at the time of the preparatory survey.
- *2 Number of classrooms available for continuous use at the time of the preparatory survey (90 classrooms) + 113 planned classrooms
- *3 Number of children as an actual number in 2013 divided by the number of classrooms available for continuous use.
- *4 Due to the lack of statistical data on the projected number of children in the future due to political changes, etc., the number of children was calculated assuming the same number of children as the number of children at the time of preparatory survey. Since the impact of an increase in the number of children was possible at the time of evaluation, this point was taken into account in the evaluation. The number of children per classroom was set at 50, but in some of the target schools, the number of children per classroom exceeds 50 due to the difficulty in securing a site for the expansion of classroom buildings.
- *5 While this project was planned to be completed in June 2018, the actual completion was in April 2019. As the target year is three years after the completion of the project, the evaluation of the project was based on the results of 2022, not 2021.

<Impact>
 The average number of students enrolled in the Grade 1 of the 11 visited schools increased from 114 in 2018/2019 academic year to 145 in 2021/2022. The availability of classroom has enabled the target schools to receive more students in the first year. The decrease in students enrolled in EPP Hotsika and Ambodivontaka is explained, according to the directors, by the fact that new EPPs were being built nearby. The data to show the rate of retention as well as drop-out in each school is not available at MEN. Positive impacts have been observed in terms of vulnerable groups, persons with disabilities, social inclusion, well-being, and human rights. As mentioned above, the project allowed students with disabilities to have access to school, sanitation including separate toilets for boys and girls has encouraged especially girls to go to school. In schools with water tanks, parents of students expressed that their children's health has improved since the frequency of diarrheal diseases and influenza has reduced. As for human rights, the project has effectively addressed the fundamental rights to benefit from education in a normal condition promoting school attendance and learning performance.

As for the impacts on the gender issues, in addition to the effects mentioned above, some good impacts have been observed. The recruitment of local workers during the construction phase allowed men and women in the village to get a job. According to some members of the former FEFFI, the project insisted on the fact that the FEFFI committee should be composed equally of men and women. This has given women and men the same opportunity to get involve the school related activities.

No negative impacts have been observed in the natural environment. Nonetheless, a concern was expressed that the increase in bats after the project as mentioned above became a problem on agriculture that is close to the school.

<Evaluation Result>
 In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was as planned (the ratio against the plan: 100%), the project period exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 124%). Reasons for the delay include bad weather (effected to the progression of the construction work), delay in the supply of certain materials, difficulty on the transport of materials, replacement of employees (workforce) within the local company during the construction phase, due to problems with the payment of salaries of former employees, and insufficient local workforce.

Outputs were produced in accordance with the detailed design.
 In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ③.

4 Sustainability

< Institutional/Organizational Aspect>
 It is recognized that FRAM and FEFFI who have taken in charge of Operation and Maintenance (O&M) of school facilities have been functioning and the sufficient staff is assigned. As some minor issues, the members of FEFFI are changing if their term is over, therefore, it is important to have take-over session when member changes.

<Technical Aspect>
 The O&M staff has had necessary technical skills at the time of ex-post evaluation since they can maintain the school facilities without any damages so far, and also they could conduct some repair. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the regular training system has not been established to maintain the technical skills and knowledge of staff for O&M, however it was observed that the present staff in charge of O&M has made an effort to maintain the facilities in good condition by their own way.

<Financial Aspect>
 The necessary budget for the O&M has been partially secured by MEN. As the actual school management is entrusted to FEFFI, and FEFFI is responsible to manage the subsidies from MEN. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, it is confirmed that MEN has allocated subsidies properly to FEFFI. On the other hand, the large part of the school fund (subsidies) has been allocated to the payment of FRAM teachers' salaries so far and the fees for maintenance, in particular "small" repairs (purchase of bolts, change of non-functional padlocks, unclogging toilet pipes, welding) are borne by the contribution of students' parents.

<Environmental and Social Aspect>
 No specific risks have been observed.

<Current Status of Operation and Maintenance>
 There were no major problems on the status of equipment itself. However, the maintenance activities have not been conducted regular base and the procurement of the necessary spare parts have not been done in timely manner. Meanwhile, the cleaning unites has been organized under the participation of both students and teachers. They organize themselves about the weekly cleaning program on a cleaning schedule per week. A few student desk-benches were found to be unbolted because of the rapid of obsolescence of the steel parts under the effect of sea breeze air and sabotage on the part of the students. This happens almost every school year. In order to remedy of such situation, the member of FEFFI and the school administration carries out systematic controls of equipment, repairs / replacement of defective parts, rising students awareness of the importance of equipment maintenance and punishes students who have committed sabotage.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational / technical / financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ③.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project almost achieved the project objectives as planned, as the targets of the quantitative effects such as the number of classrooms that can continue to be used in the target schools (Indicator 1), and the number of students per classroom (Indicator 2), have been mostly achieved as planned. As for the efficiency, although the project period exceeded the plan, the project cost was as planned. As for the sustainability, no problems have been observed.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations to Executing Agency:

- It is recommended that MEN make an effort to secure the budget for the maintenance as well as construction and reparation of school facilities including fences and gates of schools and to add its budget to subsidies to schools before next budget request (August 2023). At this moment, the budget for such activities is not included in the budget item but it is essential for MEN to take in charge of necessary cost for maintenance and reparation of schools considering that the contribution from the FRAM is limited. Hence, the Direction in charge of the school construction such as DPFI should work with the DREN, CISCO and Zone Administrative et Pédagogique/ Administrative and Pedagogical Area (ZAP) to discuss the budget necessary for the maintenance. Then, DREN should include its budget in the Annual Work plan that serves as the basis for budget application for the next fiscal year. It is also important to raise awareness of the maintenance and management of the facilities at the level of the central government, so that they would realize that allocation of the necessary budget for the reparation and maintenance is significant. In this sense, to organize study tours for officials of MEN to make them understand the situation on site would be one of the ideas.
- It is recommended that DREN, CISCO and ZAP that they should establish training system and provide training to the staff for O&M regularly in order to keep their skills necessary of O&M at the certain level. In order to implement O&M in proper manner with certain level, it is necessary to retrain the staff in charge of O&M. For that, the training system should be established at first hand in collaboration with DREN, CISCO and ZAP, then the staff of DREN, CISCO and ZAP who participated in the training provided by the project should give training on O&M to new headmasters and FEFPI members. It is also important to include the monitoring and evaluation mechanism within the O&M training so that the progression of O&M activities would be reported to the supervisory authority (such ZAP, CISCO, DREN and MEN) in properly and all parties concerned will always be able to have same understanding about the status of O&M.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- In consideration of the gender equality and the socially vulnerable, the construction of the separated toilets for girls and boys and of facilities for people with disabilities were done by the project. In consequence, the motivation to go to the school of girls and students with disabilities were raised. On the other hand, those facilities were designed only with consideration for the physically handicapped. The Government of Madagascar is promoting inclusive education, and international trends such as inclusive education being one of the goals in the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) require consideration for the visually impaired in the future.
- In this project, water tanks were installed at EPPs where water supply facilities do not exist or existing water supply facilities are hindered. As a result, the public health environment for children has been improved, such as keeping toilets clean and washing hands after physical education in EPPs equipped with water tanks. On the other hand, in schools where water tanks were not installed, some hygienic issues were declared by the teachers and students, such as toilets not being cleaned properly. In the future, when conducting similar projects, the project should be formulated in consideration of the installation of water tanks for improvement of sanitary environments in all schools because all schools targeted by the project should receive the same benefits after the project.



A classroom of EPP Ambodivontaka. Before the Project, this school was destroyed by the cyclone and the students were forced to use the temporary classroom constructed by wooden materials.



Toilet booth of EPP Analamalotra. The toilets were designed with taking into consideration of the gender and socially vulnerable groups.