

Country Name	Nouakchott City Urban Master Plan Development Project
Islamic Republic of Mauritania	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>Nouakchott City had been growing rapidly since the establishment of the city in 1960 as capital of Mauritania. The rapid population growth of the city was partly driven by serious poverty and scarcity of foods in the inland and rural areas caused by droughts and sandstorms that took place in 1970's. The influx of the population resulted in formation of vast unplanned residential areas, or shanty towns, in the areas close to the central area, as well as in the outskirts of the City as ribbon type sprawl.</p> <p>In addition to these various urban issues, the absence of an urban plan to properly manage the city's development and the lack of capacity of the relevant agencies resulted in unregulated development of the city and the related agency was not able to take measures of creating a favorable urban environment in the city.</p> <p>Ministry of Land Use, Urbanization and Habitation (MHUAT) formulated the Urban Development Master Plan (Schema Directeur d'Amenagement Urbain: SDAU) in 2003, which represented development framework of whole Nouakchott city and targets 2010 and 2020, in order to restrain sprawl of the city and increase the density of urban area. However, due to unpredictable population growth and lack of common recognition among relevant organizations, SDAU had not been utilized. In addition, the Local Development Plan (Plan Local d'Urbanisme: PLU), which represents land use and development plan of a commune and should be consistent with SDAU, had not been formulated yet. On the other hand, the Detailed Spatial Plan (Plan d'Aménagement de Detail: PAD) was formulated without reference to PLU, nevertheless PAD should fundamentally refer to PLU and SDAU. Therefore, an urban master plan, which indicates the future development vision of Nouakchott city was needed.</p>						
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through formulating the draft urban planning master plan (SDAU and PLU of a target commune) targeting 2040, and enhancing the capacity of relevant organizations, the project aims at contributing to the efficient infrastructure development and improvement of urban environment.</p> <p>1.Expected Goals through the proposed plan: The development of district plans in some districts in the commune for the formulation of PLUs for each commune will contribute to the proper regulation and guidance of development in Nouakchott, the efficient development of infrastructure and the improvement of the urban environment.</p>						
Activities of the project	<p>1.Project site: Nouakchott City 2.Main activities: (1) Formulation of urban development M/P for Nouakchott City (SDAU part) (2) Formulation of urban development M/P (PLU of a selected commune) (3) Capacity assessment of relevant organizations for formulation and implementation of urban plan (4) Strengthening of the capacity of relevant agencies in the formulation and implementation of urban planning and coordination with relevant agencies (5) Recommendations for the realization of urban development M/P 1.Inputs (to carry out above activities)* Inputs other than number of personnel will also be confirmed during the survey.</p> <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Mauritanian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Mission members: 14 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 7 persons</td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side	Mauritanian Side	1) Mission members: 14 persons	1) Staff allocated: 7 persons
Japanese Side	Mauritanian Side						
1) Mission members: 14 persons	1) Staff allocated: 7 persons						
Project Period	(ex-ante) October 2016-March 2018 (18 months) (actual) November 2016-September 2018 (22 months)	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 310 million yen, (actual) 313 million yen				
Implementing Agency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Department of Urbanism (DU), Ministry of Land Use, Urbanization and Habitation (MHUAT) - Urban Community of Nouakchott (CUN) 						
Cooperation Agency in Japan	RECS International Inc. CTI Engineering International Co., Ltd. PACET Corporation PASCO Corporation						

<Source> p.

II. Result of the Evaluation

1 Relevance/Coherence
<p>[Relevance]</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Policy of Mauritania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation > The project was consistent with the development policy of Mauritania at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Mauritania's development strategic plan (draft), "Poverty Reduction and Development Strategy Post-2015 Strategic Framework," set out five strategies. One of the strategies, "stable development of the poor," included urban development as one of the main actions.</p> <p><Consistency with the Development Needs of Mauritania at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation > The project was consistent with the development needs of Mauritania at the time of ex-ante evaluation. As mentioned above, Nouakchott city faced issues of unpredictable population growth with little support of common recognition among relevant organizations.</p> <p><Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>The project design/approach was appropriate.</p>

Some consideration for the vulnerable was incorporated. In Mauritania, land/housing addresses have not yet been regularized. The project plan had to be changed considering the actual status. The project implementation expanded its scope to include interviews with the National Office of Statistics and establishing the database of land use per plot. By having this change, the zones of the vulnerable such as low-income groups and poor-education groups were integrated into the project.

As for the design/approach of the project, although some lectures on developing survey questionnaires, deciding sample volume, and so on, were delivered in response to the request of CUN and some hearings and meetings were undertaken by the government staff, MHUAT recognized that the Japanese side delivered the majority of the field survey and the experts shifted every three months, which made the Ministry staff difficult to receive the technical transfer. In spite of that situation, they worked to create a collaborative system with other ministries and departments in order to have a large picture of the SDAU with the projects planned by other stakeholders. The Ministry came up with the cost estimation to work on the PLUs for 8 other communes of Nouakchott (in the masterplan study they did for one commune) and called for other partners to take it over. It was also emphasized at the SDAU seminar organized by MHAUT on 26 September 2022. Currently the Ministry is negotiating with MOUDON (Le Projet d'Appui à la Décentralisation et au Développement des Villes Intermédiaires Productives: Project to support the decentralization and the development of Intermediate Productive Cities) supported by the World Bank whether they can include Nouakchott in their scope. (MOUDON is basically to support development of 7 cities nearby the border in 2020-2025).

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③¹.

[Coherence]

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Mauritania at the time of ex-post evaluation. Under the Country Assistance Policy to Mauritania (2012), "poverty reduction in urban areas" was listed as a priority area. Under this priority area, the policy aimed to improve the basic living standards of the people through the development of basic infrastructure in urban areas where the population is growing rapidly.

<Interlinkage with other JICA's interventions>

Any synergy effect by the interlinkage between the project and other JICA's intervention was not clearly planned.

<Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation, it was expected that the realization of SDAU and PLU would be delivered by the collaboration with other partners, the Ministry had communicated with other ministries and departments for any planned or on-going projects related to SDAU as they intended to have all the projects streamlined to SDAU. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the EU announced its launch of a new project on development of urban mobility based on the SDAU in April 2022. The concrete project based on SDAU has not yet launched so many, partly because of the situation of COVID-19, it is expected that these kinds of synergy effects will be multiplied in coming years. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the Ministry was able to mobilize the government budget to hire an external consultant. The consultant has been working to draft necessary legal updates and to elaborate new projects in cooperation and coordination with other ministries and some technical specialists.

The Ministry of Transport and Equipment has been preparing to launch the urban mass-transport projects which are based upon the proposal of SDAU. It is one of the expected results of the Study. Other ministries are also requested by MHAUT to follow the guidelines of SDAU.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ③.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Objectives at the Time of Project Completion>

At the time of ex-ante evaluation the following outputs were planned: 1) To formulate an urban development master plan (an SDAU for the entire administrative area of Nouakchott City and a PLU, a law binding plan to restrict regulations with more detailed drawing, for the administrative area of one Commune to be selected in the course of the Project); and 2) To clarify the roles of related organizations in the formulation and implementation of urban planning and to improve the coordination mechanism among related organizations

Output 1 above was achieved as planned at the project completion, as SDAU and PLU for one municipality were drafted. Output 2 was partially achieved. The roles and responsibilities of relevant organizations were clarified, and a capacity development plan was proposed. Besides, establishment of a coordination mechanism among the relevant stakeholders to ensure implementation of an urban plan and its effective management was discussed. Through interviews with Department of Development, Planning and Urban Regulation (DDPRU), it seems that the coordination and discussion within the governments and communes were so complicated that the MHUAT and stakeholders took time to have a clear vision of the roles of each actor. Nonetheless, after the completion of the project, a foreign consultant was hired by the government budget. Based upon the technical support by the consultant, a new coordination mechanism, based upon the recommendations of the study, has been proposed by MHAUT. It has two main bodies; 'Follow-up Community' with 24-25 related ministries and agencies, and 'Technical group' with specialists under the leadership of MHAUT and the Urban Development Agency (Agence Développement d'Urbanism: ADU). This arrangement is currently under the process of validation by the Prime Minister.

< Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation> Partially utilized

The proposed plan has been partially utilized by the time of ex-post evaluation.

On 12th February 2020, Decree No. 2020-11 approved and declared the SDAU was public utility, though PLU was not a part of approval and PLU borders are still unclear. This is the fundamental result of the project. Any project related to the Nouakchott development should be based on SDAU. On 14th July 2020, Decree No. 020-77 articulates the definitions of the typology in human settlement and social infrastructure. This will help further development of any project based on SDAU. On 26th September 2022, at SDAU seminar organized by MHAUT, ADU was declared to be the primary office to develop projects with guidance of SDAU.

As for the status of urban development projects, development and building regulations planned or implemented in accordance with the urban

¹ ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low *To be the same afterwards.

development master plan proposal, a draft of a new code for urban development has been developed. The new code is to declare all the constructions including public service posts such as police station and greenbelt have to follow the guidance of SDAU.

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The expected goals through the proposed plan “Development and land use of Nouakchott city and target commune will be managed and controlled properly.” have been on its way to be achieved by the adoption of the new code mentioned above. It takes time to formalize any new plan or law and it is particularly so when the multiple ministries are involved. It has made progress though slowly.

<Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-post Evaluation>

No negative impacts on the natural environment have been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In spite of several ongoing movements which refer to SDAU which may have impacts in the future, any specific impact had not been actualized at the time of this evaluation. In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ②.

Status of Achievement of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan and Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan			
Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan	Indicator 1 Authorization/approval of proposed urban development master plan (SDAU proposal and PLU) by the Cabinet, etc.	Status Utilization: Partially utilized (Ex-post evaluation) On 12th February 2020, Decree No. 2020-11 approved and declared the SDAU was public utility, though PLU was not a part of approval and PLU borders are still unclear.	DDPRU
	Indicator 2 Status of urban development projects, development and building regulations (number, area, reflection in the review process, etc.) planned or implemented in accordance with the draft urban development M/P (SDAU draft and district plans for some areas in the commune for PLU formulation) (including the status of capacity building)	Status Utilization: Partially utilized (Ex-post evaluation) A draft of a new code for urban development has been developed. The new code is to declare all the constructions including public service posts such as police station and greenbelt have to follow the guidance of SDAU.	DDPRU

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and the project period slightly exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 101% and 122%, respectively). Outputs were produced as planned. Because of combined factor, the project cost and the project period exceeded the plan.

In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ③.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

SDAU and PLU have been included in the missions of the new department in the new organizational chart of the MHUAT, called: DDPRU. All the cities of Mauritania need strategic documents such as the SDAU, PLU etc. in order to provide the public power or decentralized communities with well-regulated planning tools to participate in the development of the Mauritanian state policy in the field of urbanism and access to land ownership.

< Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

DDPRU is supposed to monitor the SDAU. Implementation should be realized by the MHUAT in general. From September 2022, Agency for urban development (Agence pour le Développement Urbain: ADU) has been appointed as the primary agency to follow up any project based on SDAU.

As for the number of staff, DU of MHUAT had, at the time of the project implementation, about 20 young technical specialists. DU is supposed to have 3 subsidiary units but in reality, Assistant Director and the young staff have been handling their diverse tasks with flexibility. Observatory of Urban Services and Heritage of Nouakchott (OSPUN) of CUN has been under-staffed as well, but the staff are highly motivated.

As mentioned above, the coordination among the government ministries and agencies is under way and some legal/regulatory issues are expected to be solved. Once the government coordination mechanism is ready, they will start calling for some investment by the stakeholders.

<Technical Aspect>

The technical transfer has been somewhat limited. However, some of the staff had participated to JICA's Knowledge Co-Creation Program since 2000 until at the time of ex-post evaluation, and they sustained the skills and knowledge. Some staff who had worked for the project have been promoted.

<Financial Aspect>

Since the announcement of Decree 2020-07, some budget to promote the SDAU adoption in other projects of other ministries and departments has been allocated. It is expected that the MOUDON Project supported by the World Bank is going to integrate the work of further PLU.

<Environmental and Social Aspect>

All these aspects will be taken into account during the implementation of the project.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical and financial aspects of the implementing agency. However, once the related regulatory/legal issues are solved, it will be much easier for other development partners to join the support. The sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is ②.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project formulated the urban development master plan (SDAU and PLU). After the project completion, the proposed plan was approved, and the plan has been partially utilized. As for the Sustainability, though problems in terms of financial aspect have been observed, the

Ministry was able to secure its own budget to take steps of implementation, as suggested in SDAU. Integration of other donor finance such as the mobility plan by the EU and MOUDON by the World Bank are currently underway. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

JICA faced a delay and difficulties in collecting data for the ex-post evaluation because of the transfer of the responsible agency that was in charge of the project. We recommend that the ADU is going to be fully responsible to take over the further work of SDAU implementation in the projects of other ministries.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

1. The plan developed under SDAU has still not been effectively implemented. The absence of PLU in other parts of Nouakchott has also hindered the implementation of SDAU. At the time of project formulation, it is important to ensure that the project is sustainable. JICA needs to ensure that the project is a priority for the counterpart and that the counterpart is capable of ensuring sustainability at the end of the project. In order to do so, JICA needs to involve the counterpart even before projects are formulated.
2. Interviews with MHUAT revealed that one of the main problems for the continuity of the project activities is the lack of technical transfer from the Japanese to the Mauritanian side. Thus, to ensure continuity of the project, it is necessary to ensure that the transfer of knowledge is done in a more effective way. Specifically, the counterpart organization's capacity has to be clearly assessed and their expectation towards the technical transfer to be understood well in the ex-ante.
3. The basic data processing was done from Japan and therefore, the counterparts were not fully involved. It is also necessary to have a clear plan to involve the counterpart staff in the basic surveys and the processing of the data.