

Country Name	<b>Project for Capacity Building for Community Development in Conflict-Affected Areas in Mindanao</b>
Republic of the Philippines	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	Due to the long-lasting conflicts in Mindanao, particularly in the south-western and central areas of the island, the areas had the relatively high poverty rate even in the Philippines and struggled with many problems such as significant shortage of basic social services, including schools and health facilities, and deterioration of infrastructures. To resolve the conflicts, the Aquino administration started the peace negotiation with Moro Islamic Liberation Front (MILF) in 2011. In the case where the peace agreement was established, various community development projects were expected to be formulated and implemented for post-conflict reconstruction and development. However, the Bangsamoro Development Agency (BDA), an agency which would be involved in the activities, did not have skills and experiences necessary to undertake such activities. Therefore, it was necessary to build up administrative capacities of the BDA.										
Objectives of the Project	The project aims to develop an effective and efficient implementation mechanism for community development projects (the CD-CAAM model) and build capacities of the BDA in conflict-affected areas in Mindanao. Expected Goals through the proposed plan <sup>1</sup> : in the project target areas, through utilization of the guidelines prepared by the project, operation and maintenance of facilities are continuously conducted, and effective and efficient projects along with situations in conflict-affected areas are implemented among community development programs carried out by the BDA, Office of the Presidential Adviser on the Peace Process (OPAPP) and others.										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project Site: Conflict-affected areas in Mindanao (the municipalities of Panglima Sugala, Sultan Mastura and Matungao)</li> <li>Main activities: 1) Selection and examination of target municipalities, 2) Formulation, implementation, and evaluation of pilot projects, 3) Extraction of recommendations and lessons learned from the pilot projects, 4) Preparation of community development guidelines and basic technical manuals, 5) Trainings on community development for stakeholders such as communities and the BDA, etc.</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Philippine Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Mission members: 14 persons</td> <td>1) Staff Allocated: 12 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Equipment: PCs, printer, road roller, compactor, motorcycle, etc.</td> <td>2) Land and facility: a project office in the OPAPP and the BDA</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Local costs: cost for project activities</td> <td>3) Local costs: utility cost, travel expenses, etc.</td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Philippine Side	1) Mission members: 14 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 12 persons	2) Equipment: PCs, printer, road roller, compactor, motorcycle, etc.	2) Land and facility: a project office in the OPAPP and the BDA	3) Local costs: cost for project activities	3) Local costs: utility cost, travel expenses, etc.
Japanese Side	Philippine Side										
1) Mission members: 14 persons	1) Staff Allocated: 12 persons										
2) Equipment: PCs, printer, road roller, compactor, motorcycle, etc.	2) Land and facility: a project office in the OPAPP and the BDA										
3) Local costs: cost for project activities	3) Local costs: utility cost, travel expenses, etc.										
Project Period	(ex-ante) April 2012 – March 2015 (actual) April 2012 – July 2016	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 480 million yen (actual) 856 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Office of Presidential Advisor on the Peace Process (OPAPP) Bangsamoro Development Agency (BDA)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	IC Net Limited Central Consultant Inc.										

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

&lt;Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation&gt;

- The project aimed to principally prepare guidelines for community development, implement pilot projects in target communities and disseminate the pilot projects to non-target communities at an output level. Therefore, as for “Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan”, it is necessary to verify the status of use of the guidelines by checking 1) if the activities of the pilot projects implemented and disseminated during the project have still remained, 2) if the pilot projects have been further promoted to other communities and 3) if other community development projects using the guidelines were implemented. On the other hand, the indicators, especially indicator 1 and 2, set in “Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan” are overlapped with the 1) and 2) raised above. Thus, this ex-post evaluation checked the indicator 1 and 2 as “Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan” rather than “Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan” and make an evaluation judgement for “Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan” only based on the indicator 3 set.
- BDA has now become a MILF organization, while it was envisaged to be a part of Bangsamoro Transition Authority and a temporary organization established under the Tripoli Agreement between the Government of Philippines and MILF to take charge of humanitarian and reconstruction development in conflict areas at the time of starting the Project.

**1 Relevance**

&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of Philippine at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation &gt;

The project was consistent with Philippine’s development policy of the “Philippine Development Plan” (2011-2016) raising initiatives to make political agreements through peace negotiations and improve causes of disputes to smoothly proceed with peace processes as initiatives for conflict resolution.

&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of Philippine at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation &gt;

The project was consistent with Philippine’s development needs for building up administrative capacities of the BDA for formulation and implementation of effective and efficient community development projects for post-conflict reconstruction and development.

<sup>1</sup> The degree of achievement of expected goals is not to be assessed in principle at the time of ex-post evaluation, since it is defined as the medium-to-long-term goals which will be attained as a result of crystallizing the proposed plan (“output” of the project).

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with “The Country Assistance Program for the Republic of the Philippines” (2008) positioning “peace and stability in Mindanao” as one of the three priority areas, in particular focusing on support for policy planning and implementation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the Project is high.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement for the Output at the time of Project Completion>

The objectives of the project were achieved by the time of project completion. Through the project, the pilot projects in the sectors of agriculture, fishery and road were implemented in the target municipalities during the pilot phase and the extension phase<sup>2</sup>. Based on the experiences and results obtained from the pilot projects, community development guidelines and technical basic manuals were formulated (Output 1). Through the pilot projects, the implementation capacity of the BDA with regard to the CD-CAAM model as well as smooth coordination with local government units (LGUs) and relevant agencies were strengthened. At the same time, the capacity of LGUs and relevant communities were also heightened (Output 2). At first, the pilot projects were jointly implemented by Japanese experts and the BDA, and then, when expanding it to Tawi-Tawi province, the BDA took its initiative. Moreover, most of the pilot projects contributed to income generation of residents in the target communities. To illustrate, fish culture in Matungao municipality made a profit of 24,916 Philippine peso (Php) (Output 3). Furthermore, some technologies of the pilot projects were disseminated to other barangays within Sultan Mastura and Matungao municipalities using farmer-to-farmer (FTF) approach during the extension phase (for instance, vegetable production and marketing for Barangay Buliok in Sultan Mastura municipality and fish culture for Barangay Purok in Matungao municipality) (Output 4).

<Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The proposed plan has been partially utilized at the time of ex-post evaluation. Out of 24 barangays where the pilot projects were introduced, 18 barangays have continued the activities even after the project completion. The reason for the continuous implementation of the activities is because they deliver additional income to meet people’s needs. On the other hand, some of the activities were ceased due to drought, failure of production of fingerlings for fish culture, and others. Also, the BDA has not conducted any monitoring or follow-up activities due to lack of manpower and financial resources as well as absence of a strategy for sustaining social preparation activities prior to project phaseout. (Indicator 1). The BDA implemented other community development projects by using the knowledge and skills gained through the project as well as the community development guidelines and the technical basic manuals produced by the project. For instance, under the Phase 2 of the World Bank-funded Mindanao Trust Fund (MTF), the BDA rehabilitated and developed six MILF camps in Bangsamoro Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao (BARMM) by using community-driven development approaches piloted during the project. For the livelihood component, the manuals on goat raising were leveraged. Furthermore, some of former counterparts of the BDA, who serve as community volunteers at the time of ex-post evaluation, have implemented a community development program, named LEAD program, targeting 14 municipalities in Central Mindanao. According to them, the manuals are easy to use due to their simplicity and they have tapped two former FTF farmers as resource persons to transfer the knowledge and skills on farming technologies to fellow farmers as they are effective in doing so (Indicator 2).

<Status of Achievement for Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

The Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan have been partially achieved at the time of ex-post evaluation. Although community development projects have been fanned out even after the project, most of them are of a small-scale or a backyard-scale; therefore, they have not contributed to income generation. However, households undertaking the activities have been able to generate savings in food expenses. As a notable exception, there is a farmer in Matungao municipality who operates tilapia culture and generates income by supplying fingerlings to other fish farmers in nearby municipalities (Indicator 3).

<Other Impacts at the time of Ex-post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts were confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. Women who were involved in the pilot project activities have contributed to playing significant roles in livelihood activities such as maintaining backyard vegetable gardens and marketing of surplus products. Furthermore, during the project, unity among Muslims and Christians in the target barangays was fostered, but after the project, the unity was further fostered through the pilot projects. What is more, the project increased confidence among counterparts of the BDA during the project so that they have been actively applying their learnings in the project to their volunteer work for LEAD program or the MTF.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is fair.

Achievement Status of Outputs, Status of Achievement of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan and Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source						
(Achievement Status of Outputs)	Output 1. Lessons on community development are obtained through the implementation of the pilot projects and these lessons are compiled into a guideline.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In the pilot phase, pilot projects shown in the table below were implemented, and based on the experiences and results obtained through the activities, community development guidelines and technical basic manuals were formulated.</li> </ul> [Sector of pilot projects and Name of target barangays]	Final Report						
		<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sector / municipality</th> <th>Sultan</th> <th>Matungao</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sector / municipality	Sultan	Matungao				
Sector / municipality	Sultan	Matungao							

<sup>2</sup> The project was composed of two phases, the pilot phase and the extension phase. The pilot phase was originally planned for establishing the CD-CAAM model through implementation of pilot projects, preparation of community development guidelines and technical basic manuals based on the results of the pilot projects, and enhancement of the administrative capacities of the BDA. While, the extension phase was added in the late of the pilot phase to fan out the model to other areas and further heighten the administrative capacities of the BDA for the operation and dissemination of the model.

			Masura		
		Agriculture	Macabiso	Puntod	
		Fishery (pond culture)	Tambu	Cadayonan	
		Fishery (cage culture)	Solon	Pasayanon	
		Road rehabilitation	Tariken	Cadayonan/Bubong radapam	
		Road maintenance	Namuken	Bangco/Batal	
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In the extension phase, pilot projects shown in the table below were implemented, following the community development guidelines and technical basic manuals prepared in the pilot phase.</li> </ul>			
		[Sector of pilot projects and Name of target barangays]			
		Sector / municipality	Sultan Masura	Matungao	
				Panglima Sugala	
		Vegetable Production and Marketing	Boliok	Matampay	
		Tilapia Culture, Processing, and Marketing	Tapayan Balut	Purok Santa Cruz Koriod Santa Cruz	
		Seaweed Production	-	-	
		Goat Production	Kirkir	Somiorang	
				Sumangday	
	Output 2. Implementation capacity of the BDA with regard to community development projects as well as smooth coordination with LGUs and relevant government agencies are strengthened. At the same time, capacity of LGUs and relevant communities are also strengthened.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Through the implementation of the pilot projects in the pilot phase and the extension phase, the implementation capacity of the BDA with regard to the CD-CAAM model as well as smooth coordination with LGUs and relevant agencies were strengthened. At the same time, the capacity of LGUs and relevant communities were also heightened.</li> </ul>			Final Report
	Output 3. Project activities based on the mechanism of the community development are implemented by the BDA with its initiative and contribute to income generation of the people in target communities.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The pilot projects were jointly implemented in most of the target areas by Japanese experts and the BDA, and then were initiated by the BDA in Tawi-Tawi province.</li> <li>Most of the pilot projects contributed to income generation of dwellers in the target communities as the following tables show.</li> </ul>			Final Report
		[Total profit from the pilot projects]			
		Target area	Type of pilot projects	Profit	
		Barangay Macabiso, Sultant Mastura municipality	Vegetable	-10,560	
		Sultan Mastura municipality	Fish culture	12,142	
			Livestock	3,200	
		Barangay Puntod, Matungao municipality	Vegetable	23,054	
		Matungao municipality	Fish culture	24,916	
		Barangay Buan, Tawi-Tawi province	Seaweed	6,094	
	Output 4. Activities for income generation based on the mechanism of the community development are expanded in mainland as well as island provinces with utilization of Farmer to Farmers approach.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved (Project Completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In the extension phase, some technologies were fanned out to other barangays within Sultan Mastura and Matungao municipalities using FTF approach as shown in the table below.</li> </ul>			Final Report
		[Barangays that introduced technologies introduced by the project]			
		Technology / Municipality	Sultan Mastura	Matungao	
		Vegetable production and marketing	Boliok	Matampay	
		Fishery	Tapayan Balut	Purok Santa Cruz Koriod Santa Cruz	
(Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan)	1. The status of operation and maintenance of the pilot	(Ex-post Evaluation) Partially Achieved <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In 18 out of 24 barangays in the target municipalities (8 barangays in</li> </ul>			Interviews with former BDA

	projects by regional government units and community organizations.	Sultan Masura municipality, 8 barangays in Matungao municipality and 2 barangays in Panglima Sugala municipality), income generation activities introduced as pilot projects have remained.	counterparts; questionnaire survey results
	2. The cases that other community development projects are implemented in conflict-affected areas using the lessons learned and recommendations drawn from the project.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved • The BDA implemented other community development projects, such as the MTF, by using the knowledge and skills gained through the project as well as the community development guidelines and the technical basic manuals produced by the project.	Interviews with former BDA counterparts; questionnaire survey results
	3. The cases that the pilot projects implemented under the project have been further promoted to other communities.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Achieved • Some of former counterparts of the BDA have implemented LEAD program in 14 municipalities in Central Mindanao, using former FTF farmers as resource persons.	Interviews with former BDA counterparts; questionnaire survey results
(Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan) In the project target areas, through utilization of the guidelines prepared by the project, operation and maintenance of facilities are continuously conducted, and effective and efficient projects along with situations in conflict-affected areas are implemented among community development programs carried out by the BDA, Office of the Presidential Adviser on the Peace Process (OPAPP) and others.	1. The status of operation and maintenance of the pilot projects by regional government units and community organizations.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not Applicable • Refer to indicator 1 of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan	-
	2. The cases that other community development projects are implemented in conflict-affected areas using the lessons learned and recommendations drawn from the project.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not Applicable • Refer to indicator 2 of Utilization Status of the Proposed Plan	-
	3. Other community development projects contribute to income generation of people in the communities.	(Ex-post Evaluation) Not achieved • Most of the community development projects are of a small-scale or a backyard-scale; therefore, they have not contributed to income generation. However, households undertaking the activities have been able to generate savings in food expenses. As a notable exception, there is a farmer in Matungao municipality who operates tilapia culture and generates income by supplying fingerlings to other fish farmers in nearby municipalities.	Interviews with former BDA counterparts; questionnaire survey results

Source : Final Report, questionnaire and interview to the BDA and former counterparts of the BDA; Municipal Agricultural Officers

### 3 Efficiency

The project period exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 144%), the project cost significantly exceeded the plan (ratio against the plan: 178%). This is because the project added further activities for the extension phase such as support to the BDA for disseminating the CD-CAAM model. The project period extended along with the decision of the extension phase. The original activities were conducted and completed by the original project period. The original outputs were 1 and 2, and the output 3 and 4 were added later, but all of them were produced. Additional project cost and period were necessary to produce the additional outputs. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

The “Philippine Development Plan” (2011-2016) seeks to develop and protect communities in conflict-affected areas as a strategy to achieve just and lasting peace by implementing peace-promoting and catch-up socio-economic development in the areas, and the “Bangsamoro Development Plan” (2020-2022) aims to uphold peace, security, public order and safety and respect for human rights as one of the eight development goals by fast-tracking the rehabilitation of conflict-affected areas. As the project aimed to build up administrative capacities of the BDA for effective and efficient community development projects for post-conflict reconstruction and development, it has been endorsed by these national policies.

#### <Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

There have not been any changes in the organizational structure/setting to disseminate/promote the CD-CAAM model introduced by the project. According to the BDA, they have had around 40 staff responsible for implementing community development projects such as the MTF in conflicted-affected areas. However, it was also reported that they have not monitored or followed up the pilot projects implemented by the project anymore due to lack of manpower and financial resources.

#### <Technical Aspect>

After the end of the project, all former counterparts of the BDA left, but the current executive director. However, most of the current staff of the agency have used the knowledge and skills transferred by the project to implement community development projects such as the MTF. In the background, the knowledge and skills the former BDA staff acquired were transferred to the current staff through the former BDA staff’s participation in various phases of CD-CAAM project implementation.

The community development guidelines and technical basic manuals prepared by the project have been continuously used by the BDA and LGUs even at the time of ex-post evaluation because they are easy to understand and can be applied to various community projects. However, it was also confirmed that there is a governmental officer at the LGU level who was unaware of the existence of the guidelines and manuals due to personnel turnover.

#### <Financial Aspect>

According to the BDA, they have had a sufficient amount of budget for the MTF, but not for the monitoring or follow-up activities of the pilot projects implemented by the project. Due to inadequate budget and personnel, the BDA was unable to assign personnel to monitor the pilot projects after project completion. This is because the operation and management of the pilot projects should be under LGUs' jurisdiction.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational, technical, and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the effectiveness through the project is fair.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project formulated, implemented and evaluated pilot projects in the target areas, prepared community development guidelines and basic technical manuals based on the results of the pilot projects, and heightened the administrative capacity of the BDA to formulate and implement community development projects in conflict-affected areas. As a result, the Expected Goals through the Proposed Plan was partially achieved, aiming to continuously conduct the operation and maintenance of facilities and implement effective and efficient projects along with situations in conflict-affected areas among community development programs carried out by the BDA, the OPAPP and others. As for sustainability, although BDA have had insufficient manpower and financial resources to monitor the pilot projects after the project, the knowledge and skills is maintained in BDA staff and the community development guidelines and technical basic manuals prepared by the project have been continuously used. As for efficiency, although the project cost significantly exceeded the plan and the project period exceeded the plan, additional cost and period were necessary to produce the additional outputs.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be partially satisfactory.

**III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned**

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- BDA should consider setting up a mechanism for sustaining the social preparation activities in pilot areas considering the socio-economic context of the communities in CAAM. In other words, BDA should prepare the beneficiaries or the community in accepting the project for ensuring full participation and cooperation prior to project implementation.
- To enhance technical sustainability, BDA should formulate a plan or strategy to promote the CD approach for continuous use of the guidelines and manuals.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- Sustained social preparation is key to overall sustainability of community development projects. Therefore, it is important that JICA and the implementing agency agree at the time of project formulation that a strategy for sustaining social preparation activities in pilot communities shall be formulated by the implementing agency before the project ends or prior to project phase-out. In the strategy, responsibilities of the implementing agency such as project monitoring and provision of follow-up training for project beneficiaries should be stipulated for sustaining social preparation activities.



A Farmer Trainer and a former beneficiary of CD-CAAM project under Fishery at Brgy. Boliok, Sultan Mastura, Maguindanao) demonstrating bed preparation for vegetable seeds.



A Farmer Trainer and a former beneficiary of CD-CAAM project under Livestock at Brgy. Kirkir, Sultan Mastura, Maguindanao) demonstrating an actual Goat Vaccination with beneficiaries.