

Country Name	Project on long-term care service development for the frail elderly and other vulnerable people
Kingdom of Thailand	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>Thailand has the most aged population among developing countries in the Southeast Asian region. Although there was no data available on the number of elderly people requiring nursing care in the country, approximately 20% of the residents of residential facilities for the elderly under the Ministry of Social Development and Human Security (MSDHS) were bedridden or had dementia. The fact indicated that there were a considerable number of elderly people requiring nursing care nationwide.</p> <p>In response to that situation, relevant Thai ministries and government agencies had begun to take various measures. In that context, the technical cooperation project "Project on Development of a Community Based Integrated Health Care and Social Welfare Services Model for Older Persons " (2007-2011) was implemented with the cooperation of Japan. The project aimed to improve the quality of life of the elderly by integrating the various services, that had been provided inefficiently by each organization individually, through cooperation among related organizations in the community. The project had produced some results, such as the rolling out of the model developed by the project to other areas.</p> <p>However, the care provided by family members and volunteers was not systematic and not based on a unified assessment, and the level of care was not sufficient. There was a gap between the needs of the elderly requiring care and the ones actually provided, and this had been a major issue from the perspective of fairness of services.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through (1) developing policy recommendation on the long-term care for the elderly, (2) developing and implementing "Model Services" at pilot sites, and (3) developing training programs for care workers and coordinators, the project aimed at that the policy recommendations are accepted by the relevant ministries and organizations, thereby contributing to the Thai government policy planning on the long-term care for the elderly.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Policy recommendations on the long-term care for the elderly are reflected in the Thai government policies. Project Purpose: Policy recommendations on the long-term care for the elderly are accepted by the relevant ministries and organizations. 										
Activities of the project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Chiang Rai, Khon Kaen, Nakhon Ratchasima, Nonthaburi, Bangkok, Surat Thani Main activities: (1) Developing policy recommendation on the long-term care for the elderly, (2) developing and implementing "Model Services" at pilot sites, and (3) developing training programs for care workers and coordinators Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Japanese Side</td> <td>Thai Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 28 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 30 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 116 persons</td> <td>2) Land and facilities: project office, conference rooms, furniture, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: PCs, a photocopy machine, digital cameras, video cameras, etc.</td> <td>3) Local cost: costs for training, conferences, monitoring, and part of cost associated with the Japanese experts</td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side	Thai Side	1) Experts: 28 persons	1) Staff allocated: 30 persons	2) Trainees received: 116 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office, conference rooms, furniture, etc.	3) Equipment: PCs, a photocopy machine, digital cameras, video cameras, etc.	3) Local cost: costs for training, conferences, monitoring, and part of cost associated with the Japanese experts
Japanese Side	Thai Side										
1) Experts: 28 persons	1) Staff allocated: 30 persons										
2) Trainees received: 116 persons	2) Land and facilities: project office, conference rooms, furniture, etc.										
3) Equipment: PCs, a photocopy machine, digital cameras, video cameras, etc.	3) Local cost: costs for training, conferences, monitoring, and part of cost associated with the Japanese experts										
Project Period	(ex-ante) January 2013 – August 2017 (actual) January 2013 – August 2017	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 408 million yen, (actual) 244 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Public Health (MOPH) and Ministry of Social Development and Human Security (MSDHS)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare										

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Constraints on Evaluation>

- Under the situation of COVID-19 pandemic, the evaluation team could not manage face to face interview, since implementing agencies were busy with countermeasures for COVID-19 and vaccination. The information was collected through questionnaires/e-mails.

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

- Continuation status of the indicator of the Project Purpose at the time of ex-post evaluation was verified under the Overall Goal, as the Overall Goal is the consequence of the Project Purpose.

1 Relevance

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Thailand at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development policy of Thailand at the time of ex-ante evaluation. One of the strategies under the Second National Plan on the Elderly (2002-2021) was "to enhance social protection" which includes program for the families and care givers.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Thailand at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Thailand for the Long-term Care (LTC). Thailand has the vast population of the elderly, however, there was still a gap between the needs of the elderly requiring care and the care actually provided.

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was also consistent with Japan's ODA policy to Thailand. "Sustainable economic development and response to a maturing

society” was one of the priority areas for the ODA to Thailand which includes the aging problem¹.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③².

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the Time of Project Completion>

The Project Purpose was achieved at the time of project completion. Although there was no clear official document, Indicator 1 “By the end of the Project, policy recommendations are found useful (in terms of effectiveness and fiscal sustainability) as a basis of the national policy planning by the relevant ministries” was achieved, as the “Policy Recommendation on the Development of Long-term Care System for the Frail Elderly in Thailand” was communicated officially from MOPH to the Ministry of Interior, National Health Security Office (NHSO) and MSDHS. The Policy Recommendation for service delivery for LTC based on the model services implemented under the project are follows: “A care management system should be set up consisting of a Care Plan developed by a Care Manager (CM) to address the care needs of frail older people (dependent/bed-bound), and older people who have a limited ability to perform their daily activities (partially dependent/homebound) and their family by considering suitability, efficiency and standards. A Care Plan should be developed for the individual under an agreement between a service provider and a service receiver.” The Policy Recommendation was moved forward to implement a pilot project on a national scale that includes elements of Care Planning, Care Managers and Care Workers with the LTC Fund, which was launched by NHSO in 2015. In 2016, the budget of 600 million baht, 100 million of which was distributed to district hospitals and 500 million baht to district funds.

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

The project effects have continued since the project completion. The practices have continued at the pilot sites. Especially, some good practices have been observed in Khon Kaen and Nonthaburi. At Khon Kaen, the concerning counterpart of this site learned how to develop Care Plans and how useful daycare centers are for the elderly. Daycare center and home visit rehabilitation was realized as “family team care” at home. At Nonthaburi site, all concerning members, such as CM, Care Workers and Care Givers (CG) and other experts, have developed Care Plans collaboratively and have tried to give sufficient cares for the elderly as a team thanks to the project. The most notable thing is this Care Plan consists of the whole rehabilitation process for one elderly people to get better. Both models were introduced nationwide through television broadcasts and newspapers. They became a learning site on elderly services in a daycare center and in the community for educational institutions, Thailand Nursing and Midwifery Council, WHO, and the governmental agencies within and outside Thailand.

The counterparts of the project obtained enough knowledge for LTC thanks to the project through general activities and especially training in Japan. They have played important roles in both central and community level, as they have disseminated the practices including daycare center operations and Care Plan to other areas.

During the project implementation, the CM training curriculum was developed by the Department of Health (DOH), MOPH with support from the project. The training has continued, as it was certified and registered by the DOH. Each province has used the curriculum to educate more trainees. A training manual was adapted from what the project counterparts inherited from Japan. Also, the curriculum was authorized by the Thailand Nursing and Midwifery Council as equivalent to 50 credits, which are the numbers of credits needed by Thai nurses for upskill training every five years.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

The Overall Goal has been achieved. The policy recommendations by the project were reflected in the Thai government’s policies, especially the “LTC Fund”, the national LTC program launched by NHSO in November 2015 as mentioned above. The service model developed by the project, which is comprised of a home care service and daycare service was adopted as standard practice of LTC in Thailand. The practice of having a Care Managers who systematically plans, coordinates, monitors, and evaluates services for older people using a Care Plan and ensuring that Care Givers are appropriately trained was adopted as the main standard of operation (3C Components). Importance of having a daycare center was integrated in joint operation between the Tambon Health Promotional Hospital and Local Administration Organization and community participation was incorporated as well.

The Care Plan usage, originally introduced under the project has been expanded nationwide and has had a significant impact in improving the quality of life of dependent older people in terms of improvement of Activities of Daily Living (ADL). One factor promoting this achievement was the expansion of Care Plan usage that resulted from the efforts of the Government of Thailand in setting the indicator “percentage of dependent older people served under the Care Plan” and the development of the 3C online program by the DOH. In 2018, DOH and counterparts from the pilot sites under the project cooperated with Maejo University, Thailand in developing the 3C (Care Manger, Care Giver, Care Plan) online program, which allowed registration of CMs and CGs in the database system and facilitated the development of the Care Plan.

<Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

No negative impacts on natural environment have been observed.

<Evaluation Result>

Therefore, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
(Project Purpose) Policy recommendations on the long-term care for the elderly are accepted by the relevant ministries and organizations.	Indicator 1: By the end of the Project, policy recommendations are found useful (in terms of effectiveness and fiscal sustainability) as a basis of the national policy planning by the relevant ministries.	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): achieved (continued) (Project Completion) According to the information provided during the interviews under this Terminal Evaluation, -Joint Coordination Committee approved “Policy	source : JICA documents

¹ Source: MOFA, ODA Data book 2013

² ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low

		<p>Recommendation on the Development of Long-term Care System for the Frail Elderly in Thailand” was communicated officially from MOPH to the Ministry of Interior, NHSO and MSDHS. However, the whereabouts of the original of this official communication document and the actual timing of the communication were not confirmed. Nevertheless, in the planning and implementation of various measures, the contents of the recommendations were taken into consideration. In this sense, despite the lack of official evidence as above, it can be considered that the project purpose is to be achieved, at least in terms of effectiveness. With regard to the fiscal sustainability, while a cost analysis was carried out, discussions on the tangible topics or detailed analysis did not seem to have been conducted.</p> <p>(Ex-Post Evaluation) See the Overall Goal below.</p>	
(Overall Goal) Policy recommendations on the long-term care for the elderly are reflected in the Thai government policies.	Indicator 1: National Policies such as the National Plan for the Older Persons are revised, reflecting the policy recommendations.	<p>(Ex-Post Evaluation) achieved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The policy recommendations by the project were reflected in the Thai government’s policies, especially the “LTC Fund”. The Fund is the national LTC program launched by NHSO in November 2015. - Some part of the service model developed by the project, which is comprised of a home care service and daycare service was adopted as standard practices of long term care in Thailand. 	source : MOPH, NHSO, and Municipality/TAO
	Indicator 2 National programs on the long-term for the elderly are implemented, reflecting the policy recommendations.	<p>(Ex-Post Evaluation) achieved</p> <p>Refer to the Indicator 1 above.</p>	source : MOPH, NHSO, and Municipality/TAO

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and project period were within the plan (the ratio against the plan: 60%, 100%). The outputs were produced as planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is ③.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

The Government of Thailand has already implemented policies, laws, rules to support long-term care for the elderly. Notification and regulations include (i) Notification of National Committee on the Elderly “specifying the rights of elderlies in Section 11 (13) in the Elderly Act” On 11 Sept 2018, (ii) The 3rd Notification by Prime Minister’s Office on “Agencies responsible for the protection, promotion, and support of elderlies in accordance with the Elderly Act” On 20 Sept 2018, (iii) Notification of Decentralization Committee In decentralizing tasks to LAOs on 21 Nov 2018, etc.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

Institutionally, applying community-based service delivery for older people has had a room for improvement.

MOPH has had a good foundation for health care since it has had health infrastructure, together with formal and informal health care human resources at all levels. MOPH, as the main counterpart agency of the project needs to lead to success in developing community-based service delivery for older people to be applied nationwide.

MSDHS has had functional entities and human resources only at the central and provincial levels and has been mainly in charge of elderly-policy development and providing social assistance to older people. The social assistance provided by the ministry has been principally in the forms of public assistance. An agency with the similar characteristics needs to be involved. However, the problem of no acting bodies at the community level should be a concern since authorities at the community level would need to cooperate with the activities to be conducted.

Under the situation, the possible concerned agencies would be those working closely in a daily manner with people at the community level. LAOs under the Ministry of Interior might become the first candidate which are the closest to local residents, and can best grasp the needs and conditions of residents. Taking into consideration the nation’s political orientation for decentralization, they are expected to play more important roles for community-based activities for the elderly in the near future.

Expansion of Care Plan usage nationwide was made possible with the indicator set by MOPH mentioned above and 3 C online program developed by DOH. MOPH has set up Bureau of Health Promotion, under DOH, a unit responsible for service system development for elderly both in central and regional area. Major mandates on elderly care; Healthcare / Health prevention and promotion to older people / Training Care Manager and Care Givers / Care Management system for LTC.

DOH is the big Department, had the sufficient number of staff to promote or disseminate of the system.

<Technical Aspect>

As mentioned above, there has been an established system for training CMs and CGs. The Government of Thailand has set an indicator on “number of CM trained” and placed an importance on curriculum development, leading to the expansion of CMs and CGs nationwide.

<Financial Aspect>

The LTC Fund has been expanded since it was launched in 2015. The fund integrated the health-related budget (NHSO), the social welfare related budget (MSDHS), the quality of life development budget (local authority) to provide services for the frail elderly (dependent/bed-bound), and the elderly who has limitation to perform their daily activities (partial dependent/ homebound). Local authority will be assigned

to manage the fund under the mechanism of Tambon committee in order to issue or improve rules and regulations to allow local authority to operate the fund suitably. As of April 2021, 85.18% of LAOs with Local Health Security Fund, which is utilized for health care by local community, participate in the LTC program. The budget started with 600 million baht in the first year (2016), and the budget was increased to 1.159 billion baht in 2018. After having care management system (CM, CG, Care Plan) well-rooted in Thailand, the financial support by NHSO through LTC fund to all 77 provinces.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ②

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved the Project Purpose at the time of project completion, as the policy recommendation was communicated officially with relevant ministries and reflected in the national policy. The Overall Goal has been achieved, as the LTC Fund has expanded and the model developed under the project has become the national standard. As for the Sustainability, some problems have been observed in terms of institutional aspect, however, no problems have been observed in terms of policy, technical and financial aspects.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

MOPH and MSDHS should continue sharing the experiences and evidence from the project in Thailand to ASEAN countries on management of care, empowerment of community care and family, cost of care, and to explore ideas to respond to LTC needs in middle and low income countries. If there is a chance, MOPH should promote technical cooperation among developing countries by extending technical and financial assistance to the other country on THIRD COUNTRY TRAINING PROGRAMME (TCTP) in order to provide training which better fits the needs and respective conditions of the participating countries and to contribute toward social development of ASEAN countries.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

Training in Japan has contributed to improving the counterpart's practices as well as extending the knowledge and skills to other areas in Thailand. The counterparts were exposed to Japan's experiences with elderly care through training in Japan, and found it useful for local authorities in raising their awareness and upgrading services for older people. The municipality staff applied the knowledge gained, such as developing a hoist for shoulder exercises after seeing modern assistive devices utilized and rehabilitation programs conducted in Japan. In addition, the counterparts have become resource persons to extend the practices under project to other areas in Thailand, partly due to the experience in training in Japan.

In addition, there are several approach to realize a healthy and well-being aging society by JICA, such as dispatching JICA volunteers, JICA Partnership Programs in grassroots level, and Public-Private Partnerships with private actors. It is efficient to utilize the outcomes and human networks developed by this Technical Cooperation Projects in cooperation with other activities and it is expected to bring the synergy effect among various cooperation by JICA.



Assess the Elderly and Prepare Care Plan at Rehabilitation Center for People with Disabilities and the Elderly at Bangsithong Sub-district Municipality, Nonthaburi



Home visit by Care Giver of Bangsithong Sub-district Municipality, Nonthaburi