

Country Name	Sharing Knowledge on Development and Implementation of Execution Plans Project
Arab Republic of Egypt	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>In June 2012, the Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation (MOPIC) first formulated the “Strategic Framework for Economic and Social Development Plan until 2022” (Strategic Framework), which states the outlook and strategies of the national development after the revolution.</p> <p>MOPIC was planning to formulate and implement a public works investment plan based on the Strategic Framework. The issue was that MOPIC had formulated annual investment plans in a bottom-up style, meaning that they had compiled a list of new works submitted by sector ministries and agencies or regional governments and then assigned the budget per sector or region. They had not created budgeting plans in accordance with a national development policy.</p> <p>Therefore, the Egyptian government requested Japan in October 2012, to work on this technical cooperation project with the objectives of organizing the structure, including a planning committee needed for the planning and its implementation, and developing human resources.</p>				
Objectives of the Project	<p>The Project aimed at developing and implementing national development plans according to national priorities as decided by Ministry of Planning, Monitoring and Administrative Reform (MOPMAR)¹ in cooperation with the Egyptian development partners through establishing the organizational framework and strengthening the capacity of staff to develop and implement execution plan in compliance with the national development plans in Egypt, thereby contributing to improve the process of the national development planning and implementation according to national priorities.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: The process of the national development planning and implementation according to national priorities is improved. Project Purpose: National development plans are developed and implemented according to national priorities as decided by MOPMAR in cooperation with the Egyptian development partners. 				
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: the whole area of Egypt Main activities: 1) Formulation of the Execution Plan, 2) Restructuring of the organizational framework of MOPMAR and support for enhancing the capacity of MOPMAR’s staff Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> Japanese Side 1) Experts: 9 persons 2) Trainees received: 44 persons 3) Equipment: Stationery </td> <td style="width: 50%; vertical-align: top;"> Egyptian Side 1) Staff allocated: 2 persons (Project Director and Project Manager) 2) Facilities: A project office, desks, chairs, LAN </td> </tr> </table>			Japanese Side 1) Experts: 9 persons 2) Trainees received: 44 persons 3) Equipment: Stationery	Egyptian Side 1) Staff allocated: 2 persons (Project Director and Project Manager) 2) Facilities: A project office, desks, chairs, LAN
Japanese Side 1) Experts: 9 persons 2) Trainees received: 44 persons 3) Equipment: Stationery	Egyptian Side 1) Staff allocated: 2 persons (Project Director and Project Manager) 2) Facilities: A project office, desks, chairs, LAN				
Project Period	(ex-ante) June 2013 – May 2016 (36 months) (actual) Oct 2014 – Sep 2017 (36 months)	Project Cost (Japanese side only)	(ex-ante) 480 million yen, (actual) 420 million yen		
Implementing Agency	Ministry of Planning, Monitoring and Administrative Reform (MOPMAR)				
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Naruo Research Institute, Ltd. Vision and Spirit for Overseas Cooperation Co., Ltd.				

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

- The continuous status of project effects: Regarding the verification of the continuous status of the project effects, the continuous status of the Project Purpose was checked and analyzed as a part of the status of the achievement of Overall Goal.

1 Relevance/Coherence

[Relevance]

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Egypt at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development policy of Egypt at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Article 167 of the constitution requires the development of “the general policy of the state” and “the general plan of the state.” The Project contributed to the formulation of the mid-term plan as the general plan of the state by referring to the general policy of the state, the Sustainable Development Strategy: Egypt’s Vision 2030 (“SDS2030”).

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Egypt at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Egypt at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Egypt formulated “five-year plans”, which summarize investment plans for major national five-year projects by ministries and agencies, up to the sixth plan (July 2006–December 2011). After the revolution in 2011, however, it was needed to formulate and implement a more strategic and transparent development plan, which shows and realizes a vision of the new nation and society reflecting the popular will, instead of simply reflecting the demands of ministries and agencies, under the deteriorating economy and increasing civic consciousness.

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

The project design/approach was appropriate. One of the main directions of the SDS 2030 is emphasizing on increasing the efforts towards the social protection of the poor and vulnerable, women with children and disabilities for achieving inclusiveness. The plan also

¹ In June 2014, when the new cabinet was formed, the Ministry of International Corporation was separated from MOPIC, and then MOPIC was integrated into the Ministry of State for Administrative Development. As the result, MOPMAR was the implementing agency during the project implementing period.

emphasizes on achievement of SDGs and treating any development gaps in sectors or governorates. In line with SDS 2030, 5 initiatives have been introduced for implementation to accelerated the implementation of SDGs. One of the initiatives is “Hayat Kareema” in English means “Decent Life” which is targeting the poorest villages and areas in Egypt as well as local development of Upper Egypt which has relatively poorer areas. No problem attributed to the project design/approach was confirmed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③².

[Coherence]

<Consistency with Japan’s ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan’s ODA policy to Egypt at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The Government of Japan declared that “Support for fair political and administrative management” was positioned as one of the priority areas of reform support for middle east and north African countries at Summit of Deauville in May 2011.

“The Country Assistance Policy for the Arab Republic of Egypt”(2008) aimed at “Transition to a competitive and stable economy and society”, as one of the development issues Japan should support , in which “Expansion and improvement of public services” was positioned as one of the priority program.

<Collaboration/Coordination with other JICA’s interventions>

Any collaboration/coordination between the project and other JICA’s intervention was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation. However, there was some interlinkage with JICA’s technical cooperation for “Developing Statistical Quality System at CAMPAS”, since Ministry of Planning and Economic Development (MOPED) depended on the statistics of the Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics (CAPMAS), implementing agency of this project in their development plans, CAPMAS staff also participated as members of the “Benkyo-kai” introduced in the project and accompanied the training in Japan, and the Project also made policy recommendations to CAPMAS. In addition, through “Benkyo-kai” approach, the Project supported formulating mid-term plan of Ministry of Education and Ministry of Higher Education where JICA implemented several technical cooperation projects under the bilateral partnership called “Egypt-Japan Education Partnership (EJEP).”

<Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework>

Any cooperation/coordination with other institutions was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation. However, the project contributed to the review and analysis of a policy paper which was developed in 2014 under cooperation with Rockefeller Brothers Fund leading to recommendations for improvement of planning process.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ③.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the Time of Project Completion>

At the time of project completion, the Project Purpose was partially achieved. The mid-term plan for SDS 2030 was formulated in July 2017 by the MOPMAR through United States Agency for International Development (USAID)’s support on the preparation of the logical framework. The Project mainly supported the development of the mid-term plan in education only, while the MOPMAR promoted the whole formulation process. Therefore, the Project’s contribution to this indicator was limited (Indicator 1). The annual investment plan 2017/18 was developed together with the mid-term plan for 2030 by the MOPMAR. However, it was unclear that the annual investment plan would be produced for the following year and beyond (Indicator 2).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

The continuous status of the Project Purpose was checked and analyzed as a part of the status of the achievement of Overall Goal and, as the result, was evaluated as “continued” since the national development plan and other plans were developed and implemented on a regular and timely basis.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of ex-post evaluation, the Overall Goal has been mostly achieved as planned. The government of Egypt has been using SDS2030 as the comprehensive framework from which all medium- and short-term development plans emanate, including the national development plans such as the Master Plan, EP, and Annual Investment Plans. These plans are regularly and timely developed and implemented within the framework of the medium-term plan to achieve the goals of SDS2030 (Indicator 1). Egypt's approach to implementing national mega projects is based on a comprehensive and participatory planning process that ensures the selection of projects that align with the country's development goals and priorities, while also considering environmental sustainability and social inclusivity (Indicator 2).

<Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of Ex-post evaluation, any other impacts were not observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
(Project Purpose) National development plans are developed and implemented according to	Indicator 1: Execution Plan is formulated through the cooperation with Egyptian development partners.	Status of the Achievement: partially achieved (Project Completion) The mid-term plan for SDS 2030 was formulated in July 2017 by the MOPMAR through USAID’s	Terminal Evaluation Report

² ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low * To be the same afterwards.

national priorities as decided by MOPMAR in cooperation with the Egyptian development partners.		support on the preparation of the logical framework. The Project mainly supported the development of the mid-term plan in education only, while the MOPMAR promoted the whole formulation process. Therefore, the Project's contribution to this indicator was limited.	
	Indicator 2: The annual investment plans are produced by the MOPMAR based on the execution plan and followed up every year.	Status of the Achievement: partially achieved (Project Completion) The annual investment plan 2017/18 was developed together with the mid-term plan for 2030 by the MOPMAR. However, it was unclear that the annual investment plan would be produced for the following year and beyond.	Terminal Evaluation Report
(Overall Goal) The process of the national development planning and implementation according to national priorities is improved.	Indicator 1: The national development plans (SDS2030 (Master Plan), Execution Plan (EP) and Annual Investment Plans) are regularly and timely developed and implemented.	(Ex-Post Evaluation) mostly achieved as planned The government of Egypt has been using SDS2030 as the comprehensive framework from which all medium- and short-term development plans emanate, including the national development plans such as the Master Plan, EP, and Annual Investment Plans. These plans are regularly and timely developed and implemented within the framework of the medium-term plan to achieve the goals of SDS2030.	MOPED
	Indicator 2: National mega projects are implemented according to the national development plans.	(Ex-Post Evaluation) mostly achieved as planned Egypt's approach to implementing national mega projects is based on a comprehensive and participatory planning process that ensures the selection of projects that align with the country's development goals and priorities, while also considering environmental sustainability and social inclusivity, such as "Hayat Karima" (Decent Life) Presidential Initiative, that include and implement several projects in various fields, for example the establishment of new medical units in rural areas, construction of new schools, rehabilitation of roads etc.	MOPED

3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and the project period within the plan (the ratio against the plan: 88% and 100%, respectively.), because of combined factors.

	Project Cost (Japanese side only, yen)	Project Period (months)
Plan (ex-ante)	480 million	36
Actual	420 million	36
Ratio (%)	88%	100%

Outputs were produced as planned.

In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ④.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

New Planning Law was prepared in 2022 and currently its executive regulations are being finalized. The law aims to have participatory approach in planning with engagement of private sector and civil society. It also aims to achieve balanced developments among governorates.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

Due to the restructuring of the Egyptian government, MOPMAR was changed to MOPED in 2019. MOPED has established a Strategic Planning Unit, Risk and Crisis Management Unit, and an Internal Audit Unit to implement the national development plan, and they are functioning. The number of staff of these units are sufficient.

<Technical Aspect>

Most of the staff working in MOPMAR were reallocated to other ministries shortly after the completion of the project, upon the restructure to MOPED. However, the remaining staff tried their best to share and transfer the knowledge to their colleagues, using the materials and manuals prepared by the project. The training mainly depended on person-to-person approach, or a kind of on-job training from senior staff to new staff.

The manuals and the materials developed by the project have played a pivotal role in preserving the knowledge at the ministry, even though the absence of the project's counterparts.

<Financial Aspect>

The source of budget of MOPED is the state's budget and the financial ability to sustain the effects of the project is ensured.

<Environmental and Social Aspect>

There are several preventive measures against risks in the environmental and social aspects for sustaining the project effects in the future. The Egyptian government has launched several green strategies, green projects, and initiatives to promote a green economy and achieve sustainable development. In addition, Egypt has environment law No. 4 for year 1994 and the Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency (EEAA) formulates policies and plans for protection of the environment and follows their implementation. The law mandates environmental screening for projects by competent authorities and some projects (depending on their expected impact on the environment) would be required to prepare full EIA to be approved by EEAA before their implementation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the technical aspect of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ③.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project partially achieved the project purpose which aimed at developing national development plans and implementing according to national priorities and mostly achieved as planned the overall goal which aimed at improving the process of the national development planning and implementation according to national priorities. With reference to sustainability, slight problems have been observed in terms of the technical aspect of the implementing agency. Although most of the staff working in MOPMAR were reallocated to other ministries shortly after the completion of the project, upon the restructure to MOPED, the remaining staff tried their best to share and transfer the knowledge to their colleagues, using the materials and manuals prepared by the project. With reference to efficiency, both the project cost and the project period within the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Non-score Items

Adaption and Contribution:

Although JICA signed the R/D on the project with the MOPIC in April 2013, due to the political change and the succeeding deterioration of government functions in Egypt that took place in July 2013, the implementation of the project was forced to be postponed. As the result, JICA decided to launch the project by dividing it into two stages: Phase 1 (October 2014-September 2015) (formulation of a detailed plan) and Phase 2 (October 2015-September 2017) (implementation of the detailed plan agreed on in Phase 1). Even in case there was uncertainty of the realization of the project, JICA contributed to realization of the project by proposing alternative plan (dividing it into two stages, in this case). Therefore, in case there are uncertainties on the project, the project had better establish a Plan-Do-Check-Action (PDCA) cycle to find an issue in a timely manner and modify a plan.

IV. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

(1) Continuation of the “Benkyo-kai” approach

It was realized through the project that the mechanism of having communication and focus group discussion (Benkyo-kai) among MOPED and relevant staff in-charge of planning in relevant ministries has a positive impact on the efficiency and the effectiveness of the planning process. Accordingly, the continuation of this mechanism is believed to have a positive contribution to the planning process.

(2) Re-launch of the Project’s Website

Since the project’s website was closed upon the completion of the project and the manuals and guidelines developed by the project were not accessible, MOPED is recommended to re-launch the project’s website and upload the manuals, guidelines and other training materials to it, to maximize the benefit to other relevant entities.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

(1) Preparation of Comprehensive Manuals and Training Materials

The preparation of comprehensive manuals and training materials has proven to be a very good practice by the project team, as it has positively supported the preservation of the project’s outputs and continued to benefit MOPED, even after its restructure and reallocation of most of the project’s counterparts to other organizations. JICA should include the development of comprehensive manuals and training materials as an output of the similar projects in the future.

(2) Influence of Political Situations

The project was launched by high-level commitment by the Government of Egypt. The objective of the project was very challenging, since the scope of cooperation was to change the mechanism of national development strategies of Egypt. Although, some of committees and units, and plans were not developed as expected due to change of political situation in Egypt, although similar organizations and plans were established. Since this political change is defined as a “important assumption” of technical cooperation projects, JICA should only concentrate on technical part of the project which is not influenced by political condition in a recipient country which are in most cases out of control, or JICA should consider possible means to be able to have more flexible structure of implementation for similar type of project.



Benkyo-kai session for the Ministry of Higher Education & Scientific Research (November 2016)



The publications of the project that the Ministry of Planning & Economic Development (MOPED) still uses. (May 2023)