

Country Name	<b>The Project for Community-Based Regional Tourism Development in Petra Region</b>
Jordan	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	In Jordan, tourism is one of the major industries to generate foreign currency revenue and was expected to provide employment opportunities for the youth. Petra is one of the Jordan’s proudest the World Heritage sites and the country’s largest tourist destination attracting approximately 610,000 of the 7.3 million annual visitors to the country (2013, National Bureau of Statistics). However, most tourists did not stay long in Petra due to the lack of attractive tourist infrastructure. In addition, the number of tourists to Jordan had decreased significantly due to the political instability in the Middle East. Therefore, it was necessary to provide human resource development for administrative officers to be involved in the development of attractive environment and regional development in order to increase economic impact of the tourism industry in Petra Region. Under these situations, the government of Jordan requested a technical cooperation project from the government of Japan for human resource development for comprehensive regional development in Petra Region.		
Objectives of the Project	Through establishing a coordination system among stakeholders related to Petra regional tourism development, strengthening capacity of Petra Development and Regional Tourism Authority (PDTRA) for tourism promotion planning and implementation, strengthening tourism product development in collaboration with local community and implementation capacity of PDTRA, and building up necessary function of the Petra Museum for its opening, the project aims at strengthening capacity of PDTRA for sustainable community-based regional tourism development, thereby contributing to continuous community-based regional tourism development in Petra region.		
	1. Overall Goal: Community-based regional tourism development is implemented continuously in Petra 2. Project Purpose: Capacity of PDTRA for sustainable community-based regional tourism development is strengthened.		
Activities of the Project	1. Project Site:6 communities of Petra Region (Wadi Musa, Taybeh, Umm Sayhoun, Baidha, Rajif, and Dlagha) 2. Main Activities: 1) establishing a coordination system among stakeholders of Petra regional tourism development, 2) strengthening capacity of PDTRA for tourism promotion planning and implementation, 3) strengthening tourism product development in collaboration with local community and implementation capacity of PDTRA, and 4) building up necessary function of the Petra Museum for its opening, 3. Inputs (to carry out above activities) Japanese Side 1) Experts: 10 persons 2) Trainees received: 19 persons 3) Equipment: Video camera, camera, 3D scanner, PCs, software, printer, hygrometers Jordanian Side 1) Staff allocated: 10 persons 2) Facilities: office space 3) Travel costs and fees for personnels		
Project Period	(ex-ante) 15 November 2015–14 November 2018 [36 months] (actual) 15 November 2015–14 March 2020 [52 months]	Project Cost (Japanese side only)	(ex-ante) 430 million yen, (actual) 396 million yen
Implementing Agency	Petra Development and Tourism Region Authority (PDTRA)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	International Development Center of Japan Inc, Nippon Koei Co., Ltd, and H.I.S. Co., Ltd.		

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

&lt;Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation&gt;

[Verification of Continuation Status of the Project Effects]

- The indicator 2 for the Project Purpose was verified as a factor affecting the level of achievement of the Overall Goal or the Sustainability of the project effects.
- The indicator 3 for the Project Purpose was verified through the baseline and endline surveys during the project. However, since it is difficult to objectively verify the stakeholders' awareness and ownership as a continuation status of project effects by the ex-post evaluation, the indicator 3 was confirmed by means of qualitative questions to stakeholders by this ex-post evaluation survey.

[Verification of Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation]

- Although the Palestinian-Israeli conflict began in October 2023 during the survey period of this ex-post evaluation, the result of the evaluation verifies the achievements based on the information collected prior to the conflict.

**1 Relevance/Coherence**

[Relevance]

&lt;Consistency with the Development Policy of Jordan at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation &gt;

The project was consistent with the development policy of Jordan at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In the "Government Work Plan 2013-2016", the tourism sector was specified as one of the pillars of Jordan's medium- and long-term development. In addition, the "National Tourism Strategy 2011-2015" included the development of tourist areas and environment for tourism promotion.

&lt;Consistency with the Development Needs of Jordan at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation &gt;

The project was consistent with the development needs of Jordan at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Although Petra is one of Jordan's proudest the World Heritage sites and the country's largest tourist destination, most tourists did not stay long in Petra due to the lack of attractive tourist infrastructure. Therefore, it was necessary to provide human resource development for administrative officers to be

involved in the development of attractive environment and regional development in order to increase economic impact of the tourism industry in Petra Region.
<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach> The project design/approach was appropriate. No problem attributed to the project design/approach was confirmed.
<Evaluation Result> In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③ <sup>1</sup> .
[Coherence] <Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation> The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Jordan at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In the "Country Development Cooperation Policy for the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan" (2012), one of priority areas was "support for self-reliant and sustainable economic growth" covering the support for development of industries including tourism industry and employment creation. <Collaboration/Coordination with JICA's other interventions> Although the collaboration/coordination between the project, a grant aid project of the "Project for the Construction of the Petra Museum" (2014-2018) and technical cooperation (individual expert dispatch) of the "Heritage Tourism Development Advisor (Phase 1)" (2013-2015) and phase 2 (2016-2019) were planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation and were implemented, any effects were not confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. In line with the provision of facilities and equipment for the Petra Museum through the grant aid project, the project supported the Petra Museum to develop its management, prepare contents of the Petra Museum such as short movies and digital signage, leaflets, guidebooks and develop capacity of museum staff through trainings in Jordan and Japan. The advisor dispatched by JICA delivered trainings for the museum staff and supported all the process for opening the museum, such as selecting exhibits, advising on display techniques and public relations, etc. <Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework> Although the cooperation/coordination with the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) and the International Council of Museums (ICOM) were planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation and during the project period and were implemented, any positive effects were not confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. JICA was responsible for the opening of the Petra Museum and USAID was responsible for the construction of an adjacent visitor centre. After joining ICOM in 2021, the Petra Museum, in accordance with its Code of Ethics, conducted awareness-raising campaigns to encourage tour guides and visitors to hand over to the Petra Museum antiquities that were purchased or found at the archaeological site. This is also in line with the Petra Museum's strategy to stop the trade in antiquities. <Evaluation Result> In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ②.
[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence] In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.
2 Effectiveness/Impact
<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the Time of Project Completion> At the time of project completion, the Project Purpose was achieved as planned. PDTRA prepared and implemented 25 items of plans and activities for tourism development in Petra Region (Indicator 1). The level of PDTRA's capacity on tourism /regional development was significantly improved from 27.5% (the result of the amended baseline survey <sup>2</sup> in 2016) to 87.5% (the result of the endline survey) (Indicator 2). The level of stakeholders' awareness and ownership about tourism/regional development was also improved from 54.2% (the baseline survey in 2016) to 83.3% (the endline survey in 2018) (Indicator 3). <Continuation Status of Project Effects at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation> By the time of the ex-post evaluation, the project effects have been continued and further developed. In addition, PDTRA signed the agreement with the Jordan Tourism Board (JTB) in 2019 and has been implementing the promotional activities. PDTRA held music concerts in the cultural village with the support of JTB, including contracting technical teams such as audio and visual teams and coordinating with well-known and international singers. PDTRA also participated in the international tourism exhibition such as Expo in Paris and International Tourism Exchange (ITB) Berlin through the arrangement of the JTB. At the time of ex-post evaluation, the human resource development plan had been upgraded within the framework of the ongoing JICA's technical cooperation for development planning (TCDP), the "Project for Tourism Development Master Plan" (2021-2025) and the government's initiative. The tourist map was further updated and translated into 10 languages. PDTRA has been working on new trekking routes in the Petra Archaeological Park (PAP) and also working with local institutions and community-based organizations to rehabilitate and maintain the existing routes. For the trails in 6 communities proposed by the project, PDTRA established an internal committee to materialize these trails. PDTRA held 7 festivals in the culture village and invited twin towns of Egypt and Brazil, promoting culture exchange. PDTRA has regularly updated its Social Network Service (SNS) by its own staff and provided local communities with the opportunity of training for branding in cooperation with the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Supply. The trial of shuttle bus service contributed to the development of a concept of holistic approach connecting both inside and outside of the PAP by shuttle bus and building infrastructure such as bus stations, supported by USAID. PDTRA provided investment incentives for investors of tourism sector and has successfully attracted investments. As a result, they created 100 employment opportunities and 40 Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) projects. It was confirmed that PDTRA's capacity on tourism/regional development has been improved, because PDTRA continues providing training for small enterprisers in local communities and then working with them to develop tourism products and support the opening of some shops in a village. In addition, the exhibition material and administrative documents developed by the project are fully utilized and periodically updated in the Petra Museum. <Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

<sup>1</sup> ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low

<sup>2</sup> The result of the original baseline survey was 82%. However, the project recalculated to provide a more accurate estimation of the change in the perceptions of survey respondents by asking for baseline responses and endline responses in the endline survey, considering that their mindsets might become different between the baseline survey in 2015 and the endline survey in 2018.

At the time of ex-post evaluation, the Overall Goal has been achieved as planned. Although PDTRA does not have data to verify the satisfaction level of local resident and tourists, the current situation indicates that their satisfaction level has increased (Indicator 1). After the end of the global outbreak of COVID-19, the tourism sector in Petra has recovered quickly and the region has received increasing numbers of tourists. Tourists can enjoy not only the Petra Museum, but also more diversified experience provided by the private sector such as balloon, Petra Kitchen, Petra light-up show (projection mapping). According to the visitor survey implemented by the ongoing JICA's TCDP, the "Project for Tourism Development Master Plan" in 2022, 83.55% of respondents (the number of respondents=7,715) answered "strongly agree" or "agree" to the statement "I will recommend a visit to Petra region to my friends and relatives". Although the exact number of tourism products by year was not counted by PDTRA, the above-mentioned various services and events held in the cultural village were introduced. According to PDTRA, the Virtual Reality (VR) experience service in the visitor centre, an adventure park and zipline activities will be launched with the support of investors in 2023. A large part of the residents earn income from tourism related businesses, and the number of hotels has increased from 44 in 2019 to 67 in 2022, which provides employment and more income opportunities for local residents; therefore, local residents also increase their satisfaction level.

Involvement of the local residents has been increasing through the associations, in particular Nabataean Capital Association<sup>3</sup> (Indicator 2). PDTRA does not have information about the income of local associations, but it is assumed that the income has increased as the number of tourism-related businesses has been increasing after the pandemic of COVID-19. The number of associations involved in tourism-related businesses has also increased from 45 to 49 and the number of local residents participating in tourism sector increased by 32% from 2,654 at the time of the endline survey to 3,511 at the time of the post-evaluation. Therefore, the project has contributed to paving the way to promote local community's participation in the tourism businesses.

Since the opening of the Petra Museum the highest number of tourists visiting Petra was recorded in 2019, and the target was achieved beyond the plan (indicator 3). However, in 2020 and 2021 there was a significant decrease in the number of tourists, due to the COVID-19 pandemic. After travel restrictions due to the COVID-19 pandemic were lifted in September 2021, the tourists started to return to Petra, and the number of tourists in 2022 increased by 9%, compared to the endline data in 2018. It is expected that the highest number of tourists will be recorded in 2023, exceeding the number of tourists in 2019.

#### <Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

Some positive impacts have been observed in the ex-post evaluation. New investment projects in Petra region are required to include conditions to promote the employment of local people and the participation of female. The Petra Museum employs 6 females as permanent staff, 5 of them as cleaning staff and 5 females as part-time staff (working in shifts) as part of the local community hiring initiative.

No negative impact on natural environment was observed.

#### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

#### Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
(Project Purpose) Capacity of PDTRA for sustainable community-based regional tourism development is strengthened.	Indicator 1 The number of policies, plans and activities implemented by PDTRA as a part of the Project is to be more than 10.	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Achieved as planned (continued and further developed) (Project Completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>25 items of plans and activities were implemented as follows: formulation of 3 tourism promotion plans and a human resource development plan in marketing, development of 4 tourist maps, improvement of 5 trekking routes in the Petra Archaeological Park (PAP), identification of some trails based on the study of potential touristic attractions, holding 3 festivals in Petra and the United Kingdom (UK), implementation of pilot shuttle bus services, provision of training in SNS marketing, tourism investment, museum and tourism promotion, etc</li> </ul> (Ex-Post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>25 items of plan and activities were further developed and implemented as follows: the tourism promotion plan was updated in 2019. PDTRA signed the agreement with JTB for the promotional activities. The human resource development plan has been upgraded. The tourist map was further updated and translated into 10 languages. PDTRA worked on new trekking routes and rehabilitated and maintained the existing routes. PDTRA established an internal committee to materialize the trails proposed by the project. PDTRA held 7 festivals in the culture village and invited twin towns. PDTRA has regularly updated its SNS by its own staff. The trial of shuttle bus service contributed to development of a concept of holistic approach, connecting both inside and outside of the PAP by shuttle bus. PDTRA has successfully attracted investments.</li> </ul>	Project completion report and Questionnaire to PDTRA
	Indicator 2 Level and changes of PDTRA's capacity on tourism /regional development is to be improved by 10% after the project.	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Achieved beyond the plan (Continued) (Project Completion) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The amended baseline surveyed in April 2016 was 27.5% and the end line survey in May 2018 was 87.5%. The change was an increase of 60%.</li> </ul> (Ex-Post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Refer to the technical aspect of "Sustainability"</li> </ul>	Project completion report
	Indicator 3	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): Achieved beyond the plan	Project

	Level and changes of stakeholders' awareness and ownership in regard to tourism /regional development is to be improved by 10%	(continued and further developed) (Project Completion) • Baseline surveyed in Feb 2016 was 54.2% and Endline surveyed in May 2018 was 83.3%. There was an increase of 29.1%. (Ex-Post Evaluation) • As PDTRA continues working with local community for further development of tourism sector, awareness of local stakeholders has been increasing.	completion report and Questionnaire to PDTRA
(Overall Goal) Community-based regional tourism development is implemented continuously in Petra.	Indicator 1 Level of satisfaction of local residents and tourists is to be increased by 10% respectively by 2020	Status of the Achievement: partially achieved (Ex-Post Evaluation) • PDTRA does not collect quantitative data related to the satisfaction of local residents and tourists. However, according to the visitor survey implemented by another JICA project, 83.55% of respondents answered positively agree with the statement "I will recommend the Petra region to my friends and relatives". In addition, a large proportion of local residents have also increased their satisfaction levels because the growth of tourism-related business and the hotel industry has provided more employment and income opportunities for local residents.	Questionnaire to PDTRA
	Indicator 2 Tourist activities newly developed by the Project enable 5% more local residents to participate in tourism business and increase income level by 5% by 2020.	Status of the Achievement: Achieved as planned (Ex-Post Evaluation) • The number of associations involved in tourism businesses has increased from 45 to 49 after COVID-19. • The number of local residents participating in the tourism sector increased by 32%, compared to the number of endline survey. • PDTRA does not have information about the income of local associations, but it is assumed that their income would be increase as the number of tourism business has increased.	Questionnaire to PDTRA
	Indicator 3 Number of tourists is to be increased by 5% by 2020.	Status of the Achievement: achieved beyond the plan (Ex-Post Evaluation) • In 2020 and 2021 the number of tourists decreased significantly due to the negative impact of COVID-19, but in 2022 tourists started to return to Petra and recorded 109%, compared to the number of endline survey. As of March 2023, it is expected that the number of tourists in 2023 would exceed the number of 2019, which recorded the highest (137%).	Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities and Questionnaire to PDTRA
	Indicator 4 Number of repeaters is to be increased by 5% by 2020.	Status of the Achievement: Not verifiable. (Ex-Post Evaluation) • PDTRA does not have mechanisms to collect statistics of repeaters.	Questionnaire to PDTRA

### 3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was within the plan (the ratio against the plan:92%) and the project period considerably exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan:144%). Delays in the project implementation were due to responses to increase the project's effectiveness. The completion of the construction and handover of the Petra Museum was originally expected to be in April 2018, and the opening of it was expected to be in November 2018. However, the handover of the Petra Museum was delayed until October 2018. Besides, experts of the museum advisor team were dispatched in September-October 2018 under the consultancy contract of the project, and various challenges were pointed out by the expert. Therefore, PDTRA and JICA decided to extend the project period to March 2020 to address the issues. After the opening of the Petra Museum in April 2019, PDTRA and JICA implemented promotional activities including the publication of the museum official guidebook and Familiarization (FAM) trip.

	Project Cost (Japanese side only, yen)	Project Period (months)
Plan (ex-ante)	430 million yen	36 months
Actual	396 million yen	52 months
Ratio (%)	92%	144%

Outputs were produced as planned.

In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ③.

### 4 Sustainability

#### <Policy Aspect>

Tourism sector remains one of Jordan's priority sectors. It is mentioned in various policies and strategies including the "Government's Economic Priorities Program" (2021-2023) and the "Economic Modernization Vision" (2022-2033). These policies prioritise key business environment reforms and target growth and opportunities over the next 10 years for the country. His Majesty King Abdullah II visited Petra in January 2023 and encouraged the development of infrastructure and diversification of the tourism product. In addition, the "Jordan National Tourism Strategy" (2021-2025) identifies Petra as a key heritage tourism destination.

#### <Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

PDTRA has a clear direction and mechanism for involving local communities in decision making of tourism development. Thus, the community-based approach is most likely to be continued in the future. The "PAP Rehabilitation and Renovation Program" (2022-2024) was launched to rehabilitate the trails in PAP with local associations such as Nabataean Capital Association and Bait Al Anbat. This

program has so far provided employment for 250 people. PDTRA formulated the “Operation Plan for Elgee Village (2022-2024)” which describes investment opportunities in Elgee Village. As a part of the plan, handicraft shop was operated in cooperation with Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ).

The organization structures of the Petra Museum established through the project is still valid. PDTRA and the Petra Museum have sufficient staff to operate and maintain their facilities. The Research Unit was newly established under the Commissioner of PAP and Tourism Affairs of PDTRA in 2021 to enhance statistics and studies. PDTRA is also preparing for establishing a specialized division to develop promotional material such as photograph, videos, and so forth.

#### <Technical Aspect>

All staff of PDTRA have training opportunities especially for local community and tourism sector. Some trainings have been provided by the Civil Service Bureau and the Ministry of Planning and International Corporation. Since the IT department provides basic IT training to their staff, the SNS account (visitpetra) has been regularly updated by PDTRA staff. In addition, PDTRA has provided basic computer and software trainings to the Petra Museum. The Petra Museum has an action plan for the training of curators and the museum staff to practice their skills through simple activities. The Petra Museum has occasional interactions with the Jordan Museum and other museums to learn from each other. Based on this experience, the Petra Museum is eager to collaborate more with other museums in the Middle East region.

#### <Financial Aspect>

PDTRA established a sustainability fund for unexpected events causing negative impact on the tourism sector after the pandemic of COVID19. In addition, PDTRA has continuously allocated the necessary budget for the community involvement activities and the operation of the Petra Museum. The source of the budget is the revenue from the entrance ticket for PAP and the license fee for tourism business and accommodation in Petra.

#### <Environmental and Social Aspect>

No issue on environmental and social aspect has been observed, and it has not been necessary to take any countermeasures. PDTRA has its own risk management system to monitor various types of risks, including environmental and social risks. When any risk is identified, countermeasures will be taken.

#### <Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, no problem has been observed in terms of the policy, institutional/organizational, technical, financial, and environmental and social aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ④.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project achieved as planned the Project Purpose to strengthen capacity of PDTRA for sustainable community-based regional tourism development and the overall goal to continuously implement community-based regional tourism development in Petra. As for efficiency, the project period significantly exceeded the plan.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

## III. Non-score Items

### Adaption and Contribution:

As the museum was not ready for opening at the end of the original project period, JICA office extended the project period and took the responsibility to provide all the necessary support for opening of the Petra Museum. JICA had maintained good communication with PDTRA and supervised the implementation schedule of activities for the opening of the Petra Museum jointly with PDTRA. This continuous communication helped identify and resolve the problems faced and contributed to the successful opening of the Petra Museum. In addition, the Heritage Tourism Advisor dispatched by JICA provided all the necessary on-site technical advice to the Petra Museum such as the production of exhibition materials, the production of reconstruction model of the artifacts, the mounting of the exhibits, the development of the official guidebook and so forth. As a result, by the time the Petra Museum opened, the quality of the soft components necessary for the museum's operation had been maintained and improved.

## IV. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- It is recommended that PDTRA and the Petra Museum share more information about other attractions of the region, local products, intangible heritage touristic attractions that attract tourists other than the archaeological tourism represented by the Al-Khazneh through SNSs and their websites. As tourists become aware of more products and attractions, they would extend their stay in Petra, which contributes to a greater economic impact.

### Lessons Learned for JICA:

- At the time of the ex-ante evaluation, it is necessary to set indicators that can be measured after the completion of the project. During the project implementation, the actual values for some indicators, such as “the number of repeaters” and “the satisfaction level of local residents” were collected by the Japanese experts at the time of the baseline and endline surveys, however, the implementing agency has not collected such figures in its regular operations. In case that an indicator is not set properly at the time of the ex-ante evaluation, taking into the account the operations of the implementing agency, it could be difficult to implement a proper evaluation at the time of the ex-post evaluation.
- Museum Specialists (a member of the consultant team) were dispatched just before the end of the original project period, and various issue including critical problems such as the quality of showcase and exhibition panels were pointed out. As a result, JICA decided to extend the project period, and JICA office took over the responsibility for solving these issues and doing necessary preparation for the opening of the museum. To ensure such members of the consultant team is dispatched in appropriate timing, JICA needs to carefully monitor the plan and implementation by the consultant.
- During the project implementation, there were some outputs that lacked coherence between the grant aid project and technical cooperation project, such as the lack of uniformity in the installation of display cases and panels, and lack of uniformity in the information and font of panels and documents, etc. Therefore, under JICA's initiative, the consultants of the grant aid project, the experts of the technical cooperation project and the counterpart staff of the implementing agency should have had closer



Activities at Petra Museum for Nabatean pottery painting targeting children who visited Petra. The activity was implemented in cooperation with Petra Pottery Association.



Improvement of the sign boards for the trails in the Petra Archaeological Park.