

Country Name	The Project on Strengthening COE (Center of Excellence) Program for PDAMs in the Republic of Indonesia
Republic of Indonesia	

I. Project Outline

Background	<p>The ratio of population with sustainable access to safe drinking water in Indonesia was still low. The ratio of population with access to safe water through piped water was 27% in 2011 against the goal of 41% by 2015 in the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).</p> <p>Water supply services in Indonesia are operated and managed by water utilities (PDAMs) in each district and city under the local government. In 1990, Ministry of Public Works and Housing (MPWH) established the Water Supply and Environmental Sanitation Training Center (BTAMS) with the support of Japan. Since then, MPWH started to conduct trainings to staff of PDAMs. However, capacity of BTAMS such as capacity of providing reliable mentors/trainers as well as capacity of existing facility/equipment was limited for the number of PDAMs. These problems and challenges led MPWH to start the new program for developing the capacity of human resources in PDAMs across the country from 2012, which was named "Center of Excellence (COE) Program". Even though PDAMs faced many challenges, for example, the effects of the COE Program were very limited because the COE Program was just started and its training modules were also limited to just three, i.e. non-revenue water, energy efficiency, and financial accounting for non-public enterprises.</p> <p>For improving this situation, MPWH requested for support to strengthen the COE Program to the government of Japan.</p>										
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through strengthening implementation framework of the COE program, improving existing training modules and developing new training modules for the COE Program, the project aims at enhancing implementation capacity of the COE Program for PDAMs in the Directorate General of Human Settlement, thereby contributing to enhancement of capacity of PDAMs on improvement of PDAM management.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Overall Goal: Capacity of PDAMs on improvement of PDAM management is enhanced. Project Purpose: Implementation capacity of the COE Program for PDAMs in the Directorate General of Human Settlement is enhanced. 										
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Project site: Jakarta (Project Management Unit, DGHS, MPWH), Bekasi and Surabaya (BTAMS Training Center), South Sulawesi and South Sumatra provinces (for the basic study on present and past status of the project activities), and South Sulawesi, some provinces where the Provincial Trainings and Kabupaten/Kota Trainings etc. are implemented (for applying the newly developed modules and the revised modules) Main activities: Strengthening implementation framework of the COE program, improving existing training modules and developing new training modules for the COE Program Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Indonesian Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 10 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 49 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 24 persons</td> <td>2) COE Training Expenses</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Equipment for Non-Revenue Water (NRW) and Energy Efficiency (EE) module training, Office Equipment</td> <td>3) Project Office and Operational Expenses</td> </tr> </table> 			Japanese Side	Indonesian Side	1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff allocated: 49 persons	2) Trainees received: 24 persons	2) COE Training Expenses	3) Equipment: Equipment for Non-Revenue Water (NRW) and Energy Efficiency (EE) module training, Office Equipment	3) Project Office and Operational Expenses
Japanese Side	Indonesian Side										
1) Experts: 10 persons	1) Staff allocated: 49 persons										
2) Trainees received: 24 persons	2) COE Training Expenses										
3) Equipment: Equipment for Non-Revenue Water (NRW) and Energy Efficiency (EE) module training, Office Equipment	3) Project Office and Operational Expenses										
Project Period	(ex-ante) July 2015 – July 2018 (actual) August 2015 – August 2018	Project Cost	(ex-ante) 310 million yen, (actual) 323 million yen								
Implementing Agency	Directorate General of Human Settlement (DGHS), Ministry of Public Works and Housing (MPWH)										
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Koei Research & Consulting Inc. Nihon Suido Consultants Co., Ltd. Yokohama Water Co., Ltd.										

II. Result of the Evaluation

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

- The continuation status of project effects: Regarding the verification of the continuation status of the project effects, the continuation status of the indicator 1 in the Project Purpose was checked and analyzed as a part of the sustainability of technical aspect and that of the indicator 2 was checked and analyzed as a part of the indicator 2 of overall goal.

1 Relevance/Coherence

[Relevance]

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Indonesia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development policy of Indonesia at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The National Medium-Term Development Plan (RPJMN) (2010 – 2014), which was the subordinate plan of the Long-Term National Development Plan (2005-2025) as a national development policy in Indonesia, was committed to the achievement of MDGs.

The sector-wise national policy and strategic plan (RENSTRA 2010-2014) developed by MPWH mentioned the organizational and institutional aspects, financing, water sources, water services, and private sector participation as issues to be addressed. The Decree "National Strategy and Policies for Water Supply Development" (No. 13/PRT/M/2013), which was passed in December 2013, clarified that PDAMs would strengthen their efforts to improve their financial capacity, expand public-private partnerships, and improve organizational capacity and human resource development.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Indonesia at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Indonesia at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Water supply services in Indonesia were operated and managed by PDAMs in each district and city under the local government. However, this water sector had problems and challenges such as (i) many PDAMs were not able to get investment funds due to the bad financial status, and (ii) good practices and lessons learnt were not disseminated nationwide due to decentralization in Indonesia. In addition, good interventions could not be continued due to the limited human capacity of PDAMs. MPWH had struggled with the challenges of shortage in human resources of PDAMs and need for improvement in the capacity of existing human resources.

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

The project design/approach was appropriate. No problem attributed to the project design/approach was confirmed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③¹.

[Coherence]

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Indonesia at the time of ex-post evaluation. "Country Assistance Policy for the Republic of Indonesia" (April 2012) positioned "assistance for further economic development" and "assistance for correction of inequality and establishment of a safe society" as one of the priority areas. A cooperation program in "JICA Country Analysis Paper for the Republic of Indonesia" (March 2012) positioned "urban infrastructure development program for the metropolitan area" and "program for the development of local development and hub urban areas" as major development issues.

<Collaboration/Coordination with other JICA's interventions>

Any collaboration/coordination between the project and other JICA's intervention was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation. However, the project was in line with and complements previous JICA projects with an output of increasing the efficiency of water supply in Indonesia.

<Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework>

Any the cooperation/coordination with other institutions was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ②.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the Time of Project Completion>

At the time of project completion, the Project Purpose was mostly achieved as planned. Four modules (Non Revenue Water (NRW), Energy Efficiency (EE), Customer Relations (CR) and Financial Analysis and Management (FAM)) revised or developed by the Project were utilized in the COE Program. In the 2017 COE Program, after the revision of NRW and EE modules, 2 trainings for existing Provincial Trainers (PT) and 4 trainings for Kab/Kota Trainers (KT) were conducted in 2017. As for the newly developed CR and FAM modules, Provincial Training was conducted in January/February 2018 and KT in April 2018 under JICA funding (Indicator 1). Directorate of Water Supply System Development (DWSD) confirmed with PERPAMSI the substantial contents of M/P along with next steps forward. M/P was approved in August 2018 (Indicator 2).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

The continuation status of project effects at the time of ex-post evaluation was not examined in this part. This is because the continuation status of Indicator 1 can be covered by checking the sustainability of technical aspect and that of Indicator 2 can be covered by checking Indicator 2 of overall goal.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of ex-post evaluation, the Overall Goal has been partially achieved. Improvements of activities are observed in the COE program on all modules (Indicator 1). The COE program is not running smoothly due to the dismissal of the Water Supply System Development Supporting Agency (BPPSPAM) which was supposed to be the implementing agency of COE program after the project completion and budget limitation. However, some parts of project are well implemented. The modules are still used by some PDAMs and the trainers trained by several PDAMs still have sufficient knowledge (Indicator 2).

<Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of Ex-post evaluation, other positive impacts were observed. Since many COE trainers are women, the project has increased gender roles in PDAMs. The project has also increased the competence and confidence of trainers to teach both within PDAMs and outside PDAMs. Furthermore, water pressure has increased and monitoring of water distribution has been easier.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source
(Project Purpose) Implementation capacity of the COE Program for PDAMs in the Directorate General of Human Settlement is enhanced.	Indicator 1: Four modules (NRW, EE, CR, FAM) revised or developed by the Project are utilized in the COE Program.	Status of the Achievement: mostly achieved as planned (Project Completion) Four modules were utilized in 2017 COE Program: - NRW & EE: Training for existing PTs was conducted in Aug 2017 and KT in Oct 2017. - CR & FAM: Provincial Training in Jan/Feb 2018 and KT in Apr 2018	Project Completion Report

¹ ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low * To be the same afterwards.

	Indicator 2: The Master Plan for the COE Program is approved by the Director of DWSD.	Status of the Achievement: mostly achieved as planned (Project Completion) - Draft M/P prepared by the project was discussed by DWSD, PERPAMSI and other stakeholders in the preparatory meetings and JCCs in 2018. - DWSD confirmed with PERPAMSI the substantial contents of M/P along with next steps forward. M/P was approved in August 2018.	Project Completion Report										
(Overall Goal) Capacity of PDAMs on improvement of PDAM management is enhanced.	Indicator 1: Improvement of activities in PDAMs which participated in the COE program on NRW, EE, CR and FAM is observed.	(Ex-Post Evaluation) mostly achieved as planned Improvements of activities are observed in the COE program on all modules as follow. <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Module</th> <th>Improvements of the activities in PDAMs</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>NRW</td> <td>- Raising awareness & Sharing knowledge about NRW reduction program - Improvement of water meter O&M - Improvement of leakage management - NRW team formation</td> </tr> <tr> <td>EE</td> <td>- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for EE program - Installation of capacitor bank</td> </tr> <tr> <td>CR</td> <td>- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for customer service program - Customer management through online apps</td> </tr> <tr> <td>FAM</td> <td>- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for financial management program</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Module	Improvements of the activities in PDAMs	NRW	- Raising awareness & Sharing knowledge about NRW reduction program - Improvement of water meter O&M - Improvement of leakage management - NRW team formation	EE	- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for EE program - Installation of capacitor bank	CR	- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for customer service program - Customer management through online apps	FAM	- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for financial management program	PDAMs, Directorate of WS
	Module	Improvements of the activities in PDAMs											
NRW	- Raising awareness & Sharing knowledge about NRW reduction program - Improvement of water meter O&M - Improvement of leakage management - NRW team formation												
EE	- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for EE program - Installation of capacitor bank												
CR	- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for customer service program - Customer management through online apps												
FAM	- Raising awareness & sharing knowledge for financial management program												
	Indicator 2: Modules revised or developed by the Project are continuously utilized in COE Program.	(Ex-Post Evaluation) partially achieved - At the time of ex-post evaluation, the COE program is not running smoothly due to a dismissal of BPPSPAM which was supposed to be the implementing agency of COE program after the project completion and budget limitation. - However, some parts of program are well implemented. The modules are still used by some PDAMs and the trainers trained by several PDAMs still have sufficient knowledge.	PDAMs, Directorate of WS										

3 Efficiency

The project cost slightly exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 104%) due to responses to achieve results and the project period was as planned (the ratio against the plan: 100%). Outputs were produced as planned.

In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ③.

4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

There is a regulation to support the improvement of PDAM management at the time of ex-post evaluation. Regulation of MPWH Number 15/PRT/M/2018 of 2018 enforced the Indonesian National Work Competency Standards in the field of drinking water supply system.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, since BPPSPAM, the organization that were supposed to run the COE program, was dismissed, the organization for COE implementation has not been running and it is neither clear nor determined yet who will carry on the program. However, Directorate of Water Supply (DOWS) under the Deputy Directorate of Technical Planning is trying to resume the program. DOWS is actively planning and securing necessary budget for COE. There are several staff (about 5 persons) under Deputy DOWS who know the project well and retain the knowledge, although the program is not yet implemented. In addition, most of the trainers who were trained during the project are still actively working in related PDAMs. PDAM in Pare-Pare city is forming 3 teams to focus on NRW and CR.

<Technical Aspect>

The trainers who were trained during the project are still actively disseminating knowledge. In addition, the trainings are continuously conducted by DOWS under the Technical Assistance and Capacity Building Team of the National Urban Water Supply Project (TACT NUWSP) funded by the World Bank. JICA has also provided training in relation with the project. In 2021, PDAM Gowa conducted internal training on financial reports and NRW reduction.

The modules developed by the project have been utilized by BTAM and some PDAMs. Trainers provide material to PDAM staff according to their respective competencies, but there are several trainers who have not provided material due to limited funds.

<Financial Aspect>

Since the organization for COE implementation has not been running at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the budget has not been allocated. However, Deputy DOWS is planning a COE program, and trying to allocate the budget for it. The source of the budget is the national budget.

<Environmental and Social Aspect>

There was no monitoring system considered at the time of ex-ante evaluation and there is no monitoring activity related to the risk to the environment and social aspects, since the project itself was in the form of training of trainers/leveled training.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational and financial aspects of the

implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ②.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project mostly achieved as planned the project purpose which aimed at enhancing implementation capacity of the COE Program for PDAMs in DGHS and partially achieved the overall goal which aimed at enhancing Capacity of PDAMs on improvement of PDAM management. With reference to sustainability, some problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational and financial aspects of the implementing agency. The trainers who were trained during the project are still actively disseminating knowledge and the trainings are continuously conducted. With reference to efficiency, the project cost slightly exceeded the plan due to responses to achieve results.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

Despite uncertainty on the continuity of the program, the trainers are still actively giving trainings and the modules are still being used. To enhance the impact of such positive outcomes, it is recommended to: i) coordinate such training activities in one organization (i.e. Perpamsi); ii) adjust the modules to the current condition and officiate the modules as an official guide for PDAMs.

Number or percentage of women and marginalized people, including people with disabilities, indigenous people, children, disaster survivors, and low-income communities, should be monitored. As reference for other PDAMs, output of several PDAMs should be monitored to identify best practices.

Lessons Learned for JICA:

Looking at the sustainability of the project, during the project period, it is necessary to officiate the organization unit responsible for the future program arrangement. If it is not achieved during the project period, it might be necessary for JICA to follow up on the creation of a responsible unit up to a certain point.



Energy Efficiency (EE) Working Group Meeting



Discussion of COE Master Plan