

Country Name	<b>Project for Green Growth Promotion in Halong Bay Area, Quang Ninh Province</b>
Socialist Republic of Viet Nam	

**I. Project Outline**

Background	<p>In Quang Ninh Province, the environmental impact of industrial effluents and other discharges became apparent due to measures such as the rapid development of coastal areas, the establishment of economic zones and industrial parks, and the active attraction of domestic and foreign investment. In addition, energy consumption increased with the promotion of industrial activities, and the potential need for efficient energy consumption grew. Still, the size of the initial investment and other factors were inhibiting companies' implementation of energy-saving activities. To overcome these challenges, Quang Ninh Province's green growth policy aimed to shift from polluting industries to industries with reduced environmental impact and low carbon. Quang Ninh Province also identified the promotion of tourism as one of the pillars of its green growth policy.</p>																
Objectives of the Project	<p>Through awareness raising activities, preparation of the recommendations for the post-project phase to promote green growth, and pilot activities, the project aims at promoting Green Growth in Halong Bay Area through the implementation of environmentally sustainable policies in the key industrial sectors and implementation of development policies in tourism sector, thereby contributing to promoting green growth in Quang Ninh Province through transition from brown to green economy.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overall Goal: Green growth is promoted in Quang Ninh Province through transition from brown to green economy.</li> <li>Project Purpose: Green Growth is promoted in Halong Bay Area through the implementation of environmentally sustainable policies in the key industrial sectors and implementation of development policies in tourism sector.</li> </ol>																
Activities of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project site: Halong Bay Area (Bai Tu Long Bay, Halong City, Cam Pha City, Van Don District, Hoanh Bo District, Quang Yen Town, Uong Bi City in Quang Ninh Province)</li> <li>Main activities: 1) Awareness raising activities and preparation of the recommendations for the post-project phase to promote green growth, 2) development and implementation of environmentally and financially sustainable policies for the selected key industrial sectors as pilot activities, 3) implementation of measures to stimulate sustainable growth of tourism sector as pilot activities</li> <li>Inputs (to carry out above activities) <table border="0" style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">Japanese Side</td> <td style="width: 50%;">Vietnamese Side</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1) Experts: 16 persons</td> <td>1) Staff allocated: 79 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Trainees received: 25 persons</td> <td>- Steering Committee (StC): 13 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Equipment: Composting toilet for tourist boat, composting plant with accessories for organic waste composting</td> <td>- Project Management Unit: 7 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4) Local cost</td> <td>- Working Groups: 59 persons</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>2) Land and facility: Office space</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>3) Local cost</td> </tr> </table> </li> </ol>			Japanese Side	Vietnamese Side	1) Experts: 16 persons	1) Staff allocated: 79 persons	2) Trainees received: 25 persons	- Steering Committee (StC): 13 persons	3) Equipment: Composting toilet for tourist boat, composting plant with accessories for organic waste composting	- Project Management Unit: 7 persons	4) Local cost	- Working Groups: 59 persons		2) Land and facility: Office space		3) Local cost
Japanese Side	Vietnamese Side																
1) Experts: 16 persons	1) Staff allocated: 79 persons																
2) Trainees received: 25 persons	- Steering Committee (StC): 13 persons																
3) Equipment: Composting toilet for tourist boat, composting plant with accessories for organic waste composting	- Project Management Unit: 7 persons																
4) Local cost	- Working Groups: 59 persons																
	2) Land and facility: Office space																
	3) Local cost																
Project Period	(ex-ante) November 2016 - November 2019 (37 months) (actual) November 2016 - January 2020 (39 months)	Project Cost (Japanese side only)	(ex-ante) 440 million yen, (actual) 481 million yen														
Implementing Agency	Quang Ninh Provincial People's Committee (PPC), Department of Planning and Investment (DPI) of Quang Ninh Province																
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Nippon Koei Co., Ltd. International Lake Environment Committee Foundation (ILEC), International Development Center of Japan Inc. (IDCJ)																

**II. Result of the Evaluation**

<Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation>

• After the project, a JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor) was dispatched from Shiga Prefecture to DPI (April 2021 - December 2023). In addition, the collaboration between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture has been implemented based on the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU)<sup>1</sup>. Therefore, the effects we observe in this evaluation may include those of the support of JICA Expert and such collaboration.

• To examine the continuation status of the project effects, whether the two discovery trails (ecotourism programs) developed and provided during the project have been continuously provided is also examined as Supplement Information 1.

**1 Relevance/Coherence**

[Relevance]

<Consistency with the Development Policy of Viet Nam at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development policy of Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation. Quang Ninh Province Socio-economic Development Plan (SEDP), a master plan developed in 2013, aimed to ensure that by 2020 the province would have modern socio-economic and urban infrastructure and environmental protection, as well as economic development while protecting and promoting sustainable use of the World Natural Heritage Area of Halong Bay and National Park Bai Tu Long Bay. In the master plan, Quang Ninh Province was focusing on shifting from a "brown economy" to a "green economy" centered economic structure. As an action plan to realize this, the Quang Ninh Province Green Growth Action Plan 2014 - 2020, based on the National Green Growth Strategy (NGGS),

<sup>1</sup> Quang Ninh PPC and Shiga Prefectural Government signed the MOU in October 2017 on environmental and economic cooperation by sharing their expertise and experiences about the issues.

was approved in 2014.

<Consistency with the Development Needs of Viet Nam at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >

The project was consistent with the development needs of Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation. In Quang Ninh Province, the environmental impact of industrial effluents and other discharges became apparent. In addition, energy consumption increased with the promotion of industrial activities, and the potential need for efficient energy consumption grew.

<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>

The project design/approach was appropriate. No problem attributed to the project design/approach was confirmed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③<sup>2</sup>.

[Coherence]

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Viet Nam at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The Country Assistance Policy for the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam (December 2012) included "Response to Fragility" (Response to the Negative Impacts Brought by Economic Development) as one of the priority areas, focusing on strengthening the ability to cope with environmental degradation caused by rapid urbanization and industrialization, and with environmental problems in tourist areas, and on supporting rural development.

<Collaboration/Coordination with JICA's other interventions>

Although the collaboration/coordination between the project and an SME overseas expansion support project<sup>3</sup> of JICA was planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation and was implemented, any effects were not confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. The pieces of equipment provided by the project have not been used/maintained effectively as planned.

<Cooperation with other institutions/ Coordination with international framework>

The cooperation/coordination with Shiga Prefecture was planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation<sup>4</sup> and implemented as planned, and the positive effects were confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. During the project, the technical transfer for green growth promotion from Shiga Prefecture was performed by the Shiga advisory missions, several opportunities for technical seminars, training courses in Japan, etc. Based on the MOU signed in 2017 between Quang Ninh PPC and Shiga Prefectural Government, collaboration has been implemented<sup>5</sup>. Promoting collaboration was also included in the action programs for the post-project phase prepared by the project. Cooperation with Shiga Prefecture has contributed to increasing the effectiveness and sustainability of the project. For example, Halong Bay Research Center, established in Halong University in 2019 by referring to Shiga Prefecture's Lake Biwa Research Center, has been functioning to conduct research activities, provide professional advice for the Quang Ninh PPC, training and support to students in their professional fields. Shiga Prefecture applied for the city-to-city collaboration project of the Japan Ministry of the Environment (May 2022 - March 2025) and is currently developing various projects in Quang Ninh Province. New private sector networks for promoting green growth are also being built in the process of creating the Halong Bay Goals, referring to Mother Lake Goals, Shiga Prefecture's local version of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), in order to incorporate the views of the private sector.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ③.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In light of the above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

## 2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Status of Achievement of the Project Purpose at the Time of Project Completion>

At the time of project completion, the Project Purpose was mostly achieved as planned. Mechanisms with approved institutionalized documents for green growth promotion were developed and approved by Quang Ninh PPC in the key industrial sectors and tourism sector. (Indicator 1). The recommendations for the post-project phase prepared for Quang Ninh Province were approved in the final StC of the project on 6th November 2019. (Indicator 2).

<Continuation Status of Project Effects at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

By the time of the ex-post evaluation, the project effects have been continued. Out of 8 institutionalized mechanisms, 6 have been functioning well, with 1 mechanism under revision and 1 in re-organization. The post-project phase action programs proposed for the departments and organizations in Quang Ninh Province to realize the recommendations have been implemented. Out of 15 proposed actions, 12 are in good progress. The remaining 3 related to the tourism sector are in some progress, partly due to COVID-19. The two (2) discovery trails developed and provided during the project have also been provided.

After the completion of the project, Quang Ninh Province issued Plan No. 73/KH-UBND dated April 27, 2020, on implementing the results of the project in the period of 2020 - 2025. Plan No.73/KH-UBND has become an important provincial legal basis for implementing green growth in Quang Ninh Province.

<sup>2</sup> ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low

<sup>3</sup> Verification Survey with the Private Sector for Disseminating Japanese Technologies for Environment Improvement Technology Using Bio-Toilet, "Bio-Lux" and New-Johka system, "Bio-Lux Water" (December 2015 - May 2018)

<sup>4</sup> The cooperation scheme between Shiga Prefecture and Quang Ninh Province was initiated in the Detailed Planning Phase (October 2015 - September 2016). The project was designed to find applications from the experiences of Shiga Prefecture in Japan and Lake Biwa Model developed by Shiga Prefecture. The present Lake Biwa Model is reached through the following steps: Tackle the issues on increasing water demand and severe water pollution under the rapid economic growth (1st step); Formulate and implement the comprehensive management of water environment and water body in the lake, including the conservation of water quality and nature (2nd step); Harmonize the comprehensive lake management with utilization of water body and resources to enhance the regional development in socio-economic aspect (3rd step).

<sup>5</sup> Ongoing projects supported by JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor) dispatched from Shiga Prefecture and those based on the MOU include: 1) Creation of "Halong Bay Goals", the first local version of SDGs in Viet Nam, based on "Mother Lake Goals" which is Shiga Prefecture's local version of SDGs, 2) Project to install Johkasou on tourist islands in the Halong Bay World Heritage Area using a subsidy from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MOFA) of Japan, 3) Project for Enactment of Johkasou Maintenance Ordinance in Quang Ninh Province to introduce solar power generation equipment and high-efficiency boilers to Quang Ninh Industrial Park utilizing Joint Credit Mechanism (JCM) and introduction of them, 4) Project for the construction of garbage collection vessels using subsidies from the MOFA of Japan, 5) Project for Ethnic Minority Ecotourism in Binh Lieu, Quang Ninh Province.

<Status of Achievement of the Overall Goal at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

At the time of ex-post evaluation, the Overall Goal has been mostly achieved as planned. As for Indicator 1, White Book for Y2020 was only published in January 2023 for the period between Y2019 and Y2022. This is due to the impact of COVID-19. DPI waited for the arrival of the delayed JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor) to maximize the effects of publishing White Book for capacity building of staff in relevant departments and for use as an educational tool at school. Currently, DPI is coordinating with other departments to develop White Book for Y2021 to be published in December 2023. In regard to Indicator 2, a total of 11 activities are identified as conducted through the environmental management regulations and organizations developed by the project. As for Indicator 3, no eco-tour program has been newly developed and provided because COVID-19 hit Quang Ninh's tourism industry hard and the pilot project for ecotourism was also suspended for some time. New ecotourism programs are under consideration. A new program of ethnic minority ecotourism is being developed and is expected to start in April 2024.

Out of three indicators, Indicator 1 and Indicator 3 are not achieved. However, considering the present situation, the prospect for future progress is well expected. Indicator 2 can be weighted higher among the three indicators because it covers multiple areas and activities. In addition to the steady progress of the post-project phase action programs to promote Green Growth in Quang Ninh Province as mentioned above, it is considered that the project mostly achieved the Overall Goal as planned.

<Other Impacts at the Time of Ex-Post Evaluation>

Positive impacts were confirmed. Out of 63 provinces in Viet Nam, 48 have established the Environmental Protection Fund (EPF). Quang Ninh's EPF was evaluated for best performance at the 2022 Financial Conference of the Viet Nam EPF. The cooperation between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture has also positively impacted Shiga. As a result of Shiga's contribution during and after the project, Shiga Prefecture's overseas technical cooperation and dissemination of Lake Biwa Model have been promoted, which brought Shiga Prefecture to win the international contribution award at the 23rd Japan Water Prize in June 2021. No negative impacts were observed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

Aim	Indicators	Results	Source																																							
(Project Purpose) Green Growth is promoted in Halong Bay Area through the implementation of environmentally sustainable policies in the key industrial sectors and implementation of development policies in tourism sector.	Indicator 1: The following regulations and organizations to promote green growth are approved by Quang Ninh Province. ▪ Regulation and organization for publishing the Quang Ninh Province green growth white book continuously [A] <sup>6</sup> ▪ Financial and budgetary mechanisms and organization for promoting environmental management activities and energy saving activities [B] ▪ Regulation and organization for delivering and updating tourist information as well as marketing. [C] ▪ Regulation and organization for promoting eco-	Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion) ▪ Mechanisms with approved institutionalized documents for green growth promotion were developed and approved by Quang Ninh PPC in the key industrial sectors and tourism sector. (Ex-Post Evaluation) ▪ Out of 8 institutionalized mechanisms, 6 have been functioning well, with 1 mechanism under revision and 1 in re-organization.	Project Completion Report, Questionnaires & Interview with DPI, Interview with EPF, Department of Industry and Trade (DOIT), Van Don District, Department of Tourism (DOT), Green Growth Advisor, Questionnaire to Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD)																																							
		<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">No</th> <th colspan="3">(Project Completion)</th> <th>(Ex-Post Evaluation)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Field</th> <th>Mechanism</th> <th>Document</th> <th>Status of continuation</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1 [A]</td> <td>Awareness Raising on green growth</td> <td>Publishing the Quang Ninh Province Green Growth White Book</td> <td>Decision No.3231 on 2nd Aug. 2019</td> <td><u>Functioning</u> See Overall Goal Indicator 1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2 [B]</td> <td>Enhancement of the provincial funds and financial mechanisms for green growth</td> <td>Amendment of charter of organization and operation of EPF</td> <td>Decision No.114/QD-UBND on 11<sup>th</sup> Jan. 2019</td> <td><u>Functioning</u> EPF has been continuously provided. According to the conclusion of the provincial inspector, the EPF has been effectively deployed in accordance with the approved functions and tasks.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3 [B]</td> <td></td> <td>Policies to encourage investment and linkage in production, processing and consumption of agricultural products</td> <td>Resolution No. 194/2019/NQ-HDND on promulgating in Quang Ninh Province on 30th Jul. 2019</td> <td><u>Functioning</u> By the end of 2022, Quang Ninh Province has approved and implemented 28 district-level linkage projects.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4 [B]</td> <td>Promoting energy efficiency</td> <td>Implementation plan of 2020 with application for budget allocation</td> <td>Document No. 1114/SCT-QLNL in May 2019</td> <td><u>Functioning</u> The budget is allocated according to No.73/KH-UBND and other related Decision of the Province.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5 [B] [E]</td> <td></td> <td>Provincial action plan under Prime Minister Decision 280/QD-TTg on approval of the National Energy Efficiency Programme for the period of 2019 - 2030</td> <td>Draft Decision on Approving Program of Economical and Efficient Use of Energy in Quang Ninh Province toward 2030 <i>To be institutionalized in the post-project phase</i></td> <td><u>Functioning</u> The Program was approved by Plan No. 172/KH-UBND (Date of approval: Oct. 1, 2020)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6 [C]</td> <td>Dissemination and update of tourism information and marketing</td> <td>Approval of the establishment of Destination Marketing Agency (DMA)</td> <td>Decision 65/QD-UBND on 28th Jun. 2019 Decision No.384/ QD-SDL on Tourism Information and Promotion Center</td> <td><u>Functioning</u> These decisions are still valid. TIPC still performs its functions and tasks including DMA functions as regulated.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		No	(Project Completion)			(Ex-Post Evaluation)	Field	Mechanism	Document	Status of continuation	1 [A]	Awareness Raising on green growth	Publishing the Quang Ninh Province Green Growth White Book	Decision No.3231 on 2nd Aug. 2019	<u>Functioning</u> See Overall Goal Indicator 1	2 [B]	Enhancement of the provincial funds and financial mechanisms for green growth	Amendment of charter of organization and operation of EPF	Decision No.114/QD-UBND on 11 <sup>th</sup> Jan. 2019	<u>Functioning</u> EPF has been continuously provided. According to the conclusion of the provincial inspector, the EPF has been effectively deployed in accordance with the approved functions and tasks.	3 [B]		Policies to encourage investment and linkage in production, processing and consumption of agricultural products	Resolution No. 194/2019/NQ-HDND on promulgating in Quang Ninh Province on 30th Jul. 2019	<u>Functioning</u> By the end of 2022, Quang Ninh Province has approved and implemented 28 district-level linkage projects.	4 [B]	Promoting energy efficiency	Implementation plan of 2020 with application for budget allocation	Document No. 1114/SCT-QLNL in May 2019	<u>Functioning</u> The budget is allocated according to No.73/KH-UBND and other related Decision of the Province.	5 [B] [E]		Provincial action plan under Prime Minister Decision 280/QD-TTg on approval of the National Energy Efficiency Programme for the period of 2019 - 2030	Draft Decision on Approving Program of Economical and Efficient Use of Energy in Quang Ninh Province toward 2030 <i>To be institutionalized in the post-project phase</i>	<u>Functioning</u> The Program was approved by Plan No. 172/KH-UBND (Date of approval: Oct. 1, 2020)	6 [C]	Dissemination and update of tourism information and marketing	Approval of the establishment of Destination Marketing Agency (DMA)	Decision 65/QD-UBND on 28th Jun. 2019 Decision No.384/ QD-SDL on Tourism Information and Promotion Center	<u>Functioning</u> These decisions are still valid. TIPC still performs its functions and tasks including DMA functions as regulated.
		No			(Project Completion)			(Ex-Post Evaluation)																																		
				Field	Mechanism	Document	Status of continuation																																			
		1 [A]		Awareness Raising on green growth	Publishing the Quang Ninh Province Green Growth White Book	Decision No.3231 on 2nd Aug. 2019	<u>Functioning</u> See Overall Goal Indicator 1																																			
		2 [B]		Enhancement of the provincial funds and financial mechanisms for green growth	Amendment of charter of organization and operation of EPF	Decision No.114/QD-UBND on 11 <sup>th</sup> Jan. 2019	<u>Functioning</u> EPF has been continuously provided. According to the conclusion of the provincial inspector, the EPF has been effectively deployed in accordance with the approved functions and tasks.																																			
		3 [B]			Policies to encourage investment and linkage in production, processing and consumption of agricultural products	Resolution No. 194/2019/NQ-HDND on promulgating in Quang Ninh Province on 30th Jul. 2019	<u>Functioning</u> By the end of 2022, Quang Ninh Province has approved and implemented 28 district-level linkage projects.																																			
4 [B]	Promoting energy efficiency	Implementation plan of 2020 with application for budget allocation	Document No. 1114/SCT-QLNL in May 2019	<u>Functioning</u> The budget is allocated according to No.73/KH-UBND and other related Decision of the Province.																																						
5 [B] [E]		Provincial action plan under Prime Minister Decision 280/QD-TTg on approval of the National Energy Efficiency Programme for the period of 2019 - 2030	Draft Decision on Approving Program of Economical and Efficient Use of Energy in Quang Ninh Province toward 2030 <i>To be institutionalized in the post-project phase</i>	<u>Functioning</u> The Program was approved by Plan No. 172/KH-UBND (Date of approval: Oct. 1, 2020)																																						
6 [C]	Dissemination and update of tourism information and marketing	Approval of the establishment of Destination Marketing Agency (DMA)	Decision 65/QD-UBND on 28th Jun. 2019 Decision No.384/ QD-SDL on Tourism Information and Promotion Center	<u>Functioning</u> These decisions are still valid. TIPC still performs its functions and tasks including DMA functions as regulated.																																						

<sup>6</sup> [A]-[E] are put to refer to the table based on the Project Completion Report for convenience.

<p>tourism in Van Don District. [D]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Regulation and organization for labeling to promote energy saving and sustainable tourism activities [E]</li> </ul>	<p>7 [D]</p>	<p>Promotion of ecotourism in Quan Lan Island</p>	<p>Deciding on the roles, responsibilities and activities of Community-based Ecotourism (CBET) board</p>	<p>(TIPC) Function on 10th Sept. 2019</p> <p>Decision No.2019/QD-UBND on 6<sup>th</sup> Jun. 2019</p> <p>Decision No. 3043/QD-UBND on 6<sup>th</sup> Jun. 2019</p> <p>Decision No.2324/QD-UBND on 1<sup>st</sup> Jul. 2019</p>	<p><u>Under revision</u></p> <p>At reviewing conference organized in July 2021, the current roles and responsibilities of the CBET Board were reviewed but the regulation on operating of the CBET Board has not been officially issued yet.</p>																																																			
<p>Indicator 2: The recommendations for the post-project phase are submitted to Quang Ninh Province.</p>	<p>Status of the Achievement (Status of the Continuation): mostly achieved as planned (continued) (Project Completion)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The recommendations prepared for Quang Ninh Province were approved in the final StC of the project on 6th November 2019.</li> </ul> <p>(Ex-Post Evaluation)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Out of 15 proposed actions, 12 are in good progress. The remaining 3 related to the tourism sector are in some progress, partly due to COVID-19.</li> </ul>			<p>Project Completion Report, Questionnaires &amp; Interview with DPI, Interview with EPF, DOT, TIPC website</p>																																																				
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Program</th> <th>No.</th> <th>Actions [Responsible Authority]</th> <th>Status of Progress</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td rowspan="4">A. Balancing between abatement of environmental pollution load and economic growth in the industrial sector</td> <td>1</td> <td>A.1: Expansion of publicity on EPF [Department of Natural Resources and Environment (DONRE)]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: EPF operation plan is prepared &amp; approved annually by the Board of management. 8 workshops (2021) &amp; 11 workshops (2022) were conducted.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>A.2: Increase of application and users of EPF with enforcement of environmental regulations [DONRE]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: The application of EPF is increasing year by year.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>A.3: Steady enforcement of provincial policy based on Decision No.280 by the central government on energy saving [DOIT]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: It is implemented according to Plan No.73/KH-UBND.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>A.4: Promotion of energy saving besides the industrial sector [DOIT]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: It is implemented according to Plan No.73/KH-UBND.</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="4">B. Promotion of sustainable tourism</td> <td>5</td> <td>B.1: Display of DMA function of TIPC through collaboration with main actors in the tourism sector [DOT]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: TIPC cooperates with a tourism association, local communities &amp; tourism businesses, other countries (Korea, Japan, etc.), and other provinces for promotion and marketing.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6</td> <td>B.2: Strengthening of operational capability of CBET in Quan Lan Island through collaboration with higher locality [Van Dong District]</td> <td><u>Some</u>: The official operation procedure of CBET has not been issued yet. Some marketing and promotional activities are conducted combined with other promotion campaign/program of the district.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>7</td> <td>B.3: Branding the BSC system [Halong City PC]</td> <td><u>Some</u>: Due to the impact of COVID-19, BSC's branding has been slowed down. DOT presented the 2023 plan to develop BSC in accordance with the actual situation.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8</td> <td>B.4: Expansion of the ecotourism model in Quan Lan Island to the Van Don District [DOT &amp; Van Dong District]</td> <td><u>Some</u>: In Jul. 2021, DOT organized a review conference and discussed solutions to expand the ecotourism model.</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="5">C. Maintenance and improvement of institution for promotion of green growth policy</td> <td>9</td> <td>C.1: Continuation of provincial budget arrangement for promotion of green growth policy [PPC]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: According to Plan.No73/KH-UBND, budgets are allocated.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>10</td> <td>C.2: Refresh training for staff [PPC]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: Staff apply to training during publishing White Book, etc.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>11</td> <td>C.3: Continuation of initiative and commitment by PPC [DPI]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: DPI annually reports the progress of green growth policy implementation to PPC including issues &amp; countermeasures. PPC refers DPI's report to report to MPI.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>12</td> <td>C.4: Regular dialogues with the central government such as Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI) [DPI]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: DPI periodically organizes seminars with related departments to publish an annual White Book with different topics.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>13</td> <td>C.5: Promotion of collaboration between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture [DPI]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: The cooperation between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture is implemented according to the MOU.</td> </tr> <tr> <td rowspan="2">D. Strengthening of involvement of important actors for the implementation of green growth policy</td> <td>14</td> <td>D.1: Strengthening of collaboration among departments in PPC and examination of cross-sectoral financial mechanism for green growth promotion [DPI, Department of Finance (DOF)]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: By complying with Plan No. 73/KH-UBND, funds are allocated from the provincial budget to the related departments for implementation annually.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>15</td> <td>D.2: Strengthening of collaboration among government, industry, academic, and private entity through utilization of the Green Growth White Book [DPI]</td> <td><u>Good</u>: DPI periodically organizes seminars with related departments to publish an annual White Book with different topics.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Program	No.	Actions [Responsible Authority]	Status of Progress	A. Balancing between abatement of environmental pollution load and economic growth in the industrial sector	1	A.1: Expansion of publicity on EPF [Department of Natural Resources and Environment (DONRE)]	<u>Good</u> : EPF operation plan is prepared & approved annually by the Board of management. 8 workshops (2021) & 11 workshops (2022) were conducted.	2	A.2: Increase of application and users of EPF with enforcement of environmental regulations [DONRE]	<u>Good</u> : The application of EPF is increasing year by year.	3	A.3: Steady enforcement of provincial policy based on Decision No.280 by the central government on energy saving [DOIT]	<u>Good</u> : It is implemented according to Plan No.73/KH-UBND.	4	A.4: Promotion of energy saving besides the industrial sector [DOIT]	<u>Good</u> : It is implemented according to Plan No.73/KH-UBND.	B. Promotion of sustainable tourism	5	B.1: Display of DMA function of TIPC through collaboration with main actors in the tourism sector [DOT]	<u>Good</u> : TIPC cooperates with a tourism association, local communities & tourism businesses, other countries (Korea, Japan, etc.), and other provinces for promotion and marketing.	6	B.2: Strengthening of operational capability of CBET in Quan Lan Island through collaboration with higher locality [Van Dong District]	<u>Some</u> : The official operation procedure of CBET has not been issued yet. Some marketing and promotional activities are conducted combined with other promotion campaign/program of the district.	7	B.3: Branding the BSC system [Halong City PC]	<u>Some</u> : Due to the impact of COVID-19, BSC's branding has been slowed down. DOT presented the 2023 plan to develop BSC in accordance with the actual situation.	8	B.4: Expansion of the ecotourism model in Quan Lan Island to the Van Don District [DOT & Van Dong District]	<u>Some</u> : In Jul. 2021, DOT organized a review conference and discussed solutions to expand the ecotourism model.	C. Maintenance and improvement of institution for promotion of green growth policy	9	C.1: Continuation of provincial budget arrangement for promotion of green growth policy [PPC]	<u>Good</u> : According to Plan.No73/KH-UBND, budgets are allocated.	10	C.2: Refresh training for staff [PPC]	<u>Good</u> : Staff apply to training during publishing White Book, etc.	11	C.3: Continuation of initiative and commitment by PPC [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : DPI annually reports the progress of green growth policy implementation to PPC including issues & countermeasures. PPC refers DPI's report to report to MPI.	12	C.4: Regular dialogues with the central government such as Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI) [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : DPI periodically organizes seminars with related departments to publish an annual White Book with different topics.	13	C.5: Promotion of collaboration between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : The cooperation between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture is implemented according to the MOU.	D. Strengthening of involvement of important actors for the implementation of green growth policy	14	D.1: Strengthening of collaboration among departments in PPC and examination of cross-sectoral financial mechanism for green growth promotion [DPI, Department of Finance (DOF)]	<u>Good</u> : By complying with Plan No. 73/KH-UBND, funds are allocated from the provincial budget to the related departments for implementation annually.	15	D.2: Strengthening of collaboration among government, industry, academic, and private entity through utilization of the Green Growth White Book [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : DPI periodically organizes seminars with related departments to publish an annual White Book with different topics.			
Program	No.	Actions [Responsible Authority]	Status of Progress																																																					
A. Balancing between abatement of environmental pollution load and economic growth in the industrial sector	1	A.1: Expansion of publicity on EPF [Department of Natural Resources and Environment (DONRE)]	<u>Good</u> : EPF operation plan is prepared & approved annually by the Board of management. 8 workshops (2021) & 11 workshops (2022) were conducted.																																																					
	2	A.2: Increase of application and users of EPF with enforcement of environmental regulations [DONRE]	<u>Good</u> : The application of EPF is increasing year by year.																																																					
	3	A.3: Steady enforcement of provincial policy based on Decision No.280 by the central government on energy saving [DOIT]	<u>Good</u> : It is implemented according to Plan No.73/KH-UBND.																																																					
	4	A.4: Promotion of energy saving besides the industrial sector [DOIT]	<u>Good</u> : It is implemented according to Plan No.73/KH-UBND.																																																					
B. Promotion of sustainable tourism	5	B.1: Display of DMA function of TIPC through collaboration with main actors in the tourism sector [DOT]	<u>Good</u> : TIPC cooperates with a tourism association, local communities & tourism businesses, other countries (Korea, Japan, etc.), and other provinces for promotion and marketing.																																																					
	6	B.2: Strengthening of operational capability of CBET in Quan Lan Island through collaboration with higher locality [Van Dong District]	<u>Some</u> : The official operation procedure of CBET has not been issued yet. Some marketing and promotional activities are conducted combined with other promotion campaign/program of the district.																																																					
	7	B.3: Branding the BSC system [Halong City PC]	<u>Some</u> : Due to the impact of COVID-19, BSC's branding has been slowed down. DOT presented the 2023 plan to develop BSC in accordance with the actual situation.																																																					
	8	B.4: Expansion of the ecotourism model in Quan Lan Island to the Van Don District [DOT & Van Dong District]	<u>Some</u> : In Jul. 2021, DOT organized a review conference and discussed solutions to expand the ecotourism model.																																																					
C. Maintenance and improvement of institution for promotion of green growth policy	9	C.1: Continuation of provincial budget arrangement for promotion of green growth policy [PPC]	<u>Good</u> : According to Plan.No73/KH-UBND, budgets are allocated.																																																					
	10	C.2: Refresh training for staff [PPC]	<u>Good</u> : Staff apply to training during publishing White Book, etc.																																																					
	11	C.3: Continuation of initiative and commitment by PPC [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : DPI annually reports the progress of green growth policy implementation to PPC including issues & countermeasures. PPC refers DPI's report to report to MPI.																																																					
	12	C.4: Regular dialogues with the central government such as Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI) [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : DPI periodically organizes seminars with related departments to publish an annual White Book with different topics.																																																					
	13	C.5: Promotion of collaboration between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : The cooperation between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture is implemented according to the MOU.																																																					
D. Strengthening of involvement of important actors for the implementation of green growth policy	14	D.1: Strengthening of collaboration among departments in PPC and examination of cross-sectoral financial mechanism for green growth promotion [DPI, Department of Finance (DOF)]	<u>Good</u> : By complying with Plan No. 73/KH-UBND, funds are allocated from the provincial budget to the related departments for implementation annually.																																																					
	15	D.2: Strengthening of collaboration among government, industry, academic, and private entity through utilization of the Green Growth White Book [DPI]	<u>Good</u> : DPI periodically organizes seminars with related departments to publish an annual White Book with different topics.																																																					

(Overall Goal) Green growth is promoted in Quang Ninh Province through transition from brown to green economy.	Indicator 1: Quang Ninh Province green growth white book is continuously published.	Status of the Achievement: not achieved (Ex-Post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>White Book for Y2020 was only published in January 2023 for the period between Y2019 and Y2022.</li> </ul> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Version</th> <th>Y2017</th> <th>Y2018</th> <th>Y2019</th> <th>Y2020</th> <th>Y2021</th> <th>Y2022</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Year of Publishing</td> <td>2018</td> <td>2019</td> <td>-</td> <td>Jan. 2023</td> <td>Dec. 2023</td> <td>-</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2"></td> <td>Project Completion</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>To be published</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>This is due to the impact of COVID-19. The dispatch of the JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor) was delayed from 2020 to 2021, who was to support Quang Ninh Province, including publishing the White Book. DPI waited for the arrival of the JICA Expert, considering that publishing White Book was one kind of staff capacity building in DPI &amp; other departments. Moreover, because of the locking down by COVID-19, even if DPI had published White Book, it could not have been used effectively. After publication, the White Book was expected to be utilized by the Department of Education and Training of Quang Ninh Province for education at school.</li> <li>Currently, DPI is coordinating with other departments to develop White Book for Y2021 to be published in December 2023.</li> </ul>	Version	Y2017	Y2018	Y2019	Y2020	Y2021	Y2022	Year of Publishing	2018	2019	-	Jan. 2023	Dec. 2023	-			Project Completion			To be published		Questionnaire & interview with DPI	
	Version	Y2017	Y2018	Y2019	Y2020	Y2021	Y2022																		
	Year of Publishing	2018	2019	-	Jan. 2023	Dec. 2023	-																		
		Project Completion			To be published																				
Indicator 2: Ten (10) or more activities concerning provincial fund/financial mechanisms, energy saving, reduction of direct pollution load to the bay are conducted through the environmental management regulations and organizations developed by the Project for the selected key industrial sectors in Quang Ninh Province.	Status of the Achievement: achieved as planned (Ex-Post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A total of 11 activities are identified as conducted (6 concerning provincial fund/financial mechanisms, 5 concerning energy saving, and 0 concerning reduction of direct pollution load to the bay).</li> </ul> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Area</th> <th>Regulations</th> <th>No. of activities</th> <th>Conducted by</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td rowspan="2">1) Provincial fund/financial mechanisms</td> <td>Decision No.114/QD-UBND</td> <td>2</td> <td>DONRE (EPF)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Resolution No. 194/2019/NQ-HDND</td> <td>4</td> <td>DONRE (EPF)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2) Energy saving</td> <td>Plan No. 172/KH-UBND</td> <td>5</td> <td>DARD, DOIT, DPC (District People's Committee)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3) Reduction of direct pollution load to the bay</td> <td>-</td> <td>0</td> <td>* Related projects supported by JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Total</td> <td>11</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Projects related to reduction of direct pollution load to the bay have been supported by JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor). (e.g. Ongoing project to install Johkasou on tourist islands in the Halong Bay World Heritage Area using a subsidy from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MOFA) of Japan)</li> </ul>	Area	Regulations	No. of activities	Conducted by	1) Provincial fund/financial mechanisms	Decision No.114/QD-UBND	2	DONRE (EPF)	Resolution No. 194/2019/NQ-HDND	4	DONRE (EPF)	2) Energy saving	Plan No. 172/KH-UBND	5	DARD, DOIT, DPC (District People's Committee)	3) Reduction of direct pollution load to the bay	-	0	* Related projects supported by JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor)	Total		11		Questionnaire & interview with DPI, Interview with EPF, Green Growth Advisor
Area	Regulations	No. of activities	Conducted by																						
1) Provincial fund/financial mechanisms	Decision No.114/QD-UBND	2	DONRE (EPF)																						
	Resolution No. 194/2019/NQ-HDND	4	DONRE (EPF)																						
2) Energy saving	Plan No. 172/KH-UBND	5	DARD, DOIT, DPC (District People's Committee)																						
3) Reduction of direct pollution load to the bay	-	0	* Related projects supported by JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor)																						
Total		11																							
Indicator 3: Two (2) or more eco-tour programs and their tourism information are developed and provided through the regulations, mechanisms and organizations developed by the Project for the tourism sector in Quang Ninh Province.	Status of the Achievement: not achieved (Ex-Post Evaluation) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No eco-tour program has been newly developed and provided because COVID-19 hit Quang Ninh's tourism industry hard and the pilot project for ecotourism was also suspended for some time.</li> <li>New ecotourism programs are under consideration. A new program of ethnic minority ecotourism is being developed and is expected to start in April 2024. Ecotourism trainings were held in 2021.</li> </ul> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Activities following the results of the Quan Lan Island pilot ecotourism program developed by the project</th> <th>Status</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Binh Lieu District, Cai Chien Island, Uong Bi City, Tien Yen City and other cities have considered developing ecotourism programs.</td> <td>Under consideration</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>A new program of ethnic minority ecotourism is being developed in Binh Lieu District with the cooperation of Japanese partners.</td> <td>Under development Expected to start in Apr. 2024</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Ecotourism training was held for tourism administrators, tourism business operators, and local residents in Hai Ha District &amp; Binh Lieu District (130 participants in Hai Ha, 70 participants in Binh Lieu)</td> <td>Sep. &amp; Oct. 2021</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Activities following the results of the Quan Lan Island pilot ecotourism program developed by the project	Status	1	Binh Lieu District, Cai Chien Island, Uong Bi City, Tien Yen City and other cities have considered developing ecotourism programs.	Under consideration	2	A new program of ethnic minority ecotourism is being developed in Binh Lieu District with the cooperation of Japanese partners.	Under development Expected to start in Apr. 2024	3	Ecotourism training was held for tourism administrators, tourism business operators, and local residents in Hai Ha District & Binh Lieu District (130 participants in Hai Ha, 70 participants in Binh Lieu)	Sep. & Oct. 2021	Questionnaire to DPI, Green Growth Advisor											
	Activities following the results of the Quan Lan Island pilot ecotourism program developed by the project	Status																							
1	Binh Lieu District, Cai Chien Island, Uong Bi City, Tien Yen City and other cities have considered developing ecotourism programs.	Under consideration																							
2	A new program of ethnic minority ecotourism is being developed in Binh Lieu District with the cooperation of Japanese partners.	Under development Expected to start in Apr. 2024																							
3	Ecotourism training was held for tourism administrators, tourism business operators, and local residents in Hai Ha District & Binh Lieu District (130 participants in Hai Ha, 70 participants in Binh Lieu)	Sep. & Oct. 2021																							

### 3 Efficiency

Both the project cost and the project period slightly exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 109 % and 105 %, respectively) due to the combined factors. Outputs were produced as planned.

	Project Cost (Japanese side only, yen)	Project Period (months)
Plan (ex-ante)	440 million yen	37 months
Actual	481 million yen	39 months
Ratio (%)	109%	105%

In light of the above, the efficiency of the project is ③.

### 4 Sustainability

<Policy Aspect>

NGGS in the period of 2021 - 2023, with a vision toward 2050 was approved by the Vietnamese government in 2021. The Strategy

regulated the general opinions, objectives, solutions and organizations for implementing green growth of Viet Nam. In the Quang Ninh Provincial SEDP in the period of 2021 - 2023, with a vision toward 2050 (Decision No.80/QD-TTg dated February 11, 2023), it mentions that the development perspective of Quang Ninh Province is being green growth, transforming industry and society from “brown” to “green” towards sustainability.

<Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

Although the provincial steering committee<sup>7</sup> was dissolved at the time of project completion, Quang Ninh provincial departments continue to implement the results of the project as assigned in Plan No.73/KH-UBND dated April 27, 2020 (2020 - 2025) with a sufficient number of staff except for CBET. Members of the CBET Board mainly work part-time, so the Board’s functions are not carried out continuously. At the reviewing conference organized by DOT and Van Don PP in July 2021, the current roles and responsibilities of the CBET Board were reviewed but the regulation on operating of the CBET Board has not been officially issued yet.

<Technical Aspect>

Quang Ninh provincial departments continue to implement the results of the project as assigned in Plan No.73/KH-UBND. Staff training is carried out at all organizations. All 13 staff employees at EPF hold a master's degree. TIPC usually cooperates with local and foreign organizations to perform their functions as well as acquire and update new competencies and skills needed for their work. The staff of TIPC are graduates from Economy University and Tourism University and are good at foreign languages. Operation manuals (integrated into Plan No.73/KH-UBND) and materials for BSC and to promote discovery trails are utilized and updated in accordance with the actual situation. In addition, support from JICA Expert (Green Growth Advisor) and collaboration with Shiga Prefecture based on the MOU contribute to strengthening the technical capacity of relevant organizations.

However, the CBET Board does not have enough necessary skills and time to perform the Board’s functions. As for equipment provided by the project, the Composting Toilet has not been used because it was found to be unsuitable for tourist boats. Composting Plant is still used to recycle fish residue into pharmaceutical products, which has been changed from the originally planned one due to the unfeasibility of the organic waste recycling model and the fact that maintenance for the original purpose is difficult and costly.

<Financial Aspect>

With the budget as assigned in Plan No.73/KH-UBND, Quang Ninh provincial departments continue to implement the results of the project. EPF has been continuously provided, with a current chapter capital of 50 billion VND, which is funded by the provincial budget. CBET Board does not have its own budget to promote its activities. It mainly combines with the district’s promotion programs to advertise their activities.

<Environmental and Social Aspect>

No issue on environmental and social aspect has been observed, and it has not been necessary to take any countermeasures.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, some problems have been observed in terms of technical aspect and slight problems have been observed in terms of the institutional/organizational and financial aspects of the implementing agency. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ③.

### 5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project mostly achieved the Project Purpose as planned which was to promote Green Growth in Halong Bay Area and the Overall Goal to promote Green Growth in Quang Ninh Province. The project effects continue as evident in the functioning status of the developed mechanisms during the project and the progress of the post-project phase action programs. As for sustainability, although there have been some issues, Plan No.73/KH-UBND (2020 - 2025) basically underpins all the aspects of sustainability as an important provincial legal basis. Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

### III. Non-score Items

#### Additionality and Creative Values:

- Shiga Prefecture's history of the industry, government, academia, and civil society working together to preserve the environment of Lake Biwa and its efforts to position Lake Biwa as the core of the region's economic growth are known as “Lake Biwa Model”. The project was effectively implemented by collaborating with Shiga Prefecture and taking advantage of its experience and knowledge in developing comprehensive policies for regional development and natural resource management, including Lake Biwa Model. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, the collaboration between Quang Ninh Province and Shiga Prefecture has continued, contributing to the realization of green growth in the province.

### IV. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

#### Recommendations for Implementing Agency:

- Plan 73/KH-UBND (2020 - 2025) has been instrumental in continuing the project effects and underpinning sustainability. As it will expire in 2025, it is recommended to extend it to continue implementing the next Green Growth plan.

#### Lessons Learned for JICA:

- The project was designed not only to support the technical transfer but also to institutionalize the necessary mechanisms (mainly in provincial decisions). Such project design is effective in ensuring the policy implementation in the post-project phase. For the continuation of the effects and the sustainability of projects that construct mechanisms, it is useful to institutionalize them through officially approved documents like governmental decisions and regulations during the project implementation. Having a legal basis like Plan No.73/KH-UBND (2020 - 2025) in place soon after the project's completion is also highly effective in calling for action with budget, which is essential for policy implementation.

<sup>7</sup> To guide the implementation of the NSGG in Quang Ninh Province, the provincial steering committee for Green Growth of Quang Ninh Province period 2014-2020 was established under Decision No. 3281/QD-UBND issued in 2014. The secretariat office was set up in DPI. The departments consisting of the steering committee and local administrations, such as Halong City, have sections concerning green growth promotion.



CBET & discovery trails evaluation conference with the participation of Green Growth Advisor



Workshop organized by EPF