

Country Name	The Project of the Construction and Equipment of Primary and Lower Secondary Education Teacher Training Center (Le Projet de Construction et d'Equipped d'un Etablissement de Formation des Enseignants de l'Enseignement Fondamental)
Republic of Djibouti	

I. Project Outline

Background	In Djibouti, the overall primary enrollment rate increased from 40.0% to 68.9% for the period from 1999/2000 to 2007/2008. The proportion of students going from primary education to lower secondary education also increased from 44.4% to 67.0% for the same period. In addition, the number of pupils in basic education (9 years: 5 years of primary education and 4 years of lower secondary education) was expected to continuously increase as the government of Djibouti aimed to achieve 100% completion rate of primary education by 2015. Training for new primary school teachers was delivered by the Centre of the Training for Teachers of National Education (Le Centre de Formation des Personnels de l'Education Nationale: CFPEN), the only teacher training school in the country. However, the teacher training capacity needed to be expanded in order to cope with the future increase in the number of pupils in primary education. As for the training of lower secondary school teachers, though university general education graduates completed short-term training at CFPEN and entered the teaching profession, ensuring the quality of new and current lower secondary school teachers who have completed adequate teacher training became an issue. Therefore, the Ministry of National Education and Higher Education of Djibouti was planning to introduce a new teacher training system. However, the training capacity of CFPEN (about 120 teachers) was not sufficient to meet the expected needs (about 650 teachers).					
Objectives of the Project	To expand the new teacher training of primary and lower secondary education by constructing a new primary and secondary teacher training school in Djibouti City					
Contents of the Project	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Project Site: Djibouti City 2. Japanese side: (1) Building facilities: Education building, administration and special classrooms, student dormitories, etc., (2) Equipment: Audio-visual equipment, science experiment, etc., (3) Consulting services: bidding assistance and supervision 3. Djibouti side: (1) Demolition and removal work for structure existing in the construction site, (2) Others 					
Project Period	E/N Date	February 11, 2010	Completion Date (ex-ante)	February, 2012	Completion Date (actual)	December 12 2015 (Completion of construction)
	G/A Date	February 18. 2010				
Project Cost	E/N Grant Limit / G/A Grant Limit: 767 million yen, Actual Grant Amount: 767 million yen					
Executing Agency	Ministry of National Education and Vocational Training (Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Formation Professionnelle: MENFOP)					
Contracted Agencies	Main Contractor(s): HAN JOO CONSTRUCTION Co., Ltd Contractor for the remaining works: AMA Construction Main Consultant(s): MOHRI, ARCHITECT & ASSOCIATES, INC. Agent: Japan International Cooperation System					

II. Result of the Evaluation

< Special Perspectives Considered in the Ex-Post Evaluation >

While the target year of the effect indicator was 2014 at the time of ex-ante evaluation, due to the delay of project completion, the target year was set as 2017 with this ex-post evaluation.

1 Relevance/Coherence
[Relevance]
<Consistency with the Development Policy of Djibouti at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >
The project was consistent with the development policies of the government of Djibouti at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The government of Djibouti identified education as one of the key issues for the country's development. In the "Basic Plan for Education" formulated in 2000 and "Education Action Plan (2001–2005 and 2006-2011)," which were comprehensive plans for the education sector in Djibouti and the access to education, quality improvement, and strengthening of the teacher training system were prioritized in these plans.
<Consistency with the Development Needs of Djibouti at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation >
The project was consistent with development needs of Djibouti at the time of ex-ante evaluation. The training of new primary school teachers was provided by CFPEN only. However, the teacher training capacity needed to be expanded in order to cope with the future increase in the number of pupils in primary education. As for the training of lower secondary school teachers, although university general education graduates completed short-term training at CFPEN and entered the teaching profession, ensuring the quality of new and current lower secondary school teachers who have completed adequate teacher training became an issue.
<Appropriateness of Project Design/Approach>
The project design/approach was appropriate. The project components addressed the development needs to expand training capacity for the new teacher training. In addition, the project paid attention to vulnerable people who attend the new teacher

training school from the planning stage, including installing a multi-purpose restroom in a class room building and a slope between the 1st floor of special classroom building and the road facing to the school gate for disabled students as well as constructing a dormitory for students who come from countryside, some of which are expected to be vulnerable. There had been several disabled students registered so far, while the exact number was not counted in the Training Center for Teachers of Fundamental Education (Centre de Formation des Enseignants de l'Enseignement Fondamental: CFEEF). There were no issues and complaints from the disabled students for the facilities (they had handicaps on their legs, but they could use the same facility with others). At the time of ex-post evaluation, the student dormitory has been used by 30 students for the Arabic Baccalaureate from Markazi refugee camp. It has been also used by seven sign language teachers and 90 students from the regions for the dictation competition temporarily. According to the implementing agency, these facilities have provided comfortable environment with these students, and no problem attributed to the project design/approach was confirmed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the relevance of the project is ③¹.

[Coherence]

<Consistency with Japan's ODA Policy at the Time of Ex-Ante Evaluation>

The project was consistent with the Japan's ODA policy to Djibouti at the time of ex-ante evaluation, in which the priority area was (i) water, (ii) energy, and (iii) strengthening the coast guard and the area of employment (vocational training), health and education was expected for the assistance.

<Collaboration/Coordination with JICA's Other Interventions>

The collaboration/coordination between the project and JICA's other intervention was not clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation or during the project period, but after the project completion, several collaborations were conducted, and the positive effects were confirmed at the time of ex-post evaluation. These include: (i) the construction of a school in Djibouti city through Japanese Grant Aid "The Project for construction of fundamental school at Nassib, Balbala in Djibouti (2021-2025)", where a number of teachers trained in CFEEF are working; (ii) the dispatch of two Japanese Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCVs) to CFEEF where JOCVs introduced creative materials to improve the quality of education for students, especially for the math class, and teachers trained in CFEEF learnt how to make their class more attractive and clearer for students from JOCV's activities which improved their performance; and (iii) several staffs' participations in The Knowledge Co-creation Programme (KCCP) and the country focused training program regarding mathematics and science analysis, those who created a working group, spread what they learned in Japan, especially mathematics and science teaching method in CFEEF after the return to Djibouti, thus, improving the quality of the teachers by using material for mathematics class and experiments tool for science class.

<Cooperation with Other Institutions/ Coordination with International Framework>

No cooperation/coordination with other institutions was clearly planned at the time of ex-ante evaluation or during the project period.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the coherence of the project is ②.

[Evaluation Result of Relevance/Coherence]

In the light above, the relevance/coherence of the project is ③.

2 Effectiveness/Impact

<Effectiveness>

The project objectives were mostly achieved as planned. As for the annual number of teachers trained for the secondary school (Indicator 1), the actual number of teachers trained in 2017 (2 years after completion) was 212. Although the actual number of teachers trained were 200 in 2018 and 2019, it was over the target value of 240 in 2021 and 2022. It was 193 in 2023, which is below the target. The numbers of teachers enrolled in CFEEF depends on the teachers' demand situation of each regional government. As for the annual number of teachers trained for Primary school (Indicator 2), it has exceeded the target value of 85 since the project completion in 2017. It was because of the rapid increase in the number of basic schools by the policy of decentralization in the central government of Djibouti. The capacity of CFEEF was not designed to accommodate such large numbers of students, but CFEEF has overcome this situation by introducing double shifts and by combining classroom learning and online learning with the purchase of audiovisual equipment.

As for the qualitative effect, the expected qualitative effect was achieved as planned. Although CFPEN was to train existing teachers after the completion of CFEEF in the original plan, after CFEEF was partially completed in 2014, CFPEN was integrated into CFEEF, which has been in charge of training for new teachers and existing teachers. The training program for existing teachers have been delivered five times a year in CFEEF. Due to the facilities and equipment installed by the project in CFEEF, these teachers have been able to get prepared their class well and get the knowledge that they need to teach in a classroom. Therefore, these factors improved the quality of existing teachers in their service. According to CFEEF, the number of trainees of existing teachers reached 2,500 persons/year at the time of ex-post evaluation.

<Impact>

According to CFEEF, the improvement of the quality of trained teachers has contributed to making the quality of teaching primary and secondary school students better. The factors of the improvements of the teaching quality are: (i) regular training concerning education services, (ii) using video conference for distance learning, (iii) empowering teachers by providing them the information they need to improve their skills including course outlines, teacher guides and other important information that can be easily downloaded through the platforms for documentation and lesson preparation, and (iv) changing teacher's posture in the classroom.

By installing a multipurpose rest room in the hall, library and large classroom building, a slope between the 1st floor of special

¹ ④ : very high, ③ : high, ② : moderately low, ① : low

classroom building and the road facing to the gate for disabled people, the barriers experienced by disabled persons have been mitigated. In addition, the dormitory has helped students who are from rural areas. There is no quantitative data available related to the elimination of regional disparities in teacher training such as the origin of enrolled students, and places to be assigned after the completion of the training in CFEEF.

No negative impact on natural environment was confirmed.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, the effectiveness/impact of the project is ③.

Quantitative Effects

Indicators	Baseline 2009	Target 2014	Actual 2015	Actual 2016	Actual 2017	Actual 2018
	Baseline Year	2 years after completion	year of completion	1 year after Completion	2 years after Completion	3 years after Completion
Indicator 1: Annual number of teachers trained for the secondary school according to the new system (middle, secondary school and professional training)	0	240	NA	196	212	200
Indicator 2: Annual number of teachers trained for fundamental school (Preschool education, primary education & primary special education)	30	85	120	131	157	160

Indicators	Actual 2019	Actual 2020	Actual 2021	Actual 2022	Actual 2023
	4 years after Completion	5 years after Completion	6 years after Completion	7 years after Completion	8 years after Completion
Indicator 1: Annual number of teachers trained for the secondary school according to the new system (middle, secondary school and professional training)	200	255	252	232	193
Indicator 2: Annual number of teachers trained for fundamental school (Preschool education, primary education & primary special education)	150	294	294	265	233

Source: CFEEF

3 Efficiency

Although the project cost was as planned (the ratio against the plan: 100%), the project period considerably exceeded the plan (the ratio against the plan: 291%). The main reason that the project period considerably exceeded the plan was the construction contractor's financial difficulty and eventual bankruptcy. Due to the appreciation of the Japanese yen against the US dollars (USD), especially in 2012, the Djibouti Francs (DJF), which was fixed rate with USD, was significantly depreciated. Djibouti basically imports all essential from overseas, so the financial situation of the government was critical between 2011 and 2015. Due to the currency depreciation and the government budget shortage, the government did not pay the works for the government obligation portion to the contractor, which made the contractor cash shortage. In addition, the bank where the contractor borrowed funds and used to receive payment from the government fell into a state of insolvency and put under the control of the National Bank of Djibouti (the central bank). Due to the financial deterioration of the contractor, the work progress was significantly delayed even though the procurement agency and the consultant worked speed up the construction progress by sending additional personnel to the construction site, and eventually the contractor went bankrupt in 2013, and the contract was abandoned in December 2013. A new contractor was selected through a designated tender, and the work resumed in May 2014 and completed in December 2015.

	Project Cost (Japanese side only, yen)	Project Period (months)
Plan (ex-ante)	767 million	24
Actual	767 million	70
Ratio (%)	100	291

The output was produced as planned.

In the light above, the efficiency of the project is ②.

4 Sustainability

< Institutional/Organizational Aspect>

The operation and maintenance (O&M) of the facilities constructed in this project is managed by the department of the project, maintenance and equipment under the General Department of Administration in Ministry of Education and Training (MENFOP). While MENFOP has been in charge of procurement of expensive equipment, and CFEEF has been in charge of small procurement and maintenance. The exact number of O&M staff is not clear, but according to CFEEF, the sufficient number of staff has been deployed, and all equipment has been well maintained.

<Technical Aspect>

CFEEF has maintained an appropriate ability to maintain the facilities and equipment installed in the project. CFEEF has recruited experienced technicians from the contractor. In addition, other staff members have learned from the technicians recruited from the contractor in daily work (on the job training), although no O&M manual has been available and official training programs for the persons who are in charge of O&M have been delivered. Thus, it is considered that this does not affect the O&M of the facility.

<Financial Aspect>

While the actual data of budget is not available, normally, it satisfies approximately 70% of the necessary amounts. According to CFEEF, even though it has been always difficult to secure the budget that CFEEF needs, so far it is almost satisfied. The O&M budget of CFEEF has been provided by MENFOP. The budget has been originally allocated from the Ministry of Budget to MENFOP based on CFEEF's request for an estimated amount from the past expenditures and future plan.

<Environment and Social Aspect>

No issue on environmental and social aspects has been observed, and it has not been necessary to take any countermeasures.

<Current Status of Operation and Maintenance>

Several defects identified before the project completion were all repaired by the JICA's Follow-up project in 2017, and at the time of ex-post evaluation, all of equipment have been well maintained.

<Evaluation Result>

In light of the above, slight problems have been observed in terms of the financial aspects. Therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is ③.

5 Summary of the Evaluation

The project objective is mostly achieved as planned. The target of annual number of teachers trained for the secondary school according to the new system was almost achieved, and the target of annual number of teachers trained for fundamental school exceeded the target. As for efficiency, the project period significantly exceeded the plan, but the project cost is as planned.

Considering all of the above points, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

III. Recommendations & Lessons Learned

Lessons Learned for JICA:

- Due to the shortage of government budget mainly caused by the depreciation of the currency of the recipient country, the recipient government was not able to pay to the contractor for the works which should be done by the recipient government side. Also, from the early stage of the project, the financial position of the contractor including funding availability in the recipient country affected the implementation capacity of construction works and caused the delay of the works. Therefore, in the case where the grant aid project is implemented in a country with fiscal and financial vulnerability, it is desirable that at the time of project planning stage, the recipient country's fiscal condition be recognized as a risk factor and that possible countermeasures be considered in case the risk materializes. Furthermore, during the project implementation period, the fiscal situation of the recipient country should be closely monitored, and appropriate countermeasures should be taken if the likelihood of the risk materializing increases. In addition, when the project is conducted in small countries with limited number of well experienced local construction companies and with tough natural/weather conditions, it is essential to survey and consider the capacity of the local construction companies which could affect the quality of the work and the construction schedule.



Entrance of CFEEF



Classroom